

**Women's Movements and Women's Policy Offices in Western
Postindustrial Democracies, 1970-2001**

**Dataset for a Study Conducted by the Research Network on
Gender Politics and the State**

TEXT APPENDICES

February 15th, 2011

Coordinated By

Dorothy E. McBride, Florida Atlantic University

Amy G. Mazur, Washington State University



NOTE TO USERS

This part of the RNGS dataset contains the text information for each of the 130 observations to supplement the attached SPSS dataset. For specific project information and variable definitions see the RNGS codebook.

The format for each debate appendix is as follows:

Debate ID:

Title:

Women's Policy Agency (s) – WPA or Quasi WPA (s) – QUAWPA:

Dates of coding:

Descriptive information for each of the following variables:

C1A_1— Women's Movement Actors (WMA), Name, Micro Frame: Issue Definition/
Policy Goals

C1A_2 – Women's Movement Actors (WMA) Issue Definition and Policy Goals That
Are Feminist

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA (s) by Acronym

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

The country researchers provided the information for these appendices through the research conducted for their published chapters in the five issue books listed in Appendix 5 of the codebook and for data collection worksheets assembled for the quantitative phase of the project. Dorothy McBride and Amy Mazur filled in the text appendices as a part of the larger coding process. The text is for the most part in regular font or bold; in cases where the text is in italics, these are notes from the coders about specific coding decisions.

The appendices are arranged by country. There are two tables of contents: one to indicate locations by country and the second to indicate location by Issue area. Debates may also be searched through the regular search function by typing

COUNTRY ABBREVIATION/ DEBATE ABBREVIATION/DEBATE NUMBER.

Note an _ must be inserted after the country abbreviation. FOR EXAMPLE: AUT_PT1, to locate the appendix for the first prostitution debate in Austria.

TABLE OF CONTENTS BY COUNTRY

Austria

Abortion 1	8
Abortion 2	12
Abortion 3	15
Hot Issue.....	19
Political Representation 1	25
Political Representation 2.....	29
Political Representation 3.....	35
Prostitution 1.....	41
Prostitution 2.....	44
Prostitution 3.....	48

Belgium

Abortion 1	52
Abortion 2	60
Abortion 3	64
Hot Issue.....	70
Political Representation 1.....	77
Political Representation 2.....	82
Political Representation 3.....	87

Canada

Abortion 1	92
Abortion 2	97
Abortion 3	103
Hot Issue.....	110
Job Training 1.....	115
Job Training 2.....	122
Job Training 3.....	129
Prostitution 1.....	136
Prostitution 2.....	146
Prostitution 3.....	154

Finland

Hot Issue.....	158
Job Training 1.....	163
Job Training 2.....	168
Job Training 3.....	172
Job Training 4.....	177
Political Representation 1	181
Political Representation 2.....	184
Political Representation 3.....	189
Prostitution 1	194
Prostitution 2.....	198
Prostitution 3.....	202

France

Abortion 1	208
Abortion 2	215
Abortion 3.....	222
Hot Issue.....	228
Job Training 1.....	235
Job Training 2.....	242
Job Training 3.....	248
Job Training 4.....	254
Job Training 5.....	259
Political Representation 1.....	264
Political Representation 2.....	268
Political Representation 3.....	272
Prostitution 1.....	284
Prostitution 2.....	289
Prostitution 3.....	293

Germany

Abortion 1	298
Abortion 2	303
Abortion 3	309
Hot Issue.....	314
Political Representation 1.....	328
Political Representation 2.....	332
Political Representation 3.....	338

Great Britain

Abortion 1	342
Abortion 2	347
Abortion 3	353
Hot Issue.....	359
Political Representation 1.....	365
Political Representation 2.....	369
Political Representation 3.....	376
Prostitution 1.....	383
Prostitution 2.....	386
Prostitution 3.....	389

Ireland

Abortion 1.....	394
Abortion 2	398
Abortion 3	403
Job Training 1.....	410
Job Training 2.....	412
Job Training 3.....	419

Italy

Abortion 1	424
Abortion 2	430
Abortion 3	435
Hot Issue.....	439
Job Training 1.....	446
Job Training 2.....	450
Political Representation 1.....	456
Political Representation 2.....	460
Political Representation 3.....	465
Prostitution 1.....	475
Prostitution 2.....	480
Prostitution 3.....	484

Netherlands

Abortion 1	489
Abortion 2	493
Abortion 3	497
Hot Issue.....	501
Political Representation 1	507
Political Representation 2.....	513
Political Representation 3.....	520
Prostitution 1.....	526
Prostitution 2.....	532
Prostitution 3.....	536

Spain

Abortion 1	540
Abortion 2	544
Hot Issue.....	548
Job Training 1.....	553
Job Training 2.....	556
Job Training 3.....	560
Political Representation 1	564
Political Representation 2.....	569
Political Representation 3.....	575
Prostitution 1.....	581
Prostitution 2.....	586
Prostitution 3.....	591

Sweden

Hot Issue.....	596
Political Representation 1	603
Political Representation 2.....	607
Political Representation 3.....	612
Prostitution 1.....	616
Prostitution 2.....	621
Prostitution 3.....	627

USA

Abortion 1.....	632
Abortion 2	637
Abortion 3	642
Hot Issue.....	648
Job Training 1.....	659
Job Training 2.....	664
Job Training 3.....	667
Political Representation 1	673
Political Representation 2.....	680
Political Representation 3.....	684
Prostitution 1.....	687
Prostitution 2.....	691
Prostitution 3.....	696

TABLE OF CONTENTS BY ISSUE AREA

Abortion

Austria 1.....	8
Austria 2.....	12
Austria 3.....	15
Belgium 1.....	52
Belgium 2.....	60
Belgium 3.....	64
Canada 1.....	92
Canada 2.....	97
Canada 3.....	103
France 1.....	208
France 2.....	215
France 3.....	222
Germany 1.....	298
Germany 2.....	303
Germany 3.....	309
Great Britain 1.....	343
Great Britain 2.....	347
Great Britain 3.....	353
Ireland 1.....	394
Ireland 2.....	398
Ireland 3.....	403
Italy 1.....	424
Italy 2.....	430
Italy 3.....	435
Netherlands 1.....	489
Netherlands 2.....	493
Netherlands 3.....	497
Spain 1.....	540
Spain 2.....	544
USA 1.....	632
USA 2.....	637
USA 3.....	642

Hot Issue

Austria.....	19
Belgium.....	70
Canada.....	110
Finland.....	158
France.....	228
Germany.....	316
Great Britain.....	359
Italy.....	439
Netherlands.....	501

Hot Issue (cont.)

Spain.....	548
Sweden.....	596
USA.....	648

Job Training

Canada 1.....	115
Canada 2.....	122
Canada 3.....	129
Finland 1.....	163
Finland 2.....	168
Finland 3.....	172
Finland 4.....	177
France 1.....	235
France 2.....	242
France 3.....	248
France 4.....	254
France 5.....	259
Ireland 1.....	410
Ireland 2.....	414
Ireland 3.....	419
Italy 1.....	446
Italy 2.....	450
Spain 1.....	553
Spain 2.....	556
Spain 3.....	560
USA 1.....	659
USA 2.....	664
USA 3.....	667

Political Representation

Austria 1.....	25
Austria 2.....	29
Austria 3.....	35
Belgium 1.....	77
Belgium 2.....	82
Belgium 3.....	87
Finland 1.....	181
Finland 2.....	184
Finland 3.....	189
France 1.....	264
France 2.....	268
France 3.....	272
Germany 1.....	328

Political Representation (cont.)

Germany 2.....	332
Germany 3.....	338
Great Britain 1.....	365
Great Britain 2.....	369
Great Britain 3.....	376
Italy 1.....	456
Italy 2.....	460
Italy 3.....	465
Netherlands 1.....	507
Netherlands 2.....	513
Netherlands 3.....	520
Spain 1.....	564
Spain 2.....	569
Spain 3.....	575
Sweden 1.....	603
Sweden 2.....	607
Sweden 3.....	612
USA 1.....	673
USA 2.....	680
USA 3.....	684

Prostitution

Austria 1.....	41
Austria 2.....	44
Austria 3.....	48
Canada 1.....	136
Canada 2.....	146
Canada 3.....	154
Finland 1.....	194
Finland 2.....	198
Finland 3.....	202
France 1.....	284
France 2.....	289
France 3.....	293
Great Britain 1.....	383
Great Britain 2.....	386
Great Britain 3.....	389
Italy 1.....	475
Italy 2.....	480
Italy 3.....	484
Netherlands 1.....	526
Netherlands 2.....	532
Netherlands 3.....	536
Spain 1.....	581
Spain 2.....	586
Spain 3.....	591
Sweden 1.....	616
Sweden 2.....	621
Sweden 3.....	627
USA 1.....	687
USA 2.....	691
USA 3.....	696

Debate ID: AUT_AB1 1970-72

Title: Austria-the Social Democratic Party's Proposal to Decriminalize Abortion in the First Trimester

QUAWPA: Women's Section of the Social Democratic Party (WSSDP)

Dates of coding: 12/20/03, 3/3/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1.

Name : **The Aktionskommittee (Action committee for the Repeal of Section 144)**

Micro Frame: **None**

Issue Definition: **Abortion was a women's issue and was necessary for women's emancipation; liberalized abortion law would promote free choice and self determination for women.**

Policy Goals: **The goal of the Aktionskommittee was to get the SPD to reverse its position and support legalizing abortion.**

Policy Goals: **Legalizing abortion.**

C1A_2—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Name : **The Aktionskommittee (Action committee for the Repeal of Section 144)**

Micro Frame: **None**

Issue Definition: **Abortion was a women's issue and was necessary for women's emancipation; liberalized abortion law would promote free choice and self determination for women.**

Policy Goals: **The goal of the Aktionskommittee was to get the SPD to reverse its position and support legalizing abortion.**

Policy Goals: **Legalizing abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Abortion legal on demand in the first trimester of pregnancy.**
2. **Woman decides after consulting with trained counselor or medical doctor to**
3. **have abortion.**
4. **After first trimester, limited access to abortion: where physical or mental risk to the pregnant woman; child expected to suffer from a mental disease; where pregnant woman has a tumor.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **The Aktionskommittee (Action committee for the Repeal of Section 144)**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Aktionskommittee organized discussions but also campaigned by actions/events in the streets.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The Social Democratic party won the 1970 election and brought a proposal for abortion law reform as a government draft.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The issue was framed by the old members of the Social Democratic party. They focused on the need for social justice and recommended that abortion be decriminalized because it allowed only for rich women to have abortions which they could do by traveling to other countries or illegally under worst conditions. Under the law that banned abortions, the social Democrats saw that poor women were left to carry their babies to term or to have dangerous illegal abortions. The issue was not gendered in the beginning and did not include much mention of women and men.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Abortion is a question of women's right to self determination; linked abortion question to women's individual rights and emancipation.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Abortion is a question of women's right to self determination; abortion is linked to women's individual rights and emancipation.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 WSSDP

For the older women abortion was framed in terms of social justice, the younger women focused on self determination. At the end of the debate the SPÖ women's organization presented the proposal to decriminalize abortion within the first three months arguing that it is up to the individual woman to decide. That means that this Quasi WPA supported the self determination. But for some proponents of the SPÖ women's organisation (especially the older generation but also the head of the organisatin) the traditional frame was one of social justice.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Abortion linked to self determination of women; supported decriminalization of abortion.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

WSSDP was formally focused on all issues that concerned women in the Social Democratic Party and society at large.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WSSDP transported demands on women's issue via the official party structures – e.g. party conferences. Then the Party as Party was obliged to push forward the proposals in government or in parliament. SPÖ women are organized in a separate women's organization. The Social-Democratic women's organization is constituency-based within the party statute. It is one of the Party's affiliated organizations (other are the Youth organization, the senior people organization). It is not in the party's decision-making executive.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Herta Firnberg**

Years in WPA: **1967 – 1982 head of the WPA**

WMA Activities: **Activist and member of the SDP women's organization as well as the Social Democratic Party since the 1930s, engaged in women's issues and organization in the late 1950s and 1960s as an individual before becoming head of the QUAWPA.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and Source: **Abortion was a unifying question and a high priority for the emerging women's movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job Discrimination/Equal pay**
- **Self Help/Sexuality**
- **Education**
- **Third World Women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Aktion Leben (Action for Life) founded in 1971. An umbrella organization with most anti-abortionist groups working within. There were catholic groups lay organizations, the so called catholic women's movement (Katholische Frauenbewegung) but also medical doctor's groups or platforms and a platform of judges and lawyers, the later were informal groups.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

SPÖ party organization

WSDP

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democratic Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not applicable

Debate ID: AUT_AB2 1975-1978

Title: Parliamentary Rejection of People's Initiative/ Retention of Legal Abortion

QUAWPA: Women's Section of Social Democratic Party(WSSDP)

Dates of Coding: 12/20/03, 3/13/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1.

Name: **Aktion Unabhängige Frauen (AUF)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's rights issue.**

Policy goals: **Maintain abortion on demand.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's rights issue.**

Policy goals: **Maintain abortion on demand.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Parliament rejected people's initiative to ban abortion; retained abortion on demand. Here is what was rejected:**
 - a. **add paragraph to Constitution on the protection of human life**
 - b. **extend help for pregnant women in need of alternatives to abortion**
 - c. **recriminalize abortion for other than medical reasons.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Aktion Unabhängige Frauen (AUF)**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Sometimes illegal tactics through autonomous feminist groups; Membership was organizing discussion on sexuality and against the people's initiative, also some spectacular street events.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Almost immediately after the Social Democratic majority in Parliament decided to legalize abortion within the first trimester of pregnancy, the counter-movement's umbrella organization, Aktion Leben moved to reopen the debate. It used a special political instrument related to direct democracy: the people's initiative. The people's initiative is a means for ordinary citizens to place a bill on the parliament's agenda. At least 100,000 voters must sign the initiative in the presence of authorities, and all signatures must be collected within one week.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The issue frame was social justice, and women's emancipation and self-determination. Within this, the SPÖ saw need for legal abortion on the basis of class and gender. The women within the SPÖ sought to keep abortion legal.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Legal abortion necessary for women's emancipation and self-determination.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end of the debate, the issue frame was social justice linked to women's right to choose versus demands for protecting the right to life of the fetus. This was the result of activism by Catholic church's move to focus the debate on the right to life of the unborn.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Social justice linked to women's right to choose.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

QUAWPA Women's Section of SPÖ (WS SPÖ)

Right of women to terminate unwanted pregnancy is central part of women's liberation; demand for abortion on request.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Right of women to terminate unwanted pregnancy is central part of women's liberation; demand for abortion on request.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA The women's section of the Social Democratic party was concerned with a broad range of women's issues. They had formal charge to deal with all women's issues per party statute. But it was and is for the women's organization to select priority issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

QUAWPA The women's section was part of the Social Democratic Party. It had its own staff.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Herta Firnberg**

Years in WPA: **1967 – 1982 head of the WPA, activist and member of the SPÖ women's organization as well as the Social Democratic Party since the 1930s, engaged in women issues and organization in the late 1950s and 1960s.**

WMA activity: **As an individual. She was an activist and functionary of the Social Democratic women's movement for years. A non organization member would never be elected as chairwoman/head of the SPÖ women's organization. In the 1970s but still today most high rank positions are held by people who are engaged in the**

party's affiliated organizations and party organization at more or less since their childhood or teenage years.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and Source: **During this debate, the women's movement was in a growth stage. Activists in the Social Democratic Party continued to thrive and autonomous groups were increasing in numbers.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job discrimination/Equal pay**
- **Self help/Sexuality**
- **Education**
- **Third world women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

The Aktion Leben- an umbrella group of anti-abortionists; Catholic Church
There are formal organizations like the catholic lay organization (there is the Catholic lay organization for men (called catholic men's movement), and the catholic lay organization for women (called catholic women's movement). The Catholic Bishop Conference (the highest decision making body within the Austrian Catholic church) took a position. Some formal organizations were split: e.g. there were some doctors - most free lancing medical doctors – are organized within the medical doctors association who were anti-abortionists, others publicly supported women's demands. Also the judge and lawyers associations were split referring to the political Camp the individual judge or lawyer belong to.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Political Parties: SPÖ and Austrian Peoples Party; Parliament—National Council (lower house) Federal Council (Upper house).

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

SPÖ had majority.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: AUT_AB3 1998-99

Title: Austria- The authorization of mifegyne.

WPA: Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Dates of coding: Dates: 12/20/03, 12/1/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Groups in the Catholic church**

Microframes:

Issue definition: **Accept abortion as matter of fact and recommend liberal and feminist counseling for women seeking help.**

Policy goals: **Supported no change in law.**

WMA 2

Name: **Feminist women within the official parties**

Microframes:

Issue Definition: **Supported legal abortion as women's rights.**

Policy Goals: **No change in law; application of Mifegyne ok.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the Social Democrat Party**

Microframes:

Issue Definition: **Women's right to choose abortion and the method appropriate for them; focused on men's responsibility for reproduction.**

Policy goals: **Demanded more public funding for day care; keep abortion legal; application of Mifegyne ok.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Supported legal abortion as women's rights. Women's right to choose abortion and the method appropriate for them; focused on men's responsibility for reproduction.**

Policy goals: **Demanded more public funding for day care; keep abortion legal.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Mifegyne to be used in private or public clinics and hospitals**
2. **No reopening of debate over retaining legal abortion in the first trimester.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Groups in the Catholic church**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (Catholic Church)**

Activities During the Debate:

WMA 2 Feminist women within the official partiesForm: **Informal**Location: **Non women's movement organization (Liberal/Green parties)**Activities During the Debate: **Operated from within the Liberal Party and the Green Alternative party.****WMA 3 Women's Section of the Social Democrat Party**Form: **Formal**Location: **Inside non-women's movement organization (Social Democrats)**Activities During the Debate: **Women's section of SPÖ was active in the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

A new debate started when, in 1998, the pharmaceutical industry wanted the Austrian state to authorize the use mifegyne, also known as RU 486 or the abortion pill. Mifegyne offers an alternative to surgery for women seeking an abortion. The use of mifegyne to terminate pregnancies had already been authorized in several countries of the European Union. Reports from France, where the pill had been in use for some years under medically supervised conditions, showed a number of women choosing this new method. Countermovement saw this as opportunity to reopen debate on legal abortion.

C3A_1—Issue frame at the beginning of the debate

In the beginning of the debate the debate focused on mifegyne as a medical issue and an abortion technique and on the conditions under which the pill would be used. Some medical experts argued that mifegyne would decrease health risks for women because they could now avoid the dangers of surgery. The medical experts in favor of mifegyne argued that it should be approved by the EU so that it could be used in Austria.

C3A_2—List of gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the beginning of the debate

Mifegyne would decrease health risks for women and avoid surgery.

C3A_3—Issue frame at the end of the debate.

Through the course of the debate, anti-abortionists attempted to shift the focus of the debate back to morality and the life of the fetus. The anti-abortionists were not successful and overall, the dominant frame of the debate remained focused on women's health and medical issues. The debate did take on some gendered frames throughout. After the anti-abortionists tried to shift the focus back to morality, feminists reasserted that abortion was central to women's rights and argued that mifegyne would extend women's freedoms. Feminists and other women's movement actors argued that mifegyne should be approved by the EU and made legal for use in Austria. The abortion bill was approved by some EU member states. The only question was the application for Austria.

C3A_4—List of gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the end of the debate

Women's health and medical issues.

(NB: although feminists asserted abortion was central to women's rights, it is not clear that this became part of the issue frame used by policy actors).

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

The MWA focused on not reopening the debate on the legality of abortion and advocated the use of mifegyne; demanded easier access to abortion in public hospitals.

The minister made use of the debate on mifegyne to promote her demands for easier access to abortion.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The MWA was concerned with all issues that affected women. This includes social welfare programs (pension law reforms), reforms on parental leave as well as reforms on divorce law or programs to promote women in federal administration. Mandate and orientation were cross sectional.

Policy Issues: The MWA had a broad cross sectional mandate that allowed it to focus on all issues that affected women. The MWA came out in favor of abortion and in favor of the use of mifegyne.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The MWA is located at the top level of the Austrian government and is a cabinet level ministry.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Barbara Prammer**

Years in WPA: **3 years**

WMA Activity: **She was a functionary of the SPÖ women's organisation and a moderate feminist who was able to co-operate with more radical feminist projects or groups.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **During the 1980s, the institutionalization of the more moderate part of the women's movement grew rapidly. In the 1990s, agenda setting in terms of women's policies was on the side of women working at the institutional level.**

Meanwhile, radical feminists set up alternative non governmental institutions such as women's housing, rape crisis centers, and feminist health centers.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals: **Some medical doctors, e.g. Johannes Huber who is the head of the biggest gynecological department in Austria, he is a well known anti-abortionist. also some male journalists.**

Informal organizations: **Radical anti-abortionists in coalition with extreme right and fundamentalist Catholics. One of these organizations is I Choose Life, or Pro Life, which is the succeeding organisation to Aktion Leben of the 1970s.**

Formal Organizations **Catholic church hierarchy**

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Since there are two issues here, there are two policy arenas: the parliament (similar to Debates 1 and 2) and the Ministry of Health. The issue of the decriminalization of abortion took place in the parliament with the major role of the political parties. The issue of Mifegyne was a bureaucratic procedure. Parties in parliament refused to reopen the debate on abortion on demand as radical anti-abortionists want them to do. That's typical referring to EU regulations.

NOTE: National parliaments have only restricted competences in policy formulation; policy making in a lot of issues is governed by central bureaucratic rules. Especially when economic interests are involved as it was the case with mifegyne, where a pharmaceutical firm wants access to the Austrian market. Existing Austrian legislature on abortion was not against abortion on demand. Therefore there was no real reason to veto the application of the mifegyne. That was the reason why radical anti-abortionists tried to change the abortion law once again. They only made use of the opportunity, but did not succeed.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democratic party dominated; the Austrian Peoples Party was the junior partner.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Women's Global Reproductive Rights Network

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: AUT_HI 1999-2001

Title: Family Policy: Law on Child Care Allowances 2001

WPA: Unit for Women's Affairs (UWA)

Dates of coding: 11/11/05, 11/24/05, 11/30/05, 12/01/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Maria Rauch-Kallat. Chair of the ÖVPs women's section, member of parliament later (since 2002) minister for women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Difficulties to combine work and family.**

Policy Goals: **Pay parents a sort of salary for raising children.**

WMA2

Name: **Monika Mühlwert , FPÖ, deputy of the Upper house**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Erosion of traditional family. People see children only as burden
Women suffer from a double burden because they are forced into waged labour.**

Policy Goals: **Give mothers the choice to stay at home with children.**

WMA3

Name: **Madeleine Petrovic, Green Party, speaker of Green women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Critique of conservative family ideology. Critique of sexual
division of labour and discrimination of women on the labour market.**

Policy Goals: **Not mentioned**

WMA 4

Name: **ÖVP women's caucus**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Difficulties for men and women to combine work and family.**

Policy Goals : **Enable mothers and fathers to combine work and family.**

WMA 5

Name: **SPÖ women's organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Critique of sexual division of labour, of conservative women's
images and family images.**

Policy Goals : **More gender democracy. Equal share of care work, encourage
women for waged labour.**

WMA 6

Name: **UFF**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Unequal share of work between men and women, inequality in wages.**Policy Goals: **Right to combine family and work for men and women, more public childcare, 2 year childcare allowance for single mothers (only for working mothers).**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

- **Critique of conservative family ideology**
- **Critique of sexual division of labour and discrimination of women on the labour market**
- **Difficulties for men and women to combine work and family,**
- **Critique of sexual division of labour, of conservative women's images and family images**
- **Unequal share of work between men and women, inequality in wages.**

Policy goals:

- **More gender democracy**
- **Equal share of care work, encourage women for waged labour**
- **Enable mothers and fathers to combine work and family**
- **Right to combine family and work for men and women, more public childcare, 2 year childcare allowance for single mothers (only for working mothers).**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Provided child allowance to all childcarers up to 3 years (if both parents work) or 30 months if one parent is full time care giver. Not linked to work experience but awarded to any parent caring for a child regardless of employment. Thus, this is not a parental leave benefit but a more traditional family allowance.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Kallat**Form: **Individual**Location: **Parliament; chair of OVP women's section**Activities During the Debate: **Parliamentary debate**WMA 2 **Muhlwert**Form: **Individual**Location: **Parliament**Activities During the Debate: **Bundesrat debate**

WMA 3 PetrovicForm: **Individual**Location: **Parliament; Green Party**Activities During the Debate: **Spokesman for Green party women in parliament****WMA 4 OVP women's caucus**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **In OVP Political party— Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Arguments inside party and parliament****WMA 5 Women's section of SPO**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Inside SPO party— Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Party program; parliamentary debates****WMA 6 UFF**Form: **Informal Organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Organizing public debate, organizing a 'women's referendum' (people's initiative for women), media work.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

Family issues played a major role in the national election campaign of fall 1999. Both right wing parties, ÖVP and FPÖ, promised a salary for child-care, which would be the same for each child and paid to all mothers or fathers, regardless of a former employment. They portrayed families as the 'heart of society', the 'nucleus of society'. This image of happy families with many children contrasted sharply with the picture of Austria as an aging and dying society.

To support the election campaign of the ÖVP, the conservative Family Association launched a people's initiative on families (Familienvolksbegehren) in September 1999. The people's initiative, publicly supported by representatives of the Catholic Church, demanded parental benefits for everybody, the reconciliation of family and job, the strengthening of families, free public transport for pupils and even free tooth braces for children. 183,154 voters signed the initiative.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame was a debate over the nature, extent and reasons for the crisis in families in Austrian society. The right wing parties viewed that families were in peril because previous left wing governments had pushed women into the workforce and had neglected care needs in the family. The left wing said that families were in crisis because the government did not provide enough support for working mothers, eliminating discrimination, providing more family leave benefits. The debate was gendered as a major debate and was over whether to reinstate more traditional gender roles. The right parties actually wanted both fathers and mothers to work

and take parental leave, but that women should work only part time after several years of child rearing.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Previous left wing governments had pushed women into the workforce and had neglected care needs in the family**
- **Families were in crisis because the government did not provide enough support for working mothers, eliminating discrimination, providing more family leave benefits.**
- **Both fathers and mothers to work and take parental leave, but that women should work only part time after several years of child rearing.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

One frame:

- **Improve the situation of families by first giving parents the choice to stay at home with their children by granting a child-care allowance and second, measures for the reconciliation of family and job like public child-care, childminders and part-time jobs.**
- **the importance of flexibility in patterns of work. ‘Choice’, in the neo-liberal sense, became the symbol for this approach.**
- **stressed the importance of family work and care work—equal to wage work for society.**
- **stressed the necessity of paying parents a salary for raising children.**

VERSUS:

- **viewing the problems of families in terms of poverty – especially of lone mothers – and as a lack of possibilities to combine child-care and waged labor for both mothers and for fathers.**
- **criticized the ‘conservative family ideology’ of the governing parties.**
- **wanted to introduce a new definition of family beyond the male breadwinner model and marriage.**

Second frame: Included contrasting views of justice and equality in family policy

- **high poverty risk for people with children, family policy must be social policy (i.e. a policy which reduces social gaps between richer and poorer families).**

VERSUS:

- **the view that family policy must be seen as a specific policy to support families – regardless of family income In this view, social inequality was not a difference in family income but as a difference in having children or not having children; each child should be treated equally; further, parental leave benefits were portrayed as an unjust policy towards farmers' wives, self-employed women and students.**

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Viewing the problems of families in terms of poverty – especially of lone mothers – and as a lack of possibilities to combine child-care and waged labor for both mothers and for fathers.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

**UWA Unit for Women’s Affairs in the Ministry of Social Security and Generations
None**

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames **None**

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Policy Issues: **Women’s status re: pensions and social security**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
Bureaucratic agency inside the Ministry of Social Security and Generations

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Not available**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **Since the beginning of the new century it is once again in decline and under pressure. The right wing government that came to power in 2000 directly attacked the movement and its projects. Through cuts in funding and symbolic acts the governing parties tried to delegitimize the movement by defining it as separatist, criminal and leftist.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Strong

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Ministry for Security and Generations, Ministry of Finance; The federal parliament (Nationalrat) majority of the governing parties ÖVP and FPÖ; The only outside organizations heard were Conservative family organizations close to the dominant ÖVP and FPÖ.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

ÖVP

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

European Women’s Lobby

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Art. 11, Sec 2.

In order to prevent discrimination against women on the grounds of marriage or maternity and to ensure their effective right to work, States Parties shall take appropriate measures:

c) To encourage the provision of the necessary supporting social services to enable parents to combine family obligations with work responsibilities and participation in public life, in particular through promoting the establishment and development of a network of child-care facilities.

Debate ID: AUT_PR1 1975-1979

Title: Appointing Women to the Cabinet

QUAWPA: Women's Section of Social Democratic Party (WSSDP)

Dates of coding: 12/22/03, 3/03/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Cheryl Benard/Edith Schlaffer, Erica Fischer**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The importance of having women represent women's interests.**

Policy goals: **Pushed for more women in the Cabinet.**

WMA 2

Name: **Frauenzentrum (AUF), Frauenkommunikationszentrum Amerlinghaus, women groups working at university level, women working in autonomous feminist projects.**

Micro-frame:

Issue Definition: **Women need to be represented by women as a group to address the causes of gender-discrimination and promote gender equality in a meaningful way.**

Policy goals: **They were interested in the establishment of autonomous projects on grass root level. They did not concentrate on top down reform policies and state institutions. However, verbally they supported demands for increasing participation of women.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women need to be represented by women as a group to address the causes of gender-discrimination and promote gender equality in a meaningful way.**

Policy goals: **They were interested in the establishment of autonomous projects on grass root level. They did not concentrate on top down reform policies and state institutions. However, verbally they supported demands for increasing participation of women.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Social Democrats accepted the chancellor's proposal for allowing 4 women to serve in his cabinet.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Cheryl Benard/Edith Schlaffer, Erica Fischer**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non Women's Movement**

Activities During the Debate: **Two were prominent feminist social scientists teaching feminist classes at the university and writing in very popular newspaper, they were members of the SPÖ but they were better known as autonomous feminists /Erica Fischer prominent left wing second wave feminist.**

Mobilized with the women's committee in SPÖ to push for the nomination of more women to the cabinet.

WMA 2 Frauentrum (AUF), Frauenkommunikationszentrum Amerlinghaus, women groups working at university level, women working in autonomous feminist projects

Form: Informal organizations

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Women's groups working at university level, women working in autonomous feminist projects mostly informal organizations, no membership, very small informal free standing groups groups more or less connected to SPÖ Frauen (z.B. Frauenhaus – home for battered women) activities: organizing women's nights, campaign against a very well-known sexist journalist, of course these groups brought forward demands for increasing participation of women but more general.

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Only a few months after the 1979 election, Chancellor Kreisky pronounced a cabinet reshuffle dismissing the minister of health; a woman. At this point, women's movement activists directed their demands once more towards the Chancellor and the Social Democratic Party's elite to set an example and choose a woman in his cabinet proposal. In Austria, the cabinet is the most important political institution and the main prize in the political game. Kreisky was well known not only for his charisma but also his sensitivity to hot issues. And political presentation of women was a hot issue in most western countries at that time. He first wanted to expand the cabinet by the recruitment of two female under secretaries of state. Due to the different power brokers, interest groups and traditional wings of the Social Democratic party, this number doubled (at least). Two of the new under secretaries of state were explicitly responsible for women's issues, one for women's affairs in general and one for affairs of working women. For final decision-making, Kreisky presented this proposal to the Social Democratic Party executives and the Social Democratic faction in Parliament.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of injustice toward women in general. Male members of the Social Democratic Party gave lip service to the idea that the party should do more to represent women, but they did little to see that this was carried out or that it was important to have women representing women's interests.

**C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
More representation of women would bring justice toward women in general.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

As the debate progressed, the dominant frame focused on the expansion of the cabinet. Opponents of the Chancellor's plan to expand the cabinet (so that it would

include several female representatives) argued that it was unnecessary and would cost the taxpayers money. The women's section of the Social Democratic party helped to gender the debate. They argued that the official legal equality was not enough to ensure gender equality and that the government would have to take steps to ensure that there was an end to the de facto inequalities between men and women. Throughout its course, the debate became more gendered. Both opponents and proponents of the legislation recognized that female representatives had different perspectives than male representatives. In the end, the gendering focused on the role of the under secretaries in the cabinet. Many in the debate argued that the under secretaries were powerless and often referred to them as housewives. Feminists argued that the chancellor should put women in more powerful positions within the Austrian cabinet, as full secretaries or ministers.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Official legal equality not enough to secure gender equality; government has to take positive steps.**
- **Female representatives have different perspectives than male representatives.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs by Acronym (include QUAWPAs)

The Women's Section of the Social Democratic party (a QUAWPA) pushed for including more women in the cabinet and upper levels of the executive. Women should represent women's interests to promote real gender equality.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA1. Women's Section of the SPÖ (WSSPO)

Women should represent women's interests to promote real gender equality.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1. (WSSPO)

The Women's Section traditionally focused on social and welfare policies; responsible for women's issues in general. There was a change in the 1970s when younger well educated women entered the scene. 1979 the head of the women's section on national level was a more traditionally oriented Social Democrat. But the younger more feminist part of the women's section.

The Women's Section came out in favor of increasing women's political representation and of creating some policy agencies to represent women within the Austrian State.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 (WSSPO)

SPÖ women are organized in a separate women's organization. The Social-Democratic women's organization is constituency-based within the party statute. It is one of the Party's affiliated organizations (other are the Youth organization, the senior people organization). There are women representatives and women groups

on local, regional and national level. Like other women's groups in similar institutions, it holds annual conferences (Bundesfrauenkonferenz) at national level and passes resolutions forwarded to the party's national conferences, where they have direct representation. The national Women's Conference is a forum to articulate concerns and press demands directed at the party elite. The chairwoman of the women's organization is co-opted in the party's highest decision-making body.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Herta Firnberg**

Years in WPA: **1967 – 1981 head of the WPA, activist and member of the SPÖ women's organization as well as the Social Democratic Party since the 1930s, engaged in women issues and organization in the late 1950s and 1960s.**

WMA activities: **As an individual within Social Democratic party.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **In the second half of the century, the women's movement was in a full growth stage. Feminist consciousness expanded, women organized events and activities or set up their own groups at a local level.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job discrimination/Equal pay**
- **Self help/Sexuality**
- **Education**
- **Third world women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No organized countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Social Democratic Party Leadership**
- **Prime Minister and Head of Party Bruno Kreisky**
- **Women's Section of the Social Democratic Party**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democratic party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

The 1975 International Women's Year Conferences

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Not applicable, joined in 1980.

Debate ID: AUT_PR2 1990-93

Title: Equal treatment of men and women in civil service

WPA: Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Dates of coding: 12/23/03, 3/3/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Cross-Party Group of Women MPs (OVP/SPO)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Agreed on the need to diminish the gender inequality and gender specific employment structures as well as gender related pay differentials in general**
 Policy goals: **Agreed to compromise on burden of proof issue, not on employer, but supported all other affirmative action clauses.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section of OVP (People's Party)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Wants to reach de facto equality between men and women**
 Policy goals: **Supported the Minister for women affairs draft – but at least did not accept the affirmative action/shift of burden paragraph because this was against party line.**

WMA3

Name: **Frauenorganisation der SPÖ (SPÖ women's section)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Challenge to male dominated practice deeply connected to bureaucratic structure itself. Women's under-representation in administrative bodies was portrayed to contradict representative democracy.**
 Policy goals: **Demand of affirmative action measures to overcome the effects of past discrimination because removing discriminatory barriers alone will not reach de-facto equality. Membership supported the Minister for Women's Affairs' proposal and draft.**

WMA 4

Name: **Austrian Trade Union Women's Organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **During the debate the Trade Union Women's Organization and its spokeswomen (chairwomen Ingrid Schmidleitner who was also SPÖ) argued that a more moderate version will be fine and that the Minister of women's affairs will risk the whole thing by imposing her will (especially on the dissent matter of shifting the burden of proof).**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: Challenge to male dominated practice deeply connected to bureaucratic structure itself. Women's under-representation in administrative bodies was portrayed to contradict representative democracy.

Policy goals: Demand of affirmative action measures to overcome the effects of past discrimination because removing discriminatory barriers alone will not reach de-facto equality.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The law expressly prohibits both direct and indirect discrimination. Discrimination is defined as any form of non-objective prejudicial treatment.**
- 2. The damages due employees for discriminatory treatment are: up to two months salary for failure to hire, four times the difference between actual monthly remuneration and the higher salary for failure to promote, and at least ATS 5.000,— for cases of sexual harassment.**
- 3. The law lays down a general requirement for positive action in favor of women, which is translated into detailed provisions for the preferential treatment of women in hiring, promotion, training, and further training, etc.**
- 4. In terms of the degree of women's under-representation, the Ministers have to adopt individual plans for the advancement of women within their units followed by detailed reports dedicated to the National Council and Equal Treatment officers to monitor the implementation of the Equal Treatment law and ensure that it will be implemented properly.**
- 5. As a compromise, the negotiating partners agreed on a soft version of this demand. The employer – federal ministries and agencies – would not have to prove non-discrimination of women in cases of conflict. They would only have to elaborate that they did not discriminate women, if requested to do so.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Cross-Party Group of Women MPs (OVP/SPO)

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in floor debate and forged cross-party compromise on the final law.**

WMA 2 Women's Section of OVP (People's Party)

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Within non women's movement organization (Party)**

Activities During the Debate: **High priority of this WMA, promoted the draft in general, formed a cross-party women's network in parliament with female MPs of the SPÖ and the Greens on the whole equal treatment package the Minister of women affairs (SPÖ) initiated and formulated. In pre-parliamentary negotiations they argued against the shift of burden paragraph and argued that the Minister of women affairs will risk the whole thing by insisting on the shift of burden to prove paragraph.**

WMA 3 Frauenorganisation der SPÖ (SPÖ women's section)**Form: Formal organization****Location: Within non women's movement organization (Party)****Activities During the Debate: Formed cross party women's network in parliament; This WMA was not able to push through this more feminist demand against other wings (especially the business wing/affiliated association of business men which is another affiliated or sub-organization of the ÖVP and often dominates the official Party line.****WMA 4 Austrian Trade Union Women's Organization****Form: Formal organization****Location: Within non women's movement organization (union)****Activities During the Debate: During the debate the Trade Union Women's Organization and its spokeswomen (chairwomen Ingrid Schmidleitner who was also SPÖ) argued that a more moderate version will be fine and that the Minister of women's affairs will risk the whole thing by imposing her will (especially on the dissent matter of shifting the burden of proof).****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate****Courts did not traditionally play an important role in Austrian politics. However, in December 1990 the Constitutional Court made a momentous decision. According to Austrian pension law, women can retire at 60, men at 65. This is to compensate for prior disadvantages related to women's familial duties. The Constitutional Court decided to remove this paragraph from the pension law because they deemed it incompatible with the general principle of equality laid down in the Austrian constitution. Taking into account the Constitutional Court's decision, government was obliged to prepare a draft on the reform of the pension law. The secretary of state for women's affairs took up this point and used the Court's judgment as an opportunity to force government to introduce measures to minimize the inequality of men and women in economic and social life.****C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate****In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of democracy and proponents of the legislation argued that the under representation of women in the bureaucracy was an affront to representative democracy. Nearly all participants agreed that there was a need to feminize the bureaucracy and include more women in it. Proponents of the legislation recognized that there were more men in the government and they argued the legislation would take steps toward establishing defacto equality between women and men.****C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate**

- **Under representation of women in public bureaucracy is affront to representative democracy**
- **Need to feminize the bureaucracy and include more women to establish defacto equality between women and men.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through its course, the debate remained focused on representation and increasing the number of women in the Austrian bureaucracy. Additionally, the debate became more gendered. In calling for objective criterion for hiring civil servants, proponents of the new legislation challenged traditional gender power structures. Traditionally, civil service appointments were controlled by men, and often times the men would rely on good old boy types of networks and patronage types of politics. There was much disagreement over how to make women more equal to men. Proponents of the legislation argued in favor of an affirmative action program that would actively recruit and hire women, while opponents of the legislation argued that this affirmative action would lead to reverse discrimination against men and a shift of the burden of proof to employers.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Challenging traditional gender power structures**
- **View of civil service appointments controlled by men and old boy networks**
- **Proposals to have affirmative action to over come this tradition; opposed as reverse discrimination against men.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

The Ministry was a major proponent of the equality legislation and argued that the state should take positive steps to ensure the inclusion of more women in the bureaucracy. De-facto equality was the dominant goal, raising taboo question – for instance, sexual harassment. challenge to old boys networks and patronage politics, wanted to feminize bureaucracy. Th introduction of affirmative action measures to overcome gender related job segregation.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

De-facto equality as dominant goal, raising taboo question – for instance, sexual harassment. challenge to old boys networks and patronage politics, wanted to feminize bureaucracy. Introduction of affirmative action measures to overcome gender related job segregation.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

All women’s issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

The Ministry was located within the Chancellery and had a moderate administrative capacity with a medium sized staff and a moderate budget. It was member of the Ministers’ Council, held a veto right in the Ministers’ Council meaning that it could stop all governmental drafts.

The Federal Ministry of Women's Affairs was a national level women's policy office that was free standing and not attached to other governmental agencies. The Ministry of Women's Affairs had expanded status and had the right to veto some issues in the Cabinet of Ministers.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Name: **Johanna Dohnal**

Years in WPA: **1979 - 1990 Secretary of State for Women's Affairs, 1990 – 1995**

Minister of Women's affairs (the Secretary of State becomes an Ministry).

WMA activities: **Head of the Women's Commission of the SPO 1987 - 1995—counted as a women's movement actor. Also in close contact with autonomous feminist women's groups and projects.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **In the 1990s the women's movement was consolidated but fragmented. Women had successfully entered bureaucracy; the number of women's projects with regular state support had increased. Femocrats were working on a regional and local level to implement women's offices and programs.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet—SPÖ/ ÖVP: Minister of Women's Affairs: Minister's Council**
- **Minister of administration and administrative reform**
- **Parliament MPs**
- **Austrian Trade Union Federation**
- **Austrian Business League**
- **Civil Servants Trade Union**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The SPO held the majority during the debate and formed a coalition with the OVP (Austrian People's Party) as a junior partner.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

EU Women in Decision-Making TAN

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: AUT_PR3 1994-99

Title: Gendering Public Party Finance

WPA: Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Dates of coding: 12/23/03, 3/03/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Madeleine Petrovich: chair woman of the green party as well as leader of the Green's Parliamentary faction or club. MP's of the Green party.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The problem was defined in terms of democratic representation. Many members of the Green party supported solutions that would increase the number of women in the Austrian government and Parliament, so that it would better represent women.**

Policy goals: **Many members of the Green party supported the policy to link party financing to the percentage of women that each party supported in parliament.**

WMA 2

Name: **Individual Representatives of the Social Democratic Party Women's Organization Ilse Merkel (MP), Elisabeth Hlavac (MP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Ambivalent because the male dominated parties would send Alibi-women to avoid financial loss. It is up to the parties to attract women and to increase the number of women on electoral lists.**

WMA 3

Name: **MPs of the People's party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They support the demand to increase the number of women's MPs but not by linking party finance and women's representation in the Parliament.**

Policy goals: **No force, no legislative intervention, gender should not matter in politics, self-regulation.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section of the Social Democratic party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Increase women's representation**

Policy goals: **They supported the demand to increase the number of female MPs but not by linking party finance and the number of female MPs. They argued that it is rather parties' interest to catch votes (of the female electorate) that should govern recruitment practice than legislative intervention.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: The problem was defined in terms of democratic representation. Many members of the Green party supported solutions that would increase the number of women in the Austrian government and Parliament, so that it would better represent women.

Policy goals: Many members of the Green party supported the policy to link party financing to the percentage of women that each party supported in parliament.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **No change in law**
2. **The position which prevailed was that mandatory measures such as party linking rules were not necessary to achieve equal representation of men and women.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Madeleine Petrovich: chair woman of the green party as well as leader of the Green's Parliamentary faction or club. MP's of the Green Party

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization (parliament)

Activities During the Debate: Initiated and supported the private members bill and tried to gender the debate on public party finance, no big activities outside the Parliamentary beside newspaper articles.

WMA 2 Individual Representatives of the Social Democratic Party Women's Organization Ilse Merkel (MP), Elisabeth Hlavac (MP)

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization (MPs in parliament)

Activities: Social Democrat MPs who took position in public.

WMA 3 MPs of the People's party

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization (MPs in parliament)

Activities: Active in parliament and speaking in public.

WMA 4 Women's Section of the Social Democratic party

Form: Formal organization

Location: In non women's movement organization (SD party)

Activities: Active only inside parliament through MPs; supported idea of increasing women in parliament, but not through party financing; opposed Green party bill.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the aftermath of the 1994 federal election the trend towards increasing the number of female MPs stopped for the first time since the 1970s. The two major parties, the SPÖ and the ÖVP, sent fewer women to parliament in response to their loss of seats. Women's participation in legislature declined from its peak of 25.14% in March 1994 to 21.85% in 1995. Women also

remain vastly underrepresented in elective office at a regional and local level. (Male) party officials publicly agreed to the need to emphasize women's political representation, but increasing the number of women in decision making bodies was not their primary interest. Facing the failure of the party elites to support women as candidates and office holders, at a conference on women and politics in 1994, the chairwoman of the Green Fraction, Madeleine Petrovich, announced that she would draft and propose a Private Member's Bill on the subject. An additional clause to Party law and other related laws, proposed that 15% of public subsidies would be contingent on the number of female representatives proportional to the population. Additionally, public party finances should account for concrete action plans and training programs to promote women. Shortly after the first reading of the draft, the cabinet resigned and re-elections took place. Thus, in 1996 the Greens started a new parliamentary initiative by introducing a similar draft on public party finances and the advancement of women. They also brought forth an entire set of additional demands, e.g., more family-friendly National Council session times and a public kindergarten for the children of MPs and parliamentary staff.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Initially debate was framed on the one hand by the necessity of austerity measures to consolidate the federal budget and on the other, the coalition parties' demands to increase public party financing. An increase of state subsidies to political parties did not seem appropriate at a time of budgetary restraint. The debate over subsidies to parties made no specific reference to men or women, until the private members bill was introduced.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

After the private members bill on linking public financing to parties to quotas of women in elections was introduced, women were the major participants in the debate; nearly all agreed that there was a need to increase the number of women in parliament, so that there would be greater democratic representation of women, however they disagreed on the ways that this should be accomplished. Proponents of the private member bill argued that quotas for the percentage of women on party tickets were a desirable way to increase female representation, while opponents to this argued that parties should base their candidate choices on who would get the most votes, and not on gender. The debate was gendered, as it focused on surmounting the barriers to women's representation throughout; some identified women's low position to be a byproduct of the division of labor in the home. Throughout the debate remained focused on increasing women's representation and on the values of using quotas throughout. Proponents of the quota system argued that it would break down traditionally male dominated political nomination methods (which involved choosing party members from the prominent social

partners) .Opponents of the quota system argued that it would encourage the appointment of token women and would not ensure that they would be good (high quality) candidates for office.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Need to increase female representation in parliament**
- **Focus on how to surmount barriers faced by women**
- **Quotas as a means of breaking down traditional male domination**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

Did not take a position on party financing and women’s promotion; in general wants to increase women’s political representation but not by measures of party finance because this proposal was a proposal of MPs of the Green party and the Minister was appointed by the SPÖ. Attempting to avoid conflict with both the SPÖ party executive and also the coalition party (the ÖVP), the minister refused to take a position on public party finances and women’s quota.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist micro Frames

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

Not applicable (took no position)

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

- **WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)**
- **Multi-issue. Coordinated the Government’s general policy ensuring that women’s political objectives are taken into account – horizontal policy on women, can propose laws, supporting programs or measures for women,**
- **Did not provoke debates on hot issues, active commitment to improve childcare structures.**
- **All women’s issues at federal level**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

The Ministry of Women's Affairs is in the Federal Chancellery, a high level agency that was close to centers of power and had a veto right in the minister's council.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MWA)

Name and years: 1994-1998 there were 3 heads. 1990-1995 the minister was Johanna Dohnal. 1996-1997 the minister was Helga Konrad and 1997-1999 the minister was Barbara Prammer.

WMA activity: Spokespersons and functionaries of the SPÖ women’s section.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and Source: **In the 1990s the women's movement was consolidated but fragmented. Women had successfully entered bureaucracy; the number of women's projects with regular state support had increased. Femocrats were working on a regional and local level to implement women's offices and programs.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Private Members Bill, proposed by a minority party –Green Party**
- **Parliament**
- **Political party decision makers**
- **National Council – Equality Committee**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The SPO held a majority and was in a coalition with the OVP as a junior partner.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **EU/Council of Europe TAN on Women in Decision-making:**
- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **European Women's Lobby**
- **UN TAN on Women's Political Representation**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

(a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;

(b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;

(c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.

Debate ID: AUT_PT1 1984

Title: Penal Code Amendment on Pimping

WPA: Women's State Secretary (WSS)

Dates of coding: 12/22/03, 3/03/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

None

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The new law made living from a sex worker's money a punishable criminal act.**
2. **The new law distinguished four categories of criminal pimping:**
 - a. **simple pimping describes a relationship in which a person utilizes prostitutes earnings for their own purpose**
 - b. **pimping with the intent of exploitation and intimidation**
 - c. **prohibition of gangs of pimps**
 - d. **intimidation with the intent to discourage women from getting out of prostitution is prohibited.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

None

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In early 1982, the Austrian High Court ruled that pimps should be prosecuted not only if they 'exploit' prostitutes, but also if they utilize prostitutes' money for their own purposes. This decision spurred the legislature into action. On 18 October 1982, the Federal Ministry of Justice organised a conference on prostitution and pimping in Vienna. The conference paved the way for the debate on a new Penal Code, increasing publicity of the issue. Administrative workers, police, health, and medical officers as well as public prosecutors, governors from the provinces and academic experts attended the conference. In 1983, eight out of nine provinces supported the proposed restrictions of the Penal Code. When the SPÖ formed a coalition with the pre-Haider FPÖ (who were also the 'law and order' faction) in 1983, the way opened for the proposed restrictions. Harald Ofner, the new FPÖ Minister of Justice, provided the legislative backing. On 29 November 1983, the governing parties presented the bill to the Parliament, that passed the restrictive law that very day. The new Penal Code came into effect in 1984.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the parliamentary debate on the new law centered on a law and order discourse. Neighborhood safety and keeping the streets clean were the main objectives by OVP and conservative Social Democrats. A group of leftist Social

Democrats presented prostitution as a class problem. The logic of their arguments also included a punishment of pimps. In this debate, proponents sought to use new legislation to outlaw pimping.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on outlawing pimping and also became gendered in two ways. One gendered issue was the criminal action of pimps, who were primarily perceived as men who make a living from exploiting prostitutes. Yet within this whole discourse, prostitutes were not addressed specifically as being women . . . Another dominant gendered frame was the polarization of normal women and prostitutes. An OVP member of Parliament even went as far as claiming to protect innocent women against johns, pimps, and prostitutes through clamping down on the legal situation of prostitutes and pimps.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Pimps are men who exploit prostitutes (although no mention that prostitutes are women).**
- **Polarization of normal women and prostitutes; innocent women need protection from pimps and prostitutes.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WPA did not take a position on the debate.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
The Women's State Secretary had a focus on issues that affected women. The State Secretary took positions on abortion, equal pay and discrimination in the workplace.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
The Women's State Secretary was situated in the Federal Chancellory and had a small staff and no independent budget. Located in the upper echelons of the national political hierarchy.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Johanna Dohnal**

Years in WPA **1979-90; then Women's Affairs minister**

WMA activities: **Active in Social Democrat women's organization**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The Austrian movement only slowly mobilised, mainly around the issue of abortion. In the 1980s, it expanded and became more of a project-oriented movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Job Discrimination/equal pay**
- **Violence against women**
- **Rape**
- **Women and Academia**
- **Third World Women**
- **Political Representation**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of Justice with authorities and experts**
- **The Parliamentary Committee on Justice**
- **Provincial Governments**
- **Experts**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Social Democratic Party (SPO) was in the majority in coalition with FPO

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: AUT_PT2 1991-1992

Title: Vienna's prostitution law 1991

WPA: Vienna Councillor for Women's Affairs (VCWA)

Dates of coding: 12/22/03, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Gudrun Hauer, AIDS Group Vienna**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work, not only forced work; acknowledgement as work,**

Policy Goals: **Fighting for good working conditions, social security and women's rights.**

WMA 2

Name: **LEFÖ**

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work, not only forced work; acknowledgement as work,**

Policy Goals: **Fighting for good working conditions, social security and women's rights.**

WMA 3

Name: **Austrian Organizations of Prostitutes**

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work, not only forced work; acknowledgement as work,**

Policy Goals: **Fighting for good working conditions, social security and women's rights.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work, not only forced work; acknowledgement as work.**

Policy Goals: **Fighting for good working conditions, social security and women's rights.**

NOTE: this position is feminist in that it promotes gender equality and improves the status of women as sex workers.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Vienna's prostitution law section 2 not longer defined prostitution in moral terms, as a sex offence, but as professional sex acts.**
2. **Aside from some exceptions, such as prostitution of minors, prostitution was permitted.**
3. **Zoning laws were set up. Street prostitution within the vicinity of 150 m from schools, youth centers, playgrounds hospitals, churches, and stations was prohibited.**

4. **Prostitution in bars and private apartments remained illegal, whereas sex work in clients apartments became legal.**
5. **The law permitted brothels or houses where only prostitutes live**
6. **The new law guaranteed more privacy rights for prostitutes. A new requirement was that prostitution records must be destroyed within six months after canceling registration with the police.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Gudrun Hauer, AIDS Group Vienna

Form: **Individual**

Location: **AIDS group, Vienna; formal Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote articles on the issue in feminist/movement journals.**

WMA 2 LEFÖ

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **LEFÖ only started debate and counseling prostitutes from Latin America.**

WMA 3 Austrian Organizations of Prostitutes

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Austrian Organization of Prostitutes (VPÖ); lobbying, putting the issue on the public agenda.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Because of the ban on prostitution in flats, street prostitution was on the rise after the fall of the 'Iron Curtain', and numerous sex bars and clubs were established. Due to these issues, prostitution received public attention as the media jumped at the chance to report on the topic. In 1987, members of the opposition party ÖVP in the Council of Vienna proposed a bill that aimed to put restraints on Vienna's Prostitution Law of 1984. The main objective was to limit street and bar prostitution, both of which were perceived as 'secret prostitution'. The Council did not vote on the bill. It was only in 1988, during the new legislative period, that a parliamentary commission on the matter was formed with members from the SPÖ, ÖVP and FPÖ.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and was framed in terms of a public health issue prompted by earlier AIDS debates. Although the debate was largely not gendered, in the beginning it did focus on prostitutes, and it portrayed them as immoral and at high risk for diseases. With regard to policy suggestions, the policy solution reflected in the media and parliamentary debates aimed to reduce the number of prostitutes on the streets, encourage registration with the police, and

urge prostitutes to go to the weekly health checks. Also counseling and assistance in finding another profession dominated the content of the debate.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of public health and it was not gendered. Gender sensitive ideas were still rare in the debate on Vienna's prostitution law.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WPA 1: **VSWA None**

C5A_3—WPA feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1: **The Vienna Stadtratin of Women's Affairs focused on a number of women's issues including equal opportunity, employment, violence against women, and beginning in the late 80s, prostitution. Together with family and youth issues, sport Women's issues were one issue among others.**
Policy Issues: **Family and youth, sport**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
WPA 1 **The Department had very limited administrative capacity, having no personnel and finances at its disposal.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
WPA 1:
Name: **Christine Schirmer, Ingrid Smejkal (from 1991)**
Years in WPA: **Schirmer: 3, Smejkal 5**
WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and Source: **In the late 1980s and early 1990s, the Vienna women's movement had reached its zenith and was a bustling project-oriented movement. Many women's projects in Vienna were state-subsidised, mainly by the municipality, for instance the mayor's office, and the Department of Women's Affairs.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The municipal department for elections and various legal matters.**
- **A party commission composed of members from the SPO, OVP, and FPO.**
- **AIDS organizations**
- **Social workers and gynecologists from the Health Department of the City of Vienna**
- **The Vice Squad.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

There was a proportional government including the Social Democratic Party (SPO) Austrian Peoples Party (OVP), the and the FPO. The leader of the Viennese government was a Social Democrat and there was a SPO-OVP majority in the cities governing body.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: AUT_PT3 1997

Title: Social Insurance Law Amendment on Private Enterprise

WPA: Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Dates of coding: 12/22/03, 3/03/03, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Lateinamerikanische emigrierte Frauen in Osterreich (LEFO) Vienna:**

Lilith: Vienna

MAIZ city of Graz

LENA, City of LINZ

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **All groups framed the issue as discrimination of women as obstructing prostitutes in doing their work**

Policy goals: **The LEFO and all the other groups advocated allowing prostitutes into the social insurance program.**

WMA 2

Name: **VPO Prostitutes union**

Micro frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work**

Policy goals: **Urgency to let prostitutes into social insurance scheme.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue frame: **Discrimination against women and obstructing prostitutes in doing their work**

Policy goals: **Allow prostitutes into the social insurance program**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The new law did not take sex workers explicitly into consideration, but regulated precarious self employed workers.**
2. **The new law expanded the previously limited definition of private enterprise to include sex workers. The new legislation on social insurance recognized prostitution as a form of work, even though it was regarded as coercive and immoral work.**
3. **Prostitutes were now eligible for enrollment in the social insurance system.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Lateinamerikanische emigrierte Frauen in Osterreich (LEFO) Vienna:**

Lilith: Vienna

Form: **Formal organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The LEFO participated in the debate by acting as expert advisors and interacting with the Ministry of Women's Affairs, the Minister**

of Labor and Social Affairs, and with members of parliament. Others were counseling prostitutes in their cities.

WMA 2 VPO Prostitutes union

Form: Formal

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Lobbied political parties and government agencies and interacted with women's state secretary.

C2A_2 — Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

SPÖ Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare remained inactive on the issue until 1997. On July 11, 1997, parliament members of the LIF and Green Party petitioned to the Minister of Labor, Health and Social Welfare, Eleonore Hostasch, to act on the issue of social insurance for prostitutes. In late 1997, the 'Forum for the Rights of Prostitutes' (*Plattform für die Rechte von Prostituierten*) was founded by members of the Green and Liberal Parties in collaboration with other organizations offering counseling to prostitutes. The initial cause for the Forum was the conservative government members' attempts to pose further restrictions on the Viennese prostitution law. It organized public events with prostitutes, members of the parliament and with women's groups in Vienna's city centre. They publicly demanded government action, raising the issues of social security and recognition of prostitution as an enterprise or as regular employed work.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning of the debate (since 1983), the debate was not gendered at all; it was the question of taxing prostitution and justice in taxing all work, including sex work; but not gendered. Prostitutes were seen as normal workers that should receive coverage. Additionally, the 'social work frame' saw that prostitutes were often exploited by pimps and others and that they did not always choose prostitution as a line of work.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end of the debate the question of discrimination of women (prostitutes) came to the sub-system: Women (prostitutes) paying taxes but are not allowed to subscribe for state social security;

Over its course, the debate became gendered and focused on the idea that failure to treat prostitutes as workers was sex discrimination. They should be included in the social security system. Members of the Green party and Social Democratic party added more gendered frames to the debate. Social Democrats criticized the current social security for doing social injustice to women by not including prostitutes in the social security system. Social Democrats argued that prostitutes often had poor working conditions and that they should be entitled to social insurance and retirement benefits. Green party members attacked the double standard of holding

prostitutes (and not clients, who were men) responsible for spreading diseases. Further, Green Party members argued that prostitutes should have equal rights with other workers.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Failure to treat prostitutes as sex workers is sex discrimination;**
- **Current social security system does injustice to women;**
- **Double standard of holding prostitutes but not male clients responsible for spreading diseases;**
- **Prostitutes should have equal rights with other workers**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Framed the issue as discrimination of women as obstructing prostitutes in doing their work. Advocated allowing prostitutes into the social insurance program.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Framed the issue as discrimination of women as obstructing prostitutes in doing their work. Advocated allowing prostitutes into the social insurance program.

NOTE: Prostitution as sex work focuses on equality and rights of prostitutes against male pimps.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

All issues that affected women; supported VPO on the issue. Women's issues and consumer issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

National level women's policy office that was free standing and not attached to other governmental agencies. The Ministry of Women's Affairs had expanded status and had the right to veto some issues in the Cabinet of Ministers.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Name and years in WPA: **Johanna Dohnal (1990-1995), Helga Konrad (1995-1997), Barbara Prammer (1997-2000)**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **By the mid-1990s, the autonomous women's movement was consolidated and it changed strategy and focus.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women**
- **Equal pay**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Women in academia.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The legislative, the executive, and the social partnership formed the policy sub-system.**
- **Federal Social Insurance Agency**
- **Vienna Chamber of Commerce**
- **Trade section of the Ministry of Commerce**
- **Ministry of Labor**
- **Union of Arts, Media and Free Enterprise**
- **Parliament.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The majority was controlled by a SPO (Social Democrat)- OVP (Austrian People's Party) coalition.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAMPEP (European organizations for counseling of prostitutes)**
- **Femmigation**
- **Human Rights Watch,**
- **OSZE,**
- **Terre des Femmes**
- **Women Watch**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: State parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: BEL_AB1 1974-1976

Title: State Commission for Ethical Problems

WPA: Consultative Commission on the Status of Women (CCSW)

Dates of coding: 5/07/03, 10/03/03, 12/01/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **'Dolle Mina' (Flemish Marxist movement)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **Pluralistic Action Groups Equal Opportunities for Men and Women (PAG)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **Marie Mineur**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 4

Name: **National Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 5

Name: **Vrouwen Overleg Komitee (Women's Consultation Committee)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 6

Name: **Women's Section in the Socialist party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.

Policy Goals: Decriminalize/legalize abortion.

WMA 7

Name: **Women's Section of the Christian Democrat party: Vrouw en Maatschappij**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: Against legal abortion on social and economic grounds.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name **'Dolle Mina' (Flemish Marxist movement)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.

Policy Goals: Decriminalize abortion.

WMA2

Name **Pluralistic Action Groups Equal Opportunities for Men and Women (PAG)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.

Policy Goals: Decriminalize abortion.

WMA 3

Name: **Marie Mineur**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.

Policy Goals: Decriminalize abortion.

WMA 4

Name: **National Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.

Policy Goals: Decriminalize abortion.

WMA 5

Name: *Vrouwen Overleg Komitee (Women's Consultation Committee)*

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 6

Name: **Women's Section in the Socialist party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy Goals: **Decriminalize/legalize abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The government's decision to pass the discussion over to parliament was, in fact, a non-decision. In 1977 the government decided to postpone its own decision and handed the reports over to the United Commission of Justice and National Health of the Senate, a temporary combination of two standing committees, to decide the question. This played into the hands of the advocates of delay: the discussions in the Senate commission would take 14 years, and during this period the 1867 law remained on the books undisturbed. Major substantive components:**
 - a. **abortion remained a crime against family order and morality**
 - b. **both women and doctors punished along with other accomplices**
 - c. **publicity for abortion, drugs banned**

But abortions were performed in Belgium despite the criminal status.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **'Dolle Mina' (Flemish Marxist movement)**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Membership: about 20 members; Part of Second-wave movement, did not participate directly in the sub-system; took a public position on abortion.**

WMA 2 **Pluralistic Action Groups Equal Opportunities for Men and Women (PAG)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Membership: 400 members. Part of Second-wave movement, did not participate directly in the sub-system; took a public position on abortion.**

WMA 3 Marie MineurForm: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No real members—informal; Part of Second-wave movement, did not participate directly in the sub-system; took a public position on abortion.**

WMA 4 National Women's CouncilForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Membership: 500 individual members + 33 affiliated associations. Older umbrella organization, founded in 1905. Part of Second-wave movement, did not participate directly in the sub-system; took a public position on abortion.**

WMA 5 *Vrouwen Overleg Komitee* (Women's Consultation Committee)Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Umbrella organization, founded in 1972. Part of Second-wave movement, did not participate directly in the sub-system; took a public position on abortion.**

WMA 6 Women's Section in the Socialist partyForm: **Formal organization**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Formal WM organization within the Socialist party: SVV/FPS: health care and socio-cultural orientation. SV/FS: political organization (only formally part of the socialist party since 1980)Membership SVV/FPS: 630.000 membersNo information on membership SV/FS. Did not participate in sub-system.**

WMA 7 Women's Section of the Christian Democrat party: *Vrouw en Maatschappij*Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Formal women's movement organization within the CD party. *Vrouw en Maatschappij*: 1974 – Membership: less than 2000. Did not participate in sub-system.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1973, Dr. Willy Peers was imprisoned after admitting that he had performed abortions in defiance of the 1867 law. While the Belgian Family Planning Association had been speaking out against the restrictive laws since 1955, it was not until the Peers affair that a large-scale mobilization took place. This coincided with the formation of a new government coalition between Christian Democrats and Liberals. Abortion, together with birth control, was one of the main issues during the negotiations around the formation of the new

government. Because of other urgent political problems between the two language communities, three traditional parties— the Liberals, Socialists, and Christian Democrats- were keen to come to an agreement with regard to abortion. The liberal Minister of Justice Vanderpoorten was put in charge of preparing a proposal for the revision of the abortion law, which turned out to be unacceptable to the Christian Democrats and the Socialists. In 1974, the government fell and in the same year a new coalition without the Socialists decided to found a State Commission for Ethical Problems (SEP), composed of 'experts'. The Mission of the SEP was to provide the government with advice concerning birth control, the anonymity of the mother when giving birth, and abortion. Simultaneously, an agreement was reached with the magistracy in order to establish a serene political climate: there were to be no more prosecutions of abortion violations during 1974-7.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Both reports defined the abortion issue as a fundamental matter of ethics. According to the majority report, the complete juridical ban on abortion and the abortion taboo caused abortions to take place away from a sphere of responsible and conscious ethical reasoning and conduct. First of all, the problem of the failure or unavailability of contraceptives needed to be tackled in order to reduce the abortion cases to a 'residue'. Secondly, the existing law was unjust. Abortions must be made legal not only to reduce the medical risks for women, but also to reduce inequality between those who have the financial means to obtain safe abortions on the one hand and those who are in a less 'fortunate' situation on the other hand. The minority report was based on the notion that the abortion problem reflected a conflict of values and interests conflict between the respect for the human life on one side and the health and happiness of women, family well being, and the survival of society on the other side.

The majority proposal stipulated that abortion should not be considered a crime as long as circumstances posed a severe and long-term threat to the physical, psychological and social well being of women. Decision making about abortion should be the responsibility of 'the woman together with the physician, after consulting the support team'. The woman had to decide herself whether her husband or partner had a say in the matter. The majority report emphasized the need to provide support and assistance, in the form of information, comfort and encouragement, to the woman who wanted to terminate a pregnancy. Although the report called for a one week waiting period before getting an abortion, and the support team could discuss 'alternative solutions' (read as: hand over for adoption), as well as contraceptive methods, the intent of the majority was that this service should be 'neutral', not a would-be court. The majority saw that the abortion issue needed to be integrated into a consistent and broad policy on responsible parenthood and education, a child-focused culture policy and a birth control policy. It was these stipulations concerning the assistance service that encouraged the two Christian-democratic women on the committee to sign the majority report.

The recommendation of the minority report was to maintain criminalized abortion, except when (1) the continuation of the pregnancy would jeopardize the life of the woman, (2) it is known for certain that it may cause serious, remaining harm to the physical and mental health of the woman, and (3) an abortion could not be avoided insofar as all the conditions as required by law were taken into account. Although the report of the twelve stated that the final decision should be made by the woman herself, in fact, the proposal gave the power to decide to the physician, with few exceptions. Since, according to this proposal, abortion would be legal only in cases where there were medical indications, the woman's decision came down to following her doctors advice or continuing the pregnancy to full term, in spite of medical risks. Like the majority report, the report of the twelve also emphasized providing relief and aid, as well as advice against abortion. It judged that the legislator was not capable of dealing with the matter of illegal abortions because this would imply that illegal abortions were simply transferred to the category of legal abortions which, according to the signers, did not resolve the fundamental problem as such.

To sum up, we can state that the different interpretations of the ethical problem of the abortion situation (as a result of the 1867 law) also gave rise to different solutions: the majority report wanted to adjust the law both to facilitate birth control/family planning and to reduce illegal abortions; the minority report wanted to establish the ethical principle of the right to life of the fetus as paramount except where the woman's right to life was endangered.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Gender ideas were present in the report of the thirteen and absent in the report of the twelve, but in both reports it took—at least at certain points—the shape of a paternalistic approach towards women. By taking the overall living conditions of women into account and attributing autonomy to women, the majority report considered the abortion issue to be primarily a female problem. In addition, it considered psychological and sociological as well as medical reasons acceptable as an indication for abortion. According to this approach, the woman, admittedly in close consultation with her physician, had the right to self-assess her state and decide if abortion would be the right decision. It was recognized, however, that this right to decide might frequently be curtailed because of external pressure—moral, economic and cultural dependence on the partner, employer or family—that forced her to end the pregnancy. The assumption that the abortion issue was a matter of specific importance to women was also made clear that assistance services had to be offered by a committee composed by an equal number of men and women.

The image of women presented by policy actors was rather paternalistic. For example, despite assurances about a woman's autonomy, the majority report allowed her decision to have an abortion only *with* the physician and *after* consulting the support team. The minority report went even further down this line by stating that the physician should have the last word and that those providing assistance must play a role in discouraging abortions. Hence, neither of the reports gave the woman the absolute right to an independent decision. Her role was on the same

level (majority report) or even on a lower level (minority report), with respect to the physician's decisional power. Both reports would give her the right to visit another physician if the first rejected her request. Finally, all SEP members agreed that 'abortion according to one's needs is not a sign of the emancipation of women' reinforcing their paternalistic construction of the woman in the debate.

C3A_3—Issue frame at the End of the Debate.

The SEP published these two conflicting reports with regard to abortion reform; the policy outcome was, however, no change in the 1867 law. The dominant frame of debate had changed little from the beginning, that is, abortion was defined in terms of ethics, the values and interests involved in making the abortion decision and, as a result of that, the degree to which abortion could be legalized. It was clear, however, that all parties were in favor of some sort of amendment of the law, and the majority and minority reports presented two alternatives: either a partial decriminalization with socio-psychological conditions or a legalization of the therapeutic abortion for medical reasons.

C3A_4—List of gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the end of the debate
Same as during the debate, see above.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1— Consultative Commission for the Status of Women (CCSW)

Did not take a position on abortion during the debate.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 -CCSW

Preparation for International Women Conferences, assisting Minister of Foreign Affairs in determining Belgian attitude toward problems concerning the status of women; give advice concerning status of women in international agenda. Focused on creation of new jobs, equal pay for equal work; more political involvement; did not touch subject of abortion or birth control. Policy areas 'Health', 'Violence against Women and Children', 'New Action Programma' (European Commission), 'Third World'.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 -CCSW

The 26 members of the WPA are appointed by the Minister of Foreign Affairs. 20 of them are recruited from 'political and social milieus', 5 are nominated by the Minister of the Self-Employed, the Minister of Employment, the Minister of Justice, Minister of Social Affairs, Minister of Public Health and Family, and 1 member is a cabinet member or a civil servant of the Cabinet/Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Low in the hierarchy of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs: advise, preparation and follow-up of official standpoint.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 CCSW

Mieke Coene (1975-1976, Head)

The chairs of the WPA are femocrats. Mieke Coene was related to the Flemish Christian-Democratic milieu.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Many autonomous women's organizations had their origin in the so called Feminist Second Wave during the 1970s. Many integrated organizations were founded as well.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equal Treatment before the Law**
- **Political Representation**
- **Childcare and reproduction**
- **Social justice (poverty, equal pay, pensions)**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

In this phase of the abortion debate there was no *active* countermovement. Pro Vita (formal organization) had formed as a result of the first reform proposal of the socialist Calewaert in 1971. This organization opposed all forms of abortion, but during the 1974-76 debate its activities were still simmering.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Government and coalition parties (Christian Democrats and Liberal Parties); members of the SEP.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

During the debate, Belgium was governed by a coalition of Christian Democrats and Liberals.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

DK

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Did not ratify until 1985.

Debate ID: BEL_AB2 1981-1982

Title: Detiege bill to suspend prosecution

WPA: Consultative Commission for the Status of Women (CCSW)

Dates of coding: 4/01/03, 9/13/03, 3/1/04, 12/12/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Leona Detiege; feminist member of parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Right of self determination for women; correct traditional image of woman**

Policy goals: **End prosecution of abortions.**

WMA 2

Name : **Umbrella organization of autonomous women's organizations: Fem-Soc movement; Women's Consultation Committee; National Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the Socialist party: SVV/FPS and Socialistsche Vrouwen/Femmes Socialist**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Pro legalization of abortion.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women in Christian Democratic party: Vrouw en Maatschappij/Femmes PSC**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Social and economic grounds opposed to abortion**

Policy goals: **Against legal abortion.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Leona Detiege; feminist member of parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Right of self determination for women; correct traditional image of woman**

Policy goals: **End prosecution of abortions.**

WMA 2

Name : **Umbrella organization of autonomous women's organizations: Fem-Soc movement; Women's Consultation Committee; National Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Abortion remained criminalized; crime against the person.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Leona Detiege; Feminist member of parliament**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Tried to influence other members of parliament.**

WMA 2 **Umbrella organization of autonomous women's organizations: Fem-Soc movement; Women's Consultation Committee; National Women's Council**

Form: **Free standing**

Location: **Informal women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Formal women's organizations inside informal networks.**

WMA 3 **Women's Section of the Socialist party: SVV/FPS and Socialistsche Vrouwen/Femmes Socialist**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate:

WMA 4 **Women in Christian Democratic party: Vrouw en Maatschappij/Femmes PSC**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate:

C2A_2 —Information on the Beginning of the Debate

After the expiration of the 1974-7 'judicial cease fire', the public prosecutor resumed prosecutions in 1978 and trials in 1981. The conflict over reform of the law increased, as, in reaction to this renewed judicial activity, individual Members of Parliament submitted suspension bills trying to breach the political impasse. By June 1982, the Parliamentary Commission of Justice, a standing committee had four bills on its agenda. The first three bills provided for suspension of the law authorizing the prosecution of abortion; the fourth one, submitted by socialist MP Detiege bill was the most far- reaching proposal to date concerning the self- determination of women.

In order to pool support, MPs supporting reform sided with the bill for a three- year suspension of the law put forth by MP Risopoulus, a member of the Francophone Communal Party (FDF). For the first time, success in reform of the criminal abortion law seemed possible. However, the Liberal Party was divided over strategy. Some thought that if a temporary suspension were accepted in the Chamber, a parallel liberal bill would not stand a chance in the Senate. The Risopolous bill was defeated by a slight margin in the Parliamentary Commission. Later, in 1981 and 1982, Detiege submitted a suspension bill. Subsequent parliamentary deliberations were aimed at overcoming the political deadlock.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Doctors uncertain about their medical practice; wanted suspension of prosecution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

No gendered ideas at the beginning of the debate.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Led to issue of legalization of abortion due to problems of illegal abortion.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Advocates for legalization emphasized effects on women. Challenged the image that only irresponsible women chose to terminate their pregnancies; rather emphasized women in distress; linked lack of contraceptives to desire for abortion.

Some deputies linked abortion to the overall emancipation of women; focused on women's autonomy.

C4A_4—Micro frames of WPAs by Acronym (include QUAWPAs)

CCSW No micro frame

C5A_3—WMA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Determining Belgian attitude toward problems concerning status of women; especially status of women in international agenda.

Creation of new jobs; equal pay for equal work; more political involvement. (did not touch subject of abortion or birth control).

Working groups: Health, Violence against women and children, New Action Program (European Commission), Third World.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

Assist Minister of Foreign Affairs; 26 members appointed by the Minister; 20 recruited from 'political and social milieus' 5 nominated by the Minister for the

Self Employed, Ministers of Employment, Justice, Social Affairs, and Public Health and family. One a cabinet member or a civil servant of the Cabinet/Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Responsibility: advise, preparation and follow up of official standpoint.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Francoise Lavry

Time in WPA: **From 1981.**

WMA Activity: **Author identifies Lavry as feminist; no information on women's movement activity.**

C13A_1 —WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Both the autonomous and integrated parts of the women's movement were in full expansion during the early 1980s.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision making**
- **Domestic violence**
- **Reproductive rights-Abortion**
- **Equality before the law**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Pro Vita; advocated abortions remain criminalized and prosecutions of people continue.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Chamber of deputies**
- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Party coalition leaders (Christian Democrats and Liberal Parties)**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Christian Democrats and Liberals

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Women's Global Reproductive Rights Network took off in 1982.

C26A_3—CEDAW provision on the policy Issue under debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: BEL_AB3 1986-90

Title: Lallemand-Herman-Michielsens Bill

WPAs: State Secretary for the Environment and Social Emancipation (SSESE); Emancipation Council (EC)

Dates of coding: 4/07/03, 3/01/04, 12/1/05, 1/13/06, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Ms. Hanquet was a member of parliament and was affiliated with the National Women's Council. Feminist positions were also voiced by other feminist MP's (male and female).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Woman who wants an abortion is capable of assessing her situation and the unborn child's in a correct way.**

Policy goals: **Hanquet supported the abortion bill and introduced the Council's position on the abortion bill into parliament.**

WMA 2

Name: **National Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The National Women's Council framed the debate as a women's issue and argued that abortion was central to women's rights and argued that women should have the final say in whether or not they should receive an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Consultation Committee**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one's womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section in the Socialist party: SVV/FPS**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Pro legalization of abortion.**

WMA 5

Name: **Women's section in the Christian Democrat party: Vrouw en Maatschappij, Femmes PSC**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Against legal abortion on social and economic grounds although tolerance for abortion was growing in Catholic circles, especially in the women's section of the CD ('Vrouw en Maatschappij/Femmes PSC').**

Policy goals: **Keep abortion illegal.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Ms. Hanquet was a member of parliament and was affiliated with the National Women’s Council. Feminist positions were also voiced by other feminist MP’s (male and female).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **A woman who wants an abortion is capable of assessing her situation and the unborn child’s in a correct way.**

Policy goals: **Hanquet supported the abortion bill and introduced the Council’s position on the abortion bill into parliament.**

WMA 2

Name: **National Women’s Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The National Women’s Council framed the debate as a women’s Issue and argued that abortion was central to women’s rights and argued that women should have the final say in whether or not they should receive an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women’s Consultation Committee**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **One must be master of one’s womb. Women have the right to choose.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The abortion reform bill did not repeal criminal abortion in the 1867 law. Instead it set forth circumstances under which abortion would be legal:**
 - a. **abortion during the first twelve weeks of pregnancy performed ‘under sound medical conditions by a physician in a health care institute, with a connected information service, that supports the pregnant woman and informs her in detail, especially of the rights, social security and advantages, that are guaranteed to families, to unmarried mothers and their children, as well as on the possibility of giving birth to the child and giving it up for adoption.**
 - b. **a service that also, when asked for by the physician or the woman, helps her and gives advice about the means that are available to her for solving her psychological and social problems resulting from her condition’. The duty of the consulted physician would be to inform the woman of the medical risks of an abortion as well as about the support services for the child. The law would empower the physician to determine whether the woman had a ‘firm will’ to end the pregnancy and whether her circumstances constituted a crisis. Based**

on this judgement of the woman's situation, the physician would have to decide whether to perform the abortion or not. Once made, this decision was to be indisputable.

- c. finally the physician must wait 6 days before actually terminating the pregnancy after receiving a written declaration from the woman. The physician or other authorised personnel could not be forced to assist an abortion (art. 2). After the 12-week term, abortion could only be terminated when a full term pregnancy would seriously jeopardise the health of the woman or when it was clear that the child suffered a very serious condition considered to be incurable at the time of diagnosis. Before as well as after the twelfth week of pregnancy, the woman would be given the right to decide if she was in need of an abortion, even in the case of medical indications.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Ms. Hanquet**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside parliament a non women's movement organization**

Activities during the debate: **Supported the abortion bill and introduced the Council's position on the abortion bill into parliament.**

WMA 2 **National Women's Council**

Form: **Formal women's movement organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **These women's organizations brought their message to parliament by means of memoranda to the person in charge of the formation of a new government, by using petitions, appeals and awareness-raising campaigns.**

WMA 3 **Women's Consultation Committee**

Form: **Formal women's movement organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **These women's organizations brought their message to parliament by means of memoranda to the person in charge of the formation of a new government, by using petitions, appeals and awareness-raising campaigns.**

WMA 4 **Women's Section in the Socialist party: SVV/FPS**

Form: **Formal Organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (Socialist party)**

Activities During the Debate: **Expressed support for legalization.**

WMA 5 **Women's section in the Christian Democrat party: Vrouw en Maatschappij, Femmes PSC**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (Christian Democrat party)**

Activities During the Debate: **Expressed opposition to legalization in the party.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The socialists learned two things from the prior debate: first, in order to liberalize the abortion law, they had to get the Liberals on their side; and second, the suspension strategy would not work. The proponents of the reform- the parties and Members of Parliament, the women's movement, and lobbies- began to develop a compromise to bridge the gap between Liberals who opposed complete decriminalization and Socialists who strongly advocated the liberalization of abortion. Roger Lallemand, a Socialist senator, and Lucienne Herman- Michielsens, a liberal senator, came up with a plan to divide the period of pregnancy into two parts: before twelve weeks and after. In that way the goals of both majority and minority reports of the SEP could be accommodated in the new law: a more generous liberalization of abortion during the first period of pregnancy and a more restrictive approach during the second. At the same time, by including the principle that the woman decides and by taking into account the existing abortion centers they could guarantee the support of lobbies and of the women's movement.

The Lallemand- Herman- Michielsens bill was first submitted to Parliament in 1985. Between 1986 and 1987, the bill was discussed on 17 different occasions in the United Commission of Justice and National Health. When the government fell in 1987, a great deal of pressure to continue the debate on abortion in Parliament was exerted during the subsequent negotiations, resulting in a mention of the issue in the government policy statement of 1988. The proposal was resubmitted in 1989 and would lead to the final legalization of abortion. Dozens of animated commissions and plenary meetings were dedicated to the Lallemand- Herman- Michielsens bill.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Demand for reform of abortion law seen as consequence of social changes. Need to address ineffectiveness of 1987 law and the uncertainty it produced in the legal system. The MPs submitting the reform proposal wanted to safeguard life while guaranteeing the woman's right to independence, self realization, and a useful life.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Guarantee women's right to independence

Women should have exclusive decisional power against the argument that the physician should have the final say

Proponents of reform pictured woman as individual capable of making a correct decision; opponents saw egoistic woman who puts own comfort ahead of her child or as a woman in distress, upset and emotionally unstable needing guidance and support.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The issue frame remained unchanged until the end of the debate.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Remained the same throughout the debate.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1

SSESE: took no position on the issue

WPA 2:

EC: took no position on the issue

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

SSESE: State Secretary dealt with all issues that related to the emancipation of women; Concerned with employment issues, social security, education, positive actions in private and public sector, physical and sexual violence against women, women and decision making.

WPA 2

EC: Same as SSESE

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1

The State Secretary came under the Ministry of Health and Environment; The State Secretary was a member of the government.

WPA 2

The Emancipation Council functioned as a counseling body for the State Secretary for Social Emancipation. The Emancipation Council depended on the State Secretary: its advice could be made public only after reaching an agreement with the minister or the state secretary.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Miet Smet was State Secretary from 1985 to 1992

Miet Smet was founder and head of the Flemish women's organization in the CD-party 'Vrouw en Maatschappij'.

WPA 2

An Hermans was head of the Emancipation Council

An Hermans was also involved in Vrouw en Maatschappij and was general secretary of the Catholic Labour Women (Katholieke Arbeidersvrouwen, KAV) 1987-1994. Both front figures of the Catholic women's movement.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **In the second half of the 1980s, the Belgian women's movement changed. The number of autonomous women's groups decreased, whereas, the number of integrated groups continued to increase. It is difficult to characterize this phase in the Belgian women's movement as a decline, all the more so because activists were able to voice their opinions in the political arena.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision making**
- **Domestic violence**
- **Reproductive rights-Abortion**
- **Equality before the law**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Pro Vita campaigned heavily against allowing abortions

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Chambers and Senate**
- **Party leaders**
- **Pressure groups and commissions**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Christian Democrats

Liberal party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Women's Global Reproductive Rights Network

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Equal access for men and women to health care and family planning.

Debate ID: BEL_HI 1999-2000

Title: Immigration Reform

WPA: Minister for Labour and Equality of Opportunity (MLEO)

Dates of coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Flemish Autonomous Women's Movement (VOK)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Immigration and citizenship is a women's rights issue because immigration has a gendered face. Women are denied a voice in politics. There is traffic in women, wives of foreign residents are legally at risk in their dependent relationships, violence against women and children is hidden in these relationships, and there are gender issues in the area of female household personnel. Voting rights for everyone is a women's issue.**

Policy goals: **The VOK demanded that all immigrants be granted voting rights.**

WMA2

Name: **Dutch Council of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Immigration and citizenship is a women's rights issue because immigration has a gendered face. Women are denied a voice in politics. There is traffic in women, wives of foreign residents are legally at risk in their dependent relationships, violence against women and children is hidden in these relationships, and there are gender issues in the area of female household personnel.**

Policy goals: **The Dutch Council of Women supported less restrictive citizenship and voting rights laws.**

WMA3

Name: **French Council of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Immigration and citizenship is a women's rights issue because immigration has a gendered face. Women are denied a voice in politics. There is traffic in women, wives of foreign residents are legally at risk in their dependent relationships, violence against women and children is hidden in these relationships, and there are gender issues in the area of female household personnel.**

Policy goals: **Supported less restrictive citizenship and voting rights laws.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **No**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The law would allow non- European citizens to become full citizens of Belgium after 3 years of legal residency.**

2. **The law originally held that the period of judicial review of applications for citizenship would be limited to one month, provided that the review found no legal problems with the applicant. However, this was later amended so that it would allow a three-month period, due to a huge increase in the amount of requests for Belgian citizenship.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **VOK**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public.**

WMA 1 **Dutch women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Dutch Council of Women participated in the debate by making its opinions public and creating a commission on migration and human rights.**

WMA 1 **French women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The French Council of Women participated in the debate by making its opinions public and creating a commissions on migration and human rights.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

When a question appears on the public agenda is a difficult issue. The debate about the reform of the Nationality Law in 1999-2000 is relatively discrete, but is related to a number of other issues around the position of non-Belgians on Belgian soil and their rights. These touch on the topics of asylum, migration, the rise of the far right and the place of Belgium and its sovereignty within the European Union. As noted above, the Nationality Law of 1984 was reformed repeatedly during the decade. The rise of the Flemish Far Right and the changing profile of the European Union also affected the public agenda on this issue. On 24 November of 1991 (Black Sunday), the Flemish Far Right made a significant electoral victory with a platform which was explicitly anti-foreign population and anti-Belgian unity. The progressive Belgian population reacted with manifestos and demonstrations demanding among other things enfranchisement of foreign populations (in a march called Hand in Hand in 1992). A highly placed female member of the Catholic ruling party (W. DeMeester) made a controversial statement in 1992 that voting rights should be extended to non-Belgian resident populations. Although shot down by the party establishment, this could be considered to officially have opened the debate that would be resolved with the revisions of the nationality law in 1999-2000.

It was the European Union Treaty of Maastricht (1992) that really put the issue of political rights for long-term residents on the agenda, however. In Belgium, all Belgian citizens are obligated by law to cast a vote in elections. A second Belgian peculiarity is that requests for naturalization are a matter for the legislature rather than the public administration, and must be voted as laws.

The Council of the European Union 1994 Directive to implement the Treaty of Maastricht (1992) required that citizens of another EU member state should have the *right* to participate in local elections. Member states needed to adopt their laws accordingly. For Belgium this would required a constitutional amendment of Article 8 to modify the requirement that only Belgian citizens must vote. The possibilities for consideration were a change in the law to allow only European citizens or those where there was a bilateral accord to vote, or a more open change that would remove the requirement of national citizenship for participation in elections (which would create a possibility for foreigners). The problem in the political post-November 1991 context was that a Swede with 1 year of residence would be able to cast a vote, while a Turk who had been legally in the country for 30 years but had not declared citizenship would be unable to vote. A second debate was around the fact that voting was considered a duty of citizenship rather than a right. Why should Belgians be forced to vote while EU citizens were offered a choice? Some proposed that voting should become voluntary.

The Catholic Socialist government attempted to address this with a reform of the nationality law in 1998. Some political groupings wished to keep voting rights (state citizenship) separate from 'nationality', and to leave national citizenship as a very restrictive category. This problem was not resolved.

At the end of October 1998 there was a vote on the new Article 8 of the constitution-which allowed citizens of the European Union to vote and notes that the right can be expanded to other parties resident in Belgium (however this change according to the report of the Centrum voor Gelijke Kansen and Racism Bestrijding must be approved before 1 January 2001. This was not satisfactory to the more progressive voices in Belgium, including parts of the women's movement in Flanders (VOK), that demanded a more full political participation for non-EU residents.

The clearest beginning of the new debate is with the elections of 1999 which result in a new coalition of Liberals (VLD/ PRL) Socialists (PS/SP) and Greens (Ecolo/Agalev). The Greens made the promise of political rights for non-Belgians a priority and demand that it be included in the government statement if they were to participate in government at all. They underlined the unfair comparison with European citizens (*Financieel Economisch Tijd*) It should be noted that the Green Party achieves more than gender parity in its appointments to cabinet posts in the new government.

The surprise change in governing coalition in 1999 from the long term ruling Christian Democrats to a rainbow group of Greens, Liberals and Socialists brought

the festering paradox to a head. For the Greens, the issue of political rights for long term foreign residents was non-negotiable. All of the partners underwrote the need for an ‘open society’ in the government’s foundation declaration. It was stated that ‘The integration of foreigners forms in a wider perspective together with a realistic and humane asylum policy and the fight against racism and intolerance one of the three pillars which the government has chosen for to make Belgium an open and tolerant society.’

Thus the resolve to address the issue of political representation and citizenship receives a place of priority in the platform of the new federal government of 1999, and a proposition of law is submitted under the emergency procedure in the late fall of that year. The Liberal party was unwilling to decouple the issue of citizenship from the issue of political franchise, while the Green party lambasted citizenship procedures as being too restrictive and discriminatory (as they were based on vague ideas of social integration in the Belgian nation).

The proposition to reform a number of conditions concerning Belgian nationality resolves this by making it possible to acquire citizenship and the duty to vote through a vastly simplified procedure that meets the demands of European treaties for speed, efficiency and justice. In principle, non-European citizens would be able to acquire citizenship in Belgium and the duty to participate in the polity after 3 years of legal residency and approval from the magistrature. This judicial review of applications was limited to one month (later extended to three months).

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of the legal regulations surrounding immigration and naturalization. The main questions in the beginning were, ‘What are the time limits to achieve political and citizenship rights in Belgium, and what procedures should be followed?’ Traditionally, potential Belgian immigrants had to show proof of integration into Belgian society, and decisions regarding the definition of this criterion were left up to a number of local and national representatives. Progressives were in favor of eliminating the criteria of integration, and argued that the only requirement for citizenship within Belgium should be legal residency, while right wingers were opposed and wanted to retain the criterion of integration. Another issue brought up in the beginning of the debate was the contrast between non-Europeans and Europeans seeking Belgian citizenship. Under existing immigration laws, Europeans were usually swiftly granted citizenship, while non-Europeans were subject to lengthy inquiries in order to gain citizenship and voting rights.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through its course, the debate remained focused on the legal issues surrounding citizenship and voting rights for individuals immigrating to Belgium. Overall, the

issue was ungendered throughout. The Flemish Autonomous movement continued its demands, and the mainstream media brought up many issues experienced by immigrant women, but it failed to connect these issues with the immigration reforms.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
MLEO: Minister for Labor and Equality of Opportunity between Men and Women/Equality council:
No micro frame.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
MLEO: The Ministry had a cell devoted to equal opportunities with special focus on aspects of women in the labor force, women in decision making and violence against women during the period in office of Miet Smet. The focus changed somewhat under Onkelinx, with a greater emphasis on exclusion and poverty among women, international issues and the application of mainstreaming within Belgian policy making. The Ministry had a commitment to gender mainstreaming and had a multi-issue potential.

Council: The Council's objectives are to contribute effectively to the elimination of all forms of direct or indirect discrimination against men and women and to the achievement of equality.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
MLEO was a full ministerial position. The Minister was rather close to centers of power and had access to the Council of Ministers. However, the council was inside the ministry and more removed.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Laurette Onkelinx (PS)
Time in WPA: **1999-2003**
WMA Activity: **Socialist party; more assuredly committed to feminism than Smit.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and Source: **The Belgian women's movement in the nineties can be characterized as increasingly consolidated (Meier 2002 and Celis 2001) and institutionalized.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision-making -Paritaire democracy**
- **Social protection (night work, pensions)**
- **Domestic violence and sexual harassment**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**
- **Solidarity with international women's movement: Women's rights internationally (trafficking, prostitution, women in development)**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Weak counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Commission of Justice within the Chamber of Deputies**
- **Commission on Naturalization within the Chamber of Deputies**
- **Ministry of Justice**
- **Ministry of the Interior**
- **Senate**
- **Chamber of Deputies**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

When the initial discussion on voting for European citizens and its relation to nationality began, the government was a coalition between the Christian Democrats and the Socialists from both sides of the linguistic frontiers. After the election of 1999 a new coalition of French and Flemish Liberals, Socialists and Greens came into power in the executive and had a majority in the two houses of parliament.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

EWL

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) **To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Article 9

- 1. States Parties shall grant women equal rights with men to acquire, change or retain their nationality. They shall ensure in particular that**

neither marriage to an alien nor change of nationality by the husband during marriage shall automatically change the nationality of the wife, render her stateless or force upon her the nationality of the husband.

2. States Parties shall grant women equal rights with men with respect to the nationality of their children.

Debate ID: BEL_PR1 1992-94

Title: Quota for electoral lists

WPA: Minister of Labour and Equal Opportunities (MLEO)

Dates of coding: 6/5/05, 6/15/05, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women MPs**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Men want to preserve their dominant power position by keeping women out of power**

Policy goals: **Quotas**

WMA2

Name: **Francophone Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **An equal or balanced participation of both sexes in decision-making is an aim, and the evolution of claims has been similar over time in all branches. They all evolved from *at least some* via *more* to an *equal share of* women; not against quotas as such, wanted equal representation.**

Policy goals: **Francophone Women's Council was against the quota, the autonomous women's movement, rejected the act. They feared that the male majority could hide behind an act guaranteeing no feminist outcome at all. They wanted equal representation not the one third quota.**

WMA3

Name: **Women's Consultation Committee**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The women's movement thinks that an equal or balanced participation of both sexes in decision-making is an aim, and the evolution of claims has been similar over time in all branches. They all evolved from *at least some* via *more* to an *equal share of* women. But although the autonomous women's movement's claim is generally more progressive; not against quotas as such, wanted equal representation.**

Policy goals: **The autonomous women's movement, rejected the act. They feared that the male majority could hide behind an act guaranteeing no feminist outcome at all. They wanted equal representation not the one third quota.**

WMA4

Name: **Women's Section of the Green Party** Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Goal is equal or balanced participation of both sexes; not against quotas as such, wanted equal representation.**

Policy goals: **Oppose the one third quota; want equal representation instead.**

WMA5

Name: **Women's section of Liberal Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Goal is equal or balanced participation of both sexes; not against quotas as such, wanted equal representation.**

Policy goals: **Oppose the one third quota; want equal representation instead.**

WMA6

Name: **Other women's sections of political parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Men want to preserve their dominant power position by keeping women out of power**

Policy goals: **Quotas**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Men want to preserve their dominant power position by keeping women out of power; goal is equal representation; not against quotas as such, wanted equal representation.**

Policy goals: **Quotas of 50% would be best.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Eventually in 1994, a quota was passed that stipulated that no more than two thirds of the people on the party lists would be of the same sex. This meant that women would have to comprise at least one third of the party lists.**
2. **Parties that did not meet this requirement would be sanctioned by leaving open the positions that they could not fill with women.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 MPs

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the parliamentary debate.**

WMA 2 Francophone Women's Council

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made public statements.**

WMA 3 Women's Consultative Committee

Form: **Informal (umbrella)**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made public statements.**

WMA 4 Women's Section Green Party

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Made public statements; tried to influence party.**

WMA 5 Women's section Liberal party

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **No activity.**

WMA 6 Women's Sections other parties

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Supported quotas in parliament.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After a decade, in 1990, the issue of political representation came to the parliamentary agenda (a quota for party lists first appeared in 1980 and was defeated). The project of the bill submitted to the Council of Ministers stipulated that electoral lists may contain a maximum of two thirds of candidates of the same sex. The same would go for the top – and most safe – list positions. Parties not respecting these stipulations should be sanctioned, losing amongst others part of their state subsidy and financial advantages. Due a disagreement in the Council of Ministers, a working group was set up. This group seriously reduced the scope of the initial bill. It wanted the act to be a temporary measure that was in a first instance only applicable to local and provincial elections. The stipulations of how to spread fe/male candidates over the lists was dropped and the only sanction should consist in having parties leave open the places which they would not manage to fill in with the required number of candidates of the under-represented sex. However, the Council of Ministers decided that the quorum should be applied to all elections, be it only from 1999 onwards. But it accepted the sanction suggested by the party chairmen's working group. These were the stipulations of the bill the government submitted to parliament.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Under representation of women is a problem.

In the beginning, the debate was gendered and focused on the improving the democratic representation of women in the Belgian government. One side in the debate favored quotas for women in parliament as a solution to the structural discrimination that women faced with regard to democratic representation. The other side in the debate rejected the idea that there was structural discrimination and argued against quotas. Preference for sensitizing and training measures for women. No barriers to women's participation in politics. Those against quotas argued that there was a lack of women in politics because women were less interested in politics than men.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Under representation of women a problem; need to improve it**
- **Quotas remedy structural discrimination against women in government**
- **Preference by some for sensitizing and training measures for women**
- **There are fewer women in politics because they are less interested than men in politics**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on improving democratic representation of women through the end. Further the debate remained gendered, with those in favor of quotas arguing that they were necessary to end the structural discrimination against women. Those opposed to quotas continued to argue that there was no structural discrimination against women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Need to improve democratic representation of women**
- **Quotas necessary to end structural discrimination against women**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

MEO: argued in favor of quotas for the number of women on party ballots. supported feminist gendering of the quota issue and argued that quotas were necessary tools for fighting the systematic discrimination that prevented women from participating in politics.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Argued that quotas were necessary tools for fighting the systematic discrimination that prevented women from participating in politics.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: had a cross sectional focus on many women's issues

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

MEO: The Minister of Equal Opportunities was a relatively autonomous agency.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Miet Smit**

Years in WPA: **Appointed 1985**

WMA activity: **Leader of CD women's section, a feminist section.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **The Belgian women's movement in the nineties can be characterized as increasingly consolidated and institutionalized.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision-making -Paritaire democracy**

- **Social protection (night work, pensions)**
- **Domestic violence and sexual harassment**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**
- **Solidarity with international women's movement: Women's rights internationally (trafficking, prostitution, women in development)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Cabinet**
- **Parliament**
- **Council of Ministers**
- **Political Parties**
- **Ministry of Equal Opportunities**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Christian Democrats held the majority throughout the debate. In the beginning the Christian Democrats formed a coalition with the Liberals, and toward the end, they formed a coalition with the Social Democrats.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: BEL_PR2 1996-97

Title: Quota for Advisory Committees

WPA: Minister of Equal Opportunities (MEO)

Dates of coding: 6/5/05, 6/15/05, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women MPs**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Increase participation of women in advisory committees**

Policy goals: **Use soft approach, not quotas.**

WMA2

Name: **Women MPs Green Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equal representation of women and men**

Policy goals: **Quotas with sanctions to enforce implementation.**

WMA3

Name: **Autonomous women's movement outside parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equal representation of women and men at all levels of government**

Policy goals: **Parity, not one third quota.**

WMA4

Name: **Women's section Liberal party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Less in support of quotas.**

WMA 5

Name: **Integrated women's movement outside parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **equal representation of women and men at all levels of government**

Policy goals: **Parity, not one third quota.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Equal representation of women and men**

Policy goals: **Parity quotas with sanctions to enforce implementation.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Under the bill, only two thirds of the people on advisory committees could be of the same sex, so women would have to comprise at least one third of the advisory committees.**

2. **Advisory committees that did not meet this requirement would be sanctioned by having vacant seats and their advice would be considered non binding on the rest of government.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Women MPs

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the Lower House advisory committee on Social Emancipation.**

WMA 2 Women MPs Green party

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participate in the debate in parliament.**

WMA 3 Autonomous women's movement outside parliament

Form: **Formal/informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

WMA 4 Women in Liberal party

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

WMA 5 Integrated women's movement

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The issue officially appeared on the political agenda when the State Secretary of Social Emancipation submitted a bill in March 1990, suggesting that all bodies nominating candidates would present a male and a female candidate for each mandate in a federal advisory committee. The Lower House debated the bill in June 1990 and the Upper House did so a month later. However, not everybody agreed on the mechanism suggested by the State Secretary. Whereas the right extremists were against any mechanism, the Greens wanted to apply a quorum to the composition of advisory committees as such. They further argued that the act would remain ineffective as long as it would not stipulate sanctions for cases of non-compliance. Nonetheless, the bill became a fact in July 1990. Six years later the issue reappeared on the political agenda. This time the – meanwhile – Minister of Equal Opportunities suggested to impose a maximum of two thirds of members of the same sex for federal advisory committees. The bill also foresaw sanctions. Mandates had to remain vacant and advises would lack binding force as long as the quota was

not respected. The Lower House debated the bill in May 1997, and the Upper House did the same two months later.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Initially framed in terms of the failure of the previous law in 1990; soft approach was not successful.

In the beginning of the debate, the issue was gendered and focused on increasing the substantive representation of women. Those in favor of the quota argued that it would help women in politics surmount the structural discrimination that they faced and to shift the balance of political power from men to women. Those against the quota gendered women in a more negative way and argued that it would do nothing because women were not as interested in political issues. Additionally, anti quota advocates doubted that women faced discrimination and argued that if quotas were adopted for gender, then they should also be adopted for other social characteristics like age and class.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Increase Substantive democratic representation of women**
- **Quota would help overcome structural discrimination against women**
- **Women are not interested in politics; quota won't work**
- **Women don't face discrimination**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of increasing the substantive democratic representation of women. Additionally, the debate remained gendered with those in favor of quotas arguing that they were necessary to combat structural and those opposed to quotas doubting that there was real structural discrimination against women. Advocates of the new quota bill blamed men for the ineffectiveness of the previous Act. At the same time they argued that there was a panoply of quotas in the Belgian political system and sex was a defining characteristics equivalent to the other social characteristics that underlay traditional social cleavages. Opponents compared sex to characteristics like age and said this was not at the same level of importance as the linguistic and other characteristics that justified quotas. Discrimination not due to sex but problems of combining family and professional life.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Increase substantive democratic representation of women**
- **Quota would help overcome structural discrimination against women**
- **Women are not interested in politics; quota won't work**
- **Women don't face discrimination; problems of combining work and family life is the reason**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 MEO: ultimately promoted the one third quota for women on advisory committees. Men hindered women from reaching the top, explicitly blamed men's reluctance to have women participate in top level decision making.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Ultimately promoted the one third quota for women on advisory committees. Men hindered women from reaching the top, explicitly blamed men's reluctance to have women participate in top level decision making.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: had a cross sectional focus on many women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Minister of Equal Opportunities was a full ministerial position in the Cabinet; includes the council for Equal Opportunities.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Miet Smit**

Years in WPA: **Appointed 1981**

WMA activity: **Former president of the Flemish Christian Democrats' political women's organization (1973-79).**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **The Belgian women's movement in the nineties can be characterized as increasingly consolidated and institutionalized.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision-making -Paritaire democracy**
- **Social protection (night work, pensions)**
- **Domestic violence and sexual harassment**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**
- **Solidarity with international women's movement: Women's rights internationally (trafficking, prostitution, women in development)**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Cabinet**
- **Parliament**
- **Council of Ministers**
- **Political Parties**
- **Ministry of Equal Opportunities.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

There was a Christian Democrat/ Social Democrat coalition with the Christian Democrats as the majority party. *Petra*: It was a coalition of Christian Democrats and Social Democrats, but they were about equal partners: in the House of Representatives the two Christian Democratic parties had 24.9% whereas the Socialists had 24.5%; in the Senate the first had 24.1% whereas the second had 26%.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: BEL_PR3 1996-99

Title: Quota for Federal Government Ministers

WPA: Minister of Equal Opportunities (MEO)

Dates of coding: 6/5/05, 6/15/05, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Sabine de Bethune, Flemish Christian Democrat MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's representation in federal ministries should be the same as men—based on principle of parity.**

Policy Goals: **Change constitution to promote parity in federal level ministries.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women MPs, links to Flemish CD**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's representation in federal ministries should be the same as men—based on principle of parity.**

Policy Goals: **Change constitution to promote parity in federal level.**

WMA3

Name: **Flemish Christian Democrat Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Basic concepts of citizenship and equal rights underlying democracy were flawed, needed to introduce parity. The Flemish Christian Democrat women argued in favor of a parity democracy for equality between men and women.**

Policy goals: **The Flemish Christian Democrat women argued in favor of a parity democracy for equality between men and women. The Christian Democrats also encouraged the party to appoint women as members of the government.**

WMA4

Name: **Social Democrat Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Basic concepts of citizenship and equal rights underlying democracy were flawed, needed to introduce parity.**

Policy Goals : **The Social Democratic Women supported the notion of a parity democracy in which women and men were represented equally. The Social Democrat Women encouraged the Social Democratic Party to focus on getting more women into parliament.**

WMA 5

Name: **Autonomous women's groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Basic concepts of citizenship and equal rights underlying democracy were flawed,**

Policy goals: **Need to introduce parity.**

C1_2A –WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Equality between men and women**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Rejection of consideration of request for opening debate on constitutional amendment to add quotas in Federal Ministers.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Sabine de Bethune**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Proposed revisions to articles 99 and 104 in the constitution.**

WMA 2 **Other women MPs**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **They were well represented on the Advisory Committee on Equal Opportunities of the Upper House.**

WMA 3 **Flemish CD women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by trying to influence other members of the Flemish Christian Democrat Party to present a proposal.**

WMA 4 **SD women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by influencing other members of the Social Democratic Party.**

WMA 5 **Autonomous groups**

Form: **Formal/informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Supported parity democracy and line of feminist in political parties; was not able to participate in the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The issue first appeared on the political agenda of the Lower House in March 1991, as an amendment to the revision of article 86 of the Constitution. Trees Merckx, a Flemish Christian Democrat, suggested that of the federal ministers and state secretaries at least one be of each sex. The underlying idea was that there is a need for measures to increase the participation of women in decision-making because their actual number is not only low but stagnating. The Lower House adopted it in May 1991. Two legislatures later the issue made it to the political agenda again, this time in the Upper House. Sabine de Bethune, a Flemish Christian Democrat, submitted a proposal to declare articles 99 and 104 – formerly 86 – of the Constitution open for revision. The idea was the same as in 1991 but she asked for an equal representation of both sexes. The underlying argument was that of parity democracy and reference was made to the federal government’s linguistic parity. The Upper House’s Advisory Committee on Equal Opportunities adopted the proposal and sent it to the Upper House’s Committee on Institutional Affairs where it was ignored. It was not considered during the debates and rejected during the votes. The issue received much of a same treatment during the debates in the Upper House’s plenary in April 1999, which was the end of the proposal to declare articles 99 and 104 open for revision.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame of the issue was the appropriateness of embedding a particular representation in the constitution. Amendment presented in terms of a demand for equal representation of the sexes based on similarity to linguistic representation.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Equal representation of the sexes

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In the course of the debate the justification for the proposal took the form of a theoretical justification of parity. No explicit reference to the blaming anyone for women’s underrepresentation. Abstract theoretical plea for a constitutionally embedded quota. There was a consensus that imbalanced gender power relations were a problem, underlining the gendered conceptualization of concepts such as citizenship, equality or rights. Like most advocates of parity democracy they criticized the basic concepts underlying the contemporary state.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Imbalanced gender power relations a problem, underlying gendered conceptualization of concepts such as citizenship, equality or rights.C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
NoneC5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: had a cross sectional focus on many women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Minister of Equal Opportunities was a full ministerial position in the Cabinet; includes the council for Equal Opportunities

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Miet Smit**

Years in WPA: **Appointed 1981**

WMA activity: **Former president of the Flemish Christian Democrats' political women's organization (1973-79).**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **The Belgian women's movement in the nineties can be characterized as increasingly consolidated and institutionalized.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women in decision-making -Paritaire democracy**
- **Social protection (night work, pensions)**
- **Domestic violence and sexual harassment**
- **Economic rights (work, training and pay)**
- **Solidarity with international women's movement: Women's rights internationally (trafficking, prostitution, women in development)**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Cabinet**
- **Parliament**
- **Council of Ministers**
- **Political Parties**
- **Ministry of Equal Opportunities.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Christian Democrats were in the majority and formed a coalition with the Social Democratic Party as a minority partner.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: CAN_AB1 1966-1969

Title: Reform of Criminal Code on Abortion

WPA: Royal Commission on the Status of Women (RCSW)

Dates of coding: 1/31/04, 3/04/04, 12/02/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **National Women's Council (NWC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Matter of justice for women.**

Policy goals: **Abortion law in Criminal code confused, conflicting, outdated and cruel.**

WMA 2

Name: **Toronto Women's Liberation Group**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Represented women's liberation emphasis; advocacy of women's rights to control their own bodies. Also referred women to illegal free-standing abortion clinics.**

Policy goals: **Legalize abortion on demand.**

WMA 3

Name **Women's Liberation Group**

Issue Definition: **Represented women's liberation emphasis; advocacy of women's rights to control their own bodies. Also referred women to illegal free-standing abortion clinics.**

Policy goals: **Legalize abortion on demand.**

WMA 4

Name **League of Socialist Action**

Issue Definition: **Represented women's liberation emphasis. Framed the debate in terms of a women's reproductive issue. Argued that women should have the right to an abortion so that they had more power in relationship to men and to the state.**

Policy goals: **Recommended that abortion should be decriminalized.**

WMA 5

Name **Federation des Femmes du Québec (FFQ)**

Issue Definition: **Framed the debate in terms of a women's reproductive issue. Argued that women should have the right to an abortion so that they had more power in relationship to men and to the state. Framed this in the context of quebec-centered nationalist—to eliminate Canadian National government control over women in Québec .**

Policy goals: **Recommended legalization, but not complete removal of Criminal code penalties.**

C1A_2—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abortion a matter of justice for women. advocacy of women’s rights to control their own bodies. Argued that women should have the right to an abortion so that they had more power in relationship to men and to the state.**

Policy goals: **Abortion law in Criminal code confused, conflicting, outdated and cruel. Legalize abortion on demand.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Abortions legal if performed in qualified hospitals/**
2. **Abortion request had to be approved by Therapeutic Abortion Committee (TAC) comprised of 3 doctors.**
3. **TAC would have to confirm that pregnancy would endanger the life or health of the mother.**
4. **Life in prison for doctors without TAC approval; woman liable to 2 years in prison.**
5. **Did not require hospitals to perform abortions.**
6. **No non therapeutic abortions.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 NWC

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented briefs to government both before and during Parliamentary hearings on the proposed reform, public symposia rarely included any representatives of women.**

WMA 2 TWLG

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made presentations to parliament.**

WMA 3 WLG

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made presentations to parliament.**

WMA 4 WSL

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Articulated positions in public, but did not appear before parliament.**

WMA 5 QQF

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Activities in debate-framing as part of quebec-centered nationalism (i.e. part of it to get rid of Canadian National control over Québec women); part of a larger cross-class movement to emerge-radicalized, pro-choice discourse emerged.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The abortion issue was brought to Parliament's attention by physicians, particularly the Canadian Medical Association (CMA), wishing to continue their de facto practices without being prosecuted. The British Columbia branch of the CMA began the call for reform the laws then on the books, launching a debate which, 'then became part of the internal politics of the association.' Media attention followed the internal discussion documenting that doctors had long been informally practicing a system which violated the Criminal Code. During the 1960s, 'eminent members of the profession regularly confessed in public that they were breaking the law', yet none of those performing hospital-based abortions was prosecuted.

By 1966, the CMA put forth a resolution to legalize abortion, but rejected abortion on demand, 'which it defined as a situation in which a woman would have a right to have her pregnancy terminated.' Rather, their resolution sought to formalize existing practices in three important ways: it would keep abortion procedures in hospitals, maintain the power of committees of physicians to decide whether an abortion was the right remedy for the situation and thus could be performed, and empower the committee to require spousal or guardian consent. The Canadian Bar Association (CBA), which was mainly concerned about the physician it was called upon to defend, joined with the CMA in its quest.

The impetus for the reforms in Parliament came initially from private members who had been working during the previous parliamentary mandate of 1965-8. In 1966 and 1967, two New Democratic Party (NDP) members, one a woman and one a male Liberal backbencher, proposed changes to the Criminal Code, including provisions to allow abortion where the pregnancy would endanger the life or health of the mother. When the Liberal government returned after the 1968 election with a large majority, 155 of 264 seats under the leadership of former Justice Minister Pierre Trudeau, it reintroduced its reform provisions.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame of the debate in the late sixties was constructed largely through interactions between the Canadian Medical and Bar Associations and some MPs. The rhetoric of the associations was based virtually exclusively on the needs of doctors under the threat of prosecution for reform in the law. Doctors sought to remove abortion from the criminal code so that they would not be prosecuted.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate was not gendered in the beginning and largely ignored women.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

There was no change in the terms of the debate from start to finish, it was mainly about physicians and their fear of prosecution, even though women had been also liable to prosecution, or denial of abortion, under the legal regime.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

In spite of the efforts of a number of women's groups, the debate also remained ungendered throughout and largely ignored women.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

Royal Commission on the Status of Women (RCSW)

The RCSW framed abortion in terms of equal rights and argued that women should have the right to an abortion in the first twelve weeks of pregnancy without medical advice; after 12 weeks, required physician's consent that pregnancy would endanger the physical or mental health of the women or child would be handicapped.

C5A-3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Abortion frame in terms of equal rights for women and argued that women should have the right to an abortion in the first twelve weeks of pregnancy without medical advice; after 12 weeks, required physician's consent that pregnancy would endanger the physical or mental health of the women or child would be handicapped.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

The RCSW was concerned with all issues that affected women. Formal orientation was liberal, rights-based, to work within the existing system. Covered five areas: economic participation of women; women in public life and the judicial process; education and training; family life and community services; and disadvantaged women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The RCSW was a royal commission that sought to study women's issues in Canada, so that it could provide policy recommendations to the majority party in the Canadian government. 'Royal Commissions tend to be the mechanism used by a government facing an election that wishes to appear committed to a controversial issue, before proposing any legislation. Commissions are usually appointed for a long period, so that they report after the current government has faced an election.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Florence Bird**

Years in WPA: **1967-1970**

WMA Activities: **Bird was first woman to head a Canadian Royal Commission; the co-chair, Elsie MacGill, was more of a long-term public activist in women's groups; previously President of Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women's Clubs.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Growth

The Canadian women's movement at the time of the first debate was in transition between the older branch representing first wave suffrage and progressive activism and the emerging second wave, which would ultimately include groups representing liberal, socialist, and radical feminism.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reproductive rights**
- **Calls for a Royal Commission**
- **Women's representation**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No Countermovement.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **PM**
- **Cabinet**
- **Cabinet Committees**
- **Deputy and Assistant Ministers**
- **Cabinet Staff**
- **Parliament**
- **Groups that presented to parliament—women's groups, doctors' groups**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Liberal Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: CAN_AB2 1988-1989

Title: Morgantaler/Daigle Cases

WPAs: Minister Responsible/ Status of Women Canada (MRSWC);
Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Dates of coding: 5/4/04, 9/23/04, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Canadian Abortion Rights Action League (CARAL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **CARAL was formed to support legalizing abortion in Canada. The members of CARAL tried to gender the debate by framing abortion as a women's rights issue and arguing that women should have the right to have an abortion if they chose and that husbands could not block that choice.**

Policy goals: **Legal abortion on demand.**

WMA2

Name **Ontario Coalition for Abortion Clinics (OCAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **OCAC was another single issue women's movement group formed to support legalizing abortion. OCAC also attempted to gender the debate, but framed abortion in a slightly different way. OCAC focused on how the other actors in society affected women's access to abortion and argued that women should have access to abortion services; it argued that the issue of choice should not be separated from power issues – 'choice as empowerment' approach .**

Policy goals: **Promote women's access to abortion services at the provincial level.**

WMA3

Name: **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **NAWL was also both active in the debates, focusing more on the litigation of cases. Liberal equality micro-frame**

Policy goals: **Assure women's choice to have an abortion.**

WMA4

Name: **Women's Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Formed to defend women's equality on the context of the Charter; focused on women's rights to choose; not so much the power relations issues.**

Policy goals: **Assure women's right to choose to have an abortion.**

WMA5

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Focus on defending women's right to choose—not to be determined by the husband.**

Policy goals: **Assure women’s right to choose to have an abortion.**

WMA6

Name: **Coalition québécoise pour le droit à l’avortement libre et gratuit**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Focus on defending women’s right to choose—not to be determined by the husband.**

Policy goals: **Assure women’s right to choose to have an abortion—free provision of abortion; focus on Québec level.**

C1A_2—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **In the Daigle case, the pro choice groups emphasized women’s rights to choose and that husbands should not block that right. (Not sure if this is feminist.) The OCAC did place women’s right to choose in context of larger power issues, but not necessarily gender hierarchies; thus may not be feminist.**

Policy Goals: **Mostly about defending women’s right to choose – not overtly feminist.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Gave women access to law and legal procedures; not an establishment of a ‘right to abortion’ per se**
2. **Removed abortion from the Criminal Code**
3. **Abortions allowed in non-hospital clinics**
4. **Leave to provincial governments to decide powers under Canada Health Act regarding funding of abortions.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Canadian Abortion Rights Action League (CARAL)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **CARAL participated in the debate by participating in pro- choice demonstrations and acting as an intervener (an interested third party that files a report with the Supreme Court) during the Daigle case.**

WMA 2 **Ontario Coalition for Abortion Clinics (OCAC)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **OCAC participated in the debate by staging pro- choice demonstrations and acting as an intervener during the Daigle case.**

WMA 3 **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Focused on litigation ; not an intervener in the Daigle case.**

WMA 4 Women's Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF)Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **LEAF was active in the debates, focusing more on the litigation and LEAF acted as an intervener during the Daigle case. LEAF worked to insert the micro-frame of liberal equality, since it was formed to litigate the Charter of Rights on behalf of women.**

WMA 5 National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **A part of pro choice coalition – participated in demonstrations.**

WMA 6 Coalition québécoise pour le droit à l'avortement libre et gratuitForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Joined in pro choice coalition in demonstrations.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Morgentaler, Smoling and Scott v the Queen (1988), 37 C.C.C. (3d) 449 (Supreme Court of Canada), and Tremblay v Daigle (1989) 62 D.L.R. (4th) 634. They concerned, respectively, whether Dr. Henry Morgentaler's freestanding- non-hospital- abortion clinics were a violation of the 1969 abortion law and whether women's male partners had the power to stop an abortion decision.

A campaigner for increased abortion services, Dr. Morgentaler began performing freestanding clinic abortions in Montreal immediately after the 1969 reforms. By the 1980s, Morgentaler had formed clinics in Ontario, Québec, and Manitoba. From 1970 on he faced trials and appeals as authorities attempted to stop him. In the Daigle case in 1989, an ex-boyfriend (Tremblay) who admitted he was guilty of physical abuse nonetheless sued his former girlfriend (Daigle) to prevent her from having an abortion. The Québec Court of Appeal agreed with Tremblay's arguments that 'the fetus was a distinct human entity.' By the time Ms. Daigle appealed to the Supreme Court of Canada, she was past the 20 week cut-off for a legal Québec abortion.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, with the Morgentaler case, the debate was framed in terms of physicians' rights, responsibilities and authority. The substance of the Morgentaler case helped to shift the frame to focus on abortion as a woman's rights issue, however in the beginning it was still framed in gender neutral terms. Morgentaler's attorneys argued that physicians should not be prosecuted for performing abortions.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Framed in gender-neutral terms.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The outcome of the Morgantaler case helped to shift the focus of the debate from the rights of physicians to the rights of women. With the Daigle case, the dominant frame shifted to focus on the rights of the father vs. the rights of the mother with respect to abortion. Daigle’s attorneys argued that fathers should have a say in the abortion decision, while women’s rights groups argued that abortion should be the woman’s choice. Women’s movement groups helped to gender the issue and in the end, the dominant frame recognized that abortion was a women’s rights issue.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Rights of mothers with regards to abortion**
- **Abortion should be a women’s rights to choose**
- **Rights of fathers versus rights of mothers**
- **Fathers should have a say in abortion**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA1

The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women took no position in the debate. Privately pro choice.

WPA 2 **The Advisory Council on the Status of Women**

Long standing position that no new federal legislation on abortion was necessary; abortion is a health issue and that women have always made, and always will make informed and rational decisions about their health. reproductive choice is an equality issue in Canadian society and that reproductive health services must be available to women equitably.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

CACSW took pro choice position relating abortion to equality for women in Canadian society. Gender equality/reproductive choice argument is feminist.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA1

The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

Had the mandate to focus on all issues that affected women; Minister Responsible-pro-government, and up to Minister (in consultation with PM) as to the main ‘issues’ represented included , free trade (also on which Minister and Advisory Council diverged at times); childcare; immigrant women status in Canada; women as employees.

WPA 2 **The Advisory Council on the Status of Women**

To bring before the government and the public matters of interest and concern to women; and to advise the Minister on such matters relating to the status of women

as the Minister may refer to the council for its consideration or as the Council may deem appropriate.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

Formal head of women's policy agency structure but Minister was a junior position that was secondary to the Minister's other 'main' portfolio(s) whatever they were at the time.

WPA 2 The Advisory Council on the Status of Women

Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW) was established in 1973 by the federal government on the recommendation of the Royal Commission on the Status Of Women. The CACSW advised the federal government and informed and educated the public about women's concerns. As an autonomous agency, the CACSW reported to Parliament through the minister responsible for the status of women, and retained the right to publish its views without ministerial consent.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

Name: **Barbara McDougall**

Years in WPA: **4 years**

WMA Activities: **None.**

WPA 2 The Advisory Council on the Status of Women

Name: **Sylvia Gold**

Years in WPA: **2**

WMA Activities: **Worked in Canadian Teachers' Federation status of women program and worked on research and publications on non-sexist materials, improved career opportunities for women in education and social issues such as childcare, pornography and elimination of sexual harassment from the workplace.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **During the second debate, the women's movement was in a stage of consolidation. While both the pro choice sector and the National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC), the umbrella Anglophone organization, were growing in membership and activities, they had established an institutionalized presence with respect to the policy making institutions.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Unemployment**
- **Free trade**
- **Child Care**
- **Job Training**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals-lawyer Gwendolyn Landolt (head of REAL Women and Campaign Life); Dr. Heather Morris, Pres. Of Canadian Alliance for Life; Joe Borowski, pro-life activist from Manitoba and his lawyer, Morris Shumiatcher, Board member of Alliance for Life; various provincial organizations, including 350-member ‘Calgary Association of Christians Concerned for Life’ (leader, Larry Heather). Formal Organizations: REAL women of Canada was organized and very active in the debates; Campaign Québec -Vie;Canadian Alliance for Life;Campaign Life;Calgary Association of Christians Concerned for Life; Physicians for Life.

Also Campaign Life and affiliated groups were active as pro-life watchers and attempts to shape the dialogue. Their microframe was to oppose the Morgentaler approach and to hope that the decision would be for ‘the protection of fetal life’ and thus against Morgentaler. They had worked for a fetal-protection clause in the Charter (under S. 7) but had been rebuffed. Like US pro-life movement, were working to widen the definition of ‘life’ to fetal life.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Judges and litigants in the two cases.

Interveners (3rd party) – Pro choice interveners: CARAL, LEAF, Canadian Civil Liberties Union – involved with Daigle case, allowed by Supreme Court, but not in Morgentaler case.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by name

Planned Parenthood Federation pro-choice

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 12

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: CAN_AB3 1989-91

Title: Bill to Recriminalize Abortion

WPAs: Minister Responsible/Status of Women Canada(MR/SWC);
Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Dates of coding: 5/4/04, 9/23/04, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Canadian Abortion Rights Action League (CARAL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **CARAL tried to switch the dominant frame of the debate that focused on physicians rights, to one which focused on women's rights. CARAL framed the debate in gendered terms and argued that women have a fundamental right to abortion.**

Policy goals: **Legal abortion on demand; Keep abortion out of the legal code.**

WMA2

Name **Ontario Coalition for Abortion Clinics (OCAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **OCAC, the other abortion rights group also actively tried to change the frame of the debate that focused on physicians to one which focused on women. The OCAC framed the debate in gendered terms and argued that women should have access to abortions if they wanted them. 'Women are not criminals.'**

Policy goals: **Promote women's access to abortion services at the provincial level; keep abortion out of the criminal code.**

WMA3

Name: **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **LEAF also tried to switch the dominant frame of the debate, arguing that abortion was a women's issue and that denying women the right to an abortion would be denying some of their fundamental rights under the Canadian Charter for Rights and Freedoms.**

Policy goals: **Assure women's choice to have an abortion; keep abortion out of the criminal code. LEAF and NAWL participated in the debate by making their opinions public and by lobbying the legislature.**

WMA4

Name: **Women's Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **LEAF tried to switch the dominant frame of the debate, arguing that abortion was a women's issue and that denying women the right to an abortion would be denying some of their fundamental rights under the Canadian Charter for Rights and Freedoms.**

Policy goals: **Assure women's right to choose to have an abortion; keep abortion out of the criminal code.**

WMA5

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued both liberal rights type of argument (women's right to life, liberty and security of the person, as enunciated in Morgentaler 1988, but also given a switch to emphasis in the late 1980s on rights of immigrant/working class/native women also their access and autonomy rights, not just those of privileged middle class 'majority' women in Canadian society.**

Policy goals: **Assure women's right to choose to have an abortion; keep abortion out of the criminal code.**

C1A_2—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
Women's fundamental right to abortion (implicitly challenges gender hierarchy).

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Legislation was not adopted; abortion law the same as at the end of Debate 2.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Canadian Abortion Rights Action League (CARAL)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **CARAL was active in the debate by staging demonstrations and lobbying senators (some, in particular, including Patricia Carney of BC, who ultimately returned to break the tie vote), as well as Senate leadership to change who sat in the Senate leader's chair the day of the vote. Presented a brief to a special legislative committee.**

WMA 2 **Ontario Coalition for Abortion Clinics (OCAC)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The OCAC was active in the debate through street demonstrations and lobbying the Senate. Also both CARAL and OCAC in terms of talking to journalists, feeding stories, information lines, etc.**

WMA 3 **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public and by lobbying the legislature.**

WMA 4 Women's Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF)Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public and by lobbying the legislature.****WMA 5 National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **A part of pro choice coalition – participated in demonstrations.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After the Morgentaler and Daigle cases, there were no federal guidelines on abortion policy. Realizing there was a policy vacuum, the Mulroney Conservative Government began quietly working to craft a new policy almost immediately after its return from the autumn 1988 election. The bill's formulation began in January 1989 with a cabinet committee that mirrored caucus divisions between social and economic conservatives but could not come to an agreement. Following that attempt, a specially selected caucus committee, headed by Senator Lowell Murray, was charged with drafting the proposal. Among the questions that had to be resolved was what language Catholic bishops would accept. Highly placed PMO members were conspicuously presented at this committee, presumably to report back to the Prime Minister, as they would be during legislative committee deliberations later in the process.

Bill C-43 was placed before the House on 3 November 1989. It was a proposal to return regulation of abortion practices to the Criminal Code, requiring that an abortion be performed by a 'qualified medical practitioner...who is one of the opinion that, if the abortion were not induced, the health or life of the female person would be likely to be threatened.' Health was defined to include physical, mental, and psychological health. Similarly, 'medical practitioner' was defined as one entitled to practice medicine 'under the laws of (any) province.' Unlike the 1969 reforms, Bill C-43 did not require that abortion be performed in a hospital; if a province allowed the procedure in clinics, as most did, by then, that would be acceptable. Because it criminalized abortion performed outside the bill's guidelines, it was immediately opposed by pro-choice organizations and by many in the opposition ranks of the House of Commons.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame as a consequence of the Court's decisions in the second debate defined the abortion issue as a question of the rights of women to dignity and choice, recognizing the rights of the fetus in the later stages of pregnancy. Bill was introduced as a compromise based on the fact that after the 1988 Morgentaler case, court challenges were still being successfully brought to challenge women's autonomy which had been inscribed in the 1988 case. Thus, the Mulroney

government reluctantly concluded that it had to introduce some sort of bill which would appeal to both social conservatives and ‘Red Tories’ (the Progressive Conservatives) in the party. Thus to say ‘anti-abortionists’ (only) introduced C-43 would be wrong - they gained the upper hand but it was in fact a highly contentious and fought - over piece of legislation in Cabinet and other committees. Framing their concerns in terms of women’s health and access to abortion, anti-abortionists introduced C- 43, which would return the regulation of abortion to the criminal code and would require abortions to be performed by qualified doctors.

**C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Abortion issue as a question of the rights of women to dignity and choice.
Women’s health and access to abortion services raised.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Women’s movement actors immediately came out against the efforts of the proponents of C-43 to reframe the debate in terms of health and access. Women’s movement actors argued that abortion should be the woman’s choice and that it should not be returned to the criminal code. Ultimately, the access and health frame dominated. Women’s movement actors, like the Ontario Coalition for Abortion Clinics, managed to gender the new frame based on access and argue that women should have access to abortion and that denying them access turned ordinary women into criminals.

**C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women’s health and access.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women Canada

The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women was pressured into supporting the government bill to limit abortion and it did not actively try to gender the debate or provide additional micro frames; required to support the government’s position and Bill C-43 to regulate abortion procedures.

WPA 2 The Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Long standing position that no new federal legislation on abortion was necessary; abortion is a health issue and that women have always made, and always will make informed and rational decisions about their health. reproductive choice is an equality issue in Canadian society and that reproductive health services must be available to women equitably.

The Advisory Council was opposed to including abortion in the Criminal Code (from its beginning in the early 1970s).

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

CACSW took a pro choice position linking reproductive choice to women's equality in Canada.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

Had the mandate to focus on all issues that affected women Minister Responsible-pro-government, and up to Minister (in consultation with PM) as to the main 'issues' represented included , free trade (also on which Minister and Advisory Council diverged at times); childcare; immigrant women status in Canada; women as employees.

WPA 2 The Advisory Council on the Status of Women

To bring before the government and the public matters of interest and concern to women; and to advise the Minister on such matters relating to the status of women as the Minister may refer to the council for its consideration or as the Council may deem appropriate.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

At the head of the women's policy machinery in the Canadian government and The Minister Responsible for the status of women is appointed by the government and generally does not diverge from the official opinions of the executive.

WPA 2 The Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women

Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW) was established in 1973 by the federal government on the recommendation of the Royal Commission on the Status Of Women. The CACSW advised the federal government and informed and educated the public about women's concerns. As an autonomous agency, the CACSW reported to Parliament through the minister responsible for the status of women, and retained the right to publish its views without ministerial consent.

The Canadian Advisory Council for the Status of Women is under the Minister's authority.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA1 The Minister Responsible for the Status of Women

Name: Barbara McDougall

Years in WPA: 4 years

WMA Activities: None.

WPA 2 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women

Name: Sylvia Gold

Years in WPA: 2

WPA Activities: Worked in Canadian Teachers' Federation status of women program and worked on research and publications on non-sexist materials, improved career opportunities for women in education and social issues such as childcare, pornography and elimination of sexual harassment from the workplace.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **During the second debate, the women's movement was in a stage of consolidation. While both the pro choice sector and the National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC), the umbrella Anglophone organization, were growing in membership and activities, they had established an institutionalized presence with respect to the policy making institutions.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Unemployment**
- **Free trade**
- **Child Care**
- **Job Training**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Pro Life groups were only marginally effective in this debate because they were divided in their support for the law. Some thought that the law was not restrictive enough on abortion. Specific groups included: Campaign Québec -Vie; Canadian Alliance for Life; Campaign Life; Calgary Association of Christians Concerned for Life; Human Life International (Canadian-US transnational organization at the time); Physicians for Life; Real Women of Canada; Christian Coalition and some violent elements, including Army of God and Operation Rescue (that supported activists such as Bill Whatcott from Canada, and James Kopp from US).

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Governing party in Executive—PM and Cabinet**
- **Cabinet committees**
- **Deputy and assistant deputy ministers in the bureaucracy**
- **Senate allowed for access to NGOS, Not the Lower House**
- **NOTE; Following NGOs are listed under WMAs; yet in description of the policy Sub-system does not mention their involvement.**
- **NAC (annual Lobby Day on Parliament); Women's Committee of national NDP; CARAL, LEAF, NAWL through affiliation with NAC but also on occasion independently (especially CARAL, LEAF).**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Planned Parenthood Federation**
- **National Abortion Federation**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under debate

Article 12

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: CAN_HI 2000-2004

Title: Health Insurance System/Romanow Commission

WPA: Women's Health Bureau (WHB)

Dates of coding: 11/20/05, 11/30/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Canadian Women's Health Network**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The CWHN recognizes the importance of information sharing, education and advocacy for women's health and equality. We work to build and strengthen the women's health movement in Canada and throughout the world. Health is a human right that, because of poverty, politics and dwindling resources for health and social services, eludes many women. Guided by a woman-centred, holistic vision of women's health, the CWHN recognizes and respects the diverse realities of women's lives and takes an active stance in ending discrimination based on gender, region, race, age, language, religion, sexual orientation or ability. Women's groups shaped both their presentations to the Romanow Commission and their responses to it by emphasizing the areas of health-care use most differentiated by gender, such as primary health, mental health and domestic violence recovery, need for prescription drugs throughout their lives, and home care.**

Policy Goals :

Opposed privatization; supported more attention to primary health care, home care and catastrophic health care. And wanted attention to women as health care providers.

First, they emphasized that any changes envisioned to the health care system must not reduce the historic Canadian commitments to the values of universality, access, public administration, portability and equality of administration (i.e. no user fees to create a 'two-tier' system).

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **CWHN recognizes and respects the diverse realities of women's lives and takes an active stance in ending discrimination based on gender, region, race, age, language, religion, sexual orientation or ability.**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **increases health-care funding over the next five years (through 2008) by \$34.6 billion from the federal government to the provinces.**
2. **Includes in its five priority areas primary health care; home care and catastrophic drug coverage.**
3. **Nearly half of the \$34.6 billion (16 billion) goes to three priority areas of primary health care, home care and catastrophic drug coverage.**

4. **Overall, federal to provincial transfers are to be increased by \$9.5 billion over the next five years (through 2008).**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Canadian Women's Health Network

Form: Formal network of formal organizations

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Made presentation to the Romanow commission; made public statements, involved in discussions.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The Liberal Government appointed the Romanow Commission to settle conflicts about costs and coverage of the health care system raised by earlier report described here:

When the Liberals returned to power in 1993, Prime Minister Chretien announced that yet another national study on health care would take place, with himself as Chair and his Minister of Health, Diane Marleau, as vice-chair. While it was initially conceived as a federal-provincial undertaking, the provinces refused to participate, suspicious of what they viewed as further federal intrusion into their policy areas. Ultimately, the Forum's report of February 1997 was a solid endorsement of Canadian medicare, arguing that key features of the system, including public funding for medically-necessary services, the 'single payer' model, the five principles of the Canada Health Act and a strong federal/ provincial/ territorial partnership must be protected. The National Forum on Health Care took the same view as the Hall Commission of 1980 that the current level of public funding was sufficient for the existing scope of the program. However, it highlighted key areas that needed to be further brought into the national Medicare system of publicly-paid services, including long-term home care (especially acute since provinces were closing hospitals at a rapid rate), and pharmaceuticals. In other words, the National Forum proposed moving these privately-provided and paid areas into the publicly-insured scope of services. It also spoke vaguely of reforming primary care delivery through changing the fee-for-service mechanisms of funding, and recommended a federal 'transition fund' to support organizational innovations. While none of these proposals became feasible or acted-upon during the short term, they all returned as main recommendations of the next major federal Commission on Health Care, the Romanow Commission of 2000-2002.

The other major set of changes, not endemic to the social policy area of the budget but impacting it the most, was the change in federal-provincial funding transfer policies during the 1980s and 1990s, including a central component which was tax policy. Based entirely on a deficit-reduction agenda, the Liberal government elected in 1993 created a new program of the 'Canadian Health and Social Transfer' (CHST). It combined the EPF program (itself a block grant) and other social assistance transfers into yet a narrower block grant in which education and health, the two most expensive provincially-funded and –administered policies, would be

forced to compete with each other for funds for the first time. The coercive mechanism of the new CHST formula, replacing the EPF one, was that the cash component of the revenue transfer was based on provincial compliance with the Canada Health Act and on the province providing social assistance without a minimum residency requirement. At first, the cash 'floor' for the CHST transfers was to be \$11 billion annually, but was increased to \$12.5 billion by 1997. Important data show that total transfers for health care as a proportion of provincial health spending decreased from 40% in 1975 to 33% in 1974. Therefore, in that same period, federal fiscal leverage over provincial compliance with the terms of Medicare declined from 40% to 12% of total provincial health care expenditures. On the other hand, switching to the CHST formula with its cash floor of \$12.5 billion increased the federally-controlled revenue distribution under the Medicare program back up to about one-quarter of the provincial health care expenditure. The overall effect was to increase federal fiscal leverage in the health field while reducing overall federal contributions to provincial budgets for social programs.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

From 1993 on the dominant frame was how to cut health care costs in light of the rising deficits. Further it was an inflated social policy commitment. It was not gendered.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

According to the National Coordinating Group the dominant frame of the commission remained ungendered. However, the need to increase support for health care was added to the frame to counteract the initial efforts to cut costs. The frame also included the need to decentralize health care administration to the provinces.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WHB: Opposed privatization; supported more attention to primary health care, home care and catastrophic health care. And wanted attention to women as health care providers.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda

- **To ensure that Health Canada's policies and programs are responsive to sex and gender differences and to women's health needs**

- **To increase knowledge and understanding of women's health and women's health needs**
- **To support the provision of effective health services to women**
- **To promote good health through preventive measures and the reduction of risk factors that most imperil the health of women**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

Bureaucratic agency in the health policy and communications branch of the Ministry of Health.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Lynne Dee Sproule - Acting Director 2000-2001;**

Cathy Mattern - Acting Director 2001-2002; Deanna St. Prix Alexander Executive director 2002 to 2006

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None; these were all policy analysts in the bureaucracy.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **The stage of the women's movement during the 1990s and beyond is described as one of consolidation. While the overall women's movement was relatively close to power (when defined in the typical political science terms of closeness to federal judiciary and Parliament) the specific women's health-care sector was even closer to power, having received much funding to set up the women's centres of excellence infrastructure.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Free trade**
- **Health care**
- **Government cutbacks generally**
- **Employment and jobs issues**
- **Government reorganization of women's offices**
- **Aboriginal issue.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Minister of Health**
- **Cabinet**
- **Romanow Commission**
- **Organizations and individuals**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Liberal party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by name

- **World Alliance on Breastfeeding Action**
- **Health Action International**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: CAN_JT1 1984-1985

Title: Canadian Jobs Strategy

WPAs: Status of Women Canada (SWC); Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Dates of coding: 1/31/04, 3/03/04, 12/1/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that one of the main problems facing unemployed women is that there were insufficient jobs in the economy, and that the CJS would do nothing to address this central problem. Also argued that the training being offered to women in most cases prepared them only for low-wage, unstable, ‘dead-end’ service sector.**

Policy goals: **NAC argued the need for government to pursue policies that would increase the number of jobs available in the economy. Government should develop and support job training programs that equip women with transferable skills that would assist them in securing well-paying, stable jobs.**

WMA 2

Name: **Canadian Congress of Learning Opportunities for Women (CCLOW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Identified as a key problem women’s low rate of participation in training for occupations in which women have historically been under-represented (‘non-traditional’ jobs), and viewed this as a result of pervasive sex-role stereotyping.**

Policy goals: **In order to shift this trend, government should undertake a systematic informational campaign promoting women’s participation in these training programs. Government should also enhance women’s chances of success in these training programs by offering bridging programs designed to prepare women for entry into them. Women’s participation in training programs should be supported financially and through the provision of services such as childcare. Need also to establish part-time flexible programs that take women’s family responsibilities into account.**

WMA3

Name: **National Action Committee On Immigrant and Visible Minority Women (NACIVM)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that women from immigrant communities do not have adequate access to English language training programs (partly as a function of restrictive federal government eligibility rules) and do not have adequate support to pursue language training (financial support, access to childcare). A lack of fluency in English or French often prevents women from being able to access job training**

programs (in either pre-employment or on-the-job contexts), as does the lack of adequate financial support for women's participation in these programs.

Policy goals: Facilitate access by immigrant and minority women to English-language training programs by removing regulatory barriers to their eligibility, by providing training allowances, and by providing financial support for childcare and transportation. Support provision of language training in the workplace and at the community level. Adapt training programs to accommodate women who have not yet achieved fluency in English or French.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **The training being offered to women in most cases prepared them only for low-wage, unstable, 'dead-end' service sector.**

Identified as a key problem women's low rate of participation in training for occupations in which women have historically been under-represented ('non-traditional' jobs), and viewed this as a result of pervasive sex-role stereotyping. Policy Goals: **Government should develop and support job training programs that equip women with transferable skills that would assist them in securing well-paying, stable jobs.**

Government should undertake a systematic informational campaign promoting women's participation in these training programs. Government should also enhance women's chances of success in these training programs by offering bridging programs designed to prepare women for entry into them. Women's participation in training programs should be supported financially and through the provision of services such as childcare. Need also to establish part-time flexible programs that take women's family responsibilities into account.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Canadian Jobs Strategy consisted of six separate programs through which federal funds were made available to support training initiatives targeted at a number of different groups, including:**
 - a. **new entrants to the labor market (young people) and women returning to the labor force after three years or more**
 - b. **the long-term unemployed (those out of work for six months or more)**
 - c. **Communities in which there had been a significant reduction in employment opportunities**
 - d. **currently employed workers needing to upgrade their existing skills in response to e.g., technological advances**
 - e. **currently employed workers interested in acquiring new skills in demand in the labor market**
 - f. **a sixth program provided funding to support research on how to address various labor market problems.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 NAC

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the February 1985 National Economic Conference and was also involved in directly lobbying the Minister of Employment and Immigration on women's training issues.**

WMA 2 CCLOW

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Conducted research in order to assess the impact of existing legislation (the National Training Act) on women's job training opportunities, especially in non-traditional areas; published the results of this research in 1984. Participated in the National Economic Conference; developed numerous recommendations regarding ways that the Canadian government could ensure that women had access to the new job training programs.**

WMA 3 FFQ

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Invited to participate in the National Economic Conference.**

WMA 4 NACIVM

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **It presented a brief with 25 recommendations at a meeting with a number of federal government ministers.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The National Training Act, adopted in 1982 had only been on the books for a short time before it began to draw critical attention from various groups and organizations. The newly elected Conservative government signaled its intention to act in the job training policy arena in the November 1984 Speech from the Throne and, in December, the Minister of Employment and Immigration released a Consultation Paper on training to promote dialogue among the Government of Canada, the provinces and other interested parties. The Consultation Paper was widely distributed, and more than 100 individuals and organizations Submitted briefs in response to it to the government. The recommendations that emerged from this process were distilled into a federal government report, 'Employment Opportunities: Preparing Canadians for a Better Future' that was released at a First Ministers' Conference in February 1985. The February conference was followed by a two and a half day National Economic Conference sponsored by the Conservative government in March 1985. It consisted of six separate programs through which federal funds were made available to support training initiatives

targeted at a number of different groups, including new entrants to the labor market (in particular women previously working in the home and students), the long-term unemployed, communities in which there had been a significant reduction in employment opportunities, and workers needing to upgrade their existing skills.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Five main themes:

- 1. Need to reduce government spending in order to control government deficit and debt**
- 2. Enhance training programs' responsiveness to needs of labor market, in part by broadening role of private sector in development and delivery of programs**
- 3. Need to reduce unemployment by ensuring a better fit between skills offered by workers and labor market needs**
- 4. Target policies and programs to those most in need (long-term unemployed; youth and women; workers being displaced by technological advances)**
- 5. Address specific needs of disadvantaged groups (women, people with a disability, aboriginal people, young people, immigrants. For women, these include recognition of gendered care giving responsibilities and support to enter non-traditional (i.e., male-dominated) occupations.**

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Women are seen as a group with special needs – recognition of gendered care giving responsibilities and support to enter non-traditional (i.e., male-dominated) occupations.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate was gendered throughout by women's groups and by many other debate participants, with significant attention to women's employment issues.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Gendered themes included the high rate of unemployment among women, women's low rate of participation in job training programs, persistent occupational segregation reflecting sex-role stereotyping in job training programs, gendered barriers to women's participation in job training resulting from care giving responsibilities and lack of financial resources.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Concern about women's high unemployment rates as compared to men, the low rates at which women were participating in training programs during the 1980s, and the persistence of occupational segregation reflecting sex-role stereotyping in training programs. A number of barriers existed to women's

equitable participation in training programs had been identified in various reports (including insufficient training opportunities or information about them.

**WPA 2 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women Canada (CACSW)
CACSW argued the importance of ensuring gender parity and the representation of women's organizations on the Local Advisory Councils that were to be established under the CJS.**

C5A-3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Expressed concern about a range of issues, including women's high unemployment rates as compared to men, the low rates at which women were participating in training programs during the 1980s, and the persistence of occupational segregation reflecting sex-role stereotyping in training programs. Noting that a number of barriers to women's equitable participation in training programs had been identified in various reports (including insufficient training opportunities or information about them, SWC offered a number of detailed recommendations for federal government action to address these.

**WPA 2 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women Canada (CACSW)
CACSW argued the importance of ensuring gender parity and the representation of women's organizations on the Local Advisory Councils that were to be established under the CJS. CACSW also developed a critique of the CJS following its adoption that highlighted the features of the policy that were problematic for women.**

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda

**WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)
Cross sectional focus on all issues that affected women.**

**WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)
Covered broad range of issues regarding women.**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

**WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)
CACSW addressed a broad range of policy issues. Its mandate was to bring before the government and the public matters of interest and concern to women and to advise the Minister on such matters relating to the status of women as the Minister may refer to the Council for its consideration or as the Council may deem appropriate.**

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Status of Women Canada had its roots in the Privy Council Office and later it became independent and was charged with the task of analyzing the impact of recommendations and initiatives to further women's equality.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership**WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)**

Name: Eileen Hendry

Years in WPA: Acting President of CACSW from July 19, 1984-March 31, 1985

WMA Activity: Founder of Vancouver Women's Network; director, Women in Management Program at the University of British Columbia; chair, Western Conference Committee, Opportunities for Women; board member, Vancouver YMCA; member, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women's Clubs; member, British Columbia Women's Studies Association; member, Therese Casgrain Foundation; member, Vancouver Status of Women.

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Name: Sylvia Gold

Years in WPA: April 1, 1985 -

WMA activity: Throughout her career, Ms. Gold's active involvement in feminist issues has demonstrated her commitment to equality and the rights of women.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and Source: During the time of the CJS policy debate (1985), the women's movement was relatively strong: NAC organized an unprecedented debate among party leaders that was devoted entirely to a discussion of women's issues during the 1984 federal election campaign, a reflection of the movement's clout at that time.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Unemployment**
- **Childcare**
- **Job training**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Governing Party**
- **Cabinet**
- **Members of Parliament**
- **First Ministers Conference (Prime Minister, Provincial Premiers)**
- **National Economic Conference**
- **Employment and Immigration Canada**
- **Status of Women Canada**
- **Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women**

- CCLOW
- NAC
- NACIVMW

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Progressive Conservative party held a parliamentary majority and formed the federal government during the debate.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 10

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in order to ensure to them equal rights with men in the field of education and in particular to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women:

(a) The same conditions for career and vocational guidance, for access to studies and for the achievement of diplomas in educational establishments of all categories in rural as well as in urban areas; this equality shall be ensured in pre-school, general, technical, professional and higher technical education, as well as in all types of vocational training.

Article 11

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights, in particular:

(a) The right to work as an inalienable right of all human beings;

(b) The right to the same employment opportunities, including the application of the same criteria for selection in matters of employment;

(c) The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training;

(d) The right to equal remuneration, including benefits, and to equal treatment in respect of work of equal value, as well as equality of treatment in the evaluation of the quality of work;

(e) The right to social security, particularly in cases of retirement, unemployment, sickness, invalidity and old age and other incapacity to work, as well as the right to paid leave;

(f) The right to protection of health and to safety in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction.

Debate ID: CAN_JT2 1994-1996

Title: Employment Insurance and Social Security Review Act

WPA: Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Dates of coding: 1/31/04, 3/03/04, 12/01/05, 2/7/06, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Importance of recognizing structural discrimination against women in the work force**

Policy goals: **Job training should be more widely available to women —equitable and accessible — and both argued against regulations that would only provide training to unemployed women and that individualized women's experiences as insurance participants with no recognition of the structural discriminations women confront in trying to access training opportunities.**

WMA 2

Name: **Federation des femmes du Québec (FFQ)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Importance of recognizing structural discrimination against women in the work force**

Policy goals: **Job training should be more widely available to women — equitable and accessible — and both argued against regulations that would only provide training to unemployed women and that individualized women's experiences as insurance participants with no recognition of the structural discriminations women confront in trying to access training opportunities.**

WMA 3

Name: **Advocates for Community Based Training and Education for Women (ACTEW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition/ Policy Goals: **Identified and discussed seven principles that they understood to be integral to an equitable training system.... argued that the implementation of these principles would require ensuring that women undertaking training had access to childcare, that bridging programs designed to meet women's particular needs were available, and that publicly funded programs and national training standards were developed to facilitate women's access to training opportunities.**

WMA 4

Name: **National Women's Reference Group (NWRG)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition/ Policy Goals: **Identified and discussed seven principles that they understood to be integral to an equitable training system.... argued that the**

implementation of these principles would require ensuring that women undertaking training had access to childcare, that bridging programs designed to meet women's particular needs were available, and that publicly funded programs and national training standards were developed to facilitate women's access to training opportunities.

C1A_2 –WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Importance of recognizing structural discrimination against women in the work force.**

Policy goals: **Job training should be more widely available to women — equitable and accessible — and both argued against regulations that would only provide training to unemployed women and that individualized women's experiences as insurance participants with no recognition of the structural discriminations women confront in trying to access training opportunities.**

Implementation of principles of equitable training would require ensuring that women undertaking training had access to childcare, that bridging programs designed to meet women's particular needs were available, and that publicly funded programs and national training standards were developed to facilitate women's access to training opportunities.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Individualized women's experiences as 'insured participants' making access to job training available only to those persons eligible under the new legislation.**
- 2. The legislative mechanism for the federal government to devolve authority for job training to the Canadian provinces.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 NAC

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate:

NAC participated in the debate in three ways. First, presenting briefs to the Standing Committee. Second, meeting personally with the Minister of HRD. Third, by sponsoring a 'parallel' social policy conference with the FFQ in order to review the proposed changes to social security and job training. Conference findings were then introduced into the government's standing committee in the Ministry of Human Resources Development.

WMA 2 FFQ

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **FFQ participated in the debate by sponsoring a conference with the NAC in order to review the proposed changes to social security**

and job training. Conference findings were then introduced into the government's standing committee in the Ministry of Human Resources Development.

WMA 3 ACTEW

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **ACTEW participated in the debate by presenting a brief to the Standing Committee.**

WMA 4 NWRG

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **NWRG participated in the debates by presenting a brief to the Standing Committee.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

A new Liberal government promised, in the January 1994 Throne Speech, to reform Canada's social safety net within 2 years. Soon after, in early February, the Standing Committee on Human Resources Development was directed by a unanimous vote of the House of Commons to, 'consult broadly, to analyze, and to make recommendations regarding the modernization and restructuring of Canada's social security system, with particular reference to the needs of families with children, youth and working age adults.' During February and March, the Standing Committee received approximately 200 briefs presented at public hearings and tabled an interim report that formed the basis of a Green (Discussion) Paper released by the government in October 1994. In November 1994, the Standing Committee traveled across Canada holding a second round of public hearings on the Discussion Paper's recommendations during which it received over 1,000 submissions and reportedly heard from more than 100,000 Canadians. The final report of the Standing Committee, *Security Opportunities and Fairness: Canadians Renewing their Social Programs*, was released in February 1995. Changes to the federal government's job training policies were announced as a part of a broader overhaul of unemployment insurance legislation in December 1995, and went into effect in July 1996.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in degendered neo-liberal economic terms. Proponents of the legislation sought to reform Canada's social security system to make it more efficient and to implement job training programs so that Canada could be more competitive in the international economy. The debate was not gendered in the beginning – there was no overt recognition of gender divisions in the labor markets, nor in the differences between women's and men's participation rates in training programs.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
In the beginning, women (and men) were referred to in gender neutral terms by virtue of universal terms such as workers, Canadians, or family members.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The dominant frame focused on job training and fixing social security and in the end, there was also a gendered frame that challenged traditional gender roles and differences between men and women. Women's groups became assertive in the debates and argued that job training programs should be targeted at women and that job training should be easy for women to access. By the end, the debate was gendered and explicitly mentioned women rather than including them in gender neutral categories.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women's should have the same access to job training as men.**
- **Established gender roles at home and at work not acceptable**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NOTE: Because SWC took over CACSW in 1995, during the debate, these are considered to be one (1) WPA for the purposes of coding

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada

The comments of the Secretary of State of SWC reflected an acceptance of the government's overriding commitment to deficit reduction and program affordability as touchstones of the review process, they departed from the women's organizations rejection of these considerations as central.

Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW).

The CACSW took a public role in presenting policy proposals and arguing that the job training programs should meet the needs of women and that in order to be effective and legitimate the SSR had to be pursued within a gender-sensitive framework.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Job training programs should meet the needs of women and that in order to be effective and legitimate the SSR had to be pursued within a gender-sensitive framework.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

SWC had a focus on a wide variety of women's issues and suggested policies on women's issues. Status of Women Canada eventually took over for the CACSW, when it was eliminated of April of 1995. SWC's legal mandate was to co-ordinate policy with respect to the status of women and administer related programs. The stated goal of SWC was to advocate and promote equality for women in all spheres

of Canadian life, thereby contributing to the overall well-being of women, their families and their communities.

CACSW was mandated to review any matter deemed of interest and concern to women. Specifically, the CACSW was mandated to: a) bring before government and the public matters of interest and concern to women; and b) advise the Minister (federal Status of Women Minister or Secretary of State) on such matters relating to the status of women referred to the Council for consideration by the Minister.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Secretary of State for SWC is appointed by the Prime Minister. The Secretary of State is a politician who holds an elected seat in the House of Commons. SWC is a small agency within a Ministry (Multiculturalism and Citizenship) that was equally not that large. SWC now under Canadian Heritage, another small ministry.

CACSW was an advisory council, arms length, in the bureaucracy; (operations Subsumed under SWC in 1995). As an arms-length agency, the CACSW reported directly to Parliament. Throughout the debate, the CACSW had a larger budget and better institutional resources than SCW.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

SWC

Name: Political Head was Sheila Finestone (Secretary of State), under the Ministry of Multiculturalism and Citizenship headed by a Minister (with full cabinet status). Under the Secretary of State there is a Co-ordinator (who reports on a day to day basis to the Secretary of State). The Co-ordinator is a public service position.

Years in WPA: Sheila Finestone was Secretary of State from November 1993 to January 1996. Hedy Fry assumed this position in January 1996 until January 2002.

WMA Activities: Sheila Finestone was President of the Federation des femmes du Québec ; Hedy Fry was once a member of the Vancouver Women's Network.

CACSW

Name: Dr. Glenda Simms (President)

Years in WPA: 1989 to 1994.

WMA Activities: Founding member of the National Organization of Immigrant and Visible Minority Women of Canada; Past President of Congress of Black Women.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: In addition to undermining NAC's credibility, these arguments helped legitimise a significant reduction in federal government support for NAC and other feminist groups since the mid 1980s. These funding cuts. resulted in a women's movement that was much weaker during the Social Security Review than at the time of the CJS debates a decade earlier.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

– **Free trade**

- **Health care**
- **Government cutbacks generally**
- **Employment and jobs issues**
- **Government reorganization of women's offices; aboriginal issue.**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

REAL Women was the only major counter movement actor during the SSR debate. They argued that federal government funding of NAC, while denying them any financial support, reflected a political bias favoring the radical feminist agenda. REAL Women's position during the debate undermined NAC's credibility and legitimized a significant cut to NAC's federal funding.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Canadian Parliament**
- **Governing Parties**
- **The Standing Committee on Human Resources Development**
- **The Ministry of Human Resources Development Canada**
- **Department of Finance**
- **Ministerial Task Force**
- **Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women**
- **NGOs Presenting Briefs to Standing Committee**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Liberal Party was in the majority.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate
Article 10

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in order to ensure to them equal rights with men in the field of education and in particular to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women:
(a) The same conditions for career and vocational guidance, for access to studies and for the achievement of diplomas in educational establishments of all categories in rural as well as in urban areas; this equality shall be ensured in pre-school, general, technical, professional and higher technical education, as well as in all types of vocational training.

Article 11

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights, in particular:
(a) The right to work as an inalienable right of all human beings;
(b) The right to the same employment opportunities, including the application of the same criteria for selection in matters of employment;

(c) The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training;

(d) The right to equal remuneration, including benefits, and to equal treatment in respect of work of equal value, as well as equality of treatment in the evaluation of the quality of work;

(e) The right to social security, particularly in cases of retirement, unemployment, sickness, invalidity and old age and other incapacity to work, as well as the right to paid leave;

(f) The right to protection of health and to safety in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction.

Debate ID: CAN_JT3 1994-1996

Title: B.C. Benefits – Youth Works and Welfare to Work

WPA: Ministry of Women’s Equality (MWE)

Dates of coding: 1/31/04, 3/03/04, 12/01/05, 3/13/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Women's Employment and Training Coalition (WETC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **WETC emphasized the importance of ensuring that training programs include the supports necessary for women's participation and argued that such programs should be designed to offer meaningful training for good jobs, rather than focusing primarily on job search skills.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women in Trades and Technology (WITT) - BC Branch**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Men and women do not enjoy equal access to employment and training opportunities. Women need to be active participants in discussions and decisions regarding training policy.**

Policy goals: **Equity initiatives are necessary to address this structural problem. It is important to develop training programs that are structured with women’s needs and circumstances in mind (e.g., childcare responsibilities), and with a view to improving women’s participation in areas which have historically been dominated by men (eg., trades, technology).**

WMA 3

Name: **Workfare Hurts One and All (WHOA)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **In the meeting with Minister of Social Services, members of WHOA criticized proposals to require single mothers to participate in training programs once their youngest child reaches the age of 7 years as a condition of continuing to receive social assistance benefits, arguing that such a measure devalues the work that mothers do in caring for their children at home. They also made clear their opposition to participation requirements , and suggested strongly that a lack of jobs was a greater problem than inadequate skills. Also expressed concern about the cuts to benefits to ‘employable’ social assistance recipients without children that were being implemented in order to fund mandatory training programs. Argued the need for policies supportive of full employment and jobs with decent wages.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition: **Men and women do not enjoy equal access to employment and training opportunities. Women need to be active participants in discussions and decisions regarding training policy.**

Policy goals: **Equity initiatives are necessary to address this structural problem. It is important to develop training programs that are structured with women's needs and circumstances in mind (e.g., childcare responsibilities), and with a view to improving women's participation in areas which have historically been dominated by men (eg., trades, technology).**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Participation in job search, job readiness, and job training activities made mandatory for 'employable' income assistance recipients; single parents whose youngest child had reached the age of seven years were defined as 'employable'.**
2. **Funded these mandatory training programs through benefit cuts to 'employable' social assistance recipients without children**
3. **Workplace-based training and assistance with childcare costs offered to single parents on social assistance who were willing to move from part-time to full-time employment (and thus off social assistance).**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 WETC

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **WETC was involved in ongoing-consultations with the Ministry of Women's Equality during the mid-1990s regarding the ways in which the provincial government's employment and training policies could respond to women's needs and interests. The organization was thus brought into the job training debates that culminated in BC Benefits through this consultative relationship.**

WMA 2 WITT – BC Branch

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Brought in through consultations with the MWE and by providing informal input into discussions regarding the proposals that culminated with the adoption of BC Benefits proposals.**

WMA 3 WHOA

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Was not involved with the debate in the beginning and was not invited to participate in the Premier's Forum. Offered critical commentary on the policy proposals; continued to protest against policies after they had been adopted and implemented. Expressed concerns about policy changes in a meeting**

with the BC Minister of Social Services in December 1995; the Minister was not receptive to WHOA's input.

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Job training became a focus of public discussion in relation to social assistance policy in British Columbia during the 1990s because it was framed by the provincial government and others as the solution to key problems: high rates of unemployment, federal policy decisions restricting eligibility for unemployment insurance benefits (which left provincial social assistance as the only option for many unemployed people), and dramatic cuts in federal transfers to the provinces to support social spending. Following the replacement of the Canada Assistance Plan (CAP) with the Canada Health and Social Transfer (CHST) announced in 1995, federal transfers for social assistance were no longer conditional on provinces meeting criteria established by the federal government as they had been under CAP. One of these criteria had specified that social assistance recipients could not be required to work as a condition of receiving benefits. The abandonment of this principle with the introduction of the CHST has opened the door for provincial governments to impose workfare-style requirements- including mandatory participation in job training activities- without fear of financial penalty from Ottawa.

The policy debate that culminated with the adoption of BC benefits began with the announcement, in the 1994 Throne Speech, that the NDP government intended to undertake a thorough review of the province's social programs. This task was to be carried out by a new body, the Premier's Forum on New Opportunities for Working and Living, whose members were to be appointed by the Premier himself. The 30 members of the Premier's Forum began their review in June 1994, with their work continuing through the remainder of the year. During January 1995 five of the Forum's members met intensively and produced a final report, which was released to the public in May 1995. The report generated significant opposition among a broad range of social justice groups, including women's organizations. The policy proposals comprising BC Benefits, based on the Premier's Forum Report and including mandatory job training activity for some social assistance recipients, were announced by the government in November 1995, began to take effect in early 1996, and were debated and passed in the BC legislature in July 1996.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- Workers need to acquire skills needed to respond to the consequences of ongoing transformations in the global & provincial economics, including higher unemployment and insecure employment (i.e., fewer jobs are 'for life' so re-skilling is needed)**
- People receiving social assistance lack the skills and attitudes necessary to make the transition to paid employment; job training is needed to cultivate these**
- The fiscal circumstances of the provincial government have deteriorated at the same time as social assistance expenditures and 'welfare fraud' have**

- increased; reducing the number of people on social assistance will address these problems**
- **Women are disadvantaged in the economy relative to men in a number of ways: they are concentrated in lower paying occupations; they are over-represented in minimum wage jobs, among the poor, among single parents, among those working part-time but preferring full-time employment; they are under-represented in apprenticeships and in scientific, technological and applied training/education programs.**

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women are disadvantaged in the economy relative to men in a number of ways: they are concentrated in lower paying occupations; they are over-represented in minimum wage jobs, among the poor, among single parents, among those working part-time but preferring full-time employment; they are under-represented in apprenticeships and in scientific, technological and applied training/education programs.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.
The debate remained gendered throughout the debate as a matter of course. There was a significant amount of attention directed to the effects that the policy proposals would have on women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Arguments advanced by various participants in the debate included:

- **Requiring single mothers to participate in job training activities would be harmful to them and their children**
- **Failing to require single mothers to participate in job training activities would mean that job training activities would not be designed with their particular (i.e., gendered) needs and interests in mind, and hence would be harmful to them**
- **The participation of women, including women with young children, in the paid labor force has increased dramatically during the post-WWII period and so it is not a problem to require single mothers with children aged three years or older to participate in job training activity, since such out-of-home activity has become the norm**
- **Requiring women to participate in job training activities would enhance women's self-esteem**
- **Childcare subsidies must be provided if participation in training and paid employment is to be financially feasible for single mothers.**

C4A_4— Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
Ministry of Women's Equality
Did not gender the debate in her contributions to discussion of the policy proposals in the legislature. As a member of the government, she supported the proposals. Ministry staff supported some women's movement goals in interministerial discussions (e.g., ensuring access to affordable childcare for mothers involved in

training and job readiness programs, supporting women's part-time involvement in these activities in recognition of their caregiving responsibilities).

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 MWE

Multi-issue: violence against women (including transition houses), economic security (including access to education and training, legal issues such as family law, pension eligibility etc.); childcare, support for women's centres.

During the mid-1990s the Ministry developed and then revised the Gender Lens, a policy analysis tool designed to assist policy analysts in all government departments to attend to the gender implications of policies at all stages of their development and to encourage them to facilitate input from diverse groups of women. This tool was distributed throughout government & departments were encouraged to seek training and advice from staff in the Ministry of Women's Equality in seeking to implement its use in their work. Ministry staff conducted training sessions in the use of the tool in other departments.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Ministry of Women's Equality is a free-standing ministry in the government of the Canadian province of British Columbia. It was established by the New Democratic Party in 1991.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

A. Political Head

Name: Penny Priddy, Minister of Women's Equality from the inception of the Ministry in 1991 until February 1996

Years in WPA: 4.5

WMA Activities: Priddy's biography identifies Surrey Women for Action as one of the groups she has been involved with 'since moving to Surrey from Nova Scotia 21 years ago]. There is a separate list of her community activities 'since leaving provincial politics,' so presumably this affiliation predates her election to the provincial legislature in 1991 [Surrey is a suburb of the city of Vancouver].

Name: Sue Hammell, Minister of Women's Equality from February 1996 until July 1999

Years in WPA: 3.5

WMA Activities: Unknown

B. Bureaucratic Head

Name: Suzanne Veit, Deputy Minister of Women's Equality from September 1993 until summer 1996

Years in WPA: **3**

WMA Activities: **Unknown**

Name: **Eloise Spitzer, Deputy Minister of Women's Equality from summer 1996 [replacing Suzanne Veit] to October 1997**

Years in WPA: **1**

WMA Activities: **Unknown**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **In addition to undermining NAC's credibility, these arguments helped legitimise a significant reduction in federal government support for NAC and other feminist groups since the mid 1980s. These funding cuts . . . resulted in a women's movement that was much weaker during the Social Security Review than at the time of the CJS debates a decade earlier.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Free trade**
- **Health care**
- **Government cutbacks generally**
- **Employment and jobs issues**
- **Government reorganization of women's offices;**
- **Aboriginal issue.**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

None

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Premier**
- **Provincial legislature**
- **Government ministries**
- **Premier's Forum (members appointed by the Premier)**
- **Women's movement actors**
- **Social justice groups and coalitions**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

New Democratic Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 10

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in order to ensure to them equal rights with men in the field of education and in particular to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women:

(a) The same conditions for career and vocational guidance, for access to studies and for the achievement of diplomas in educational establishments of all categories in rural as well as in urban areas; this equality shall be ensured in pre-school, general, technical, professional and higher technical education, as well as in all types of vocational training.

Article 11

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights, in particular:

- (a) The right to work as an inalienable right of all human beings;**
- (b) The right to the same employment opportunities, including the application of the same criteria for selection in matters of employment;**
- (c) The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training;**
- (d) The right to equal remuneration, including benefits, and to equal treatment in respect of work of equal value, as well as equality of treatment in the evaluation of the quality of work;**
- (e) The right to social security, particularly in cases of retirement, unemployment, sickness, invalidity and old age and other incapacity to work, as well as the right to paid leave;**
- (f) The right to protection of health and to safety in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction.**

Debate ID: CAN_PT1 1983-85

Title: Fraser Committee Report

WPA: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Dates of coding: 12/30/03, 3/04/04, 12/1/05, 2/15/06, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Andree Ruffo. Lawyer and member of the Fraser committee**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Sex workers should be treated as responsible adults and not singled out by criminal law**

Policy goals:

WMA2

Name: **Joan Wallace; member of the Fraser Committee**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Social and economic inequality of women needs to be taken into account**

Policy goals:

WMA3

Name: **Mary Eberts; member of the Fraser Committee, former advisor to CACSW**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Social and economic inequality of women needs to be taken into account**

Policy goals:

WMA4

Name: **Constance Backhouse, law professor, and students from the Faculty of Law Students, University of Ontario**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is caused by male sexual behaviour and male exploitation of women. The law should punish men and male behaviour in demanding and exploiting prostitute services while decriminalizing prostitution for women.**

Policy goals:

- a. make purchasing or offering to purchase the services of a street prostitute illegal.**
- b. stiffen penalties for the operation of a bawdy house and living on the avails**
- c. remove procedural restrictions on procuring offenses**
- d. proscriptions against the victims of male behaviour (the prostitutes) should be removed from the criminal Code.**

WMA5

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women enter prostitution because of poverty, sexualization of women's bodies, the double sexual standard, racism and sexual abuse. They should not be punished for selling their bodies in order to make a living. Criminalization only further stigmatizes and demoralizes prostitute women. Prohibition of prostitution only leads to 'differential justice' where weaker members of society: poor, often minority, women are punished far more often than wealthier customers and 'higher-class' prostitutes e.g. 'call-girls'. Decriminalization is the only solution.**

Policy goals:

- a. **remove soliciting from the criminal Code**
- b. **repeal bawdy-house section of the Criminal Code or amended to allow prostitutes to work from their own homes**
- c. **problems raised by street prostitution should be dealt with as problems of public order that don't require criminal sanction aimed only at prostitutes**
- d. **provide social services for child prostitutes**
- e. **provide job-training programs for young unskilled people and for women without job histories**
- f. **reinstate child abuse team and programs for young prostitutes.**

WMA6

Name: **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is the result of social and sexual subordination of women. Women enter prostitution as an act of despair and a means of survival. They often come from economically and emotionally deprived backgrounds. Criminalization only further exploits and endangers prostitutes. The current problem is not an issue of whether prostitution is per se an exploitation of the provider but how to deal with the current reality. The only solution is that light is the full decriminalization of prostitution.**

Policy goals:

- a. **soliciting should be removed from the Criminal Code**
- b. **indoor organization of prostitution should not be prohibited, even small business loans provided**
- c. **problems with street solicitation should be dealt with under the nuisance provisions of the Criminal Code and municipal bylaws**
- d. **'pimping' laws need to be clarified so that it does not target those with whom prostitutes share their lives (rather than those who simply take advantage of them). Consultations with prostitutes should be held to assess the extent of pimping.**
- e. **Avoid legislation that pushes juvenile prostitutes further underground.**

WMA 7

Name: **Elizabeth Fry Society**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women involved in street solicitation are in the minority among prostitutes. They are often women from minority groups, many have pimps, lack employment skills, have addiction problems, histories of sexual abuse and are single parents. Legislating against solicitation will only further marginalize these women and make them more vulnerable to pimps. Criminalization condemns the victims, rather than the clients and pimps and results in 'differential justice' wherein the most vulnerable are most frequently 'at the mercy of the justice system' with little recourse to legal aid. Street solicitation should be decriminalized and the socio-economic conditions that lead women into prostitution must be addressed including the sexual objectification of women.**

Policy goals:

- a. there should be no legal prohibition relating to soliciting in a public place for the purpose of prostitution, nuisance aspects should be dealt with under nuisance laws**
- b. prostitutes must be protected from exploitation by others for financial gain, therefore, pimping/ living off the avails should remain in the Criminal Code**
- c. small scale residential prostitution should be allowed (not only in the homes of prostitutes). These small-scale operations should be cooperatively owned and managed not run by the state.**

WMA 8

Name: **Canadian Organization for the Rights of Prostitutes**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Prostitution is work and should be recognized as a legal right. Criminalization puts prostitutes at risk and denies their legal right to do what they want with their own bodies. Pimping laws deny prostitutes the right to have lovers and families. Decriminalization would allow women the option of working indoors, increase security for prostitutes and give women a sense of dignity and self-worth.**

Policy goals:

- Remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- Remove living of the avails/procuring from the Criminal Code**

WMA 9

Name: **Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes, Vancouver**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is caused by the social and economic inequality of women, particularly minority women and must be decriminalized and dealt with through social and economic services for women.**

Policy goals:

- a. remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**

b. provide financial support to single women and mothers such as: day care, student grants, cooperative housing, increased welfare payments, increase minimum wage, also student grants to prostitutes in particular to help them find alternative employment and training to social workers and police who do not know how to deal with prostitutes.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition 1: Prostitution is caused by male sexual behaviour and male exploitation of women. The law should punish men and male behaviour in demanding and exploiting prostitute services while decriminalizing prostitution for women.

Policy goals:

- a. make purchasing or offering to purchase the services of a street prostitute illegal.**
- b. stiffen penalties for the operation of a bawdy house and living on the avails**
- c. remove procedural restrictions on procuring offenses**
- d. proscriptions against the victims of male behaviour (the prostitutes) should be removed from the criminal Code.**

Issue definition 2: women enter prostitution because of poverty, sexualization of women's bodies, the double sexual standard, racism and sexual abuse. They should not be punished for selling their bodies in order to make a living.

- a. remove soliciting from the criminal Code**
- b. repeal bawdy-house section of the Criminal Code or amended to allow prostitutes to work from their own homes**
- c. problems raised by street prostitution should be dealt with as problems of public order that don't require criminal sanction aimed only at prostitutes**
- d. provide social services for child prostitutes**
- e. provide job-training programs for young unskilled people and for women without job histories**
- f. reinstate child abuse team and programs for young prostitutes.**

Issue definition 3: Prostitution is work and should be recognized as a legal right. Criminalization puts prostitutes at risk and denies their legal right to do what they want with their own bodies. Pimping laws deny prostitutes the right to have lovers and families. Decriminalization would allow women the option of working indoors, increase security for prostitutes and give women a sense of dignity and self-worth.

Policy goals:

- a. remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. remove living of the avails/procuring from the Criminal Code.**

Issue definition 4: Prostitution is caused by the social and economic inequality of women, particularly minority women

Policy goal:

- a. remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. provide financial support to single women and mothers such as: day care, student grants, cooperative housing, increased welfare payments, increase minimum wage,**

also student grants to prostitutes in particular to help them find alternative employment and training to social workers and police who do not know how to deal with prostitutes.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Frazer committee report: recommendations combined both criminalization and decriminalization in an effort to address both the gender inequities inherent in the prostitution issue and the complaints of residents over the nuisance issue.**
 - a. emphasized the need to eradicate the economic inequality that underlay prostitution as well as the need to address the distorted notions of sexuality that motivated clients**
 - b. remove both prostitutes and clients from the Criminal Code, however, this was with the rider: except where nuisance provisions of the Criminal Code were contravened**
 - c. The committee recommended a revision to the bawdy house laws so that they would allow one or two prostitutes to work out of their own home**
 - d. a revision to procuring and pimping laws so that only the use of force in procuring or pimping would be considered an offence.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Andree Ruffo

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Fraser committee (Non women's movement organization)**

Activities During the Debate: **Dissented from recommendations on nuisance section.**

WMA 2 Joan Wallace

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Fraser committee (Non women's movement organization)**

Activities During the Debate: **Member of Fraser committee.**

WMA 3 Mary Eberts

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Fraser committee (Non women's movement organization)**

Activities During the Debate: **Member of Fraser committee.**

WMA 4 Constance Backhouse

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Fraser committee (Non women's movement organization)**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified (with students) before Fraser committee.**

WMA 5 National Action Committee on the Status of Women

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Fraser committee.**

WMA 6 National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Fraser committee.****WMA 7 Elizabeth Fry Society**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Fraser committee.****WMA 8 Canadian Organization for the Rights of Prostitutes**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Fraser committee.****WMA 9 Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes, Vancouver**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Fraser committee.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

In 1978, the Supreme Court of Canada in R. vs. Hutt rendered the judgement that solicitation must be 'pressing and persistent' in order to invoke S195.1. This judgement came at a time, however, when a number of municipalities were up in arms over the sex-industry and police forces and municipal governments were trying to crack-down on the 'sin strips' that had appeared to mushroom during the 1970s recession. Thus, in the aftermath of the Hutt decision, public panic over police incapacity in the face of an apparently 'thriving' sex industry reached new highs. Growing pressure from the mayors of Calgary, Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver, police associations, residents associations, media coverage and court decisions ruling municipal by-laws prohibiting solicitation in certain areas outside municipal jurisdiction, forced the government to seek a solution to the solicitation problem. The Minister of Justice, however, argued there was a 'wide divergence of opinion as to solutions', and he therefore announced the formation of a Special Committee on Prostitution and Pornography (the Fraser Committee) to examine the problem of access to pornography and its effects; considering prostitution and the exploitation of prostitutes; and looking at the experience of other countries in their attempts to deal with pornography and prostitution.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and the prostitution debate was essentially between public order and private freedom. In the beginning, proponents of stricter prostitution laws argued that prostitution was a public nuisance and that it caused many problems in communities. More liberal opponents of strict laws

argued that prostitution was a private moral issue and the government should not restrict it.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end, the debate did have a gendered framework. Those in favor of regulating prostitution because it was a public nuisance took a paternalistic view of women. Under this frame, the duty of the state was to protect good ‘normal’ women from being mistaken as prostitutes. Later in the debate, more feminist genderings of the issue became evident. Feminists did not challenge the paternalistic view of women, but rather focused on the idea that sex inequalities forced women into prostitution. Feminists emphasized that prostitution legislation should not focus on punishing prostitutes because most prostitutes were women. Because of the deeply embedded sexism of the criminal system, only decriminalization would resolve the problem. Other feminists argued for the criminalization of male clients but not prostitutes (male or female), a direct challenge to traditional gender norms. The Fraser Committee itself, in its report, incorporated a gendered framework that emphasized the social and economic inequality between women and men that underlay the issue of prostitution and the need to address that inequality in order to resolve the problem of prostitution.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Social and economic inequality between women and men requires state to address that inequality to deal with prostitution.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

The CACSW argued that prostitution was discriminatory to women and that the Canadian government should not introduce legislation that would further punish prostitutes. It addressed the relative poverty of women, and sex role socialization of both sexes. The CACSW compromised with citizens groups to address concerns of female residents and supported limited criminalization of prostitution, which would only outlaw its public nuisance aspects.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Prostitution discriminates against women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Cross sectional focus on all issues that affected women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 **Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)**

CACSW addressed a broad range of policy issues. Its mandate was to bring before the government and the public matters of interest and concern to women and to advise the Minister on such matters relating to the status of women as the Minister may refer to the Council for its consideration or as the Council may deem appropriate.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 **Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)**

Name: **Eileen Hendry**

Years in WPA: **Acting President of CACSW from July 19, 1984-March 31, 1985**

WMA Activity: **Founder of Vancouver Women's Network; director, Women in Management Program at the University of British Columbia; chair, Western Conference Committee, Opportunities for Women; board member, Vancouver YMCA; member, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women's Clubs; member, British Columbia Women's Studies Association; member, Therese Casgrain Foundation; member, Vancouver Status of Women.**

Name: **Sylvia Gold**

Years in WPA: **April 1-1985-**

WMA Activity: **Throughout her career, Ms. Gold's active involvement in feminist issues has demonstrated her commitment to equality and the rights of women.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **During the time of the CJS policy debate (1985), the women's movement was relatively strong: NAC organized an unprecedented debate among party leaders that was devoted entirely to a discussion of women's issues during the 1984 federal election campaign, a reflection of the movement's clout at that time.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Unemployment**
- **Childcare**
- **Job training**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate

Mayor Ron Wallace, Halifax.

Microframe: problem is public nuisance, solution is stronger federal laws against prostitution Follow the recommendations of the 1983 Standing Committee for tougher laws. Add offence of offering or accepting an offer to engage in prostitution, include customer in law, include motor vehicles in the definition of a public place.

Mayor Art Eggleton, Toronto.

Microframe: problem is public nuisance, decriminalization would lead to prostitutes coming into Canada from all over North America. Legalization would make the state a pimp. Stronger criminal sanction is the only answer, all forms of solicitation must be made illegal. Follow the recommendations of the 1983 Standing Committee for tougher laws. Add offence of offering or accepting an offer to engage in prostitution, include customer in law, include motor vehicles in the definition of a public place.

REAL Women

- 1. Prostitution is a corruption of society and family values caused by immoral people**
- 2. Prostitution and all associated activities should be criminalized, clients should be made equally liable to prosecution, private as well as public places should be included in any prohibition on soliciting.**

Association of Chiefs of Police

- 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance**
- 2. Follow the recommendations of the 1983 Standing Committee for tougher laws. Add offence of offering or accepting an offer to engage in prostitution, include customer in law, include motor vehicles in the definition of a public place.**

Montreal Police Association

- 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance**
- 2. Stronger criminal laws should criminalize anyone who through words, gestures or otherwise, offers or demonstrates that they are available for the purposes of prostitution.**

Calgary Police Association

- 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance**
- 2. Solicitation by both prostitute and client must be a criminal offence.**

Concerned Residents of the West End, Vancouver

- 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, has a negative impact on neighborhoods.**
- 2. Strengthen the current law against prostitution.**

Downtown Halifax Residents Association

- 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, decriminalization will not help.**
- 2. Legalize prostitution and create red light districts.**

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

The Fraser Commission, many NGOs including citizen's groups, the National Action Committee on the Status of Women, and the National Association of Women and the Law.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Liberal party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate
Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: CAN_PT2 1985

Title: Anti- Communications Law

WPAs: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW);
Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Dates of coding: 12/31/03, 3/04/04, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **National Action Committee on the Status of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women enter prostitution because of poverty, sexualization of women's bodies, the double sexual standard, racism and sexual abuse. They should not be punished for selling their bodies in order to make a living. Criminalization only further stigmatizes and demoralizes prostitute women. Prohibition of prostitution only leads to 'differential justice' where weaker members of society: poor, often minority, women are punished far more often than wealthier customers and 'higher-class' prostitutes e.g. 'call-girls'. Decriminalization is the only solution.**

Policy goals:

Opposed Bill 49 saying it would increase harassment of prostitutes. Their goals:

- a. remove soliciting from the criminal Code**
- b. repeal bawdy-house section of the Criminal Code or amended to allow prostitutes to work from their own homes**
- c. problems raised by street prostitution should be dealt with as problems of public order that don't require criminal sanction aimed only at prostitutes**
- d. provide social services for child prostitutes**
- e. provide job-training programs for young unskilled people and for women without job histories**
- f. reinstate child abuse team and programs for young prostitutes.**

WMA2

Name: **National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is the result of social and sexual subordination of women. Women enter prostitution as an act of despair and a means of survival. They often come from economically and emotionally deprived backgrounds. Criminalization only further exploits and endangers prostitutes. The current problem is not an issue of whether prostitution is per se an exploitation of the provider but how to deal with the current reality. The only solution is that light is the full decriminalization of prostitution.**

Policy goals:

- a. soliciting should be removed from the Criminal Code**
- b. indoor organization of prostitution should not be prohibited, even small business loans provided**
- c. problems with street solicitation should be dealt with under the nuisance provisions of the Criminal Code and municipal bylaws**

- d. **'pimping' laws need to be clarified so that it does not target those with whom prostitutes share their lives (rather than those who simply take advantage of them). Consultations with prostitutes should be held to assess the extent of pimping.**
- f. **avoid legislation that pushes juvenile prostitutes further underground.**

WMA 3

Name: **Elizabeth Fry Society**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women involved in street solicitation are in the minority among prostitutes. They are often women from minority groups, many have pimps, lack employment skills, have addiction problems, histories of sexual abuse and are single parents. Legislating against solicitation will only further marginalize these women and make them more vulnerable to pimps. Criminalization condemns the victims, rather than the clients and pimps and results in differential justice wherein the most vulnerable are most frequently at the mercy of the justice system with little recourse to legal aid. Street solicitation should be decriminalized and the socio-economic conditions that lead women into prostitution must be addressed including the sexual objectification of women.**

Policy goals:

- a. **there should be no legal prohibition relating to soliciting in a public place for the purpose of prostitution, nuisance aspects should be dealt with under nuisance laws**
- b. **prostitutes must be protected from exploitation by others for financial gain, therefore, pimping/ living off the avails should remain in the Criminal Code**
- c. **small scale residential prostitution should be allowed (not only in the homes of prostitutes). These small-scale operations should be cooperatively owned and managed not run by the state.**

WMA 4

Name: **Canadian Organization for the Rights of Prostitutes**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Prostitution is work and should be recognized as a legal right. Criminalization puts prostitutes at risk and denies their legal right to do what they want with their own bodies. Pimping laws deny prostitutes the right to have lovers and families. Decriminalization would allow women the option of working indoors, increase security for prostitutes and give women a sense of dignity and self-worth.**

Policy goals:

- a. **remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. **remove living of the avails/procuring from the Criminal Code.**

WMA 5

Name: **Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes, Vancouver**

Microframe:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is caused by the social and economic inequality of women, particularly minority women and must be decriminalized and dealt with through social and economic services for women.**

Policy goals:

- a. remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. provide financial support to single women and mothers such as: day care, student grants, cooperative housing, increased welfare payments, increase minimum wage, also student grants to prostitutes in particular to help them find alternative employment and training to social workers and police who do not know how to deal with prostitutes.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition 1: **Women enter prostitution because of poverty, sexualization of women's bodies, the double sexual standard, racism and sexual abuse. They should not be punished for selling their bodies in order to make a living.**

Policy goals:

- a. remove soliciting from the criminal Code**
- b. repeal bawdy-house section of the Criminal Code or amended to allow prostitutes to work from their own homes**
- c. problems raised by street prostitution should be dealt with as problems of public order that don't require criminal sanction aimed only at prostitutes**
- d. provide social services for child prostitutes**
- e. provide job-training programs for young unskilled people and for women without job histories**
- f. reinstate child abuse team and programs for young prostitutes.**

Issue definition 2: **Prostitution is work and should be recognized as a legal right.**

Criminalization puts prostitutes at risk and denies their legal right to do what they want with their own bodies. Pimping laws deny prostitutes the right to have lovers and families. Decriminalization would allow women the option of working indoors, increase security for prostitutes and give women a sense of dignity and self-worth.

Policy goals:

- a . remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. remove living of the avails/procuring from the Criminal Code.**

Issue definition 3: **Prostitution is caused by the social and economic inequality of women, particularly minority women.**

Policy goal:

- a. remove solicitation from the Criminal Code**
- b. provide financial support to single women and mothers such as: day care, student grants, cooperative housing, increased welfare payments, increase minimum wage, also student grants to prostitutes in particular to help them find alternative employment and training to social workers and police who do not know how to deal with prostitutes.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Bill made it an offence for every person in a public place or in any place open to public view to communicate or attempt to communicate with any person for the purpose of engaging in prostitution or obtaining the sexual services of a prostitute.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 National Action Committee on the Status of Women

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debates by making a formal presentation to the Parliamentary Committee and also made their opinions public in the media.**

WMA 2 National Association of Women and the Law (NAWL)

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **Presented a brief to the Parliamentary Committee hearings.**

WMA 3 Elizabeth Fry Society

Form: **Formal organization**

Location **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **Presented a brief to the Parliamentary Committee hearings.**

WMA 4 Canadian Organization for the Rights of Prostitutes

Form: **Formal organization**

Location **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **Testified at Parliamentary Committee hearings.**

WMA 5 Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes, Vancouver

Form: **Formal organization**

Location **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **Testified at Parliamentary Committee hearings.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The appointment of the Fraser Committee was widely viewed by anti-prostitution forces as a stalling tactic on the part of the Liberal government. The Conservative government, elected in late 1984 with a nearly unprecedented majority, continued to face high pressure from local and provincial politicians (particularly from those areas with large urban centres) and residents' groups to deal with the problem of street solicitation. Indeed, feeling the pressure of these groups, both the British Columbia (BC) and Nova Scotia (NS) Attorneys General sought civil injunctions against prostitution in 1984. The government faced internal pressure as well. Pat Carney, a senior female Conservative MP from Vancouver, BC, which had a strong anti-prostitution lobby, and member of the new Conservative Cabinet was vocal in her support for stronger measures against street prostitution. The new Conservative Justice Minister, John Crosbie, very early into his position, announced that the Ministry of Justice was already working on new legislation to control street prostitution and hinted that he might not wait for the Fraser Committee report in order to introduce new legislation, given the need to respond immediately to the

problem. The Conservatives introduced Bill C-49 to deal with prostitution exactly six working days after the Fraser Report was released, suggesting that the bill had indeed been prepared in-house long before the committee's input was available. Bill C-49 criminalised 'communication' for the purposes of prostitution for both clients and prostitutes, thereby greatly expanding the scope of the criminal law.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not overtly gendered and focused on the public nuisance aspects of prostitution. Conservatives argued that prostitution was a public nuisance and that prostitutes and pimps were preventing normal citizens from carrying out their everyday lives. Conservatives argued that prostitution should be criminalized and proposed a law that would ban communications for the purposes of prostitution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on prostitution as a public nuisance and also gained some gendered elements. Government endorsed limited legal notion of gender equality; also posed the nuisance of street prostitution as a threat to good women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Legal notion of gender equality linked to prostitution issue**
- **Street prostitution a threat to good women**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Supported the women's movement and argued against increasing criminal penalties against prostitutes.

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Not applicable

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Women's Movement organization micro frames: Prostitution is caused by male sexual behaviour and male exploitation of women. The law should punish men and male behaviour in demanding and exploiting prostitute services while decriminalizing prostitution for women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Cross sectional focus on all issues that affected women.

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Covered broad range of issues regarding women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

CACSW addressed a broad range of policy issues. Its mandate was to bring before the government and the public matters of interest and concern to women' and 'to advise the Minister on such matters relating to the status of women as the Minister may refer to the Council for its consideration or as the Council may deem appropriate.

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Status of Women Canada had its roots in the Privy Council Office and later it became independent and was charged with the task of analyzing the impact of recommendations and initiatives to further women's equality.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (CACSW)

Name: **Eileen Hendry**

Years in WPA: **Acting President of CACSW from July 19, 1984-March 31, 1985**

Was the WPA head a WMA or involved with any WM groups prior to taking office:

Name of WMA, years active, activity (member, leader, spokesperson, fellow traveler, etc.): **founder of Vancouver Women's Network; director, Women in Management Program at the University of British Columbia; chair, Western Conference Committee, Opportunities for Women; board member, Vancouver YMCA; member, Canadian Federation of Business and Professional Women's Clubs; member, British Columbia Women's Studies Association; member, Therese Casgrain Foundation; member, Vancouver Status of Women. (CACSW Annual Report 1984-85)**

Name: **Sylvia Gold**

Years in WPA: **April 1-1985-**

Was the WPA head a WMA or involved with any WM groups prior to taking office:

Name of WMA, years active, activity (member, leader, spokesperson, fellow traveler, etc.): **Throughout her career, Ms. Gold's active involvement in feminist issues has demonstrated her commitment to equality and the rights of women.**

WPA 2 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Name:

Years in WPA:

WMA activity:

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **During the time of the CJS policy debate (1985), the women's movement was relatively strong: NAC organized an unprecedented debate among**

party leaders that was devoted entirely to a discussion of women's issues during the 1984 federal election campaign, a reflection of the movement's clout at that time.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Unemployment**
- **Childcare**
- **Job training**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong

Patricia Carney, Member of Parliament for Vancouver Centre, Minister of Energy, Mines and Resources: 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, ruining neighborhoods, stronger criminal laws are needed . 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

William Smeaton, Mayor of Niagara Falls. 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, ruining neighborhoods, stronger criminal laws are needed . 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

Jean Drapeau. Mayor, Montreal. 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, ruining neighborhoods, stronger criminal laws are needed . 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

May Brown, Alderwoman, Vancouver. 1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, ruining neighborhoods, stronger criminal laws are needed . 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

Concerned Residents of the West End, Vancouver

1. Prostitution is a public nuisance, has a negative impact on neighborhoods, must remain criminalized. 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

Downtown Halifax Residents' Association

1. Prostitution is a public nuisance. It has a negative impact on neighborhoods and must be strongly criminalized. 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

Canadian Association of Chiefs of Police.

1. Prostitution is a public nuisance. Current laws are unworkable, police cannot control the problem, tougher criminal sanctions are needed. 2. Bill C-49 will address these concerns.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Ministry of Justice, Parliament and NGOs presenting testimony to parliament.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: CAN_PT3 1992-1996

Title: Law on Youth in Prostitution

WPA: Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Dates of coding: 12/31/03, 3/03/04, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Canadian Organization of the Rights of Prostitutes (CORP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Presented the issue of youth prostitution as very similar to adult prostitution, an issue of survival/work While CORP drew attention to violence against women and the coercion of women and youth as a general problem in this context, they recommended that this should not be dealt with through prostitution laws but through other laws dealing with extortion, violence etc. Continued criminalization of prostitution, including youth prostitution as proposed in C-27, would merely make it more difficult for women and youth to avoid violence. Decriminalization and/or regulation would provide an alternative solution.**

Policy goals:

- i. drop proposed changes in C-27 re: youth prostitution**
- ii. use existing Criminal Code provisions against common assault, kidnapping etc.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

NOTE: Not feminist; no expression of gender equity; challenge to hierarchies; rather well being of women sex workers.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Bill C-27 created a new offence of aggravated procuring was created that carried a minimum penalty of five years and a maximum of fourteen.**
- 2. The bill made it an offence to seek the services of a person believed to be under 18 as well as those actually under 18 in order to facilitate sting operations by the police.**
- 3. The bill created procedural safeguards to facilitate the testimony of youth against pimps and customers.**
- 4. Bill C-27 also extended the reach of Canadian law on child- prostitution to outside the country with its provision on child sex-tourism.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Canadian Organization of the Rights of Prostitutes (CORP)**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Membership of sex-workers (female, male, bi and trans), appeared at the Standing Committee on Justice and Law hearings in Ottawa, not included in the debate at the end.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Frustrated with the progress on prostitution laws generally, the British Columbia government pushed to establish a joint working group of federal and provincial Ministries of Justice. The Federal/Provincial/Territorial Working Group on Prostitution (hereinafter the Working Group) was set-up in 1992, to review legislation and make recommendations on prostitution policy and, additionally, to focus on youth in prostitution (Federal/Provincial/Territorial Working Group 1998: 15). Concern over youth in prostitution built up to new highs in the mid-1990s with the lead-up to the 1996 World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children organized by international children's rights NGOs and UNICEF. The approach of the World Congress not only stimulated the federal government to start taking action but generated a great deal of new media interest in the child prostitution issue. In particular, the media began to focus not only on child prostitution in Canada but the exploitation of children overseas.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and focused on ending youth prostitution. The dominant frame viewed youth as victims of predatory pimps. Nearly all parties involved in the debate supported legislation that would increase the criminal penalties for pimps and others that were trafficking young people for prostitution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on ending youth prostitution throughout. The debate was not gendered and was largely ignored by women's groups, who tended to focus more on adult prostitution. There was some emphasis on the fact the youth prostitutes were boys as well as girls. No discussion of girls as particular victims.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

SWC acted more as an ex-post facto champion of the government's intention to strengthen anti- child prostitution laws rather than an advocate of women's groups interest in decriminalization. Did not present it as a gendered issue, promoted the issue of child prostitution only after C-27 was passed.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

SWC's legal mandate was to co-ordinate policy with respect to the status of women and administer related programs. The stated goal of SWC was to advocate and promote equality for women in all spheres of Canadian life, thereby contributing to the overall well-being of women, their families and their communities.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

SWC is a small agency within a Ministry (Multiculturalism and Citizenship) that was equally not that large. SWC now under Canadian Heritage, another small ministry. SWC had been demoted from the cabinet in 1993 and was low in terms of power and authority.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Status of Women Canada (SWC)

Name: Political Head was Sheila Finestone (Secretary of State), under the Ministry of Multiculturalism and Citizenship headed by a Minister (with full cabinet status). Under the Secretary of State there is a Co-ordinator (who reports on a day to day basis to the Secretary of State). The Co-ordinator is a public service position.

Years in WPA: Sheila Finestone was Secretary of State from November 1993 to January 1996. Hedy Fry assumed this position in January 1996 until January 2002.

WMA Activities: Sheila Finestone was President of the Federation des femmes du Québec ; Hedy Fry was once a member of the Vancouver Women's Network.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: The Canadian women's movement was on the decline in the 1990s. It had been greatly affected by deep budget cuts in the early 1990s as the government cut back funding (by 50% for the national organisation NAC).

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Free trade**
- **Health care**
- **Government cutbacks generally**
- **Employment and jobs issues**
- **Government reorganization of women's offices**
- **Aboriginal issue.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

There was a strong countermovement led by neo-conservative parties at both the federal and provincial levels.

The Reform party platform was explicitly based on traditional conservative, family-oriented views and frequently opposed feminist policy agendas. The Reform Party representatives in the House during this debate viewed the issue of youth

prostitution as an issue of youth crime that required harsher penalties against prostitution generally, particularly by making ‘communicating for the purpose of prostitution’ an indictable offense.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Department of Justice**
- **Cabinet**
- **Legislative Committees**
- **Federal/ Provincial/ Territorial Working Group**
- **There were also child welfare NGOs involved.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Liberal party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Ecumenical Coalition against Prostitution in Asian Tourism (ECPAT)**
- **Stockholm World Conference on Child Sexual Exploitation**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: FIN_HI 1991-94

Title: Subjective Right to Municipal Day Care

WPAs: Council for Equality (CE); Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women MPs Social Democratic party; Green party; and part of National Coalition party women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Day care is a basis social service and an essential condition of life. it enables women to work on an equal basis with men**

Policy Goals: **Oppose postponement of subjective right.**

WMA2

Name: **Centre Party Women MPs**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Possibility to choose type of childcare is in the interest of women; women are diverse and they need choices**

Policy Goals: **Preserve the home care option.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **None**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Both home care and day care rights were postponed but not as long as government initially wanted. The law concerned the end date when all the municipalities must offer the agreed day care rights and daycare services to citizens – something that the government had been putting off.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **SD, and Green Women MPs**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participation in parliamentary debate.**

WMA 2 **Centre party women MPs**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participation in parliamentary debate.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1991, the parliament had passed a law on the extension of the subjective right to day care to all children under school age. The act was supposed to gain force in 1993. Because of the economic recession, these plans were changed, however, as demands for cutting public spending - especially social spending – got louder. Despite protests, the parliament decided in 1992 to postpone the implementation of the day care right until 1.8.1995. During the years 1993 and 1994 plans to further delay the implementation of the day care reform were clearly in the air. The issue reached its peak in the fall of 1994 in connection with the handling of the state budget for the next year, which also was to be the election year. Because of the financial difficulties faced by the state and the municipalities, the government proposed delaying the day care reform again, until 1997.

The idea for postponing the promised day care rights was initiated by bureaucrats in the Ministry of Finance. The Minister of Finance, Mr Iiro Viinanen, was a widely known opponent to ‘lavish’ social spending and thus also to the extension of the subjective rights. Similarly, the central cooperative organ of the Finnish local authorities, Kuntaliitto (the Association of Finnish Local and Regional Municipalities) had actively been lobbying against additional legal obligations for the municipalities which would increase their financial burden and limit their self-governance.

The plan of postponement was supported by the governing parties with the opposition parties - the Social Democrats, the Left-wing Alliance and the Green party - protesting loudly against it. However, the bill met also with strong resistance during the autumn of 1994 as women across the party lines and the Network of Women MPs in particular mobilised to defend the day care rights. As part of their campaign, the women MPs’ network agreed on a joint pro-day care statement, which signified a radical break-up from the official government position especially for the Governing Centre and National Coalition Party women deputies. After the statement was made public, the day care issue strongly profiled as a women’s issue in the media and the political arenas.

The subjective rights package included, however, two components: the day care right and the child home care allowance right. This came to be the decisive factor from the perspective of women’s cooperation, reflecting the old schisms between the proponents of municipal day care and the defenders of home care. The cleavage became visible when, realising that it was not possible to pull through both reforms at the same time, the majority of the active women MPs decided to prioritise the right to municipal day care. This was unacceptable for the Centre Party women who insisted that the women’s front should hold on to the home care reform as well. This dissension partly broke down the women’s co-operation in Parliament.

The disagreements also resulted in an extraordinary, conflict-ridden handling in the Social Affairs and Health Committee of the Parliament. While government-sponsored bills usually pass the parliamentary process without bigger changes, this

time the responsible committee succeeded in overturning the proposal to postpone day care rights. After this, in December 1994, the day care issue got top national publicity as the Minister of Finance Mr Viinainen immediately threatened his resignation. This would have meant the fall of the government, as Prime Minister Esko Aho later stated.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The subjective right to day care services meant that it was a public responsibility and the burden would fall on the municipalities. The frame was constructed as a conflict between the proponents and opponents of cutbacks in funding.

Day care was defined by ministerial working group as a question of needs and interests of larger society: day care had an educational benefit, contributed to social equality, economic growth and the labor market; the childcare home allowance was seen as adding choices to individual families. Working group report also pointed to merits for promoting gender equality; allowed both parents, especially women, to work.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Childcare promotes gender equality, allows both parents, especially women, to work.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Part of the issue became day care v. home care allowances.

dominant frame remained but also included the city/countryside dimension defining day care as urban and home care as for farmers. The frame took increased gendered form, marked by view that gender equality involved women's opportunity to participate in the labour market and taking away day care would take that opportunity away. There was opposition to this view by those insisting that home care allowances would open up choices for women and families.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Gender equality involved women's opportunity to participate in the labor market and taking away day care would take that away**
- **Home care allowances would open up choices for women and families.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1—CE: gave statements on social policy and day care policy, mostly very general. Concerned about the effects of the cutback policies for women, but did not focus on any specific cutback.

WPA 2—EO: None

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1: Cross sectional; reforms for gender equality

WPA 2: The Equality Ombudsman had a cross-sectional focus on many issues that effected women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1: Advisory council located under the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health

WPA 2: The Ombud is administratively connected to the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, but is independently in charge of the supervision of the Equality Act and the other functions.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1:

Name: **Tuula Kuittinen**

Years in WPA: **1991-95**

WMA activity: **MP active in Centre Party Women; not a feminist in the media profiles.**

WPA 2:

Name: **Tuulikki Petajaniemi 1993-95;**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **Women's movements had entered into a stage of consolidation in the 1990's.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women (e.g. campaign against prohibiting rape in marriage in early 90s)**
- **Prostitution**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (e.g. day care issues)**
- **Reproductive rights (especially IVF)**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **Equal pay**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Ministry of Social Affairs and Health**
- **Municipalities and cooperative organizations**
- **Kuntaliitto**
- **Parliament**
- **Biggest parties and the Ministry of Finance**

- **Social partners**
- **Some NGOs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Centre Party, National coalition Party, Swedish People's Party and Christian League

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 11 sec. 2

In order to prevent discrimination against women on the grounds of marriage or maternity and to ensure their effective right to work, States Parties shall take appropriate measures:

- (a) To prohibit, Subject to the imposition of sanctions, dismissal on the grounds of pregnancy or of maternity leave and discrimination in dismissals on the basis of marital status;**
- (b) To introduce maternity leave with pay or with comparable social benefits without loss of former employment, seniority or social allowances;**
- (c) To encourage the Provision of the necessary supporting social services to enable parents to combine family obligations with work responsibilities and participation in public life, in particular through promoting the establishment and development of a network of child-care facilities;**
- (d) To provide special protection to women during pregnancy in types of work proved to be harmful to them.**

Debate ID : FIN_JT1 1969-71

Title: Reduction of Labor Shortages and Unemployment

WPA: Temporary Committee on the Status of Women (TCSW)

Dates of Coding : 6/3/05, 6/13/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Toini Ristimäki – a female researcher in Ministry of Labor**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Married woman should be used as source of full-time labor.**

Policy goals: **Childcare policies should be developed to help mothers make a real choice about whether to work or not.**

WMA2

Name: **Edith Terästö Social Democrat MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Raised the issue of gendered membership in a context by discussing women's low labor market status, and women's lack of power in labor-related decision-making arenas.**

Policy goals: **Women should be appointed to the local commissions that would oversee the new unemployment and training policies.**

WMA 3

Name: **Sinikka Luja-Vepsä Social Democrat MP**

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: **Raised the issue of gendered membership in a context by discussing women's low labor market status, and women's lack of power in labor-related decision-making arenas.**

Policy goals: **Women should be appointed to the local commissions that would oversee the new unemployment and training policies.**

WMA4

Name: **Anna-Liisa Jokinen People's Democrat Member**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Stressed the importance of employment training for women who had to interrupt their working careers because of pregnancy or problems in arranging day-care for the children.**

Policy goals:

WMA5

Name: **Association 9 (A9)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **A9 supported the view that women's inferior position was due to division of labor between women and men at home as well as labor market; married**

women/mothers should be able to choose to pursue full-time jobs and childcare should be provided to give them a real choice.

Policy goals: Women needed to have more say in the decision-making process and representation of worker's interests.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: Raised the issue of gendered membership in a context by discussing women's low labor market status, and women's lack of power in labor-related decision-making arenas.

Women's inferior position was due to division of labor between women and men at home as well as labor market; married women/mothers should be able to choose to pursue full-time jobs and childcare should be provided to give them a real choice.

Policy goals: Women should be appointed to the local commissions that would oversee the new unemployment and training policies.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Introduced the idea of employment training as a central policy instrument to improve citizens' chances to relocate themselves in the labor markets.**
- 2. Responsibility for developing job training opportunities was given to the national government authorities, including local labor mediation offices.**
- 3. Courses were allowed to be adapted, in terms of target, length, foci etc, in function of the needs of the labor market; national and municipal authorities were allowed to plan in advance.**
- 4. Created local committees to make decisions over unemployment allowances; committees were to have a balanced representation of gender.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Toini Ristimäki – a female researcher in Ministry of Labor

Form: Individual

Location: Inside non women's movement organization (Ministry of Labor)

Activities During the Debate: Author of Appendix of Economic Commission report that introduced notion that married woman should be used as source of full-time labor and that childcare policies should be developed to help mothers make a real choice about whether to work or not.

WMA 2 Edith Terästö Social Democrat MP

Form: Individual

Location: Inside non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Presented ideas in parliamentary debates.

WMA 3 Sinikka Luja-Vepsä Social Democrat MP

Form: Individual

Location: Inside non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Presented ideas in parliamentary debates.

WMA 4 Anna-Liisa Jokinen People's Democrat MemberForm: **Individual**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Presented ideas in parliamentary debates.****WMA 5 Association 9 (A9)**Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Members of the group had participated in the work of the Committee on the Status of Women on employment issues. It was disbanded in 1970 so that WM activists could pursue strategies from within established mainstream organizations. As a result, women's sections of in many of the left-wing parties adopted A9 programs.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The issue of employment training became important in Finland at the beginning of the 1970s in the context of the development of active employment policies. The major preoccupation of many employment policy actors at the time was to ensure continuous economic growth in the face of a potential shortage of skilled labor. Immigration to Sweden had diminished the number of trained workers. The shift from an agrarian economy to an industrial and service economy through the 1960s created an uneven distribution of jobs and skilled workers throughout Finland. Whereas the North suffered from unemployment, the South had a shortage of trained personnel. Education and training measures, therefore, were regarded as a means to address the gap between demand and supply of labor.

Representatives of labor, management, and the state had already set the framework for the 1971 Act in the collective labor market agreements of 1969-1971. The work was continued in the public arena in a report issued in 1971 by the prestigious Economic Commission. The report made a number of recommendations for the development of public policies to achieve full employment. It stressed that employment policies should target the whole labor force as well as the reserves. The report also called for better coordination between employment and social policy; thus setting the framework for policies in both areas in the 1970s. Reflecting the content of the 1971 report, the bill proposed by the center-left-wing coalition government (the Center Party, the Social Democrats, the Liberals, and the Swedish People's Party) gave the state responsibility to promote the balance between work force supply and demand in order to ensure at the very least a minimum level of subsistence for Finnish citizens and national economic growth.

The draft legislation introduced the idea of employment training as a central policy instrument to improve citizens' chances to relocate themselves in the labor market. Responsibility for developing job training opportunities was given to the national government authorities, including local labor mediation offices. The regulations for the coursed for the unemployed were more flexible: the authorities were enabled to train the unemployed quickly with short courses when the demand for labor was

high and to take more participants and lengthen courses when the level of unemployment rose. The bill also gave the national and municipal authorities responsibility to plan the courses a year in advance with an eye on the general employment situation. Details on local authority responsibilities, basic unemployment allowances, and the reorganization of the labor administration were also included in the bill.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the public debate was gender neutral and focused on ways that the state could encourage full employment. The problem was that there was a shortage of trained personnel in the south and high unemployment in the north. The government turned toward job training as a solution and sought to offer job training programs to solve the labor market problems. Underlying the public gender-neutral position was the ‘assumption that married women could be used as a flexible source of labor.’ Furthermore the all-male Economic Commission report formally identified the absence of male reserves and the need to take advantage of married women who had not entered the workforce. In general gender neutral euphemisms are used to imply women should be used as a reserve of labor such as the dormant unemployed, marginal groups etc. Many policy actors saw women in their roles as housewives and mothers, economically dependent on men.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None explicit

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The issue frame of the debate was gendered by the end: the appendix in Economic Commission report by a women in the labor ministry, not taken up in the body of the report, introduced and alternative to the mainstream employment view on women – that married women/ full-time mothers were a potential for full-time labor and than childcare should be give to give them a real choice; parliamentary debate took gendered tone when two women Mps introduced gender balance into local training committees in the context of ‘discussion women’s low status, the gender discrimination in recruitment to employment courses by labor mediation offices, and women’s lack of power in labor-related decisions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Married women/full time mothers a potential for full time labor and childcare should give them a real choice**
- **Because of women’s low status in the workforce, should have gender balance on local training committees.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

TCSW: The TCSW supported the view that women’s inferior position was due to division of labor between women and men at home as well as labor market; married women/mothers should be able to choose to pursue full-time jobs and childcare should be provided to give them a real choice. Women needed to have more say in

the decision-making process and representation of worker's interests. These positions coincided with the platform of A9.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Women's inferior position due to division of labor between men and women as well as labor market; married women should be able to choose full time jobs and get childcare; need more say in decision making process.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The TCSW had a focus on issues that affected women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Within the Cabinet as advisory council

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **MP Sylvi Siltanen**

Years in WPA: **1969-71**

WMA activity: **In SD party women's section**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Clearly the women's movement was in a period of growth.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equality in working life**
- **Equality in family life**
- **Day care**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Sexual self-determination and sexual rights**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Moderate counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Collective Bargaining Process-Economic Commission**
- **Ministry of Labor**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats, Center Party, and the Peoples Democrats

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: FIN_JT2 1971-75

Title: Adult Further Training Reform

WPA: Council for Equality (CE)

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Sylvia Saimo, MP; leader of women's section of Center party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Finnish women have duty to support women who are down trodden; does not see cohabitation on equal stance with marriage.**

Policy goals:

WMA 2

Name: **Researcher; letter to editor**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Criticized the mainstream debates on employment policy for excluding gender considerations and women's equality issues.**

Policy goals:

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Redesigned training to be more flexible to target adults through further vocational training**
2. **Raised the participant age limit to 20 years in principle,**
3. **Shifted from training the unemployed to retraining employed workers**
4. **Opened the possibility to attend courses for age groups under 17 in order to close the gap between employment training and unemployment benefits.'(pg 197)**
5. **Reorganized the administration of training courses**
6. **Improved benefits so that union workers would not suffer financially by attending training courses.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Sylvia Saimo**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Spoke in parliamentary debate.**

WMA 2 **Researcher**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote letter to editor in newspaper.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The report by the all-male ministerial committee that prepared the 1975 Act from 1971 to 1973 was based on work done by the Economic Commission in the context of the 1971 Employment Act. The committee saw it as a major problem that the implementation of training courses did not sufficiently take into account the perspectives and concerns of employment policies. As a result, the report proposed a series of reforms with the aim of transforming employment training to more flexible, further vocational training intended mainly for adults. The reforms included raising the participant age limit to 20 years in principle, a shift from the unemployed to retraining employed workers, as well as opening the possibility to attend courses for age groups under 17 in order to close the gap between employment training and unemployment benefits. Another objective was an improvement in the social benefits for unionized workers so that they would not suffer financially by attending an employment course. There was also a need to reorganize the administration of training courses. As with the previous law, employment training was not seen as an effective, easy way to deal with the gap between labor supply and demand. Rather than attributing blame to anybody, the Committee report asserted that the problem was an adverse market affect and that it was up to the state to take corrective measures in the area of training.

The specific formulation of the bill proposal was overseen by the Ministry of Labor with organized labor, management, and the governing political parties. There was little debate in the preparliamentary stages and limited debate on two stipulations in parliament. An additional proposal introduced by the government was withdrawn following a threat from the People's Democratic League to leave the governing coalition. The proposal linked participation in training programs to unemployment benefits. Opponents were critical of what they saw as forced training as well as a narrow bourgeois employment training model aimed at producing humble workers not conscious of their oppression.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the issue was framed in terms of whether there was a need to reform the 1971 Employment Act so that the training programs coincide with the goals of the employment policies. Proponents of the reforms sought to shift the emphasis of the training programs from initial training to continued training of workers . The debate was gender neutral for the most part, with some mention of men's obligation with regards to paying alimony for children; there was no mention of women in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None**C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.**

The debate remained focused on the need to make the 1971 reform work with current employment policies throughout. Gendering was nearly absent from the

debates in Parliament — there was one mention of women in the context of opposing placing cohabitation on the same level as marriage. This did not gender the frame, however.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
CE: concerned with improving the skills of married women returning to working life, but politically divided in its views on the importance of job training versus adult education.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Charged with proposing reforms for gender equality

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
CE was a government advisory body with a small staff, placed in the Planning section of the PM's office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Name: **Leila Räsänen**
Years in WPA: **1971-75**
WMA activity: **Former A9 activist**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Growth**
Evidence and source: **The women's movement continued to be in a growth period during this second debate.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equality in working life**
- **Equality in family life**
- **Day care**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Sexual self-determination and sexual rights**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength
No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Economic Commission – Tripartite Body**
- **Government (Labor Ministry)**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Center Party, the Social Democratic Party, and the People's Democratic Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID : FIN_JT3 1977-87

Title: State Responsibility for Training

WPAs: Working Group (WG); Equality Group (EB); Council for Equality (CE)

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Naisasialiitto Unioni: Women's Union**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Improving women's position and rights in the labour market; equal rights frame; value care work.**

Policy goals: **Varied by political conviction; gender equality in training programs.**

WMA 2 **Social Democratic Women And Finnish Women's Democratic League (Extreme Left-Wing)**

Issue Definition: **Improving women's position and rights in the labour market; equal rights frame; value care work.**

Policy goals: **Varied by political conviction; gender equality in training programs.**

WMA3

Name: **Female-Dominated Trade Unions And Left-Wing Organisations, Academic Feminism**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Value care work performed by women.**

Policy goals: **Traditional women's professions (nursing, teaching etc.) should be better paid and valued in society.**

WMA4

Name: **Centre Party Women And Conservative Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Value women's care work**

Policy goals: **State should make it possible for individual women and individual families to choose for one parent to take care of kids at home, without losing her/his pensions rights, social security rights etc. because of this choice.**

WMA5

Name: **Small women's organizations**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Value care work by women.**

Policy goals: **Supported women's right to stay at home and take care of the family - and actually often told that this would be better for all women and the society.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Improving women's position and rights in the labour market; equal rights frame.**

Policy goals: **Gender equality in training programs.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **1987 Employment Act brought existing policy in line with the 1972 constitutional amendment that made the government responsible for guaranteeing the right of every citizen to a job.**
2. **Instituted reforms to deal with groups with high unemployment, youth, women and the long-term unemployed through improving job opportunities and state-run training programs at the municipal level.**
3. **Training— education, job training, or on the job training, both public and private— was offered to target groups as an alternative to a job.**
4. **A paragraph on gender equality that required new training programs to promote gender equality in the job market.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Naisialiitto Unioni: **Women's Union**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activity**

WMA 2 **Social Democratic Women And Finnish Women's Democratic League**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization s**

Activities: **No activity**

WMA 3 **Female trade union women etc**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization s**

Activities During the Debate: **No activity**

WMA 4 **Center party/conservative women**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organizations**

Activities During the Debate: **No activity**

WMA 5 **Small organizations**

Form: **Formal organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activity**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1972, the Constitution was amended to make the right of every citizen to a job a responsibility of the government. In 1980, the parliamentary Committee for

Constitutional Law decided that the amendment was binding and announced officially that the 1971 Act should be reformed to bring policy in line with the new amendment. From 1977 to 1980, a tripartite employment committee began to prepare draft legislation. After 1980, formulation continued in a working group in the Ministry of Labor. In the parliamentary elections of 1983, the populist Finnish Rural Party more than doubled its seats by promising to eliminate unemployment in six months. The new Ministers of Labor, Urpo Leppanen from the Rural Party, regarded a new employment act as crucial to his party's goals of eliminating unemployment. Negotiations thus continued on the bill proposal under the new Government from 1983 to 1986. The bill was presented to parliament in the late summer of 1986.

In addition to bringing existing law into line with the constitution, policy actors pursued reform in employment legislation in response to rising unemployment and the continuing growth of the labor force, predominantly fueled by women's entry into the labor market. Government officials identified that women, the young, and long-term unemployed had swollen the ranks of the unemployed as well. The main purpose of the draft bill was to guarantee citizen's right to work, in other words to make the national government and the municipalities accountable to find work opportunities for all job seekers. The primary method was to make public labor mediation more effective so that the unemployed could be placed in jobs and/or retrained without risk of becoming marginalized in the labor market. As a last resort, the national and local authorities were obliged to provide the unemployed with a temporary 6-month job in the state or municipal infrastructure.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

At the beginning of the debate (1977) the dominant frame was how to bring training policy in line with the constitutional requirement of providing jobs for all citizens; this meant training geared to eliminating unemployment.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Gender was incorporated during the course of the debate in the form of explaining unemployment in terms of women's entry into the work force. Promote gender equality will reduce unemployment; value care work in the home.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Promote gender equality in the work force**
- **Value women's care work in the home**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 WG: men are treated better than women in the job market; promoted the need to introduce a gender equality clause in the new legislation.

WPA 2 EB: men are treated better than women in the job market; promoted the need to introduce a gender equality clause in the new legislation.

WPA 3 CE: did not present micro frame

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Men are treated better than women in the job market; promoted the need to introduce a gender equality clause in the new legislation.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 WG: limited to preparing the UN decade program.

WPA 2 EB: gender mainstreaming within the Ministry of Labor.

WPA 3 CE: charged with proposing reforms for gender equality.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 WG: within the Ministry of Labor was a short- term, temporary body that was preparing for the United Nations Decade of Women program.

WPA 2 EB: an administrative body within the Ministry of Labor.

WPA 3 CE: government advisory body with a small staff, placed in the Planning section of the PM's office; in 1986 into Ministry of Social Affairs.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA1 WG:

Name: **A woman bureaucrat**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Probably none**

WPA 3 CE:

Name: **Eeva Kuuskoski-Vikatmaa (Centre Party)**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

WPA2 EB:

Name: **Matti Ilonen (male)**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Finnish women's movements continued their growth from the late 1970s t the mid 1980s, as there appeared both new groups and organizations, and women's studies started to mobilize women in the academia.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equality in working life, especially equal pay**
- **Peace issues and the question of whether women should be allowed in the army**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **The ordination of women priests**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (especially day care)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Labor**
- **Organized Management**
- **Trade Unions**
- **Equality Board (part of Ministry of Labor)**
- **Legal Experts**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Center Party- Social Democrat coalition.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: FIN_JT4 1992-93

Title: Training linked to unemployment benefits in the 1993 Act

WPAs: Council for Equality (CE); Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women's organizations**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Problem is treating married women as part of husband, rather than independent; married women work as individuals and need generous reconciliation policies.**

Policy goals: **Maintain women-friendly welfare states.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Reform of unemployment benefit system to distinguish between people with a working history, or willingness to work, and those who refuse employment.**
2. **Creation of a subsidy to fund job training for employed and unemployed workers that had an unlimited duration.**
3. **Establishment of penalties for individuals who refused training and were unwilling to work through the use of financial sanctions.**
4. **Made previous work history instead of family income a precondition for receiving allowance for job training.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women's organizations**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made general requests pertaining to the budget.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

At the beginning of the 1990s, Finland was hit by an unprecedented economic recession, due to shifts in the international economy, a decline in national exports as a result of the loss of the Soviet markets, and several banks crashing. The number of unemployed more than doubled from 1991 to 1993. Public expenditures on social benefits also skyrocketed. The new center-right coalition government pursued draconian policies to reduce state spending and to balance the budget. In the context of the increase in unemployment, a 1991 collective labor market agreement established the need to have a committee to investigate reforming unemployment

benefits. The Ministry of Social Affairs and Health nominated a tripartite committee to take up reform in 1992. In its 1993 report, the committee concluded that the Finnish unemployment system, which worked well in the past, was in crisis. Whereas on the one hand more unemployed people were facing subsistence problems, on the other hand the high numbers of long-term unemployed were straining the current social welfare system, pushing it beyond its budgetary capabilities. The solution proposed was to reform the unemployed benefit system in a way that would distinguish people with a working history, or a willingness to seek work from other groups. In the area of job training, the committee proposed to make a 'labor market subsidy' to enhance the skills of unemployed workers. It would be available to any worker willing to enroll in a training program or to take a spot in an on the job training program, regardless of economic need, for as long as the individual was in training. The incentive was backed by financial sanctions for individuals who refused training.

Reflecting the links between the center-right government and employers, many of the Committee's recommendations reflected the demands of big business rather than organized labor. The impending reforms became a sort of terrain for labor conflicts.

The question of unemployment benefits made its way to the top of the political agenda in early 1993, when trade unions threatened a general strike over the issue of young people's wages. The unions settled the dispute at the bargaining table. At the same time, tripartite agreement was reached on the principles of reforming the unemployment benefit system. The government submitted a bill in mid-October in conjunction with drawing up a state budget. The proposal followed the general recommendation of the Ministry of Social Affairs Committee with some specific changes to respond to trade union demands. In the context of impending EU membership, the government also emphasized that the new reforms would harmonize the Finnish unemployment benefit system with the European ones.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the early nineties, the Finnish economy was hit with an unprecedented recession and skyrocketing unemployment numbers. The unemployment benefits system was in crisis because of all of the newly unemployed people who were using the benefits. In the beginning, the dominant frame focused on ways to repair Finland's failing unemployment system. The center-right coalition government sought to solve the problem by introducing a policy that would distinguish between those who were willing to work and those who were not. People who were deemed unwilling to work would have their unemployment benefits reduced. The debate was gender neutral in the beginning – although gender neutral concept of an individual's dependency on spouse was introduced and individuals who care for children at home.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

The debate remained focused on ways to fix the unemployment system throughout. As the debate was brought to the parliament, some MPs attempted, without success, to introduce references to the implications of the bill on gender equality. The references to gender, however, neither changed the frame of the gender blind debate, nor affected the outcome of the law.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 CE: in the context of other policy discussions had demanded an individualization of the basic unemployment allowance to improve women's employment strategy more generally. Abstract protests against government cutbacks of programs.

WPA 2 EO: demanded individualization of the basic unemployment allowance to improve women's employment status.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 CE: gender equality

WPA2 EO: Formal head of the Equality Office, a judicial position, and is charged with overseeing the implementation of the 1972 Equality Act; multi issue.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA1 CE: located in the Ministry of Social Affairs; recommending body.

WPA2 EO: located in the Ministry of Social Affairs/judicial body.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

CE:

Name: **MP Tuula Kuittinen**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Center party women's organization.**

EO:

Name: **Tuulikki Patäjaniemi**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **Women's movements had entered into a stage of consolidation in the 1990's.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women (e.g. campaign against prohibiting rape in marriage in early 90s)**
- **Prostitution**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (e.g. day care issues)**
- **Reproductive rights (especially IVF)**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **Equal pay**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Strong counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Organized labor**
- **Management**
- **Right-wing Government – one person/small administrative committees**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Center- right coalition

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Equal Employment TAN at EU level

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID : FIN_PR1 1972-75

Title: Change in the Electoral Law

WPA: Council for Equality (CE)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women's Movement Actors**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

1. The main barrier to equality for women is the economic and social inequality, not the electoral law; did not see electoral law as a gender question

2. PR System works well for women's representation

3. This debate not a gender issue.

Policy goals: **Indifferent to proposal in this debate.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **The main barrier to equality for women is the economic and social inequality, not the electoral law; did not see electoral law as a gender question.**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. As a result of the debate, the government had to change its proposal and to accept both independent electoral associations and alliances between them.**

Previously, since 1955, the electoral law was based on independent electoral associations which registered at times of elections and had the right to put forward one candidate each. This action put the law back to this pre 1969 position.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women's Movement Actors**

Form: **Formal/informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1969, a new electoral law had been enacted in Finland. One of the most important changes was that the law granted parties a monopoly in nominating candidates in parliamentary elections. Previously, since 1955, the electoral law was based on independent electoral associations which registered at times of elections and had the right to put forward one candidate each. In 1966, the electoral law committee suggested that the right to nominate candidates in parliamentary elections should be

given to parties alone. One of the reasons was the desire to strengthen the position of parties in relation to elections.

The new law was resented among the people and many MPs from the beginning. The debate started in full in 1972 when parliamentary elections were held according to the new 1969 electoral law. The initial government position was hostile towards granting the right to nominate candidates for the independent electoral associations. However, the Constitutional Law Committee (1974) took an opposite view to the government and in the end the government gave in and drafted a new proposal that recognised the right of the independent electoral associations to nominate candidates.

In its new proposal, the government accepted independent electoral associations but did not want to allow alliances for them either with one another or with other parties. Again the Constitutional Law Committee changed the government's proposal so that the independent electoral associations were allowed to make an electoral alliance with other independent electoral associations but not with parties.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of democracy and the need to improve it. By restricting nominations to the parties many people left out according to the proponents. Proponents of the government legislation saw the independent electoral associations as a source of democracy since most people didn't belong to parties. They argued that they would help to improve representation if they were allowed to choose candidates. Those opposed to the associations argued that the electoral associations were too radical and would destroy Finnish politics. The debate was gender neutral and made no distinction between men and women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained framed in terms of democracy and representation through the end. The debate was gender neutral throughout and there was no distinction made between men and women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

CE: The current electoral laws, proportional representation especially, work for women.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
To prepare and propose reforms for gender equality.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The Council's secretariat was also placed in the Planning Section of the Prime Minister's Office, so the Council was very close to centers of power within the Finnish government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Meeri Kalavainen**

Years in WPA: **1972-75**

WMA activity: **Chair of SD women's section**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement was going through a period of growth when the debate took place. Second wave feminism gave rise to new consciousness-raising groups, which, however, had little public visibility or impact.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equality in working life**
- **Equality in family life**
- **Day care**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Sexual self-determination and sexual rights**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Political parties**
- **Lawyers**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

SDP- Center Party coalition in the Majority during the debate.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate:

Not Applicable

Debate ID: FIN_PR2 1986-87

Title: Gender Quotas in the SKDL

WPAs: None

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Sinikka Mustakallio; Ulla-Leena Alppi; MP and party activist**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **For Mustakallio, the reason that there were not more female representatives in the SKDL was that there was resistance from the patriarchal structures within the party.**

Policy Goals: **Mustakillio argued in favor of a quota for the number of women appointed to powerful positions in order to end the discrimination against women.**

WMA2

Name: **Naytit**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Naytit were disappointed at the SKDL's progress in promoting gender equality. For Naytit, the root of the problem was that there was structural discrimination that prevented women from attaining positions of power within the SKDL; patriarchal structures at the heart of inequality.**

Policy Goals : **Naytit supported quotas for the number of women appointed to positions of power within the SKDL; these should be binding, not temporary.**

WMA3

Name: **SNDL (The Finnish Women's Democratic League)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **True equality is not reached in the society without economic equality, and this we don't have yet. Quotas for women are not a solution forever, but a tool, with which you can endorse aspirations for gender equality, for example, solutions to the low pay problem. Quotas were thus a means to other ends rather than an end in itself.**

Policy goals: **Support quotas.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **The root of the problem was that there was structural discrimination that prevented women from attaining positions of power within the SKDL; patriarchal structures at the heart of inequality.**

Policy goals: **Support quotas.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Finnish People's Democratic Party (SKDL) adopted a quota rule which said that no more than 60% of the people appointed to decision-making structures could be of the same gender.**
2. **The positive impact of the quota rule was immediately seen in the Party Congress, which convened in May 1988, and where a new executive was elected (Finnish People's Democratic League 1988). 41 percent of the 163 representatives of the Congress were women. The new ten-member Party Executive had five women in it and of the vice members three were men and two women. This was a clear improvement when compared to the previous Executive. Also, in the long run, SKDL has had a gender balance in its party executive unlike most parties in Finland.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Sinikka Mustakallio**Form: **Individual**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Sinikka Mustakallio was an active member of Naytit and a member of the SKDL (The Finnish People's Democratic League). Mustakallio was asked by the party's general secretary to formulate a statement that would appeal to female voters- the party's quota proposal.**

WMA 2 **Naytit**Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated more as individuals than as an organization.**

WMA 3 **Finnish Women's Democratic League**Form: **Formal**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Made views known.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The Finnish People's Democratic League (SKDL) was the first established party in Finland to debate and to introduce gender quotas to its decision-making bodies in 1987. In its report to the Party Congress in 1988, the SKDL described itself as a male-dominated party of the working age population (SKDL, 1988a). Nevertheless, general equality objectives formed a central part of the party ideology and SKDL had been of the first parties in Finland to include new feminist ideas into its party program in the early 1970s. The party also had a separately organized women's section, the Finnish Women's Democratic League (SNDL). The introduction of the quota law in SKDL coincided with the coming into force of the Finnish Equality Act (1986). Both the party and its women's section had strongly supported the passing of the Act. SKDL's commitment to the Equality Act generated pressures for the

party to realize gender equality in its own male-dominated party structures. However, the idea for quotas did not come from the party's women's section. Instead, the general secretary of the party, Reijo Käkälä, asked Sinikka Mustakallio, who was working in the party administration at the time, to formulate a statement which would appeal to female voters and enhance the party's image among women in the elections in 1987. The women were disappointed in SKDL as a gender equality movement and Mustakallio felt that there was 'conscious resistance' against appointing women into top positions. With the support of the feminist group and particularly MP Ulla-Leena Alppi, another party activist, Mustakallio wrote a statement that argued for the introduction of gender quotas in the. The introduction of quotas was heatedly debated in the party executive, and initially, in December 1986, there was strong resistance to the idea. However, in January 1987, the executive recommended a quota rule for the decision-making bodies of the party.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

From the beginning, the debate was gendered and focused on equality. The debate was framed in terms of different conceptions of equality. There were differences in emphasis between the women, who brought forward the idea about quotas, and the party's official line. For the women active in *Näytit*, the quotas were to challenge the patriarchal structures of the party. Equal representation of women and men in the party was a value as such for these women. Quotas were regarded as the only effective way to transform the male-domination in the party and in politics. Rather than gender equality, the top officials in the party argued that the party ought to focus on economic equality and attempt to use quotas as a tool to end it.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Quotas will challenge patriarchal structures of the party**
- **Equal representation of women and men is a value**
- **Quotas the only way to overcome male domination in party and politics.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained framed in terms of equality throughout. Also the debate remained gendered and proponents of the quotas continued to argue that they would be used as a tool to remedy the effects of past discrimination against women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Quotas will challenge patriarchal structures of the party**
- **Equal representation of women and men is a value**
- **Quotas the only way to overcome male domination in party and politics.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
Not applicable

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name: **Not applicable**
 Years in WPA:
 WMA activity:

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
 Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement continued a period of growth when this debate took place. Women's studies were expanding in the academia and the women's political organizations on the left started drawing on the ideas that the women's studies were generating.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equality in working life, especially equal pay**
- **Peace issues and the question of whether women should be allowed in the army**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **The ordination of women priests**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (especially day care)**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength
Moderate counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **SKDL**
- **SKDL Party Executive**
- **Sinikka Mustakallio (Party Administration)**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Social Democratic Party, the Centre Party, The Swedish People's Party, the Rural Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate
Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the

maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: FIN_PR3 1991-95

Title: Gender Quotas in the Equality Act of 1995

WPAs: Council for Equality (CE); Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Coalition for Joint Action of Finnish Women's Organizations (NYKTIS)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need more women in parliament**

Policy goals: **supported proposals aimed at increasing the number of women in the Finnish government.**

WMA2

Name: **Network of women MPs in Parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Network focused on the problem of the under- representation of women in the Finnish government. The Network argued that the problem was outdated negative attitudes toward women and past discrimination. Majority saw discrimination through closed male networks. The argued that quotas were necessary to combat discrimination and increase women's representation within the Finnish government.**

Policy Goals : **The women argued in favor of quotas for women in governmental bodies, at least as a temporary measure.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **The problem was outdated negative attitudes toward women and past discrimination. Majority saw discrimination through closed male networks. The argued that quotas were necessary to combat discrimination and increase women's representation within the Finnish government.**

Policy goals: **Quotas**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The 1995 Equality Act included a paragraph that decrees that all government committees and other public preparatory bodies must be composed of at least 40 percent of both women and men.**
2. **There were also attempts to include a similar numerical quota in the regulations concerning the decision-making bodies of state-owned companies, but the initiative did not gain enough support. Instead, they are to have a balanced representation of both genders.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **NYKTIS**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not get directly involved in the parliamentary debate**

WMA 2 **Women MP Network**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by attempting to influence other members of parliament, playing a relatively central role; prepared alternative private member bills for inclusion of numerical quotas.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The Equality Act of 1987 included a loosely formulated paragraph on the Gendered composition of public preparatory bodies. Government committees, advisory boards and other corresponding bodies, including municipal committees, should include both women and men, unless there were special reasons to the contrary. The implementation however proved difficult, as especially municipal authorities insisted on interpreting the law in a minimal manner. The idea of including a numerical gender quota (40% of each gender) in the law in order to ensure its implementation was presented by two state committees in 1991-1992. However, the suggestion met with great criticism from most ministries and the organized management.

The final government proposal was a compromise solution that excluded the numerical gender quota in favor of a looser formulation concerning a balanced representation of both genders. In the right-centre Government, two women ministers formally dissented from the decision. Also the Minister for Gender Equality Affairs, Elisabeth Rehn (Swedish People's Party), who was responsible for the preparation of the law, personally supported a numerical quota but did not want to withdraw or delay the reform because of the conflicts. Two private member's bills for the inclusion of numerical quotas were prepared by the Network of Women's MPs in Parliament as alternatives to the Government's proposal. Mobilization by women MPs was also successful within Parliament: the Committee for Labor Market Affairs decided to recommend the numerical gender quota in its statement to the plenary.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

From the beginning, the debate was gendered. The debate was framed in terms of gender equality, which was supported unanimously throughout the debates regardless of one's opinion on gender quotas. The problem was defined as women's lack of opportunities to participate in policy preparation processes and the subsequent gender imbalance in public preparatory bodies. Women's descriptive under-representation had also led to an under-representation of women's

substantive interests in policy-making. There was not good enough use of women's resources and expertise in the service of the society either. There was disagreement over how to solve this problem. Right wing politicians argued that the root of the gender inequality problems lay in attitudes, and that quotas would do little to stem the problem. Left wing politicians argued that gender inequalities arose out of structural causes and that quotas would provide a tool to break the male domination.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Support for gender equality**
- **Problem was defined as women's lack of opportunities to participate in policy preparation processes and the subsequent gender imbalance in public preparatory bodies**
- **Women's descriptive under-representation had also led to an under-representation of women's substantive interests in policy-making. There was not good enough use of women's resources and expertise in the service of the society either.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained framed in terms of gender equality and gendered through the end. Through the debates, three different images of women arose, all of which focused on women's political competence and intelligence. One perspective ignored women's political competence and assumed that women were not in decision making bodies because of their 'political incompetence or their political passivity. The second perspective took note of women's political competence and argued that quotas were an affront to it. This perspective argued that women were largely more educated than men and that they should be allowed to succeed on their own merits, not a quota System. The third perspective argued that women were politically competent, but were restricted from decision centers because of discrimination and outdated attitudes. This perspective argued that quotas were a temporary tool necessary to correct end discrimination and outdated attitudes.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Gender equality supported**
- **One perspective ignored women's political competence and assumed that women were not in decision making bodies because of their 'political incompetence or their political passivity**
- **Second perspective took note of women's political competence and argued that quotas were an affront to it. This perspective argued that women were largely more educated than men and that they should be allowed to succeed on their own merits, not a quota system**
- **Third perspective argued that women were politically competent, but were restricted from decision centers because of discrimination and outdated attitudes. This perspective argued that quotas were a temporary tool necessary to correct end discrimination and outdated attitudes.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 CE: In the early stages of the debate, the Council was divided on the issue of quotas. In the later stages of the debate, the Council came to support quotas for women more strongly.

WPA 2 EO: the Ombudsman supported the idea of quotas for women in government. However, with the appointment of Tuulikki Petäjaniemi, the Equality Ombudsman stopped supporting quotas for women. During the debate Ombudsman stopped supporting quotas.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Cross sectional; reforms for gender equality

WPA 2 The EO had a cross- sectional focus on many issues that affected women. Ombudsman is formal head of the Equality Office, a judicial position, and is charged with overseeing the implementation of the 1972 Equality Act.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 Permanent advisory council located under the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health.

WPA 2 Judicial, formally independent official charged with supervising the equality act. Up until 2001, the women's policy offices shared an office and most of the personnel resources under the formal leadership of the Ombudsman.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Tuula Kuittinen**

Years in WPA: **1992-95**

WMA activity: **None**

WPA 2

Name: **Tuulikki Petajaniemi**

Years in WPA: **1993-95**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **Women's movements had entered into a stage of consolidation in the 1990's.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women (e.g. campaign against prohibiting rape in marriage in early 90s)**
- **Prostitution**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (e.g. day care issues)**
- **Reproductive rights (especially IVF)**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **Equal pay**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Health and Social Affairs**
- **Network of Female MPs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Social Democrats were in opposition for the first time in 25 years, and the right-wing and center parties formed a coalition government led by Prime Minister Esko Aho (Centre Party).

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Development of a TAN around issues of Gender Balance through the EU**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: FIN_PT 1 1984-86

Title: The Repeal of the Vagrant Act

WPA: Council for Equality (CE)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Vappu Taipale, Minister ; leader of Social Democratic women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize prostitution.**

Name: **Inkeri Anttila**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist**

Policy Goals: **Against new prohibitive laws on prostitution.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abolitionism**

Policy goals: **decriminalize prostitution.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The law repealed the Vagrant Act and decriminalized prostitution in Finland.**
2. **The law only allowed criminal penalties to remain for pimping.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Vappu Taipale**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Minister and leader of SD women.**

WMA 2 **Inkeri Anttila**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Member of the committee studying repeal of the vagrants act.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The preparation of a new intoxicant abuse bill took place in the Delegation for the Prevention of Intoxicant Abuse, under the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health during 1973-84. The vagrant question was discussed in the Delegation every now and then, without agreeing on the need to draft a substitute law covering those groups, e.g. prostitutes, that would not be covered by the Intoxicant Abuse Act.

At the beginning of 1984 repeal of the Vagrant Act was included in the bill under preparation. According to Tapani Sarvanti, the Secretary General of the Delegation at the time, this occurred because of a change of Ministers in the Government: Marjatta Väänänen of the Centre Party, who had opposed the repeal of the Vagrant Act, was replaced by the Social Democrat Vappu Taipale. The Social Democratic bureaucrats within the Ministry saw this as an opportunity to carry out the needed reform. According to Sarvanti, it was a purely male-dominated bureaucratic process, with no direct intervention attempts by either the Council for Equality between Men and Women or by women's organizations.

The new minister hardly was a political puppet for the ministerial bureaucrats in this matter, either. A self-professed feminist and the leader of the Social Democratic Women (1984-90) with a long career in social policy administration, Taipale had also close connections to the November movement, a 1960s protest movement speaking for the human rights of social outcasts and the abolition of outdated vagrancy laws.

A repeal of the Vagrant Act was included in a Government bill submitted to the Parliament in November 1984. The inclusion of the repeal of the Vagrant Act in the Intoxicant Abuse Act was motivated by arguments saying that the target groups of the two laws very much overlapped. Prostitution was not discussed as a specific question at all in the Bill.

In the Government, the Minister of the Interior, Matti Luttinen (Social Democratic Party), actively opposed a total repeal, defending in this way his own ministry's opinion that the Vagrant Act should be kept in force because of its deterrence value (Council of State 1984). In contrast to the quarrel within the Government, during the reading of the bill prostitution was barely mentioned.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in a way which subsumed prostitutes under the category of vagrants discussed in the vagrant act. The frame saw prostitutes and vagrants as a product of a disadvantaged social situation and things like drug abuse. Rather than punish prostitutes, the dominant frame sought to repeal the old vagrant act in order to help prostitutes.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Over its course, the debate became gendered and also focused on finding ways to help prostitutes. The Committee for Investigating the Consequences of the Repeal of the Vagrant Act was largely responsible for gendering the issue. The committee stressed the connections between prostitution and the gender system, seeing the prevalent sexual culture and the uneven power balance between the sexes along with social and economic factors as causes of prostitution. Female prostitutes were

basically defined as victims of a patriarchal culture and other social structures and they needed help through social policies. Ultimately the committee recommended that prostitution should not be criminalized and that it could be eliminated by eliminating the sexual inequalities that cause it.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Connections between prostitution and the gender system, the prevalent sexual culture and the uneven power balance between the sexes along with social and economic factors cause prostitution**
- **Female prostitutes defined as victims of patriarchal culture and need help through social policies.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

EC: was in favor of a repeal of the act and for the decriminalization of prostitution; femocrats represented abolitionist perspectives.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Abolitionism; prostitution is product of patriarchal culture.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

EC: cross sectional focus on issues that revolved around gender equality.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

A permanent advisory committee in the Prime Minister's office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Leila Rasanen and Eeva-Liisa Tuominen (in the 1980s)**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Had feminist backgrounds**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **During the debate, the women's movement was growing, and above all feminist studies were mobilizing women in academia.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equality in working life, especially equal pay**
- **Peace issues and the question of whether women should be allowed in the army**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **The ordination of women priests**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (especially day care)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

The Ministry of the Interior, the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health, Parliament; parties, municipal organizations, social partners and voluntary organizations; Committee for Investigating the Consequences of the Repeal of the Vagrancy Act.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats and the Center party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**
- **Feminist Network Against Female Sexual Slavery**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: FIN_PT2 1993-98

Title: New Sex Crime Act

WPAs: Council for Equality (CE);_Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Network of Women MPs in Parliament (NYTKIS)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is the result of the uneven balance of power between the sexes; threat to continued development of a gender equal society. Men are child molesters of the young and exploit adult women as clients of prostitutes.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize those who buy sex from the young and male clients of adult women. Total Criminalization of clients (male) only.**

WMA2

Name: **Coalition for Joint Action of Finnish Women's Organizations**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally agreed with the Network of Women MPs that prostitution was exploitation of women and that clients should be criminalized.**

Policy goals: **However, different sections (different parties' women's organisations/representatives with different political convictions) had slightly different views on what should be done: the left-wing women suggested only criminalising the clients, some right-wing + green representatives had more diffuse Ideas about criminalising both clients and prostitutes.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is the result of the uneven balance of power between the sexes; threat to continued development of a gender equal society. Men are child molesters of the young and exploit adult women as clients of prostitutes.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the clients.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Act retained the criminalization of pimping .**
2. **The final law also included limited criminalization of sex clients: henceforth, it was prohibited to buy sexual services from persons under the age of 18 years, under threat of a fine or a maximum of six months' imprisonment**
3. **The effect of the law was to limit prostitution by focusing on pimps and clients, rather than the prostitutes themselves.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 NYTKIS

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Submitted bills and promoted their micro Frame in debate and deliberations.**

WMA 2 Coalition for Joint Action of Finnish Women's Organizations

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in national conferences, discussed the issue, possibly made some statements.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The work toward a total reform of the Penal Code of 1889 had started in the early 1970s and continued in a special task force set by the Ministry of Justice from 1980. The part dealing with sexual crimes was implemented as the third stage of the reform in 1998, along with laws concerning crimes against judicial authority, public authorities and public order.

From the very beginning, the purpose of the law was to protect one's sexual self-determination and integrity, and punish the abuse of power in violation of those rights. Thus, the motive was to uphold individual rights rather than to promote a uniform conception of socially acceptable sexual mores. The law also aimed at neutrality in regard to gender, sexual orientation and family status. A second purpose of the new law was to better protect children from sexual abuse, e.g. by criminalizing new aspects of child pornography and molestation.

Initially, the aim of the law was to reform pimping laws only. However, during the 1990's other issues concerning prostitution also took on a prominent place in the policy debate.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In 1993 the frame was protection for children and the young. Proposals to make purchasing sex from the young a crime. Young people seen as too immature to make decision to be prostitute.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end of the debate government proposals had adopted view that prostitution was the consequence of the uneven balance of power between the sexes and a threat to the continued development towards a gender equal society. This was mixed with a law and order frame that forefronted the guilt of male clients including them along with pimps as part of the exploitation of women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Prostitution consequence of uneven balance of power between the sexes and a threat to continued development towards a gender equal society**
- **Male clients guilty along with pimps for exploitation of women.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1

CE: Supported women's movement abolitionist demands and actively argued in favor of criminalizing the actions of male pimps and clients.

WPA 2

EO: Supporting women's movement suggestions for criminalizing clients and pimps, while leaving prostitutes alone.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Abolitionism; criminalizing pimps, leaving prostitutes alone.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

CE: To monitor gender equality affairs, investigate on issues and to prepare matters and make initiatives for the promotion of gender equality.

WPA 2

EO: Cross-sectional focus on many issues that effected women. Ombudsman is formal head of the Equality Office, a judicial position, and is charged with overseeing the implementation of the 1972 Equality Act.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1

CE: State committee, permanent-type but in practice renewed every 3 (later every 4) years. Was at the time under the ministry of social affairs and health. In practice staff was combined with the equality ombudsman's staff under the formal leadership of the head of the equality office.

WPA 2

EO: The Equality Ombudsman was a, 'judicial, formally independent official charged with supervising the equality act. Up until 2001, the women's policy offices shared an office and most of the personnel resources under the formal leadership of the Ombudsman.' equality ombudsman formally independent; the staff under the ministry of social affairs and health in the equality office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 CE

Name: **1992-95: Tuula Kuittinen MP Centre party; 1995-98: Tuula Haatainen SDP**
Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Tuula Kuittinen was active in centre party women's section.**

Tuula Haatainen in socialdemocratic women's section. of those, only Haatainen had profiled in any manner as a feminist.

WPA 2 EO

Name: **Tuulikki Petajaniemi 1993-95; Pirkko Makinen 1995-98**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Mäkinen was a bureaucrat/lawyer and considers herself a feminist.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **Women's movements had entered into a stage of consolidation in the 1990's.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence against women (e.g. campaign against prohibiting rape in marriage in early 90s)**
- **Prostitution**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (e.g. day care issues)**
- **Reproductive rights (especially IVF)**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **Equal pay**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Strong counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of Justice**
- **Legal and social policy experts**
- **Parliament**
- **Council of Equality**
- **Equality Ombudsman**
- **Women's Rights and Children's Rights NGOs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats formed a rainbow coalition with the Greens, the Left Wing Alliance, and the Swedish Party thrown in.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**
- **Feminist Network Against Female Sexual Slavery**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: FIN PT3 1995-99

Title: Municipal ordinance of Helsinki

WPA: Equality Board of the City of Helsinki (EB)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Sari Nare, Green party, City councilor;**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The victims of the situation of increased prostitution in city were ordinary women, compelled to evaluate their risk of being harassed or violated when moving around the city; proposed prohibiting using sexual epithets and offering to buy sex in public places. Every woman has the right to move and act freely without threat of harassment in the city. prostitution oppresses women.**

Policy goals: **criminalize clients especially; prohibit using sexual epithets and offering to buy sex in public places.**

WMA2

Name: **Inka Kanerva (Green**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is threat to women's status; challenged idea that prostitution is threat to women; buyers and sellers both responsible.**

Policy goals: **Prohibit activity of both buyers and sellers of sex.**

WMA3

Name **Marjut Jyrkinen, feminist researcher**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is threat to women's status; challenged idea that prostitution is threat to women; buyers and sellers both responsible.**

Policy goals: **Prohibit activity of both buyers and sellers of sex.**

WMA4

Name **Mari-Elina Laukkanen, feminist researcher**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is threat to women's status; challenged idea that prostitution is threat to women; buyers and sellers both responsible.**

Policy goals: **Prohibit activity of both buyers and sellers of sex.**

WMA5

Name: **Unioni**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist view: prostitution as oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Unioni was against criminalizing the actions of prostitutes, but instead argued that the anti- prostitution law should ban the actions of pimps. Unioni**

recommended several proposals that would control prostitution by banning pimping and other exploitative practices.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist view: prostitution as oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Unioni was against criminalizing the actions of prostitutes, but instead argued that the anti-prostitution law should ban the actions of pimps. Unioni recommended several proposals that would control prostitution by banning pimping and other exploitative practices.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The total ban on public prostitution proposed by the City Board won out in the City Council against other ordinances. The debates in the City Council had quite clearly indicated that the ban was meant to include both the buying and selling of sex.**
- 2. The police and the city authorities interpreted the prohibition to concern only the sellers i.e. the prostitutes.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Nare**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **In non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Most active in the City Council: also wrote in the papers, participated in tv-talks and public debates on prostitution.**

WMA 2 **Kanerva**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active on city council.**

WMA 3 **Jyrkinen**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **From STAKES (Social Policy Studies Institute), wrote in the largest newspaper.**

WMA 4 **Laukkanen**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **From STAKES (Social Policy Studies Institute), wrote in the largest newspaper.**

WMA 5 **Unioni**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **National level feminist group participated in the debate by proposing laws to the city council.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Helsinki, the capital of Finland, was one of the first municipalities to be hit by open street prostitution at the beginning of the 1990s. Street prostitution spread especially to the neighborhood of Kallio, near the center of the city. The activity of street prostitutes and their clients with all its side-effects soon mobilized the mostly middle-class inhabitants to demand that the State and the City put a stop to the activity by a law or a municipal ordinance.

During the 1990s, the City of Helsinki responded to these demands by adding to traffic regulations, e.g. by prohibiting night traffic in some streets and by increasing police control in the area. On more than one occasion, the police proposed a creation of tolerance zones in some suitable uninhabited areas in order to minimize the disturbance that prostitution caused for outsiders. In the opinion of the city authorities and the Central Organization of Finnish Municipalities, it was impossible to include a prostitution ban in the municipal ordinance because that would overstep the legal authority of the municipality. This standpoint was maintained until the spring of 1999, when the authorities of Helsinki turned their coats rapidly in the face of pressure politics and the failure to enact national legislation restricting prostitution.

The reform of the old municipal ordinance of 1977 had started as early as in 1995, and the first proposal for a new ordinance was finished in spring 1998. In it, the city defined the norms and rules for public order, safety and the general welfare of the citizens. The proposal did not yet include any language on prostitution. The proposal was sent to hearing in different municipal bodies, and feedback was requested from the inhabitants. Few of the resulting 400-500 e-mails and letters brought up the prostitution issue: the citizens were more concerned about the proposal to prohibit public drinking and the rules concerning walking dogs.

A neighborhood association, the Kallio Society (*Kallio-Seura*) had been the main local pressure group in the prostitution issue since the end of the 1980s. In spring 1996 some of its activists had organised a spin-off movement called 'Prostitution off the Streets' that consisted of about 30 active members (Interview with Saara Tolonen 22 October 1999). In spring 1998, both of these pressure groups again called for a ban on prostitution by municipal ordinance, i.e. the prohibition of both the selling and buying of sexual services in public and private places. The organisations had obtained a couple of hundred signatures in support of a petition and had organised a letter campaign to be conducted by the neighbourhood.

Two of the Green councillors, Sari Näre and Inka Kanerva, had submitted a series of initiatives for restricting prostitution by municipal ordinance over the years. Some of the municipal boards, i.e. the Board for Urban Planning and the Real Estate Board, also joined the forces in favor of a prostitution ban in 1998.

The campaigns were successful in that the modified proposal for a new municipal ordinance submitted in autumn 1999 included a prohibition of prostitution in the form of a total ban on public prostitution: Prostitution in public places is prohibited.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The law and order issue set the dominant frame. The problem was defined as the increasing visibility of prostitution and the disturbances it caused for ordinary citizens. They were the victims of prostitutes, clients, and pimps. The criminal activities of prostitution were seen as being connected to drug abuse and organized crime. In order to solve this problem, a ban on prostitution in Helsinki was suggested.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on the law and order frame and in the end it was also fendered. A liberal feminist understanding of prostitution became widely accepted during the debate. The liberal feminist standpoint utilized the gender equality arguments, but also challenged the idea of prostitutes as justice victims to be protected from sanctions. From this standpoint, many of the women involved in the debate supported legislation which would criminalize the actions of both clients, pimps and prostitutes. Prostitution was seen as a threat to both ‘public peace’ and ‘women’s peace’, that is, every woman’s right to move and act freely and without threat of harassment.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Gender equality argument**
- **Prostitution threat to women’s peace; every woman has right to move and act freely without threat of harassment.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Cross sectional attention to gender equality

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Advisory board appointed by Council and advisory to it.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Male non-councillor from the National Coalition Party**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **Women's movements had entered into a stage of consolidation in the 1990's.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Violence against women (e.g. campaign against prohibiting rape in marriage in early 90s)**
- **Prostitution**
- **Reconciliation of work and family (e.g. day care issues)**
- **Reproductive rights (especially IVF)**
- **Gender equality legislation**
- **Equal pay**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Moderately strong counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Helsinki City Council**
- **National Coalition Party**
- **SDP**
- **Greens**
- **Left-Wing Alliance**
- **Swedish People's Party**
- **Centre Party**
- **Some minor parties with one elected councilor**
- **Mayor**
- **Chair of City council**
- **Chair of City board**
- **Other municipal Boards (in particular the Urban Planning Board and the Real Estate Board were active in this debate but also others gave statements on the issue)**
- **City administration**
- **Police**
- **The Kallio Society**
- **Other neighbourhood associations**
- **Association of Helsinki Neighbourhood Associations**
- **House-owning corporations**
- **Private small businesses**
- **Citizens at large**

- **Some Kallio-based institutions (the Kallio Future Workshop (Kallion tulevaisuusversta) Association Healthy Cities (Terveet kaupungit), IT House of Kallio (Kallion tietotupa))**
- **Committee for a Healthy and Safe City (Terve ja turvallinen kaupunki – neuvottelukunta)**
- **Prostitution Off the Streets**
- **Naisasialiitto Unioni**
- **Provincial government of Southern Finland**
- **Organization of Finnish Municipalities**
- **Individual feminists, individual women and men, individual law professionals**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

National Coalition Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**
- **Feminist Network Against Female Sexual Slavery**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: FRA_AB1 1979

Title: Reconfirmation of the 1975 abortion Legislation

WPA: Delegate Minister for the Status of Women and Family (DMSWF)

Dates of Coding: 12/23/03, 3/04/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Jeannette Laot, CFDT, MLAC

Micro Frame: **See CFDT and MLAC.**

Issue Definition: **Women must have the right to choose to give life (or not).**

Having a child is a fundamental act of liberty—not having the right to abortion makes women as a receptacle, a creature of reproduction.

The law is unjust. Halimi’s testimony to legislators: ‘Do you want to perpetuate a world full of cleavages, of oppression, of arbitrary privilege, or on the contrary, do you want to change so that life decisions, which are now permitted to men, will also be in principle permitted to women?’ Primarily a focus on women’s legal rights.

Policy goals: **Expand access to abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **Simone Iff, president of MFPP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Medical conditions of pregnancy, techniques and psychology necessary for women to have control over the bodies and their sexuality.**

Fundamentally abortion is a right of women, the right to control one/s own body.

Policy goals: **These included expanding the conditions under which a therapeutic abortion was allowed; suppressing the residency requirements for foreigners, allowing social security reimbursement, eliminating bans on publicity, making the interview optional rather than required, extension of the length of pregnancy for first trimester abortions; simplifying procedures for applying for abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **MLAC**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition **Abortion becomes a right for all without consideration of age or nationality.**

Policy goals: **Information on sexuality liberation that was not confined to genital sexuality.**

Assure freedom of access to contraceptives for all.

Reject all restraints on the liberty and responsibility of women, fight against the failure to treat abortion financially as another medical treatment, and fully overturn the 1920 law against abortion.

WMA 4

Name: **CHOISIR**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women must have the right to choose to give life (or not).****Having a child is a fundamental act of liberty—not having the right to abortion makes women as a receptacle, a creature of reproduction.****The law is unjust. Halimi’s testimony to legislators: ‘Do you want to perpetuate a world full of cleavages, of oppression, of arbitrary privilege, or on the contrary, do you want to change so that life decisions, which are now permitted to men, will also be in principle permitted to women?’ Primarily a focus on women's legal rights.**Policy goals: **Expand access to abortion.**

WMA 5

Name: **6 October, 1979 Demonstration**

Micro-Frame

Issue Definition: **Women must have the right to choose to give life (or not).****Having a child is a fundamental act of liberty—not having the right to abortion makes women as ‘a receptacle, a creature of reproduction.’****The law is unjust. Halimi’s testimony to legislators: ‘Do you want to perpetuate a world full of cleavages, of oppression, of arbitrary privilege, or on the contrary, do you want to change so that life decisions, which are now permitted to men, will also be in principle permitted to women?’ Primarily a focus on women's legal rights.**Policy goals: **Expand access to abortion.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Medical conditions of pregnancy, techniques and psychology necessary for women to have control over the bodies and their sexuality.****Fundamentally abortion is a right of women, the right to control one/s own body Abortion becomes a right for all without consideration of age or nationality.’****Women must have the right to choose to give life (or not). Having a child is a fundamental act of liberty—not having the right to abortion makes women as ‘a receptacle, a creature of reproduction.**Policy goals: **Information on sexuality liberation that was not confined to genital sexuality**

- **Assure freedom of access to contraceptives for all**
- **Reject all restraints on the liberty and responsibility of women, fight against the failure to treat abortion financially as another medical treatment, and fully overturn the 1920 law against abortion**

The law is unjust. Halimi’s testimony to legislators: ‘Do you want to perpetuate a world full of cleavages, of oppression, of arbitrary privilege, or on the contrary, do you want to change so that life decisions, which are now permitted to men, will also be in principle permitted to women?’ Primarily a focus on women's legal rights.Policy goals: **Expand access to abortion.**

These included expanding the conditions under which a therapeutic abortion was allowed; suppressing the residency requirements for foreigners, allowing social security reimbursement, eliminating bans on publicity, making the interview optional rather than required, extension of the length of pregnancy for first trimester abortions; simplifying procedures for applying for abortion.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. The 1975 law which legalized abortions in France was reaffirmed by loi Pelletier which passed in 1979.
2. The loi Pelletier did add some anti- abortion requirements to the 1975 law, including that doctors were required to inform patients of the consequences of abortion, of the national demographic situation, and of every person's national obligations to parent future citizens.
3. Abortion was not completely decriminalized and penalties for illegal abortions were increased.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Jeannette Laot, CFDT

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organizations**

Activities During the Debate: **Spokesperson for pro abortion reform ideas within the CFDT and brought the CFDT into the pro abortion movement activities.**

WMA 2 Simone Iff, MFPP

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Major Spokesperson for MFPP. beginning in February 1979, MFPP initiated collaboration with CFDT, CGT, FEN.**

- **31 March 1979 National Meeting on the theme: Contraception Abortion – women's rights and the laws [*Contraception avortement – le droit des femmes et les lois*].**
- **MFPP mobilization of all their activists enabled production of texts and documents throughout all regions of France—testimony, national investigations, video strips, tape recordings, panels.**
- **July 1979 MFPP issues White paper ; *Un dossier blanc sur l'avortement*.**
- **19 September 1979 appearance on TF1 show ‘ *Avortement, une loi en sursis*’.**
- **6 October 1979 March in Paris: same date as the opening of Parliament, this was attempt to show the nation's representatives the convictions, the strength in numbers and the struggle of women in the pro-abortion reform forces. 50000 women in march in Paris.**
- **October 1979 Publication of texts and documents, with legal commentary and analysis of all aspects of existing law.**
- **November 1979 at Beginning of debates, MFPP activists and the Confederation officially presented local elected reps as well as other parliamentary group with the information study.**

WMA 3 MLACForm: **Formal Organization**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **MLAC was founded to be activist and militant. Engaged in more extreme strikes, rallies, occupations, primary purpose was to bring access to abortions to all women. Members included reps of MLA, MFPF, MLF, signatories of the Manifesto of 331, GIS (Groupe Information-Sante), CFDT, MNEF, PS, PSU, etc) Activities include:**

- **10 March 1977 establishment of abortion clinic in Aix en Provence.**
- **Distribution of film on Karman method abortion to teach abortion technique.**
- **8 March 1978 co-sponsored with MFPF a day of research on Abortion and contraception.**
- **6 October 1979 March of women in Paris.**
- **Testified at government panels (for 1975 law, for 1979 debate).**
- **Throughout 1977 -79 takeovers/establishments of abortion clinics (Aix, Lyon, Marseille, Rouen, Lille).**
- **Assists women of all ages to have abortions, even if contrary to existing law.**

WMA 4 ChoisirForm: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Provides legal aid and assistance to people accused of performing or having abortions. President of Choisir, Halimi involved in creating popular social movement to push for reproductive rights. Also involved in Bobigny trial, started before this particular debate, continued through and after. Responded to outcry over ‘La Pergola’.**

WMA 5 October 1979 DemonstrationForm: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **March of 50,000 women in favor of the 1979 law.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The loi Veil also guaranteed that the question would come back to the public agenda after five years, when the National Assembly would assess the impact of the law and vote whether to reaffirm it. In late 1979, the question came to the Assembly. President Giscard d’Estaing appointed Monique Pelletier, the Ministere Deleegue après du Premier Ministre a la Condition Feminile et a la Famille (MDCFF), as floor manager of the bill.

The debate was already under way. Popular women’s magazines, like Elle, covered the issue in advance of its appearance in the National Assembly. Feminist abortion organizations launched manifestations and sent letters to politicians and ministers. The sensational la Pergola case which involved the arrest for infanticide of two doctors who had performed late term abortions, intensified the debate. The case

received much press attention, and Pergola, the abortion clinic in the 18th arrondissement of Paris, became a symbol for all that was wrong with the 1975 abortion law. For those against legalizing abortions, this case re-imaged abortion as the killing of children. For those who wanted future reforms, the case demonstrated the farce of not allowing minors to make their own decisions about abortions, the lack of appropriate facilities to perform the procedure, and the failure to inform young women of their rights.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Through the debate, the dominant frames were provided by the center- right government and the feminist movement. The center-right tried to frame the debate in ethical and demographic terms, while the feminists countered by framing abortion as a women's rights issue. The center-right group opposed abortion and argued that it should again be made illegal - a positive result would be that France's population would increase. The feminist pro-choice group recommended that the abortion law should not only be re-validated but also be be decriminalized. Furthermore they argued that many women were deprived of the right to have an abortion because of lack of social services in their locality and because of lack of money to pay, since it was not covered by state subsidies for health services. They argued that abortion should be made more widely available to women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- Abortion is women's rights issue
- Women were deprived of right to have abortion because of lack of services and lack of money
- Abortion should be made more widely available to women

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The pro choice and anti-abortion groups each framed the issue in terms similar to what they had used at the beginning of the debate. Through its course, the debate became gendered by both sides. The anti-abortionists provided an image of women as 'fecund suppliers of the nation' and argued that it was their duty , and indeed their nature, to have children. The pro-choice groups argued that abortion was necessary to ensure women's social and economic autonomy. Ultimately the issue was reframed in terms of health issues although demographic concerns continued to play a role.

In the end, the debate focused on demographics and the need to limit the number of abortions each year, so that the population would increase, but the abortion law was renewed, so the caveat about demography was established as an issue to be followed and addressed in other ways by the state and WPA.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Women as mothers

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

The MCDFFF supported the conservative government and argued that women should be mothers, in other words a pro natalist stance. Pelletier herself said that ‘abortion was not a right, abortion was not a liberalization’. Abortion was not progress. Indeed the law was proposed as the only chance to reduce abortion to only responsible acts.

Seems central although at times the debate is cast in terms of who will pay; also demographic issues coalesced with nationalism, focus on natalism as well. Why use social service monies (or why deny)? The ‘banalization’ of life: abortion allows people to do away conscience, guilt or responsibility, abortion becomes normal and it shouldn’t be.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1. Delegate Minister for Women’s Status and the Family (DMWSF)

The DMWSF a cross sectional focus on all issues that affected women. Was given the title of ‘family and feminine Condition’, and was charged with addressing all different aspects of the feminine condition. This term, however, was identified not with an approach to women’s rights but rather an emphasis on their roles as mothers and as a reserve pool of labor. The official charge is to promote all measures to improve the feminine condition, in particular those that favor the access of women to different levels of responsibilities or to eliminate all discrimination against women.

Policy Issues: Contributed to a law on rape and political representation – an early quota law; family policy, pro-natalist approach to it, increase in family allowances, reconciliation between work and family for women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1. DMSWF

A delegate minister attached to the Prime Minister’s Office.

C12A_1—WPA leader (s):

Name: Monique Pelletier

Years in WPA: Sept 1978-May 1981

WMA activities Pelletier was a Giscardian, center-right had been active in the party and had founded a women’s association called Dialogues des femmes, a small center group for women on women’s political representation (which organization wrote to Pelletier in 1980 about engineering the election of more women to municipal councils (which was adopted in Nov 1980)).

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement as a whole was scattered and decentralized, and continued to decline from its high point of activism in the late 1960s and early 1970s. Feminist groups had splintered into contentious factions and were divided over strategies as well as tactics.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Rape/ Violence against women**
- **Improving Women's Status and Rights**
- **Sex Equality in Paid Employment**
- **Anti Sexism in the Press and the Media**
- **Prostitution**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong

Views are based on a fundamentalist Christian interpretation that considers the act of abortion murder. Procreation is an act of God and it is through women that this act is possible. Thus it is unthinkable that women should control their own bodies and own destiny. This is a piece of legislation that is dangerous to society, because it does not respect life and it sacrifices innocents. In April 1979, the Church publishes paper on the 'unborn child' and the Episcopate Family Commission Against Abortion issues White paper.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Government**
- **Minister/floor manager**
- **Members of parliament.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

UDF and Giscardists had 123 deputies; Gaullists had 153 deputies.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: FRA_AB2 1981-83

Title: Reimbursement for non-therapeutic abortions Law

WPA: Delegate Ministry for Rights of Women (DMRW)

Date of Coding: 2/1/04, 3/04/04; 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Muguette Jacquaint (PCF –MP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women.**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **Denise Cacheux (PS)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women.**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

WMA 3

Name **Simone Veil**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women.**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

WMA 4

Name: **October 1982 Demonstration In Favor of Reimbursement**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women.**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

WMA 5

Name : **Mouvement pour la Liberté de l'Avortement et pour la contraception (MLAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women.**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

WMA 6

Name: **Choisir**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. Women's rights [to abortion] have been killed, if reimbursement is not provided. The right to abortion for all women (not just those who can afford it).**

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition:

Reimbursement is a battle (later a victory) against reactionary forces. Reimbursed costs for abortion are a minimal necessity for women's rights in society. described this as a social injustice and basis of inequality for women. Women's rights [to abortion] have been killed, if reimbursement is not provided. The right to abortion for all women (not just those who can afford it).

Policy goals: **In support of reimbursement. Protect women's rights to have an abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Reimburse 70% of the cost of abortion with women paying the remainder**
2. **Reimbursement not from Social Security but from the general budget**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Muguette Jacquaint (PCF-MP)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Supported reimbursement in National Assembly .**

WMA 2 **Denise Cacheux (PS-MP)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Supported reimbursement in National Assembly**

WMA 3 Simone Veil (UDF)Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Interviewed by Elle magazine****WMA 4 1982 Demonstration**Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Demonstration 10,000 people in favor of reimbursement organized by MFPF, MLAC and Choisir with participation by URP-CFDT, Choisir; MFPF, MLAC, CRIF, MIFAS Jeunes Femmes; Feminism et Politique; Centre Simone de Beauvoir; CUARH; Collectif Bichat; ANCIC (assoc Nationale des centres d'interruption des grosses and de contraception) ; CNAFAL; SND-FEN, UNE ID; CSF; CSCU; Associations Populaire et Famille; Syndicat de la Magistrature; SMG, USM, Federation Nationale de la Libre Pensee.**

Organized 1982 demonstration. Consulted on draft legislation by Roudy Ministry.

WMA 5 MLACForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Letters to Ministry, marches on streets, demonstrations. consulted on draft legislation by Roudy Ministry. After success: letters of thanks to Roudy and to Mitterrand (Minister of WPA and President respectively.) as well as large articles in newspapers and own feminist press. Organized massive demonstration in October 1982.**

WMA 6 CHOISIRForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities: **During the Debate: Choisir organized meetings, demonstrations, interviews, press releases, local activism. Consulted on draft legislation by Roudy Ministry.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

When the Socialist Party (PS) won the 1981 elections, a change was presaged for women's policy. The PS had undergone a transformation of sorts, when its own Secretariat des Droits des Femmes sponsored a congress for party delegates on women's rights in 1978; a rewritten platform on abortion was just one result. By 1979, PS had proposed a new abortion rights agenda that started with the proclamation that La Liberte de disposer de son corps est un droit inalienable- the freedom to control one's body is an inalienable right. Popular magazines took up the idea, with Elle publicizing the issue starting on 9 September 1980.

With the appointment of Yvette Roudy as the Ministere Delegee aupres du Premier Ministre charge des Droits de la Femme (MDDF) in 1981, the stage was set for abortion reform to proceed. Described by some as a militant feminist, Roudy

had made her reputation in the PS by insisting that the party pay attention to women's rights. Her leadership of the women's policy agency demonstrated a determination to bring issues to the agenda even if they were controversial and thus at risk of failure in the legislature. She first emphasized the need to focus on dissemination of contraception and contraceptive information in order to diminish the number of pregnancies that might lead to abortion: by March 1982, 88 new family planning centers had been organized under the aegis of the MDDF. Then she sought to increase the number of hospitals that offered abortion services. Lastly, the MDDF launched a campaign in January 1982 to secure reimbursement from state funds for non therapeutic abortion costs, for which there was still no state payment, although all other medical procedures were reimbursed either totally or in part by the social security system.

In March 1982, Roudy announced that an inter-ministerial council had approved the reimbursement of abortion costs, beginning in September. Prior to celebrating International Women's Day, Roudy remarked that 'March 8 is not just a symbolic day, but it is the start of a dynamic new era in the defense of women's rights.' Immediately anti-abortion groups launched street protests. Throughout the spring, the battle was played out in the press, among government ministries, and, later, in the National Assembly. In August, Social Security postponed reimbursement for abortion. Pierre Beregovoy, Minister of Social Affairs, said that the decision was not 'a question of money'. The Catholic leadership took this as a partial victory and the left, including feminist groups and unions, saw the decision as an affront to women, the breaking of a promise. Yvette Roudy found herself stuck between angry proponents of abortion reform and those who wanted to stop abortion. Beregovoy, a reluctant supporter of limited abortion reform, argued that, since it was a controversial issue, the decision should be made by Parliament.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning of the debate, Minister Yvette Roudy took the lead in establishing a dominant and gendered frame in terms of women's rights and class struggle. Pro abortionists argued that women seeking abortions should be reimbursed by the state so that poor and underprivileged women could also have access to legal abortions. There were two contrasting images of abortion seeking women throughout the debate. Pro abortionists portrayed abortion-seeking women as responsible people who had hard choices to make. Lack of access to subsidized abortions had made them criminals, or citizens unable to exercise their rights, or non-citizens unable to act as free adults. Anti-abortionists portrayed women seeking abortion as, 'murders who were trying to avoid their god-given responsibility and burden as females to give life. Anti-abortion groups argued that the state should restrict abortions by refusing to pay for them.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- Women's rights and class struggle.
- Poor and underprivileged women could also have access to legal abortions. Abortion-seeking women as 'responsible people who had hard choices to

- make. Lack of access to subsidized abortions had made them criminals, or citizens unable to exercise their rights, or non-citizens unable to act as free adults.**
- **Women seeking abortion as, murders who were trying to avoid their god-given responsibility and burden as females to give life.**
 - **Women seek abortions**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained gendered and it did slightly shift focus throughout. Ultimately, the decision concerning which fund would cover abortion reimbursement defined the terms of abortion in France. Anti- abortionists did not want to fund abortion at all, but if it was to be funded, they wanted it funded from a special source. This would distinguish abortion from other medical procedures that were funded from a general fund and it would make it so that abortion seemed like it was not a normal medical procedure.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

At the end of the debate the issue frame involved whether to treat abortion as a regular medical procedure or as a special case. Although it would appear that the issue frame became ungendered, indeed it was a feminist victory and thus essentially created an opportunity to have an issue that related only to women, to become an issue of equality and equity, rather than gender. So although it is true that it became ungendered, this was a feminist/gendered success.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

Delegate Ministry for Rights of Woman (DMRW)

Reimbursement would make women equal before the law, and able to exercise their rights—a question of justice. question was not whether abortion was going to become a normal medical practice, but whether class and sex would determine whether citizen’s rights could be accessed.

The MDDF proposed the bill to reimburse women for abortions and it argued in favor of it. Additionally, the MDDF argued that money for abortion should come from the general fund, so that it would be treated the same as other medical procedures.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

DMRW: Reimbursement would make women equal before the law and able to exercise their rights—a question of justice. question was not whether abortion was going to become a normal medical practice, but whether class and sex would determine whether citizen’s rights could be accessed.

The MDDF proposed the bill to reimburse women for abortions and it argued in favor of it. Additionally, the MDDF argued that money for abortion should come from the general fund, so that it would be treated the same as other medical procedures.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1-DMRW

Responsible for measures aimed to respect women's rights in society, to eliminate all discrimination against women and to increase the guarantees of equality for women in politics, the economy, society and culture. Informally, a strong focus on equal employment and training, first three laws were on equal employment, public funding for abortion and an anti sexist law. Did some policies on sexuality and violence; virtually nothing on reconciliation policy, avoided the whole issue of motherhood and child-rearing.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 DMRW

The DMRW was the only ministerial level WPA; all WPAs were centralized under its control. It was attached formally to the Prime Minister's Office. Unlike many delegate ministers attached to the Prime Minister's office the DMRW was at the top of the hierarchy and had a direct link to the PM's office in 1984.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Yvette Roudy**

Years in WPA: **1981-1986**

WMA activities: Roudy had been a founding member of the women's section of the PS and prior to its creation was in the Movement Démocratique et Féminin, which was a small 'club' or group close to the non Communist left, that promoted women's rights issues and focused on the improvement of women's status in politics and employment in the 1960s.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and sources: **Although the broader women's movement remained in decline, the reimbursement issue elicited a growing response from both emancipatory women's groups and the popular women's press.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Rape/Anti Sexual violence- stiffer implementation of rape law – linked to immigrant rights**
- **Anti-sexism – around the 1985 laws**
- **Equal Employment -focus on 1982 law Roudy — mostly centered in the PS and the CFDT with little mass involvement.**
- **Reimbursement of abortion – women's groups pushed Socialist government to have feminist law; women's group**
- **Immigrant Women's Rights — creation of new immigrant groups a Paris based- protest**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Some members of National Assembly spoke strongly against: Jean Foyer (RPR, Maine-et-Loire) FOYER seen in press as one of leaders of legislative opposition; Benouville (RPR, Paris) and other. Yves-Marie Sautier (UDF, Haute Savoie). For AOCPA: Bruno Meunier, Michel Raoult; Pierre Vignes; Jean-Francois Delenda.

Le Cartel pour le respect de la vie (représenter 146 associations opposed to abortion) founded 1983 by Tremblay; AOCPA (1982; Association pour l'objection de conscience a toute participation a l'avortement).

Laissez-les-vivre- SOS future meres; The catholic church and some conservatives were active, but the countermovement was rather weak and only managed to get a minor compromise on the bill (that only 70% of abortion costs would be reimbursed).

Micro Frame: Argued that this augured a continuation of immoral politics that would end in approving euthanasia and complete disrespect of life. One priest described it as euthanasia of conscience. One NA member (Hamel (UDF, Rhone) described abortion as assassination. Typically: (from Foyer) ‘For the third time, this government has chosen a period right before Christmas to push legislation of death.’ For Cartel: against reimbursement, and ‘will not pay the price for assassination’. And also that by providing reimbursement, denying rights of father and the ‘pater familias’—the law would transfer father's rights to the mother.’

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of parliament**
- **Ministers—Women’s Rights Minister – Inter parliamentary Council**
- **Health Minister leaders of Governing Majority**
- **Women’s Groups – Choisir, MFPP , MLAC and perhaps others.**
- **Pro Life Groups**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist party and Communist Party with minority governing majority status

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: FRA_ AB3 1991-1993

Title: Anti Abortion Commandos Law

WPA: Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights and Daily Life (DMRDL)

Date of Coding: 1/31/04, 3/04/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Coordination Nationale pour le Droit a l'Avortement et a la Contraception CADAC**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Actions of the abortion rights commandos were a threat to women's abortion rights.**

Policy goals: **Argued that the state should intervene and create a law that prohibited the abortion commandos from occupying abortion clinics and preventing women from obtaining abortions.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Actions of the abortion rights commandos were a threat to women's abortion rights.**

Policy goals: **Argued that the state should intervene and create a law that prohibited the abortion commandos from occupying abortion clinics and preventing women from obtaining abortions.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Penal sanctions for hindering access to abortions—a special offense**
2. **Associations given right to seek remedies in civil courts against offenders**
3. **Deleted portion of penal code that made self abortion a criminal offence**
4. **Fines of 2,000 to 30,000 francs for actions harassing patients or workers or preventing access to clinics.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **CADAC**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by writing an open letter to the premier in favor of crackdown on anti-abortion commandos. Also organizing marches and demonstrations. It was not allowed to enter the formal governmental/parliamentary sub-system on the debate.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Beginning in 1987, anti-abortion groups in France staged protests in urban streets and in front of abortion clinics and public hospitals, engaged in verbal and physical harassment of abortion clinic patients, and created blockages at hospitals and clinics. Police and judicial authorities seemed unwilling to stop the protests, and

abortion clinics rights groups as well as women's media expressed alarm about the growing threat to abortion access and rights. The actions, called commando anti-IVG, sought to save the lives of 'unborn children' by occupying clinics, harassing clients, contaminating medical supplies, and chaining themselves to equipment, before finally being evacuated by the police. SOS- Tout- Petet and La Treve de Dieu, leading groups involved in commando operations, were joined by other organizations including Laissez-les-vivre and ACPER-VIE SOS Maternite, a protestant anti-abortion commando group. In addition to encouragement from the Catholic Church, the commandos received support and advice from American anti-abortion groups such as Operation Rescue. As in the United States, the anti-abortion actions were designed to deter women seeking abortions as well as to inhibit the participation of health-care providers in abortion provision.

In June 1991, within weeks of taking the leadership of the Secretariat d' Etat aux Droits des Femmes et a la Vie Quotidienne (SEDFVQ), Veronique Neiertz issued a challenge to a commando operation at a Paris hospital. The secretariat not only judged the demonstration unacceptable, but Neiertz said she would work vigorously to stop the commandos. She hoped that the actions of the commandos would not pass without punishment and stipulated that the Ministry of Justice should pursue the offenders.

Four days after Neiertz's communiqué of June 21, the Health Minister Bruno Durieux and Mme. Neiertz issued a second circular, distributed to all regional and departmental prefects and directors of public hospitals. That communication instructed prefects and directors that blockages of hospitals and contamination of materials by anti-abortion groups were not to be tolerated, and that hospitals should take every precaution and measure to safeguard public hospital services-including abortion- and patients. Prefects were further instructed that in case of an incident, it is up to the hospital directors to immediately call public security to reestablish the hospital's functioning and to record the nature of the acts committed and the identities of the troublemakers. Administrators were further told to lodge systematic complaints for all infractions, destruction, and damage to material caused by anti-abortion groups and to provide all information and support necessary to individual victims who desire to lodge complaints. In autumn 1991, Neiertz announced the formation of an inter-ministerial study group to look at judicial sanctions and concrete measures to be taken against the commandos engaging in 'operations anti- IVG dans les hopitaux.' Ultimately the problem was brought to Parliament, where it came to a vote before the National Assembly. The inter-ministerial commission- regrettably according to Mme Neiertz- decided that the 'majority of the commando actions did not correspond to the character of infractions recognized in the legal texts, so that the issue had to be resolved by the legislative body.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, Secretary Neiertz of the SEDFVQ (The major women's policy agency) cast the anti-abortion commandos problem in two ways: one was a

reassurance to the abortion rights activists, using the rhetoric of women's bodies and rights, that she understood abortion access as a fundamental right of women; the other was to render the debate in terms of the state's legal authority, a move designed to deny legitimacy to these retrogressive anti-abortion activists. The issue was gendered in that it recognized that abortion was a women's issue and that the actions of the anti-abortion commandos threatened this rights. Abortion supporters argued that the state should create a law to prevent the anti-abortion commandos from blocking abortion clinics and argued that this was necessary so that women could receive abortions.

Anti-abortion forces introduced ideas of the immorality of abortion and returned to the theme of maternity and natalism. Important to save the life of the life of he unborn child. Women's roles were portrayed as the bearers and producers of children.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Pro- Abortion Frame:

Abortion was a women's issue and that the actions of the anti-abortion commandos threatened this rights.

These state should create a law to prevent the anti-abortion commandos from blocking abortion clinics so that women could receive abortions.

Anti-Abortion Frame: **Women's roles were portrayed as 'the bearers and producers of children.'**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

By the end of the debate, the pro anti-commando position became ungendered, an explicit strategy pursued by Neiertz. The legal status of the actions of the anti-abortion commandos was the focus. Secretary Neiertz gramed the debate more on the legal status of the actions of the anti-abortion commandos because she found that framing the debate on more feminist gendered terms where women's rights to abortion would be preserved did not get the Department of Justice to respond to the issue.

The anti-abortion commando position remained gendered in the same way, but arguably was not as much in the dominant frame as in the beginning.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
No Gendered ideas.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights and Daily Life (DMWRDL)

Argued that the state should enact laws that prohibited anti-abortion commandos from blocking abortion clinics and preventing women from receiving abortions, primarily and particularly by the end in the name of the legal status of the anti-abortion commandos. Although in the beginning she did support a feminist gendered approach to the issue.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

By the end Neiertz had explicitly rejected the gendered feminist frame of the issue, although she had clearly embraced it in the beginning.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Continued to emphasize any issues that affected women's rights, with the addition of daily life, for all citizens not just women, to women's rights; not a systematic cross-sectional remit.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

As a deputy ministry attached to the Labor Ministry it had a relative low position in the government hierarchy.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Veronique Neiertz**

Years in WPA: **1991-93**

WMA Activities: **Joined PS in 1972 at Congress at Epinay Active in the PS national committee, but not involved with women's rights issues, PS feminists or an WPAs prior being appointed.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Although there was not a significant mass-based women's movement like the movements of the 1970s, feminist organisations and movements in the early 1990s continued to gain momentum, re-emerging as important players.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Sexual Harassment**
- **Abortion and Contraception**
- **Immigrant women's rights**
- **Parity**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Strong

Christine Boutin; Thierry Lefevre (Treve de la Dieu); Xavier Dor (SOS-Tout-Petit); Jean Foyer; Michel Raoult; E-C Tremblay (president of Laissez-les-vivre).

Cartel des groupements et personnes pour le respect de la vie;

La Treve de Dieu — 1988 created by Thierry Lefevre when Pope visited Alsace.

The first organization to practice commando tactics and called it 'sauvetage'

RESCUE— Also affiliated w/ attacks on Roussel Uclaf in its research to develop RU-486.

SOS Tout Petits created in 1986 by Dr, Dor and Françoise Robin— engaged in lobbying as well as violent commando action ; Associated with extreme right and

National Front as well as catholic organizations Connected with US Right to Life since 1991 and Human Life international (a German anti-abortion group).

Les Amis du Professor Lejeune— created 1994 led by Jean Foyer (see Case #2) lobbying activity—associated with extreme right and Vatican Originally was doing genetic research on mental handicaps but transformed to distribute funds to those who want to continue work of Lejeune (who was a doctor, respected researcher, discoverer of supplementary chromosome 21, also in Opus Dei, strong supporter of Vatican and John Paul., by distributing funding to antiabortion groups).

Association catholique des infirmieres et des medecins (ACIM) founded 1982. as part of movement for Catholic youth— anti euthanasia, abortion, contraception. Publishes *Cahiers Saint Raphael*.

Cartel des groupements et personnes pour le respect de la vie; founded 1983 connected with Laissez-les-Vivre — lobbying NA/government/ provides advice to women to convince them to spurn abortion; connected to extreme right and to Vatican. Abortion is murder and anything is acceptable to stop it.

Laissez-Les-vivre – SOS Future Meres: founded by Tremblay in 1970. Publications; involved in commando action as well as lobbying. Connection to National Front as well as Vatican. The oldest of the anti-abortion organizations. In 1991 established international commission with representatives from church, NA, theological seminaries, some mayors; Birthright USA; National Front; Provida, and others. Connected also to women's section of National Front. Micro-Frame on this issue: commandos are saviors of soul of France and bodies and souls of babies, mothers, doctors.

ACPER VIE SOS MATERNITE founded in 1980 (Association des chrtiens protestants and evangeliques pour le respect de la vie) u Protestant group which is actively involved violent commando action. Closely aligned with Right to Life Committee from US who aids and advises, and to Treve de Dieu. Publishes anti-abortion tracts, crisis lines for pregnant women, and videotape lessons on how to attack clinics.

Association pour la promotion de la famille (APF);

AOCPA (association pour l'objection de conscience a toute participatoin a l'avortement);

Founded by Michel Roualt in 1982, who had left Laissez les vivre. Major activist in opposing reimbursement, also actions against Roussel-Uclaf and work with Pro-Life. Often synonymous with SOS tous-petits.

Magnificat; created 1974 charismatic Christian movement allied with Catholic Family Association. Help to sponsor démonstration in 1991.

Provie created 1986. formed from Belgian movement. ; not particularly active in France beyond supporting other movements.

L'UNEC Union des nations de l'Europe chretienne), 1989. Frame is to combat the ideologies that oppose the universal kingdom of Our Savior Jesus Christ, with ties to National Front and Belgian National Front. Pilgrimages to Auschwitz where it claims that worst genocide in history is killing of fetus.

Micro frame for all is similar: Abortion is murder, a crime. It is duty of people to save women and rescue fetus from assassination and murder. Violence is justified. All are based on a fundamentalist interpretation of Christianity. Fetus is considered a person and therefore needs to be rescued. Women are explicitly seen as achieving their rights through maternity and raising their children with the guidance of their husband.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of Justice**
- **National Assembly**
- **Ministry of Health**
- **Deputy Secretary of Women's Rights and Daily Life**
- **Interministerial Councils**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The President was a Socialist and there was a Socialist/ Center-Left Majority in the parliament.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name:

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: FRA_HI 1997-2000

Title: 35 Hour Work Week Reform

WPA: Deputy Minister of Women's Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

Date of Coding: 2/1/04, 3/03/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

Note on WMAs: There were many WMAs who developed arguments about gender equality and the 35 hour work week reform. They were a part of the equal employment policy network that brought together researchers, trade union feminists from the CFDT and the CGT, and femocrats – usually permanent staff to the Upper Council on Employment Equality together. They all more or less advanced a similar micro-frame/stance on the issue. The CNDF during the debate represented well these WMAs; all of them either participated directly or indirectly supported the political stances of the Collective. Although there were probably over 10 different actors who could be mentioned individually, organizations and individuals, the CNDF is presented here since it basically represented well the quite unified position of these EEP WMAs.

WMA 1

Name: **Catherine Genisson, Socialist Party, Member of Parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **In the National Assembly debates on the law she argued that the current definition of management time would hurt women managers attempting to combine work and family duties. More generally, supported the position that women's rights issues needed to be taken-up in the design of the 35 hour work week law, in particular in light of the gendered nature of the labor force where women were pushed into lower paying part-time jobs. This position was articulated through her government report and was widely seen as the women's movement position, but was not complete.**

Policy Goals; **Change definition of management time. Take into consideration gender equality issue in 35 hour work week reform.**

WMA 2

Name **Collectif National des Droits des Femmes (CNDF), informal, free-standing**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **CNDF defined the policy problem by focusing on gender equality and the issue of women's inferior position in the labor market compared to men it offered solutions that would make employment policy more equal for men and women.**

Policy Goals : **Argued for a framework law on the reduction of work time, proposing a 32 hour week. The paper also called for the elimination of all measures that developed part-time work, reduction of work-time without a decrease in salaries or an increase in social taxes, a and the general inclusion of equal employment as major principle.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: That women’s rights issues needed to be taken-up in the design of the 35 hour work week law, in particular in light of the gendered nature of the labor force where women were pushed into lower paying part-time jobs. Problem defined in terms of focusing on gender equality.

Policy Goals: Take into consideration gender equality issue in 35 hour work week reform. Support for a framework law on the reduction of work time, proposing a 32 hour week and the elimination of all measures that developed part-time work, reduction of work-time without a decrease in salaries or an increase in social taxes, and the general inclusion of equal employment as major principle.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. Aubry Law I

- a. all firms with 20 or more employees must establish the length of the legal work week at 35 hours by Jan. 1 2000 and by Jan. 1 2002 for business with less than 20 employees
- b. social partners must begin immediately to negotiate the modalities for reducing the work week at the branch and firm level
- c. the process for work-time reduction, including funding for firms who complete negotiations by 1/12/00 and a system of ‘*mandatement*’ that would allow unions to delegate a worker representative in firms where there was no formal employer delegate
- d. work-time reduction could be calculated over the entire work year, *annualisation*
- e. official full-time work period excludes breaks and personal time
- f. workers must have 11 hours of uninterrupted rest each day, except for transport sectors
- g. compensatory rest for over-time
- h. part-time work — reduction of employers social security dues for negotiating part-time contracts
- i. government must make interim report on 35 hour implementation to parliament and a report on reduction in the civil service.

2. Aubry Law II

- a. new, legal workweek limit of 35 hours
- b. rules governing overtime
- c. new arrangements for organizing work hours
- d. new tax breaks on employer contributions
- e. new wage guarantee system for minimum-wage
- f. Article 19 in Chapter VIII was clearly about gender equality stating that all 35 hour work week agreements must include measures aiming to ensure equal employment between men and women, and particularly to strike down discrimination in hiring. It also stipulated that the objectives in the plans for the following year must cover the principle of equal employment between men and women

- g. Article 1 Chapter IV strengthened part- time work contracts (although it did not specifically mention women, everyone recognized that women made up the majority of the part time labor force).**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Catherine Genisson, Socialist Party, Member of Parliament

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Genisson only became directly involved with the debate on the 35 hour work week during the parliamentary discussion of the second Aubry law before the Cultural Affairs Commission in the National Assembly.**

She had authored a government report on equal employment policy for women, contracted by Prime Minister Jospin and with the help of many WMAs focused on equal employment policy at the time, which had developed some positions on part-time work. The report was referred to in the debate when any sex equity positions were taken. In addition, she briefly participated in the committee hearings on the second Aubry law and in the parliamentary debates articulating feminist positions on the law. Her participation however was very marginal to the larger frame and discussions of the debate.

WMA 2 CNDF

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

The CNDF followed this debate carefully from beginning to end. As a representative and umbrella group for the various WMAs who supported equal employment approaches to the 35 hour work week, the CNDF held the National Conference on Women's Rights and set up a working group on women's employment activities, wrote an open letter to Minister Aubry, protested in favor of the 35 hour work week, so long as it promoted women's rights. It was not able to gain entry to the official policy arenas on the two reforms —social partner negotiations and government/parliament formulation.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Work week reduction had been on the public agenda numerous times in the 1980s and 1990s; however, such an extensive reduction had not been considered. Neither the reform on work-time by the Socialists in the early 1980s nor the Robien law, adopted under a right-wing government in 1996, generated the same degree of controversy and public attention. While the 1986 law, exonerating employers who reduced full-time work from paying social security taxes, served as an impertinent touchstone for many in the controversy that was unleashed in 1997, the debate on the 35 hour work week did not begin until the Socialists, in a coalition with the Communist Party and the Greens, took control of the government in 1997. The new Prime Minister, Lionel Jospin, first mentioned reducing the work-week to 35 hours in the context of the electoral campaign for the National Assembly in May 1997. Jospin supported reducing the work week in the 1995 presidential elections,

but only to 37 hours. First hinted at by Martine Aubry, Minister of Employment and Solidarity, in an August, 1997 Council of Minister meeting, Jospin formally announced his government's intention to present draft legislation at a tri-partite meeting on employment policy held at the government's initiate and attended by the national representatives of organized labor and management on October 10. The Prime Minister elaborated that reform would consist of two texts: first a Framework law (Aubry I) that would establish the general process for reducing the work-week to 35 hours for firms and a second law (Aubry II), based on assessments of the reduction process by the social partners, that would stipulate the details of reducing the work-week to 35 hours.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, quality of life arguments were secondary and the shortening of the work week seen as way of promoting France's economy. Prime Minister Jospin argued that the reforms would help to reduce unemployment and to encourage growth in France's economy. Managerial groups and right wing parties reacted by arguing that the reforms were an unnecessary intrusion into private business, and that they were too much too soon. Left wing parties and organized labor groups reacted by tacitly supporting the work week reforms and arguing that business should pay for their costs.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Through the beginning, the debate was not gendered.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of economic issues and quality of life arguments remained secondary, the dominant frame of the debates remained focused on economic issues of employer versus workers interests, some lip service was paid to the impact of the reductions on improving the quality of life through more flexibility in balancing work and family.

There was only scant mention of gender issues among the actors in the debates and the debate remained largely ungendered, however, the Cultural Affairs Committee in the National Assembly did make some mention of gender issues. The Cultural Affairs Committee supported policies that recognized that part-time jobs were mostly held by women and strengthened part-time work contracts, introduced the principle of equal employment in work contracts, supported allowing women to work at night, rest periods for pregnant women managers, and policies that recognized that the majority of minimum wage earners were women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Part-time jobs are mostly held by women and strengthened part-time work contracts
- Principle of equal employment between men and women
- Women should be able to work at night.
- Majority of minimum wage earners were women.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

Argued that the 35 hour law should support the principle of equal employment between men and women by recognizing the different employment patterns between the sexes. Also important to use the 35 hour work week to better reconcile work and family demands for men and women.

The Deputy Minister argued that the 35 hour work week law should support the principle of equal employment between men and women by recognizing the different employment patterns between the sexes and the gendered nature of the division of labor at work and at home.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

35 hour law should support the principle of equal employment between men and women by recognizing the different employment patterns between the sexes. Also important to use the 35 hour work week to better reconcile work and family demands for men and women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

The Deputy Ministry continued officially a multi- issue remit with regard to women’s rights; it was not formally charged with women’s rights issues in all areas and it actually appeared to be formally more oriented to women’s rights issues in the area of employment given its location in the Minister of Labor and its formal focus on job training.

The Péry ministry pursued a wide spectrum of issues and actually began to pursue in earnest gender mainstreaming, through instituting the assessment of gender specific budgets in all ministries and encouraging mainstreaming throughout government. It established new parliamentary committees on women’s rights in 2000 that would also pursue gender mainstreaming across all policy areas as much as possible. In this light, although the Ministries formal remit was multi-issue and it officially had job training as it’s major focus, the Ministry unofficially had a cross-sectional approach.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1. Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

The Deputy Minister was a Sub ministry attached to the Minister of Labor and was relatively removed from important decision making circles in the Ministry and the government in general.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1. Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

Name: Nicole Péry

Years in WPA: 1998-2002

WMA Activities: **PS activities and elected official—MEP, regional councilor, deputy—no WMA activities.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Overall by the end of the 1990s women’s movements in general were in a consolidation/ growth period.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Parity**
- **Unemployment and Reduced Work Week**
- **Immigrant Women’s Rights and Economic Conditions/ Violence**
- **International Women’s movement – The Un Beijing Conference and the Global Women’s March**
- **Anti sexual Harassment in the University/Sexism in the media, society and politics**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No Countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Unions- CGT and CFTD**
- **Ministry of Social Affairs**
- **Socialist Party in government and Parliament**
- **Communist Party in government and parliament**
- **Green Party in parliament**
- **Parliament**
- **Prime Minister**
- **Employer Associations like the CNPF**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Socialists were in a coalition government with the Greens and Communists as minority partners.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **EU- Equal Employment Network**
- **UN - Women’s Policy Conference Beijing Plus 5**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 11

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights, in particular:

(a) The right to work as an inalienable right of all human beings;

- (b) The right to the same employment opportunities, including the application of the same criteria for selection in matters of employment;**
- (c) The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training;**
- (d) The right to equal remuneration, including benefits, and to equal treatment in respect of work of equal value, as well as equality of treatment in the evaluation of the quality of work;**
- (e) The right to social security, particularly in cases of retirement, unemployment, sickness, invalidity and old age and other incapacity to work, as well as the right to paid leave;**
- (f) The right to protection of health and to safety in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction.**

Debate ID: FRA_JT1 1978-80

Title: 1980 Law on Youth Training and Placement

WPAs: Women's Work Committee (WWC); Deputy Ministry of Women's Employment (DMWE); Delegate for the Status of Women and Family (DSWF)

Date of Coding: 05/09/03, 09/13/03, 3/1/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Margeurite Thibert, Madeleine Guilbert**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of**

addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 5

Name: **Women's Section of Communist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Margeurite Thibert, Madeleine Guilbert,**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section of the Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 5

Name: **Women's Section of the Communist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The 1980 law's main focus was to formalize a training and placement program for pre-entry young workers called formation en alternance.**
2. **Codified the funding for youth trading programs in the Pacts.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Margeurite Thibert, Madeleine Guilbert**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Women's Work Committee; WPA, not women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote analyses of women's marginal position in the labor force and developed recommendations. They were on the Committee on Women's Work. Part of the separate equal employment sub-system—not directly involved in the debate.**

WMA 2 **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **CFDT labor union: non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the Committee on Women's Work; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 3 **Women's Section of the CGT**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **CGT; non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the Committee on Women's Work; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 4 Women's Section of the Socialist Party

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Socialist party; non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate **Participated in the equal employment sub-system; linked to Committee on Women's work through research Thibert; elaborated a study of women's unemployment and developed equal employment policy proposals that were presented in the form of private members bills.**

WMA 5 Women's Section of the Communist Party

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Communist party; non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate **Participated in the equal employment sub-system, linked to Committee on Women's work through research Guilbert; developed equal employment policy proposals that were presented in the form of private members bills—framework laws.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Job training for youth became an important issue in the 1970s in the context of rising youth unemployment. The Employment pacts of the late 1970s had included new funds for youth training programs. The government agreed to draft legislation to better codify existing youth training and placement programs through the Ministry of Labor in 1978. Labor and management were consulted the same year and the law was presented to parliament in 1980, with no amendments. There was little public attention to the policy discussions and the only disagreement was over the issue of whether youth training programs would be based in the schools or in job training centers.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

France was suffering from high levels of unemployment among the youth and in the beginning, the debate focused on ways to curb the youth unemployment problem. The government introduced youth job training programs to curb unemployment and there was only minor debate over whether to base job training programs in schools or in job training centers. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

No gendered ideas

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debates were not gendered over their course and instead took a gender blind approach, which tended to emphasize employment of young boys as opposed to young girls. The frame did not discuss the different situations for young girls as opposed to young boys, although there was a brief mention of the worse situation for

young girls in the report for the National Assembly. By the end, the dominant frame remained focused on youth unemployment and policy suggestions remained on implementing job training programs for young people.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WWC : Reflecting the consensus in the EEP community at the time, the WWC emphasized the permanence of women n the labor force and the high degree of sex-based occupational segregation, with a strong emphasis on the importance of paid work for promoting women’s well being. It recommended creating more authoritative anti discrimination and equal opportunity laws, and in particular developing training and placement programs for women at the firm level. The need for training and placement programs for young girls was one of the WWC’s policy recommendations.

DMWE: Basically the same as the WWC’s, with a strong emphasis on developing an authoritative EEP law, precursor to the 1983 equal employment law with an emphasis on women’s training, also began a program to train women for traditionally male jobs.

DMFCF: Basically the same as the WWC’s, with a strong emphasis on developing an authoritative EEP law, precursor to the 1983 equal employment law with an emphasis on women’s training, also began a program to train women for traditionally male jobs.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)

WWC : Reflecting the consensus in the EEP community at the time, the WWC emphasized the permanence of women n the labor force and the high degree of sex-based occupational segregation, with a strong emphasis on the importance of paid work for promoting women’s well being. It recommended creating more authoritative anti discrimination and equal opportunity laws, and in particular developing training and placement programs for women at the firm level. The need for training and placement programs for young girls was one of the WWC’s policy recommendations.

Feminist because it seeks to overturn job segregation and promote equality.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 The WWC focus was on any aspect of women’s work and not necessarily equal employment issues , with no specific assignment to focus on any certain aspect.

WPA 2 It formally was to deal with all different aspects of women's employment, like the WWC.

WPA 3 Was given the title of 'family and feminine Condition', and was charged with addressing all different aspects of the feminine condition. This term, however, was identified with an approach to women's rights that emphasized their roles as mothers and as a reserve pool of labor. It's official charge is to promote all measures to improve the feminine condition, in particular those that favor the access of women to different levels of responsibilities or to eliminate all discrimination against women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 WWC low level study group attached to the Minister of labor's staff. It was moved to a lower position in the government hierarchy in 1978 with the creation of the DMWE. It was under the control of the DMWE which was in turn under the authority of the Ministry of Labor.

WPA 2 DMWE a deputy ministry attached to the ministry of Work and Participation, one of three deputy ministries attached to that Ministry.

WPA 3 DMFCF a delegate minister attached to the Prime Minister's office. One level below the top level ministries, but the second lowest ranked Delegate Ministry.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Marcelle Devaud**

Years in WPA:**1971-82**

WMA Activity: Devaud was a member of the Gaullist party and self proclaimed feminist in the party. She had been elected to the Senate and had been a former mayor. She was also a member and active partisan in the Coordination Committee of Women's Associations, an association which claimed to bring together women's groups in the 1950s and 60s outside of the left.

WPA 2

Name: **Nicole Pasquier**

Years in WPA:**1978-81**

WMA Activity: No involvement with women's movement actors.

WPA 3

Name: **Monique Pelletier**

Years in WPA:**1978-81**

WMA Activity: Pelletier was a Giscardian, center-right had been active in the party. She had not been active in the women's movement prior to taking office.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **In the late 1970s, new autonomous women's movements and the older established women's groups affiliated with political parties were in decline. Women's organizations on the Left, particularly in the two major left-wing trade unions, the CFDT and the CGT and the Socialist Party were in a growth period with women activists often embracing second-wave feminist ideas.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Rape/ Violence against women**
- **Improving Women's Status and Rights**
- **Sex Equality in Paid Employment**
- **Anti Sexism in the Press and the Media**
- **Prostitution**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Government**
- **Council of Ministers**
- **Ministry of Labor**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President member of Center Right party
Gaullist Majority in the National Assembly

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

An emerging TAN on equal employment policy issues linked to the EU.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: FRA_JT2 1982-84

Title: Law on Reform of Continued Training

WPA: Delegate Ministry of the Rights of Women (DMRW)

Date of Coding:05/09/03, 3/01/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani,**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section of the Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Rigout law, or Law 84-130 passed 24 February 1984, made some reforms to job training programs for employed that were carried out by businesses.**
2. **Title II of the law extended worker and union representation in creating firm- level training programs.**
3. **Also, title II of the law stated that the principle of equal employment between men and women needed to be included in the job training plans, the firm level Development and Training Engagements, and hence in the new rules for workplace councils in designing job training programs.**

NOTE: It was not clear who inserted this clause, but it probably originated in the EEP network, particularly given the network and the MRW were involved with formulating the new EEP law that focused on developing firm-level job training programs to promote equality. Also the 1982 Avenant did not have an equality clause in it. The most active parts of the EEP network during this period outside of the WPA was the women' sections of the PS and the CFDT which both had taken positions on bringing more gender balanced representation in firm level job training negotiations.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Upper council for Equal Employment, non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote analyses of women's marginal position in the labor force and developed recommendations. They were on the Upper Council for Equal Employment. Part of the separate equal employment sub-system—not directly involved in the debate.**

WMA 2 **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **CFDT labor union: non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the upper council of equal employment; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 3 **Women's Section of the CGT**

Form: **formal organization**

Location: **CGT; non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the upper council of equal employment; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 4 **Women's Section of the Socialist Party**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Socialist party: non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate **Contributed to implementation of equal employment law – part of the EEP sub-system , through pressuring the party to take an active stance also through the Women’s Rights Ministry.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The debates that led to the 1982 Avenant and the 1984 law centered around strengthening the representation of workers through trade union delegates and in putting more requirements on employers to develop firm-level plans for training. Worker representation in firm- level negotiations had been a particular demand of the CFDE since the late 1970s, and was formally placed on the government agenda in the context of the 1983 Auroux laws. These laws revamped the firm-level negotiation process to give trade unions a more active role workplace discussions. Title II of Loi Rigout essentially extended the principles of worker representation already in the Auroux laws into the arena of job training.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of workers rights for job training. Through the debate, workers wanted greater access to training programs and more control over the content of the programs. The government introduced legislation to create more firm-level training programs for currently employed workers. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end of the debate, the dominant Frame did not change much and it remained focused on workers rights and access to job training. The debate was not gendered over its course. Public reports of the debates on the Rigout law gave no evidence that gendered ideas about employment and/ or job training were introduced in the policy discussions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

DMRW: Minister, Yvette Roudy argued that the workplace councils needed to examine carefully the position of men and women in the firm to see how women’s status could be improved.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)

DMRW: Minister, Yvette Roudy argued that the workplace councils needed to examine carefully the position of men and women in the firm to see how women’s status could be improved.

Feminist microframe because it focuses on the improvement of the status of women in relation to men.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 From the law that set it up, the DMRW was responsible for measures aimed to respect women's rights in society, to eliminate all discrimination against women and to increase the guarantees of equality for women in politics, the economy, society and culture.

Informal: Strong focus on equal employment and training, first three laws were on equal employment, public funding for abortion and an anti sexist law. Did some policies on sexuality and violence; virtually nothing on reconciliation policy, avoided the whole issue of motherhood and child-rearing.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The DWRW was the only ministerial level WPA; all WPAs were centralized under its control. It was attached formally to the Prime Minister's Office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Yvette Roudy

1981-1986

Roudy had been a founding member of the women's section of the PS and prior to its creation was in the Mouvement Démocratique et Féminin, which was a small 'club' or group close to the non Communist left, that promoted women's rights issues and focused on the improvement of women's status in politics and employment in the 1960s.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: In the mid 1980s, the women's sections of the CGT, CFDT, and PS as well as independent feminist experts were quite active and empowered because the Socialist Party, with the help of the Communist Party, held the presidency and the majority in parliament. The autonomous women's movement was in even deeper decline during this period.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Rape/Anti Sexual violence - stiffer implementation of rape law – linked to immigrant rights**
- **Anti-sexism – around the 1985 laws**
- **Equal Employment -focus on 1982 law Roudy — Mostly centered in the PS and the CFDT with little mass involvement.**
- **Reimbursement of abortion – women's groups pushed Socialists government to have feminist law; women's group**
- **Immigrant Women's Rights — creation of new immigrant groups a Paris based protest**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals – **Dirn and Stoclet book written under a pseudonym by prominent sociologists argued that women’s entry into the labor force undermined the family. Did not have much public support but was identified by feminist labor sociologists.**

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

In the Avenant Process:

- **Major Trade Unions**
- **Management**

In the Legislative Process:

- **Left-wing government, Minister of Job Training**
- **Parliament**
- **Social Partners**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist and Communist Parties

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Further development of the equal employment TAN at the EU member state level.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment to ensure on the basis of equality of men and women, the same rights; in particular:

Inter alia

Right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: FRA_JT3 1991

Title: Interprofessional agreement of 1991/law on job training

WPAs: Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights (DMRW); Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights and Daily Life (DMWRDL)

Dates of Coding: 05/10/03, 09/13/03, 3/01/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani,**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Section of the CGT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 4

Name: **Women's Section of the Socialist Party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **In general: a revision of the 1971 job training law.**
2. **Title III of the law (No 91-1405 of 31 December) addressed the role of employers in improving job training programs, including an increase in employer contributions to job training in the firm.**
3. **Increased contributions for firms with fewer than 10 employees to 1.5%**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani**Form: **Individuals**Location: **Upper council for Equal Employment, non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote analyses of women's marginal position in the labor force and developed recommendations. They were on the Upper Council for Equal Employment. Part of the separate equal employment sub-system—not directly involved in the debate.**

WMA 2 **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **CFDT labor union: non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the upper council of equal employment; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 3 **Women's Section of the CGT**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **CGT; non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate: **Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the upper council of equal employment; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.**

WMA 4 **Women's Section of the Socialist Party**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Socialist party: non women's movement organization**

Activities during the Debate: **Contributed to implementation of equal employment law – part of the EEP sub-system, through pressuring the party to take an active stance also through the Women's Rights Ministry.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the context of the twentieth anniversary of the first law on job training, the Socialist Minister of Job Training announced in 1990 that the complex and confusing stipulations based on the original 1971 job training law were in need of Systematization and reform. The decision of the Rocard government to make a wide sweeping reform to the job training System brought the social partners to the bargaining table to work out a common position on a wide range of job training issues. Lengthy discussions, from which the communist orientated CGT opted out,

concluded with the Inter-professional Agreement of July 1991. Four months later the new Minister of Social Affairs and Job Training, Martine Aubry, under Edith Cresson's premiership, presented the draft legislation to parliament. The contents of the Accord were signed into law in December of the same year.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate centered on revising the 1971 training law across a variety of areas; one of which was about increasing employer contributions to job training programs. Participants in the debate argued that the 1971 law should be revised so that employers would have to make greater contributions toward job training programs. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate retained its focus on job training and revising the 1971 law. Participants in the debate argued that the 1971 law should be revised so that employers would have to make greater contributions toward job training programs. Although employers and representatives of organized labor agreed on the amount of increase, employer representatives called for the establishment of an employees contribution to training programs. The proposal was not included in either the Accord or the Law. Throughout the discussions on the Accord and the Law, the same gender-blind approach was taken; gender specific considerations were not brought into the debate at all.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

DMWR

Two phases during debate:

André: Job training was a key to improving women's status in the work force and in terms of striking down occupational segregation and women's unemployment. Employers were key potential partners in designing firm level training programs in the firm, along with work councils, trade unions and other training program institutions at the firm level. The DMWR was trying to get firms to take advantage of the various equal employment programs that the state provided that gave funding to business to design job training programs. This position was supported and developed by the National Equal Employment Commission (NEEC) and the MEE during her tenure (for example see the report of the NEEC May 1990).

Neiertz: Did not advance specific positions on EEP/training. Focused on abortion and sexual harassment issues more. The NEE did not even meet under her tenure.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

André: Job training was a key to improving women's status in the work force and in terms of striking down occupational segregation and women's unemployment. Employers were key potential partners in designing firm level training programs in the firm, along with work councils, trade unions and other training program institutions at the firm level. The DMWR was trying to get firms to take advantage of the various equal employment programs that the state provided that gave funding to business to design job training programs. This position was supported and developed by the NEEC and the MEE during her tenure (for example see the report of the NEEC May 1990).

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

DMWR under André – Any issues that affected women's rights no change in formal policy orientation since the Roudy ministry.

Relatively strong emphasis on equal employment policy – adopted some new policies, supported the work of the NEEC, social exclusions, women's unemployment, and domestic violence, some mention of political representation, but not a high priority.

DMWRDL under Neiertz. Daily life, for all citizens not just women was added, to women's rights. But was placed in the employment ministry, so ironic that it did not follow-up on EEP.

Basically ignored equal employment policy and employment more generally; for example the NEEC did not meet under her watch.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The DMWR was a deputy secretary attached to the PMs. which meant it had a full cabinet position but was below delegate ministers and full ministers. Also, the NEEC was housed in the DMWR and was administered to by the MEE UNDER NEIERTZ, The DMWRQL was attached to the Employment Ministry.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Michèle André June 1988- June 1991

Representative of PM Rocard's efforts to appoint people from 'civil society'; from Puy-dome—director of deaf children's schools active in the Socialist Party in that department; member of exec, committee of PS since 1985 – more of a Rocardian than a PS feminist; 81-83 Regional delegate of Women's Rights in early 1980s; technically a WPA but not known for her women's rights activism, unless through the party, but not really involved with the PS feminists.

Véronique Neiertz, July 1991- July 1993

Active in the PS national committee, but not involved with women's rights issues, PS feminists or WPAs prior being appointed.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

The ineffectiveness of the 1983 law and the absence of any new groups around its implementation indicated the decline of the feminist equal policy network.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Sexual Harassment**
- **Abortion and Contraception**
- **Immigrant women's rights**
- **Parity**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

In the Interprofessional Accord Process:

- **Major Trade Unions**
- **Management**

In the Legislative Process:

- **Left-wing government, Minister of Job Training**
- **Parliament**
- **Social Partners**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist dominated Center Left Majority

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Further development of the equal employment TAN at the EU member state level.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment to ensure on the basis of equality of men and women, the same rights.

Debate ID: FRA_JT4 1993

Title: Training and Reinsertion in the 1993 law

WPA: Women's Rights Service (WRS)

Dates of Coding: 3/03/03, 4/03, 10/03/03, 12/01/05

C1A_1—Women's Movement Actor Policy Goals in Micro Frame

WMA 1

Name: **Researchers Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani,**

Issue Frame: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2 Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).

Issue Frame: **Women are in marginal positions compared to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

Activities: **Articles with recommendations and participated on NEEC. Did not actually participate in the formal arena of the sub-system; participated in the parallel sub-system of the equal employment policy network – outside of mainstream employment sub-system.**

WMA 3 Women Section Socialist Party

Issue Frame: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

Activities: **Participated on NEEC. Did not actually participate in the formal arena of the sub-system; participated in the parallel sub-system of the equal employment policy network – outside of mainstream employment sub-system.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1 **Researchers Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani,**

Issue Frame: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

WMA 2. Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).

Issue Frame: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

Activities: Articles with recommendations and participated on NEEC. Did not actually participate in the formal arena of the sub-system; participated in the parallel sub-system of the equal employment policy network – outside of mainstream employment sub-system.

WMA 3 Women Section Socialist Party

Issue Frame: Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

Activities: Participated on NEEC. Did not actually participate in the formal arena of the sub-system; participated in the parallel sub-system of the equal employment policy network – outside of mainstream employment sub-system.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Addressed weaknesses in existing training programs to help seekers and the long-term unemployed to find work.**
- 2. It also decentralized control over the formulation of youth training and apprenticeships to the regions.**
- 3. With regards to training and reinsertion, the law sought to simplify the process by which individual job seekers gained necessary qualifications for positions and by providing incentives to firms to hire the unemployed**

The final law made no mention of women or equal employment and did not include any job training programs aimed at women.

C2A_1—WMA Form and Location

WMA 1 Feminist Researchers

Form: Individuals

Location: Non women's movement organizations

Activities: Articles with recommendations and participated on NEEC.

WMA 2 Women's Commission in CFDTForm: **Formal**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities: **Participated on NEEC.****WMA 3: PS Women's Commission**Form: **Formal**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities: **Had issue on their agenda and took position****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

The 1993 law on employment and job training is considered one of the five major laws for the job training System. The law addressed weaknesses in existing training programs to help job seekers and the long term unemployed to find work. It also decentralized control over the formulation of youth training and apprenticeships to the regions. With regards to training and reinsertion, the law sought to simplify the process by which individual job seekers gained necessary qualifications for positions and by providing incentives to firms to hire the unemployed through a 'placement and training internship' or SIFE.

The 1993 law is the only major job training law that did not come out of the collective negotiation process. It was proposed under right wing Prime Minister Eduard Balladur, following the victory of the Right in the parliamentary elections of March 1993. The bill proposal was elaborated by the government in June and July, approved by the Council of Ministers in September, discussed by parliament from September to November, and voted into law in December. The law passed with no amendments and little debate. To accelerate the adoption of the law, the government kept consultation with labor and management in the pre-parliamentary stages of the law to a minimum.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate**The need for government to help the unemployed find work****C3A_2—list of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate****No gender ideas at the beginning****C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.****Helping the unemployed find work****C3A_4—list of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate****No gender ideas at the beginning****C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs****Women's Rights Service WRS****Improve women's status in the work force through firm level training programs.**

C5A_3—WMA Feminist Micro Frames

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Any issues that affected women's rights; some cross sectional approach; WRS could focus on whatever it chose.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The WRS had no formal decision making head; it was a low level administrative department within the Ministry of Social affairs.

C12A_1—WPA leadership

Name: **Aline Goddard**

Years in WPA: **1993-95**

WMA Activity: **No WMA involvement.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Although there was not a significant mass-based women's movement like the movements of the 1970s, feminist organisations and movements in the early 1990s continued to gain momentum, re-emerging as important players.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Sexual Harassment**
- **Abortion and Contraception**
- **Immigrant women's rights**
- **Parity**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—list of Policy Actors in sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Labor Ministry**
- **Parliament**

C25A_2 Parties if Single Governing Majority

Socialist party President, but Government was headed by Gaullist PM

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Equal Employment Policy

C26A_3- CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular:

to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: FRA_JT 5 1993

Title: Training and Reinsertion in the 1993 law

WPA: Women's Rights Service (WRS)

Dates of Coding: 05/10/03, 09/13/03, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani,**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: **Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in marginal position to men in the labor force due to gender inequity society, e.g. division of labor in the home. Job training is one way of addressing these inequities through positive action in training and recruitment, and promotion.**

Policy Goal: Need for employers to design firm-based training programs for women that promoted women within the firm.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Addressed weaknesses in existing training programs to help seekers and the long-term unemployed to find work.**
- 2. It also decentralized control over the formulation of youth training and apprenticeships to the regions.**
- 3. With regards to training and reinsertion, the law sought to simplify the process by which individual job seekers gained necessary qualifications for positions and by providing incentives to firms to hire the unemployed.**

The final law made no mention of women or equal employment and did not include any job training programs aimed at women.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Jacqueline Laufer, Margaret Maruani

Form: Individuals

Location: Upper council for Equal Employment, non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Wrote analyses of women's marginal position in the labor force and developed recommendations. They were on the Upper Council for Equal Employment. Part of the separate equal employment sub-system - not directly involved in the debate.

WMA 2 Women's Section CFDT (Trade Union)

Form: Formal organization

Location: CFDT labor union: non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Participated in the equal employment sub-system superficially through the upper council of equal employment; not a part of the employment sub-system. Their own unions did not present their position.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Since decentralization had first began in 1984 the national government had been reluctant to relinquish its control over job training to the regions. Since 1984, national job training budgets had increased at higher rates than regional budgets and the AFPA had remained outside of the control of the regions. Although regional governments had mildly requested that job-training policy be given to the regions, it was not until the Spring of 1993 that right wing presidents of the regional councils asked for a new law. The right wing government refused to sponsor a separate law, but agreed to include provisions about youth training in the 1993 law on employment and job training. Headed by the Minister of Job Training, who was also president of the Regional Council of Isle de France, a commission proceeded to study the problem and proposed draft legislation for the 1993 law. A government report, the Rapport Cambon, called for full decentralization of job training services

to the regions; however the national government refused and the final law gave control only over youth job training.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the dominant frame focused on the need to decentralize responsibility for youth job training programs. Proposed legislation sought to devolve administration of youth training programs to regional governments. Stemming from the a call of the President of the Regions Council calls for more authority at the regional level the Cambon report contained proposals for training decentralization. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, debate remained focused on decentralizing authority for job training programs and did not involve gender issues. While the Presidents of the region in the Cambon report had requested that regions be put in charge of all areas of training, the final law only actually gave regional authority over youth training. Women's groups did not attempt to gender this debate, perhaps reflecting the way in which gender had been closed out of any policy discussions on training by the Socialist government in early 1993, and so gender was not mentioned in any of the parliamentary committees focused on the debate.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

For the WRS and the equal employment agencies – NEEC and MEE—job Training continued to be a key to improving women's status in the work force and in terms of striking down occupational segregation and women's unemployment. Employers were key potential partners in designing firm level training programs in the firm, along with work councils, trade unions and other training program institutions at the firm level.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

For the WRS and the equal employment agencies – NEEC and MEE—job Training continued to be a key to improving women's status in the work force and in terms of striking down occupational segregation and women's unemployment. Feminist because it promotes status of women toward equality with men.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1

Any issues that effected women's rights no change in formal policy orientation since the Roudy ministry.

Multiple-issue approach, particularly in the context to the preparation of UN Women's policy Conference in Beijing. Without any ministerial leadership the WMS could focus on whatever areas it chose.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The WRS had no formal decision making head; it was a low level administrative department within the Ministry of Social affairs. The Services had three separate divisions and three individual policy specific staff positions as well as a territorial administration.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: Aline Godard

Years in WPA: 1993-1995

WMA Activity: No WMA involvement; had taken positions within the WMS that were known to be anti- feminist.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Growth

Evidence and source: Although there was not a significant mass-based women's movement like the movements of the 1970s, feminist organisations and movements in the early 1990s continued to gain momentum, re-emerging as important players.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- Anti Sexual Harassment**
- Abortion and Contraception**
- Immigrant women's rights**
- Parity**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- Right-wing Balladur Cabinet/ Labor Ministry**
- Parliament with a right-wing Majority**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist President, but Gaullist dominated right wing majority in National Assembly

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Further development of the equal employment TAN at the EU member state level.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment to ensure on the basis of equality of men and women, the same rights; in particular:

Inter alia

Right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: FRA_PR1 1981-82

Title: Constitutional Court Nullification of Sex Quota in Municipal Elections

WPA: Delegate Ministry of the Rights of Women (DMRW)

Dates of Coding: 2/04, 3/04/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Gisèle Halimi (MP, Choisir)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Asserted that women are not a category but they are all the categories at the same time. She did not go so far as saying that sex is the first characteristic of human beings - the starting point of parity argument.**

Policy goals: **Halimi supported a quota of at least 30% for female representatives. Following the advice of Georges Vedel, she supported a rather neutral drawing up of the provision. Instead of a women's quota, the amendment dealt with a proportion of persons of the same sex. She did not claim for the symbolic 50% quota. More shyly, she supported the idea of a 30% quota.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
No Feminist Frames articulated in the debate.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Parliament ultimately passed a compromised version of the quota which planned that a list of candidates couldn't have more than 75% of people of the same sex.**
2. **However, this decision was soon overturned by the Constitutional Court. In a very republican mood and also with a manifest lack of rigor, they asserted that the sex of the citizens should not be considered as relevant in the running of the political system. After this decision, it became impossible for WPAs to support any form of affirmative action.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Gisèle Halimi (Choisir)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **As an MP, Halimi participated in the debate by trying to persuade other members of government and others in the Socialist party to adopt a watered down clause on a 30% quota for women in municipal elections.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The introduction of a proportional electoral system (PR) was one of 110 proposals in the platform of the socialist candidate, François Mitterrand, in the 1981 presidential

and legislative elections. Local councils were due to being renewed in 1983. Hence the manifesto promise was to be quickly tested.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of promoting democracy and it also contained a gendered component. Proponents of new legislation sought to create a proportional elections system in France and also sought to create a quota so that 30% of those elected to office would be women.

The debate was not overtly gendered, but it did seek to improve the representation of men and women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Improvement of the representation of men and women.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained focused on promoting democracy and improving representation. The quota was presented in gender neutral terms— so that no more of 70% of political representatives could be of the same sex. Further, those in favor of the quota emphasized that it would not be a revolutionary change that would upset the French political System. Rather, the quota would merely adjust the System and allow the government to better represent both men and women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
No gendered ideas at the end.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. Delegate Ministry of the Rights of Woman (DMRW)

Ministry coolness toward a women's quota was partly the result of the political context at that time, and partly a reflection of the general Frame of women's policy in the eighties (Baudino, 2000). Instead of claiming gender difference and asking for positive action. The Delegate Minister, Yvette Roudy intended to improve women's condition by providing equality of rights between the two sexes. In the aftermath of the quotas failure, she wrote an article published in *Le Monde* (Roudy, 1982, b). This text, the sole contribution she made to the debate. It used the *Conseil constitutionnel* decision as an opportunity to reassert the need for her ministry. In effect she accepted the decision of the court. The ban on the quota should have made the public aware of the problem. Hence political parties would be motivated to select. Roudy still believed that political will could close the gender gap in representation and considered quotas to be acceptable only as a last resort In this debate Roudy showed her preference for gender neutral' equality policies. As it neither advocated quotas nor gendered the debate, the ministry's activities were symbolic.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Instead of claiming gender difference and asking for positive action, improvement in women's condition would come by providing equality of rights between the two sexes. Political will could close the gender gap in representation and considered quotas to be acceptable only as a last resort.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1 DMRW

From the law that set it up, the DMRW was responsible for ‘ measures aimed to respect women's rights in society, to eliminate all discrimination against women and to increase the guarantees of equality for women in politics, the economy, society and culture.

Strong focus on equal employment and training, first three laws were on equal employment, public funding for abortion and an anti sexist law. Did some policies on sexuality and violence; virtually nothing on reconciliation policy, avoided the whole issue of motherhood and child-rearing.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
WPA 1 DMRW

The DMRW was the only ministerial level WPA; all WPAs were centralized under its control. It was attached formal to the Prime Minister's Office. It had a nine person ministerial staff, eight different Subdivisions to deal with different policy areas, control over 22 regional delegates and 96 department delegates of women's rights, as well as increasing authority over the Women's Rights Information Centers at the Regional, Departmental and Regional levels.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
WPA 1 DMRW

Name: **Yvette Roudy**

Years in WPA: **1981-1986**

WMA Activities: **Roudy had been a founding member of the women's section of the PS and prior to its creation was in the Mouvement Démocratique et Féminin, which was a small ‘club’ or group close to the non Communist left, that promoted women's rights issues and focused on the improvement of women's status in politics and employment in the 1960s.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **But, in addition, French feminism was, in the eighties, entering a stage of waning.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Anti Rape/Anti Sexual violence- Stiffer Implementation of Rape law – linked to immigrant rights**
- **Anti-Sexism – around the 1985 Laws**

- **Equal Employment -focus on 1982 law Roudy — Mostly centered in the PS and the CFDT with little mass involvement.**
- **Reimbursement of Abortion – Women’s groups pushed Socialists government to have feminist law; women’s group**
- **Immigrant Women’s Rights — creation of new immigrant groups a Paris based- protest**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

There was no significant countermovement on the 1982 law.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Constitutional Court**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist Party, with several members of the government from the Communist Party – Presidential Majority with a coalition government.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: FRA_PR2 1985-86

Title: Reform of Electoral System

WPA: Ministry of Rights of Woman (MRW)

Dates of Coding: 2/04, 3/04/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Socialist Women MP's, Women MP from RPR, and Women Socialist Ministers

Micro-Frame:

Issue definition: **Women are under-represented in parliament and parties have low numbers of women on their lists. Oppose presenting women as 'immigrants from within'.**

Policy Goals: **Adopt a quota for women on party lists.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
No feminist Frames.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The bill implemented a proportional representation system; no specific clauses on women's representation.**
2. **With regard to the impact of the bill, ' If the change of the voting system really lessened the success of the right, it could not prevent the first cohabitation nor provide a better representation for women. The proportion of women in the National Assembly remained around 5%. After this sole experiment, the election on a majority basis was restored permanently for the general elections'**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

There were no WMAs who took a position on the issue during the debate.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1985 the socialists tried to complete their democratisation project by introducing PR at National level. But according to the right this bill was a piece of a petty political strategy. The removal of the winner takes all system was seen by opponents as a way of minimising the expected losses of the Socialists in the National Assembly. The electoral timetable was a major pressure for the reform.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was focused on the advantages and disadvantages of instituting a proportional representation system. Socialists, were largely behind instituting a proportional system and they argued that it would improve the representation of minorities and women. Right wing parties opposed the proportional system and argued that it was politically motivated and that it would give left wing parties an electoral advantage.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
There were no gendered ideas advanced in the beginning of the debate.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

During the legislative debate, right-wing deputies defended the Gaullist legacy. They strongly opposed the reform. They argued that majority rule had secured governments in the Fifth Republic, but PR would cause government instability as it had done in the Fourth Republic. Moreover, the reform aimed to prevent the coming elected government from Governing. The Socialists claimed their reform would strengthen the part played by all the parties in the political game. In the name of the minorities, the left supported a reform that promised to improve their representation.

At that time women were defined with 'other minorities'. Hence the reform argument prioritised the representation of different political tendencies. The Government and all the supporters of the bill claimed women were among the citizens who could benefit by the reform. Roudy supported the 1985 change as a substitute for a women's quota. No specific measure was included to improve women's representation, but the interest of women in the reform was invoked, hence the debate was explicitly gendered.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women were defined with 'other minorities'.

Women were among the citizens who could benefit by the reform.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 The Ministry of The Rights of Woman

Roudy supported the bill but she did not really enter the debate. Activists were indifferent. In approving the bill in the name of women, she underlined the gendered consequences of the reform. Her contribution could have been the starting point of a real feminist approach to public debates. Instead she chose to avoid a gendered way of solving problems. Moreover she presented her point of view in a newspaper rather than in a political arena. In her article, she reasserted that the failure of the 1982 women's quota had been an opportunity. She argued that the 'missed law' made the political leaderships aware of the problem. Her argument was that a gender-neutral approach to the issue could be relevant. This symbolic activity of the minister was more about supporting a government that was said to be on the road to ruin rather than aimed at improvement of women's political representation. In other words, Yvette Roudy entered the debate as a member of the government not as a women supporter.

C5A-3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

No feminist micro Frames were advanced by the WPA during the debate.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 **The Ministry of The Rights of Woman (MRW)**

From the law that set it up, the MRW was responsible for measures aimed to respect women's rights in society, to eliminate all discrimination against women and to increase the guarantees of equality for women in politics, the economy, society and culture.

Strong focus on equal employment and training, first three laws were on equal employment, public funding for abortion and an anti sexist law. Did some policies on sexuality and violence; virtually nothing on reconciliation policy, avoided the whole issue of motherhood and child-rearing.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 **MRW**

From May 1981 to May 1985, the only ministerial level WPA was a Delegate Ministry formally attached to the Prime Minister's Office. In May 1985, it became an independent ministry, The Ministry of the Rights of Woman. This change did not mean an empowerment of the WPA, it was made necessary by the rules of the Nairobi Conference. Only independent structure could represent their country. All WPAs were centralized under its control.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 **MRW**

Name: **Yvette Roudy**

Years in WPA: **1981-1986**

WMA Activities: Yvette Roudy was a member of the Socialist Party, a key figure of the Socialist Party women's section. Before the creation of the women's section of the PS she was in the Mouvement Démocratique Féminin, which was a reformist women's group, created in the 1960s.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The withdrawal of feminist concerns from the policy process can be linked to the decline of both the left and the women's movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti Rape/Anti Sexual violence- stiffer implementation of rape law – linked to immigrant rights**
- **Anti-Sexism – around the 1985 laws**
- **Equal Employment -focus on 1982 law Roudy — mostly centered in the PS and the CFDT with little mass involvement.**
- **Reimbursement of abortion – women's groups pushed Socialist government to have feminist law; women's group**
- **Immigrant Women's Rights — creation of new immigrant groups, a Paris based-protest**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

There was no countermovement on this issue.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Socialist Government**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: FRA_PR3 1995-2000

Title: Parity Reform

WPAs: Observatoire for Parity (OP); Delegate Ministry for Women's Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT); Women's Rights Service (WRS)

Date of Coding: 2/04, 3/04/04, 12/01/05

NOTE: WMA 10 was added following new research on the parity process published in Bereni, Laure. 2009. Quand la mise à l'agenda transforme la structure des mobilisations féministes. *Revue Française de Science Politique*.

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1. **Mariette Sineau, Françoise Gaspard, Antoinette Fouque, etc.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: **Favored a constitutional amendment and authoritative laws that penalized parties for non compliance.**

WMA 2. **Evelyne Pisier**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Parity is bad for women; Positive action would cause discrimination against women**

Policy goals: **Against parity reform.**

WMA 3. **Club parité 2000**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: **Supported the constitutional amendments to encourage a parity democracy.**

WMA 4. **Demain la parité**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: The implementation of parity in the political, economical and cultural fields.

WMA 5. Parité

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: It supported a constitutional law but also less ambitious means to parity as to forbid the holding of more than one political office.

WMA 6. Parité-infos

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: It supported the voting of a constitutional amendment.

WMA 7. Union des femmes françaises

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of

female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy goals: It supported the introduction of a constitutional amendment.

WMA 8 Choisir

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: Many involved in the debate argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Proponents of the parity argument recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. Proponents of parity democracy argued in favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Under this argument, encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy Goals : It supported the introduction of a constitutional amendment.

WMA 9. Conseil National des femmes françaises

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: Many involved in the debate argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Proponents of the parity argument recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. Proponents of parity democracy argued in favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Under this argument, encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy Goals : It supported the introduction of a constitutional amendment.

WMA 10. Yvette Roudy and other Women MPs from Socialist Party

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: Many involved in the debate argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Proponents of the parity argument recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. Proponents of parity democracy argued in favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Under this argument, encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy Goals : It supported the introduction of an authoritative constitutional amendment and the adopt of authoritative implementation laws.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: Argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy. Recognized that the balance of power between men and women was unequal. In favor of laws that would encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government. Encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.

Policy Goals:

- **Constitutional amendment on Parity.**
- **Authoritative laws that penalized parties for non compliance.**
- **Reduce accumulation of public offices**
- **Promote parity in social, economic and political arenas**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. As far as the revision of the Constitution is concerned, the first amendment says that:**
 - a. The law favors the equal access of women and men to political mandates and functions.**
 - b. The second amendment says that political parties contribute to the implementation of this principle.**
- 2. The Law for Parity is made of both legal obligations and financial incentives. Legal obligations are the Provisions which a list has to fulfill to be registered. There are legal obligations only for elections on a proportional basis. The financial incentives are of course less constraining. They only concern the parliamentary elections. As some elections are still on a Majority basis - like, for example, the District council elections or, partly, the Senatorial elections, the law does not apply to all the political mandates. Moreover, as all the Provisions are dealing with candidates not with the elected representatives, the law does not ensure a parity result. To put it in a nutshell, the more important and the more symbolic is an election, the less constraining are the Provisions.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Mariette Sineau, Françoise Gaspard, Antoinette Fouque, etc.

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Gave testimony to the Observatoire de la parité Social Affairs Committee in the National Assembly in favor of an authoritative parity law; proposed the idea of sanctioning political parties in the law.

WMA 2 Evelyne Pisier

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Gave testimony to the National Assembly Commission on the second law. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité.

WMA 3 Club parité 2000Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **It organized public debates, international workshops on women's in the decision making process an several symposium on the issue of women's political participation. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité (?).**

WMA 4 Demain la paritéForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Its main purpose was to set up a petition in favor of parity before the general election and also to make clear suggestions to the government. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité.**

WMA 5 ParitéForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Ask the presidential candidates what will they do for parity. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité.**

WMA 6 Parité-infosForm: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **It published a 'letter' which became very well-known, one of the main publication on parity. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité.**

WMA 7 Union des femmes françaisesForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Took public positions in the debate in favor of f parity. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité.**

WMA 8 ChoisirForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Took public positions in the debate in favor of parity. Its leader was the reporter on the report on parity for the OP.**

WMA 9 Conseil National des femmes françaisesForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Took public positions in the debate in favor of f parity. Interviewed by the Observatoire de la parité. Sponsored presidential debate in 1995 on parity.**

WMA 10 Yvette Roudy and other Women MPs from Socialist Party

Form: **Individuals**

NOTE: Although the group of MP's did form a new Parliamentart Delegation of Women's Rights in late 1999, which normally would be counted as a QUAWPA, during most of the debate, these MPs operated as an adhoc collection of individuals working together.

Location: **Formal Non Women's movement Organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Elected to parliament in 1997 a group of PS women under Yvetter roudy's leadership and with ties to some of the parity groups lobbied withing parliament to protect the more authoritative parts of the amendment and law—they were more successful on the second law. They also worked female communist senators and were the impetus behing creating the new parliamentary delegations set-up by a statute. These delegations were also a forum for feminist testimony on authoritative laws on parity .**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

At the end of the eighties, several international institutions such as UNO, the Council of Europe, the European Commission and the OECD drew attention to the over-representation of men in the political arenas. The idea of parity, defined as the equal representation of men and women in the assemblies, emerged from their deliberations. 'Parity' (*parité*) was a French word that corresponded with French political culture and values. As a result, it was more resonant in argument than English terms such as gender mainstreaming, a term not readily translatable into French. And while the notion of parity won a certain popularity, the term 'quotas' was rejected by the French public. As the implementation of quotas is obviously the main means to achieve parity, this observation may appear paradoxical. The explanation for this apparent contradiction lies in the different possible meanings of the word. While keeping difference in play in its implication that human nature is two-sided—made of men and women, the term parity also suggests equality between the sexes. Thus the idea of parity advances sexual differences as a basis for claiming equality. This combination of difference and equality allowed a wide range of women activists—feminist and non-feminist—as well as politicians to support the reform. The ambiguity of the word was an asset in the first part of the reform process. The term itself is politically significant. In a way, it worked as a Trojan horse for quotas.

Parity not only convinced but also revived the French feminist movement.

Associations such as *Parité*, *Parité 2000* or *Elles aussi* were to further the reform process. In the nineties, feminist groups and women's associations gathered together in two main networks - *Femmes pour la Parité* and *Demain la Parité* - to support the idea of parity. As French feminism has always been highly divided, it is important to underline that all of these activists supported the same goal. The development of a great, lively and united movement in favor of parity was the first factor that brought the reform into the public debate. The second was the strategy of the

movement. The activists made good use of opportunities to raise the issue: they entered each debate on democratisation and above all in each electoral campaign to obtain promises from the political leaders. During the 1990s parity gave rise to political debate on three occasions.

In 1995, the disappointing results of the 1993 parliamentary elections and the Beijing conference highlighted the need for reform. Presidential candidates were questioned on the issue. By then the gender gap in the assemblies was broadly considered to be a public problem. On 7 April, each candidate appeared before *Le Conseil national des femmes* to explain what he intended to do to improve women's political representation. Jacques Chirac who promised only the implementation of incentives to nominate more women was elected. The dissolution of the National Assembly in 1997 was an opportunity for both the Socialists and the parity activists. The socialist party campaigned as a progressive force and supported parity. Nearly 30% of the socialist candidates were women and the party leader, Lionel Jospin, promised a constitutional reform. But, once installed, the new government delayed reform. Agreements between right-wing candidates and far right-wing candidates during the 1998 local elections generated another debate on democracy. With most political leaders calling for a renewal of democracy, the parity activists were able to remind them that the improvement of democracy was also at stake in the parity reform. Accordingly, in December 1998, the bill to amend the constitution to allow parity was presented to the Assembly. In each of the three cases a wider debate on political representation permitted for parity advocates to raise the issue of increasing women's presence.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate began in the movement. But in 1995, because of the presidential election, the candidates, from left to right, were questioned on the issue. They took a clear stand in favor of the improvement of women's representation but they were divided on the means (the introduction of quotas).

In the beginning, the debate was divided into two camps—pro and anti. The debate in the pro camp was somewhat gendered and it focused on the failures of democracy. Many involved in the debate argued that democracy was failing and as evidence, they pointed to the fact that women made up a small proportion of elected representatives. The solution to this problem was the institution of parity democracy.

The starting point of the parity movement was a statement of failure: the equality of rights between the two sexes was unable to close the gender gap in political representation. In process of gendering the political representation debates of the 1990s, the part played both by women including feminist activists and women involved in political life was crucial.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- Balance of power between men and women was unequal.

- **Laws necessary to encourage equal access to politics for men and women, and encourage a greater percentage of women in government.**
- **Under this argument, encouraging a greater proportion of female representatives would improve the French democracy and guarantee women better representation.**

The supporters of parity referred to sex difference as if it was the primary human difference and, consequently, they introduced the reform as if it was obvious. If humanity is twofold - made of men and women -, power must also be equally shared between the two sexes. Their argument made the formation of the assemblies appear unfair and, in doing so, paved the way for the reform. While activists called for positive action in the assemblies, their main goal broadly defined was to introduce an explicitly gendered approach to each public problem. For its supporters the parity debate was not only gendered, it was also a way to question the gendering of all public debates.

Opponents to the reform pretended to speak for the republican system. According to them, parity was dangerous because it could have jeopardized the pillar of Universalism: its indifference to the differences.

On each side, the so-called effects of parity on the political System were discussed. If the need to improve women's representation was unanimously admitted, there was a major division on the means. More precisely, positive action was seen as the political recognition of sex difference. And, as such, it was considered either as a way to complete the regime either as a way to destroy its foundations.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The provisions of the constitutional law are the outcome of a compromise. Initially the proposal consisted only of a sole amendment containing the word ‘guarantee’ instead of the word ‘favor’ (‘The law favors the equal access of women and men to political mandates and functions’). Under the pressure from the Senate, the National Assembly changed the wording of the original amendment and also added the second (‘The law and the political parties are both responsible for its implementation’). This compromise weakened the reform. Thus the reform did not restore the balance of power between the sexes in the assemblies nor did it change the political practises. Women got involved in the political process but quickly lost the control over it.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Through the end, the debate remained somewhat gendered and focused on creating a parity democracy. Supporters of parity democracy continued to argue that allowing more women into politics would encourage greater equality between the sexes.

Despite the serious divisions between the supporters of parity and their opponents, the debate was framed in very general terms. For example, they did not really

discuss the scale of differences in the society nor did enter discussion of benefits or consequences in the debate. The generality of the debate concealed disagreements among supporters of the reform. It helped parity to advance on the agenda without really convincing public opinion.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. Observatoire de la Parité (OP)

The OP supported policy proposals that encouraged the development of parity democracy in France. It supported the introduction of affirmative action.

In the conclusion of her report for the OP, Gisèle Halimi claimed for the recognition of the ‘sexual identity of the citizens’ explaining that it would be the only way to improve equal representation between the two sexes.

WPA 2. Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

The Deputy Minister did not get involved with the debate; it was neither consulted on the draft legislation nor did it appear in parliament.

WPA 3. Women’s Rights Service (WRS)

The WRS did not take an official position on the issue.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Support of policy proposals that encouraged the development of parity democracy in France.

Introduction of affirmative action.

Recognition of the ‘sexual identity of the citizens’ explaining that it would be the only way to improve equal representation between the two sexes.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1. Observatoire de la Parité (OP)

In 1995 (see decree of the 18th October 1995), the OP was created as a consulting body to assess gender gaps within France. In 1998 its powers were increased and the OP was allowed to officially assess the consequences of the different bills on parity reforms. The policy orientation of the OP has been really dependent of the government and opinions of its reporter (‘rapporteur’).

WPA 2. Deputy Minister of Women’s Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

The Deputy Ministry continued officially a multi-issue remit with regard to women’s rights; it was not formally charged with women’s rights issues in all areas and it actually appeared to be formally more oriented to women’s rights issues in the area of employment given its location in the Minister of Labor and its formal focus on job training.

The Péry ministry pursued a wide spectrum of issues and actually began to pursue in earnest gender mainstreaming, through instituting the assessment of gender specific budgets in all ministries and encouraging mainstreaming throughout

government. It established new parliamentary committees on women's rights in 2000 that would also pursue gender mainstreaming across all policy areas as much as possible. In this light, although the Ministries formal remit was multi-issue and it officially had job training as it's major focus, the Ministry unofficially had a cross-sectional approach.

WPA 3 Women's Rights Service

Multi-issue but not systematically cross-sectional. Focused on issues taken up by its commissions and administrative divisions.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1. Observatoire de la Parité (OP)

The OP is a consulting body made of 33 experts (18 in the beginning, 33 since 1998): political Actors, feminist activists, and scholars. The OP is only a consulting body. It has no decisional power. It is attached to the Prime minister.

WPA 2. Deputy Minister of Women's Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

The Deputy Minister was a Sub ministry attached to the Minister of Labor and was relatively removed from important decision making circles in the Ministry and the government in general.

WPA 3-Women's Rights Service

The WRS was a bureaucratic agency attached to the Labor Ministry. It was in charge of the administration of all of the different WPAs at the time:

- **the central administrative divisions and field offices at the regional and departmental levels.**
- **the Centers for Women's rights Information**
- **the Higher Council on Equal Employment**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1. Observatoire de la Parité (OP)

Name: Roselyne Bachelot

Years in WPA: 1995-1998

WMA activities: None

WPA 2. Deputy Minister of Women's Rights and Job Training (DMWRJT)

Name: Nicole Péry

Years in WPA: 1998-2002

WMA Activities: PS activities and elected official—MEP, regional councilor, deputy—no WMA activities.

WPA 3. Women's Rights Service

Name: Brigitte Grésy

Years in WPA: 1997 to 2003

WMA Activities: **Upper civil service training—ENA etc,— no administrative background in women’s rights. No connections to WMAs.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The movement for the parity reform has embodied the renewal of the French feminism. While less and less women pretended to be feminist, parity succeeded in mobilizing a large range of activists.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Parity**
- **Unemployment and Reduced Work Week**
- **Immigrant Women’s Rights and Economic Conditions/ Violence**
- **International Women’s movement – The UN Beijing Conference and the Global Women’s March**
- **Anti sexual harassment in the University/ sexism in the media, society and politics**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

The countermovement was strong. It was embodied by Elisabeth Badinter, an intellectual who is said to be feminist but has never been part of women’s movement or a feminist group. She is very well-known, she wrote several articles against parity from 1995 to 2000 which were published on the front page of Le Monde. Her husband, Robert Badinter, famous leftist lawyer who embodies the abolition of death penalty, has been a senator for years. During the debate, he campaigned against the law in the Senate. Apart from the Badinter, Elisabeth Roudinesco, a famous psychoanalyst, must be mentioned and also Evelyne Pisiert, a political scientist.

Even if the left did much more to push the constitutional reform on the agenda than the right, opponents to parity came from the right and the left. They pretended to act as the Republican System defenders.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Government**
- **Observatoire de la parité – 41 individuals/ groups members interviewed for the Halimi report**
- **WMAs – pro-parity groups and individual experts who gave testimony to the OP and to the parliamentary commissions**
- **Women parliamentarians elected in NA under Leadership of Yvette Roudy—about 10 or so and also women PCF senators- 10 or so**
- **Non WMAs gave testimony to the OP**

C25A_2 – Parties if Single Governing Majority

After 1998 Socialist Majority, with Green Party participation

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **EU Network on Gender Balance in Decision-making**
- **Council of Europe Based Network**
- **United Nations Based Network**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: FRA_PT1 1972-1975

Title: Pinot Report

WPA: Deputy Ministry of the Feminine Condition (DMFC)

Dates of Coding: 5/10/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Ligue du Droits des Femmes**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a part of the System of patriarchy ; efforts to enforce it are harmful to women, who are prostitutes. Important to note that the LDF or other parts of the autonomous women’s movement had not well developed public positions on prostitution; they supported the movement more to be in solidarity with the women’s prostitute movement.**

Policy goals: **The Ligue du Droits des Femmes supported prostitutes rights and treating prostitutes the same as other professionals.**

WMA 2

Name: **Collectif des Femmes Prostituées (Collectif)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Collectif Framed the problem in terms of equal rights/ equal protection. They argued that prostitutes deserved to be treated equally to other people and other professionals. The Collectif did not support the view that prostitution was a result of patriarchy or that the promotion of women’s rights and gender equality could actually improve prostitute rights. There was a certain degree of conflict between the Collectif’ views and the other two WM groups. The group was seen as holding a view closer to small shopkeepers than ideas that came out of the second wave feminist ideas supported by the two other groups**

Policy goals: **The Collectif came out in favor of policies that afforded prostitutes the same rights as other professionals. Further, the Collectif was against state regulation of prostitution and against the reinstatement of state run brothels.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Name **Ligue du Droits des Femmes**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a part of the system of patriarchy; efforts to enforce it are harmful to women, who are prostitutes. Important to note that the LDF or other parts of the autonomous women’s movement had not well developed public positions on prostitution; they supported the movement more to be in solidarity with the women’s prostitute movement.**

Policy goals: **The Ligue du Droits des Femmes supported prostitutes rights and treating prostitutes the same as other professionals.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Prostitution is a part of the System of patriarchy ; efforts to enforce it are harmful to women, who are prostitutes.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. A report; the law did not change. The Table of Contents had Three Parts:**
 - i. The Complexity of the Prostitution Phenomenon**
 - ii. The Condition of the Prostitute**
 - iii. Prevention and Rehabilitation**

The Pinot report reflected the demands for equal rights forwarded by the women’s prostitutes movement more than the analyses of the new women’s movements. In addition to interviewing established policy actors, Pinot talked with women prostitutes to prepare his report. In the report, he discussed the dignity of ‘women prostitutes’ and their right to professional status and recognition.

In a separate Sub-section in part 3 entitled, ‘real equality for woman’, Pinot urged public authorities to guarantee effectively to woman equal opportunities compared to men with regards to job training, salaries, social mobility, etc. The report also called for law enforcement to penalise male clients rather than only women prostitutes and to lighten penalties for individual pimps. These sections however, were less than one eighth of the entire report.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Ligue du Droits des Femmes

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing women’s organization**

Activities During the Debate: **The Ligue du Droits des Femmes; formal; participated by making coming out in favor of prostitute rights; members attended meeting in Paris.**

WMA 2 Collectif des Femmes Prostituées (Collectif)

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Collectif participated in the debate by meeting with the French President and other government officials, supporting street rallies and protests in Lyons and organizing two large meetings on prostitution in Paris.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1972, a Ministry of Interior decision to crackdown on prostitution, in the context of a nation-wide campaign against policy corruption thrust the issue on the national agenda. A part of this effort, was firing the head of the city of Lyon’s vice squad, who was subsequently tried for corruption and pimping. As a result, the Lyon police force was re-organised. In 1972 the police fined 6290 prostitutes for solicitation, imprisoned 43 pimps and closed down 41 prostitute hotels. Women prostitutes organised an initial demonstration in the city centre to protest what they saw as

unfair police harassment. City judges, also following the orders of the Ministry of Interior, began sentencing repeat offenders. The murder of two prostitutes in Lyons and a state crackdown on tax fraud mobilised Lyons prostitutes to organise a ‘collectif des femmes prostituées’ under the leadership of prostitute, Marie-Claude Masson, alias Ulla.

Ulla remained the major spokesperson for the amorphous ‘collectif’ until 1975. The collectif occupied two Catholic churches in Lyon, went to visit President Valéry Giscard D’Estaing in his home district, and sought to meet with a range of government officials, including the Deputy Secretary of Women’s Status, Françoise Giroud. The collectif also organised an ‘Etats Généraux de la Prostitution’ in Lyon and participated in the first ‘Assises Nationales de la Prostitution’ in Paris.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was carried out in gender neutral terms and there was little discussion of prostitutes rights. The major focus of government policy and private prostitute aid associations was to either keep women out of prostitution or to help women leave prostitution. When prostitutes rights were raised by the social services actors it was in context of the legal and fiscal impediments that kept women in prostitution. Prostitute aid associations saw prostitution as a form of oppression and slavery not just against women by men, but against all human beings by gender neutral institutions. Also, some anti protection groups tended to refer to prostitutes in terms of women and children, thus indicating a secondary dependent role for women, although this was not necessarily the frame of the debate.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Not gendered at the beginning

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, prostitute groups became active and gendered the debate. Prostitute groups argued that prostitutes were the same as other working women and that the state should respect their rights, and avoid assuming that all of their partners were either clients or pimps. The frame of the debate identified clients and pimps as men and prostitutes as women. While it was pointed out that men were clients and pimps there was no mention of sexism or underlying systems of patriarchy or that promoting gender equality could be a solution to improving prostitute rights.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Prostitutes the same as other working women**
- **Clients and pimps are men; prostitutes are women**

(Not feminist)

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs by Acronym (include QUAWPAS)

DMFC: Giroud took no position on prostitution except that it was a man’s problem that was not a part of her very wide and otherwise Systematic charge of the

feminine condition. She refused to meet with representatives from the Lyons based collective when they came to Paris (she had met with other members of the second wave feminist movements). In general, Giroud supported gender equality and the advancement of women's status within the context of differences between men and women.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames (pending)

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

To promote all measures to improve the feminine condition, in particular those that favor the access of women to different levels of responsibilities or to eliminate all discrimination against women.

Identified with Giscard's liberal centrist approach to social issue Giscard focused on reconciling women's family and work roles within the framework of equality. Her office did not deal with the reproductive rights issues of the time, taken care of the Ministry of Health under Simone Veil. Also the DMCF was in conflict with the EEP community seeing women's roles as mothers as being just as important if not as important as their position as full-time workers.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Giroud deputy ministry was attached to the Prime Minister's office. It had three chargée de mission and limited secretarial staff. The CDM were all upper civil servants.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Françoise Giroud**

Years in WPA: **1974-1976**

Editor of l'Expres (major weekly newsmagazine) and an avowed non feminist. Giroud had no links with any women's movement group at any end of the range of groups and movements mobilizing during this high point in women's movement activism.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The French women's movements were in a period of growth in the mid 1970s. The otherwise fragmented and amorphous movement unified around the campaign to legalise abortion, which ended in 1979.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Rape/ Violence against women**
- **Improving women's status and rights**

- **Sex equality in paid employment**
- **Anti Sexism in the press and the media**
- **Prostitution**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of Health**
- **The Ministry of Justice**
- **Guy Pinot (president of the Court of Orleans)**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

UDF

Gaullist

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate:

Not Applicable

Debate ID: FRA_PT2 1989-1990

Title: Reopening State Run Bordellos

WPA: Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights (DMWR)

Dates of Coding: 3/2/03, 4/1/03, 9/13/03, 3/02/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name : **Ségolène Royale, a Socialist Deputy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Royale defined the problem by taking an overtly gendered perspective. She argued that the sexual slavery and oppression were the central Issues in the debate and argued that reopening state run brothels would encourage the sexual slavery and oppression of women. This position had been elaborated by many women's movement groups/actors associated with new wave feminism and involved with feminist campaigns against sexual violence against women.**

Policy goals: **Rejection of re-opening of state-run brothels.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name : **Ségolène Royale, a Socialist Deputy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Royale defined the problem by taking an overtly gendered perspective. She argued that the sexual slavery and oppression were the central issues in the debate and argued that reopening state run brothels would encourage the sexual slavery and oppression of women. This position had been elaborated by many women's movement groups/actors associated with new wave feminism and involved with feminist campaigns against sexual violence against women.**

Policy goals: **Rejection of re-opening of state-run brothels.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Rejection of the regulatory regime—reopening state-run bordellos.**
2. **Link the justification for that rejection to women's rights and the negative impact of prostitution on women's status—'Sexual slavery'**
3. **A purely public health approach that does not consider women's rights as prostitutes is not acceptable—although this did not appear to become norm in later debates on prostitution policy.**
4. **Keeps abolitionist regime in place; not penalize prostitutes.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Ségolène Royale, a Socialist Deputy**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities: **Made a public statement cited in Le Monde against the re-opening of state run bordellos.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of public health concerns. Those in favor of reopening public bordellos argued that it was necessary in order to slow the spread of AIDS and other diseases. The argument for re-opening went as follows: prostitutes run a risk of spreading disease- sexually transmitted diseases and beginning in the late 1980s AIDS; government run bordellos would allow more systematic supervision of prostitutes in order to reduce the public health risk.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate was largely ungendered in the beginning, however, the feminine form of prostitutes was often used to refer to prostitutes and this suggests that women were the target of government action in reopening the bordellos.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

As the debate continued, the major issue became rejecting re-opening state run bordellos. an article published by the Minister of Health brought attention to the fact that male clients could also be responsible for the spread of AIDS, in addition to the prostitutes. The debate gained some gendered frames toward the end. Opponents to re-opening the state run bordellos argued that it would be harmful to women's status. Further, many opponents argued that prostitution was a form of sexual slavery against women and oppression, and that re-opening the brothels would encourage this activity.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Attention brought to the fact that male clients could also be responsible for the spread of AIDS**
- **Opponents to re-opening the state run bordellos argued that it would be harmful to women's status.**
- **Prostitution is a form of sexual slavery against women and oppression.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

1. Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights (DMWR)

The DMWR defined the problem by taking an overtly gendered perspective. André, the Minister, argued that the sexual slavery and oppression were the central issues in the debate and argued that reopening state run brothels would encourage the sexual slavery and oppression of women. She also mentioned that women should not be treated as 'commodities. Although André did not officially take any positions on prostitution issues in her campaign against domestic violence and the DMWR was not administrative responsible for the prostitution portfolio, she was willing to be interviewed by prostitute aid groups and take general public positions on the issue when necessary.

C5A_3—WMA Feminist Micro Frames

The DMWR defined the problem by taking an overtly gendered perspective. André, the Minister, argued that the sexual slavery and oppression were the central issues in the debate and argued that reopening state run brothels would encourage the sexual slavery and oppression of women. She also mentioned that women should not be treated as ‘commodities.’

Feminist because it analyzes prostitution in terms of women’s oppression.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Relatively strong emphasis on equal employment policy – adopted some new policies, supported the work of the NEEC, social exclusions, women’s unemployment, and domestic violence, some mention of political representation, but not a high priority. Prostitution was neither informally included in the DMWR’s work on domestic violence; nor was it formally in the ministry’s jurisdiction as it had been during the Roudy Ministry and since 1997.

POLICY AGENDA: Training and equal employment, mission for equal employment, women’s individual rights, women’s associations and regional coordination, general administration and international affairs, press services, research and culture division.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The DMWR was a deputy secretary attached to the PMs. which mean tit had a full cabinet positions but was below delegate ministers and full ministers. Thus from the highpoint of the Women’s Ministry the DMWR was downgraded. At the time it still benefited from approximately the same size ministerial staff and completely developed divisions at the national level, and regional administration. Also, the NEEC was housed in the DMWR and was administered to by the MEE Mid-level within the overall government hierarchy, and at the second highest position of any cabinet position on women’s rights – deputy ministry, attached to the PM’s office. This means that it was not automatically allowed to sit in on all council of ministers meetings; just the ones where it had a proposal to make.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Michèle André June 1988- June 1991

Representative of PM Rocard’s efforts to appoint people from ‘civil society’; from Puy-dome—director of deaf children’s schools active in the Socialist Party in that department; member of exec, committee of PS since 1985 – more of a Rocardian than a PS feminist; 81-83 Regional delegate of Women’s Rights in early 1980s; technically a WPA but not known for her women’s rights activism, unless through the party, but not really involved with the PS feminists.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement from the 1970s had virtually disappeared by 1990 with a very small number of new groups emerging.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti sexual harassment**
- **Abortion and contraception**
- **Immigrant women's rights**
- **Parity**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement on prostitution

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet—Health Ministry and Administration (Former Health Minister and current Health Minister/Humanitarian Action**
- **Deputy Minister of Women's Rights**
- **Parliament—UDF, RPR,PS Groups took positions**
- **Written press as a forum for policy actors**
- **Family Planning Movement**
- **Ligue des Droits de l'homme**
- **Mouvement du Nid**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Socialist Party, with some small Center-Left MPs and the Communist Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

**Pro Prostitution TAN—Defense of Prostitute Rights came from regulatory
Anti Regulation/ Abolition TAN**

C26A_3- CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under-Debate:

Not Applicable

Debate ID: FRA_PT3 1991-1992

Title: Penal Code Law Reform 92684 of 1991

WPAs: Deputy Ministry of Women's Rights (DMWR); Deputy Minister of Women's Rights and Daily Life (DMWRDL)

Dates of Coding: 5/10/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Association Contre les Violences Faites aux Femmes au TravailAVFT**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Against any form of regulation; saw prostitution as a result of patriarchy in society.**

Policy goals: **Reduce criminalization of individual prostitutes and increase criminalization of pimps and trafficking women.**

WMA 2

Name: **Union Contre le trafic des Etres Humains,**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Against any form of regulation; saw prostitution as a result of patriarchy in society.**

Policy goals: **Reduce criminalization of individual prostitutes and increase criminalization of pimps.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name **Association Contre les Violences Faites aux Femmes au Travail (AVFT)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Against any form of regulation; saw prostitution as a result of patriarchy in society.**

Policy goals: **Reduce criminalization of individual prostitutes and increase criminalization of pimps and trafficking women.**

WMA 2

Name: **Union Contre le trafic des Etres Humains**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Against any form of regulation; saw prostitution as a result of patriarchy in society.**

Policy goals: **Reduce criminalization of individual prostitutes and increase criminalization of pimps.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The new law sought to re define pimping, so that prostitutes would not be arrested with pimps.**
2. **The law focused on increasing the punishment and arrest of pimps, particularly for those who threatened prostitutions directly.**

3. **Larger crackdown on the organized crime behind prostitution and international trafficking.**
4. **Article R 265.8 of the penal code was changed the definition of solicitation and sought to decrease penalties on prostitutes and to make solicitation a more difficult crime to be arrested for.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Association Contre les Violences Faites aux Femmes au Travail (AVFT)

Form: **Formal women's movement organization.**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **President Marie-Victoire Louis brought association into prostitute rights issues; had a special issue of AVFT's journal on prostitution in 1991. Louis also wrote an analysis of the 1991 penal code reform and several members of AVFT interviewed the Minister of Justice about the penal code reforms, specifically asking him about the articles on prostitution. The interview was also published in the AVFT's journal.**

WMA 2 Union Contre le trafic des Etres Humains

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Formally identified as a feminist group, sought to help prostitutes leave prostitution, with support of government subsidies. Head of group, Denise Pouillon-Falco spoke publicly against the institution of prostitution. Published in the AVFT special issue on prostitution.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Public positions on reforming the criminalised aspects of prostitution can be traced back to the prostitute rights movements and the Rapport Pinot discussed in the first debate. Le Mouvement du Nid also supported increased penalties for pimps and lightening potentially damaging criminal laws to prostitutes themselves. These dispersed calls for penal code reform on prostitution were ignored until the Socialist government began the lengthy process of overhauling the entire Penal Code in 1981. The Ministry of Women's Rights, through the first and only *Comité Interministeriel sur la Prostitution* had formally asked for increased penalties for pimps as early as 1981. In 1986, the powerful Roudy Ministry formulated official recommendations on the penal code reform proposal being drafted by the socialist Fabius government; however they appeared to have little impact in the parliamentary debate on the penal code reform. The recommendations included re-establishing penalties against clients who threatened or raped prostitutes, and increasing penalties for pimping and international trafficking by organised crime. These proposals used gender-neutral language e.g., 'reestablishment of serious circumstances in the area of threats, constraints or rape'. Although the language was gender-neutral, the proposals were in line with feminist positions on prostitution of the prostitute rights groups and feminist organisations at the time.

The Fabius government formally Submitted the first sections of draft penal code legislation to parliament for commission scrutiny in 1986. The intended magnitude of the reforms was articulated by the Minister of Justice in 1989, ‘to redefine the values of our society, or, more precisely, those for society of the third millennium’. The reforms were discussed in parliamentary session Beginning in April 1992 and adopted in July 1992.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate focused on promoting human rights and preventing trafficking by outlawing pimping. The debate was gender neutral in the beginning and it ignored the rights of prostitutes, and feminist discourse on prostitution. In the beginning, proponents of the criminal code revision suggested that pimping should be outlawed and that pimps should face criminal sanctions. From the beginning to end, the frame was structure by gender- neutral universalism that sometimes hides gender biases. The gender neutrality of universalism often hides the gender biased approach of many actors to women’s policy issues where gender stereotypes about men and women are the norm. In the area of prostitution policy, the gender biased aspect of republican universalism is expressed, for example, by portraying women prostitutes as sexual objects, minors or victims, or by failing to focus on male clients as criminals.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the ebate
None explicit in debate

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

The debate remained gender blind throughout and the dominant Frame focused on promoting human rights by ending pimping, without any change in the gender-blind/biased approach.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None explicit in deabte

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

DMWR & DMWRDL: André and Neiertz both argued that prostitution was a form of sexual exploitation of women and were against state regulation of prostitution. For André in the debate on state-run bordellos in 1990 and for Neiertz in an interview with the Mouvement du Nid published in 1991). Neither took any specific positions on the criminalization of prostitution nor more specifically on the implications of the penal code reform law for women’s rights.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

DMWR&DMWRDL: André and Neiertz both argued that prostitution was a form of sexual exploitation of women and were against state regulation of prostitution.

Feminist because it opposes prostitution as exploitation of women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1

DMWR under André (before July 1991) – Any issues that affected women’s rights no change in formal policy orientation since the Roudy ministry
André—Relatively strong emphasis on equal employment policy – adoptee some new polices, supported the work of the NEEC, social exclusions, women’s unemployment, and domestic violence, some mention of political representation, but not a high priority. No treatment of prostitution issues.

DMWRDL under Neiertz (after July 1991) Daily life, for all citizens not just women was added, to women’s rights. But was placed in the employment ministry, so ironic that it did not follow-up on EEP.
Basically ignored equal employment policy and employment more generally; for example the NEEC did not meet under her watch. No treatment of prostitution issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The DMWR was a deputy secretary attached to the PMs, which meant it had a full cabinet position but was below delegate ministers and full ministers. UNDER NEIERTZ, The DMWRQL was attached to the Employment Ministry.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Michèle André June 1988- June 1991**

Representative of PM Rocard’s efforts to appoint people from ‘civil society’; from Puy-dome—director of deaf children’s schools active in the Socialist Party in that department; member of exec, committee of PS since 1985 – more of a Rocardian than a PS feminist; 81-83 Regional delegate of Women’s Rights in early 1980s; technically a WPA but not known for her women’s rights activism, unless through the party, but not really involved with the PS feminists.

Name: **Véronique Neiertz**

Years in WPA:**July 1991- July 1993**

WMA Activity: **Active in the PS national committee, but not involved with women’s rights issues, PS feminists or any WMAs prior being appointed.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Although there was not a significant mass-based women’s movement like the movements of the 1970s, feminist organisations and movements in the early 1990s continued to gain momentum, re-emerging as important players.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Anti sexual harassment**
- **Abortion and contraception**
- **Immigrant women’s rights**
- **Parity**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of the Interior**
- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Justice**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Socialist; Center-left coalition

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
Around various international conferences on trafficking women and prostitute right. e.g., World Congress on Prostitutes – 1986 held in Brussels; European Parliament resolution on prostitution and Council of Europe Seminar in 1991; involved dignity of women and trafficking women issues. two separate networks developed with increased activates as the 1990s moved on, Council of Europe conference and important rallying point.

Pro Prostitution TAN—Defense of Prostitute Rights came from regulatory countries.

Anti Regulation/ Abolition TAN – beginning to emerge during this period: Later led by coalition of French feminists, femocrats, agents from the government that pushed that position in the international discussions; just Beginning to emerge.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
States shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: GER_AB1 1969 - 1974

Title: Bundestag decision to legalize abortion

WPA: None

Dates of coding: 12/23/03, 3/04/04, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Katharina Focke (Federal Health Minister)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Advocated decriminalization of abortion in the first three months.**

WMA2

Name: **Annemarie Renger, chair of federal women's organization of SPD**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Each woman should make her own decision since she is the one most affected by it; law should protect existing life and not make criminals out of women.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalization of abortion in the first three months.**

WMA 3

Name: **Aktion 218 (coalition of women's movement groups)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women should have legal right to abortion ; part of women freeing themselves and self-determination regarding their bodies and their lives.**

Policy goals: **Complete removal of abortion from the criminal code.**

WMA 4

Name: **Sozialistischer Frauenbund Westberlin**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Since society assigns women the responsibility for caring for children, it should allow them the responsibility to determine whether to have children.**

Policy goals: **Demand complete removal of paragraph 218; complete decriminalization during pregnancy.**

WMA 5

Name: **Frauenaktion 70**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **'My belly belongs to me'**

Policy goals: **Removal of abortion from criminal code.**

WMA 6

Name: **Women's Section of the SPD**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **The women's section of the SPD, tried to gender the issue and argue that the women should be allowed to freely have an abortion during the first few months of pregnancy.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women should have legal right to abortion ; part of women freeing themselves and self-determination regarding their bodies and their lives 'My belly belongs to me'.**

Policy goals: **Demand complete removal of paragraph 218; complete decriminalization during pregnancy.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Abortion remained in criminal code**
- 2. Abortion in the first 3 months of pregnancy not punished provided**
 - a. woman wanted the procedure**
 - b. doctor performed it**
 - c. woman visited counseling service**
- 3. After first 3 months abortions legal only for indications:**
 - a. danger to woman's health**
 - b. presence of severe birth defects**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Katharina Focke**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Advocated decriminalization.**

WMA 2 **Annemarie Renger**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Advocated decriminalization.**

WMA 3 **Aktion 218**

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Petition drives; demonstrations against 218; national week of protest organized in major cities in March 1973.**

WMA 4 **Sozialistischer Frauenbund Westberlin**

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate:

WMA 5 **Frauenaktion 70**

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized street demonstrations; petition drive to federal Health Minister.**

WMA 6 **Women's Section of the SPD**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **The women's section of the SPD, tried to gender the issue and argue that the women should be allowed to freely have an abortion during the first few months of pregnancy.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1970, a group of German and Swiss legal scholars released a proposed reform of the criminal code, part of the long- term post - war overhaul of the code. This alternative draft as their report became known, included two proposals for reforming abortion regulation: the periodic model, which would legalize abortion in the first three months of pregnancy and the indications model, which would legalize abortion only when certain conditions or indications were present and verified independently. These models became the foundation for the abortion debate.

Simultaneously, women's groups seized upon legal abortion as a central demand of their emerging movement and mounted numerous actions to gain public support. Meanwhile other groups, most prominently the civil rights group, Humanist Union, also began agitating for legalization, with the support from many legal and medical professionals. Finally, as other countries reformed their abortion laws in the late 1960s- notably Great Britain in 1967- German media exposed the issue of illegal abortion. Magazine and newspaper articles told the stories of women traveling to London for abortions or procuring them illegally inside West Germany. The discussion of abortion reform gained more public media attention in 1971, as the governing coalition of the Social Democratic Party (SDP) and the Free Democratic Party (FDP) began drafting its reform of the abortion portion of the criminal code.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the dominant frame of the debate focused on ways to prevent illegal abortions. The participants recognized that the current ban on abortions did not prevent abortions, but rather criminalized many women and doctors who participated in them. The dominant frame also made mention of the idea that the new abortion law would have to properly protect the life of the fetus, as mentioned in the German constitution. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The dominant frame did not change much over the course of the debate. In spite of the efforts of women's movement actors, the dominant frame remained ungendered and focused on preventing illegal abortions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
Not applicable; no WPA

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name:
 Years in WPA:
 WMA activity:
Not applicable

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
 Stage: **Growth**
 Evidence and source: **During this debate, the women's movement was in a growth stage. Dozens of groups were springing up throughout the country with demand for abortion reform as a main organizing and rallying point.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (legality/access)**
- **Battered women's shelters/Domestic violence**
- **Consciousness-raising/Self-discovery efforts [personal is political, etc.]**
- **Sexual politics (the violence of heterosexuality)**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Strong—Catholic Church; Christian Democratic Party: oppose any liberalization of law; law much protect life; CDU would allow abortion for medical indication.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in sub-system

- **Government ministers**
- **Leaders of parties in Bundestag**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
SPD/FDP coalition in power during the debates.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate
Not Applicable

Debate ID: GER_AB2 1990-92

Title: Post unification compromise

WPA: Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)

Dates of coding: 12/23/03, 3/04/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Petra Blass UFV member; PDS spokesperson on women's issues**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's complete self-determination; rights regarding own body and need for state to secure those rights.**

Policy goals: **Advocated complete decriminalization of abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **Christine Schenk. UFV member; Alliance 90 Greens spokesperson on women's issues**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's rights issue; reject patriarchal state limiting women's abortion access.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalization of abortion.**

WMA 3

Name: **Alice Schwarzer, Publisher EMMA, feminist magazine**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Decriminalization of abortion in first 12 weeks**

WMA 4

Name: **SPD & FDP women politicians who brokered compromise bill**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's traditional responsibilities for children gave them the right to determine when/whether to have them.**

Policy goals: **State should provide assistance to families to help them deal with 'pregnancy conflicts'; supported compromise bill as the best we can get.**

WMA 5

Name: **Inge Wettig, SPD spokesperson on issue**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need for freedom to choose in terms of gender inequality.**

Policy goals: **periodic model—decriminalization in first 12 weeks. Eventually supported expanded conditions model.**

WMA 6

Name: **UFV (WM)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Emphasis on women's rights issue; reject patriarchal state limiting women's abortion access.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalization of abortion at least in the first 12 weeks.**

WMA7

Name: **Frauenpolitische Runde Tisch-Berlin**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's rights issue; reject patriarchal state limiting women's abortion access.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalization in the first 12 weeks.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women's complete self-determination; rights regarding own body and need for state to secure those rights emphasis on women's rights issue; reject patriarchal state limiting women's abortion access.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalization of abortion at least in the first 12 weeks; complete decriminalization of abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Abortion left in criminal code**
2. **Abortion in first 12 weeks of pregnancy decriminalized provided woman under went mandatory counseling at least 3 days prior to the procedure**
3. **Final decision left to woman although counseling supposed to encourage continuing pregnancy**
4. **Increased social welfare benefits, including childcare spaces and free contraception to young women to reduce conflicts caused by unwanted pregnancies.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Petra Blass**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Media spokesperson for PDS on issue; prominent in Bundestag debates.**

WMA 2 **Christine Schenk**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Media spokesperson for A190 Greens on issue; prominent in Bundestag debates.**

WMA 3 **Alice Schwarzer**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Editorializing on the issue.**

WMA 4 SPD & FDP women politicians who brokered compromise billForm: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Political maneuvering within Bundestag and parties.****WMA 5 Inge Wettig**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Party spokesperson on issues; active in Bundestag debate and press coverage.****WMA 6 UFV (WM)**Form: **Formal WM organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Organized local and national demonstrations; issued press releases on various party drafts of bills; sought to coordinate women's movement response to and participation in abortion debate.****WMA 7 Frauenpolitische Runde Tisch-Berlin**Form: **Informal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Organized local and national demonstrations; issued press releases on various party drafts of bills; sought to coordinate women's movement response to and participation in abortion debate.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

The prospect of German unification in 1990 challenged this arrangement because abortion was legal in the first trimester in East Germany. The contradictory abortion laws were a serious point of contention in unification negotiations. The western CDU/CSU wanted to apply the FRG regulations to the East, as was done with other laws, but the GDR Parliament, along with some western political forces who saw an opportunity to liberalize the FRG law, resisted. A majority of East Germans especially women, were steadfastly opposed to any restriction of their right to abortion. When the issue threatened the treaty's passage, negotiators agreed to leave existing laws in effect in eastern and western Germany until a jointly elected Bundestag passed new legislation, something it was obliged to do before 1993.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame at the beginning of focused on fulfilling the state's obligation to protect unborn life (as mandated by an earlier court case), while acknowledging that women sometimes faced conflicts in pregnancy (a concession made to East Germans during the unification treaty negotiations).

The policy choice in the beginning was between the periodic model, which would legalize abortion during the first three months of pregnancy, and the indications

model, which legalize abortion only when certain conditions were present and verified independently.

Most debate participants framed their proposals with reference to how they would better protect unborn life (thus comply with the Court-determined criteria) regardless of the policy being advocated.

The debate treated abortion as a family issue and not a women's issue. It was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The framing of the debate remained focused on two points, how to balance the court's requirement that unborn life be protected and the constitutional guarantee's of women's individual rights. The emphasis shifted over the course of the debate so that, by the end, all actors with viable policy proposals focus on how to protect unborn life. Those who advocated a less restrictive abortion law emphasized this protection, along with their proposed increased assistance to families. This assistance (improved counseling and social policies like day care) was presented as a way to create a 'child-friendly' society that would protect life by encouraging families to 'say yes' to children. There were very few images of men present in the debate at all. Women themselves were often absent, subsumed under the category 'families,' but, when they were mentioned, were assumed to bear primary responsibility for childrearing.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the end of the Debate

- **Women responsible for child rearing**
- **Constitutional guarantee of women's individual rights**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)

- **abortion is a women's issue, because it is women who bear children, bear primary responsibility for their care, and bear the emotional burden of abortion. Thus women's needs need to be balanced against the rights of the unborn life.**
- **advocates both parents taking responsibility for parenting tasks; generally emphasizes men's roles as parents and the need for social welfare measures that would enable both parents to combine employment and family duties.**
- **abortion is not a 'women's rights' issue. She seeks to situate herself between the two camps on this. She rejects the framing of women's rights advocates that focus solely on women's self-determination rights, but she also avoids the language of most abortion opponents who referred to self-determination as a 'so-called' right.**
- **rejects a pure periodic model in favor of an indications model with mandatory counseling but with some flexibility built in.**

- rejects allowing final decision to be subject to review by experts (as abortion opponents proposed) and instead argues that final decision should be left up to the woman.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1 **Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)**

The policy issues were wide ranging issues related to women and youth. The women's policy issues ranged from domestic violence to equity/equality policy.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
WPA 1 **Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)**

The Minister is a member of the Chancellor's cabinet (executive) and the ministry is free-standing within the government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
WPA 1 **Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)**
Name: **Angela Merkel, Minister for Women & Youth**
Years in WPA: **1991- 1994**
WMA Activities: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and sources; **The women's movement in the 1990s is best characterized as fragmented and in decline. A lack of public support contributed to its poor bargaining position vis a vis policy makers.**

C16A_1—List of policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (post-unification)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service)**
- **Unemployment/retraining/effects of unification on eastern women was a focus of some eastern German women's movement activism**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Strong

Catholic Church: abortion is murder and sinful, it should not be permissible; penalties must be strengthened; abortion may only be allowed to save the life of the mother or in situations of dire endangerment to her health.

European Doctors' Campaign: abortion is murder

Christian Democrats for Life: abortion is mass murder; get rid of all indications except medical (life of the mother).

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in sub-system

- **Ministry of Justice**
- **Ministry for Families and Seniors**
- **Ministry for Women and Youth**
- **Bundestag (lower house of parliament)**
- **Legislative party leaders**
- **Issue spokespersons for all parties**
- **Individual MPs from all parties**
- **Special committees**
- **Experts invited to testify before special committees**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Christian Democrats (CDU/CSU) in coalition with FDP controlled the majority in the lower house of Parliament. The Social Democratic Party (SPD) controlled the upper house of Parliament during most of the debate period.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 12

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: GER_AB3 1993-1995

Title: Pregnancy and family assistance law modification

WPAs: Ministry for Womens and Youth (MWY); Ministry for Family, Women and Youth (MFWY)

Dates of coding: 12/25/03, 3/04/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Kerstin Mueller, Gr/Bu90 MP & spokesperson on women and politics for Greens as of 1994**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Striking Paragraph 218 is a fundamental issue of women's emancipation.**

Policy Goals: **Striking Paragraph 218 from criminal code.**

WMA 2

Name: **Christina Schenk, Greens/Bu90 spokesperson on women's issues (through 1994)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is a basic and fundamental women's rights issue.**

Policy Goals:

Still advocates striking law (that is, advocates complete decriminalization), but, given Court ruling, advocate confidential and unbiased counseling and medical advice, public financing for poor women, minimizing criminal penalties.

WMA 3

Name: **Rita Sussmith, CDU MP (former head of WPA)**

Micro Frame: Issue Definition:

Abortion is (morally) wrong, but should not be a criminal act

Court's decision creates a 2-class system between those who can and can't pay for abortions.

Policy Goals:

Find way to allow some public financing.

Counseling should be confidential and not with a pre-determined goal.

WMA 4

Name: **Blass, PDS spokesperson on women's policy issues; also member of UFV**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is a fundamental women's rights issue.**

Policy Goals:

Paragraph 218 belongs 'on the trash-heap of history'.

Striking paragraph 218 from the criminal code.

WMA5

Name: **Alice Schwarzer, longtime editor of Emma (the German Ms magazine)**
 Micro Frame: Issue Definition: **Abortion should be a woman's self-determination and women's rights issue, not decision made for her by patriarchy of judges or others.**
 Policy Goals:

WMA 6

Name: **Hanna Wolf as SPD Women & Policy spokesperson**
 Micro Frame:
 Issue Definition: **Women must have 'individual responsibility' for the abortion decision and must not be made to feel guilty because of biased counseling.**
 Policy Goals: **More neutral counseling, women make decision (not doctors or others), more public financing for poor women.**

WMA7

Name: **Inge Wettig-Danielmeier, SPD MP; party's spokeswoman on the Paragraph 218 reform debate**
 Micro Frame:
 Issue Definition: **Unborn life can only be protected by respecting women and their rights ; women must have individual responsibility in matters of abortion.**
 Policy Goals:
Unbiased counseling (i.e., not dominated by right-to-lifers).
Financing for poor women seeking abortion.
Social supports for pregnant women (including more public financing of childcare).

WMA8

Name: **Women's Policy Working-group of the PDS Fraktion (in Bundestag)**
 Micro Frame:
 Issue Definition: **Women's rights and self-determination issue.**
 Policy Goals: **Strike paragraph 218 from the criminal code and amend the constitution to guarantee a right to choose abortion for women.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Striking Paragraph 218 is a fundamental issue of women's emancipation.**
Abortion is a basic and fundamental women's rights issue.
Abortion should be a woman's self-determination and women's rights issue, not decision made for her by patriarchy of judges or others.
 Policy Goals: **Strike Paragraph 218 from criminal code.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Abortion declared to be unlawful**
2. **Abortion not punished if it met these criteria:**
 - a. **performed by doctor at least 3 days after pregnant women had undergone mandatory counseling meant to protect unborn life,**

- provide information on social services, advise of fetus' right to life, and that abortion only possible in an exceptional situation
- b. doctor advised woman about medical risks
- c. within first 12 weeks of pregnancy

Under this option, the final decision left to the woman

Woman had to pay for these 'unlawful' abortions; costs for women with low incomes were covered by state

3. Alternatively: abortion not unlawful if met one of these indications:
 - a. pregnancy threat to woman's life, physical or mental health
 - b. pregnancy result of rape or incest

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Kerstin Mueller**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Party spokesperson, interviews, press releases, parliamentary debates.**

WMA 2 **Christina Schenk**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented Greens/Bu90 position in Bundestag debate Jan 1994; press releases, interviews.**

WMA 3 **Rita Sussmith**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Media interviews**

WMA 4 **Blass**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Press releases, speeches in the Bundestag.**

WMA 5 **Alice Schwarzer**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (media)**

Activities During the Debate: **Editor of magazine; wrote about issue.**

WMA 6 **Hanna Wolf**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Took over as SPD women and politics spokesperson during the debate; in that capacity, gave interviews, issued press releases, and spoke to press and others on the issue.**

WMA 7 Inge Wettig-DanielmeierForm: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Interviews, public speaking, etc, especially as part of SPD electoral campaign in 1994, where she seemed to be the party's point-person on the abortion issue; one of SPD's key representatives in negotiations with the governing coalition during efforts to draft compromise bill that adhered to Court ruling.**

WMA 8 Women's Policy Working-group of the PDS FraktionForm: **Formal organization**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Press release in response to court ruling & at start of Bundestag debate in 1994.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In May 1993, the FCC struck down the 1992 Bundestag law, claiming that it did not provide constitutionally sufficient protection of the unborn life, including protection against the fetus's mother. The justices set forth specific provision that must be incorporated into new legislation including a prohibition of abortion, a legal obligation to carry a pregnancy to term, punishment of a woman's friends or family members who pressured her to have an abortion, and restrictions on the use of state health insurance funds to pay for abortions. The court also held, however, that an abortion was not unlawful if it met either a medical or criminological indication. Furthermore, the state could use counseling and other social assistance measures to protect life rather than criminal penalties.

Another policy debate began immediately after the court announced its decision, and it lasted until a new statute became law in July 1995. This debate took place largely within and between political parties. The women's ministry played an important role, particularly after a government reorganization following the 1994 elections. Inter and intra- party debates were covered in the press, but there was less press attention to other debate participants.

C3A_1—Issue frame at the beginning of the debate

After a 1992 Federal Constitutional Court decision struck down the existing abortion law for not providing sufficient protection of fetal life, the dominant frame of this debate focused on the protection of unborn life. The debate presented a paternalistic image of women and focused on ways that the state could provide help to them. With this, policy suggestions turned toward requiring women to undergo counseling before receiving abortions. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

**C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the beginning of the debate
Focus on the ways the state could help women; paternalistic role.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate did not change much throughout and remained focused on protecting fetal life by offering counseling to women seeking abortion. In spite of the efforts of women in the Alliance 90/ Green party, the on the whole, the debate remained ungendered. Other key debate topics focused on specific state provisions (income level necessary to qualify for state-funded abortions and the ability of federal states to pay for childcare services, to give two examples).

C3A_4—List of gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the end of the debate

No change in the debate; still promoted counseling of women in order to save fetal life.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs by Acronym (include QUAPAW's)

WPA 1 Ministry For Women and Youth (MWY)

Minister Merkel made a slight attempt at gendering the debate by recognizing that abortion policy directly affected women.

WPA 2 Ministry for Families, Seniors, Women, and Youth(MFSWY)

**Minister Claudia Nolte made no attempts at gendering the issue and instead argue that it was a fetal- rights issue. Nolte did not portray abortion as a women's issue and indicated that the fetus was independent of the woman
Nolte opposed periodic policy, rejected women's self determination, advocated intervention by counselors and doctors throughout the decision making process, supported continued criminalization of abortion.**

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Ministry For Women and Youth (MWY)

Multi- issue- mandate on all policy issues that affected women.

WPA 2 Ministry for Families, Seniors, Women, and Youth(MFSWY)

Multi- issue- mandate on all policy issues that affected women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Ministry For Women and Youth (MWY)

The Minister is a member of the Chancellor's cabinet (executive) and the ministry is free-standing within the government.

WPA 2 Ministry for Families, Seniors, Women, and Youth(MFSWY)

The Minister is a member of the Chancellor's cabinet (executive) and the ministry is free-standing within the government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Ministry For Women and Youth (MWY)

Name: **Angela Merkel, Minister for Women & Youth (BMFJ) Claudia Nolte, Minister for Family, Seniors, Women, and Youth**

Years in WPA: **1991-4**

WPA 2 Ministry for Families, Seniors, Women, and Youth(MFSWY)

Name: **Claudia Nolte,**

Years: **1994-1998**

WMA activities: **No**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and sources: **The women's movement in the 1990s is best characterized as fragmented and in decline. A lack of public support contributed to its poor bargaining position vis a vis policy makers.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (post-unification)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service)**
- **Unemployment/retraining/effects of unification on eastern women was a focus of some eastern German women's movement activism**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

There was a focused and Strong counter movement during this debate. The Catholic Church and various representatives of it (the German Bishops' council, for example) were very vocal in their opposition abortion and legislation which permitted it. In addition to editorializing against legal abortions in the church's own publications, representatives held press conferences and even protested directly to political parties at times. The Church was joined by other right to life groups, some groups working for the rights of the disabled (protesting the eugenic indication), and several individual CDU/CSU legislators.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in sub-system

- **Ministry of Justice**
- **Ministry for Families, Seniors, Women and Youth**
- **Ministry for Women and Youth**
- **Bundestag (lower house of parliament)**
- **Bundesrat (upper house)**
- **Legislative party leaders**
- **Issue spokespersons for all parties**
- **Individual MPs from all parties**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The conservative CDU was in the majority during the debate with the FDP as a junior coalition party. The SPD controlled the upper house, the Bundesrat, during most of this debate, and particularly during the summer of 1994, when it rejected a version of the bill passed by the Bundestag.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 12

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: GER_HI 2000-02

Title: Pre- Genetic Diagnosis (PGD) and Stem Cell Research,

WPA: Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth (MFASCWY)

Dates of coding: 12/25/03, 3/04/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1 Pia Maier (PDS), MP

Micro-Frame: **Autonomy frame**

Issue Definition: **Abortion rights**

Policy Goals: **To preserve the right to abortion, to deregulate the ESchG.**

WMA 2 Andrea Fischer (the Greens), MP, Minister of Health

Micro Frame: **Embryo protection frame and good society frame.**

Issue Definition: **Abortion rights; embryo protection, anti-eugenics.**

Policy Goals: **to preserve the right to abortion and to prevent a new form of eugenics. To preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 3 Petra Bläss (PDS), MP

Micro Frame: **Instrumentalization argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **Instrumentalization of women in the area of reprogenetics.**

Policy Goals: **prevent instrumentalization of women in the area of reprogenetics. To preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 4 Herta Däubler-Gmelin (SPD), Minister of Justice

Micro Frame: **Embryo protection frame and good society frame.**

Issue Definition: **Abortion rights; embryo protection, anti-eugenics.**

Policy Goals: **To preserve the right to abortion and to prevent a new form of eugenics. To preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 5 Monika Knoche (The Greens), MP, Parliamentary Study Commission:

Micro Frame: **Alienation argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **The technicalization and medicalization of pregnancy and human reproduction.**

Policy Goals: **To prevent the technicalization and medicalization of pregnancy and human reproduction. To preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 6 Christa Riemann-Hanewinkel (SPD), MP

Micr Frame: **Alienation argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **Medicalization of pregnancy and pressure on women.**

Policy Goals: **To prevent a new form of eugenics and social pressure on women to give birth to healthy and fit children only. To preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 7 Helga Kühn-Mengl (SPD), MP, member of the Parliamentary Study Commission

Micro Frame: **Social pressure and social solutions argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **To prevent a new form of eugenics and social pressure on women to give birth to healthy and fit children only, to preserve the right to abortion.**

Policy Goals: **To prevent a new form of eugenics and social pressure on women to give birth to healthy and fit children only, to preserve the right to abortion.**

WMA 8 Hanna Wolf (SPD), MP:

Micro Frame: **Social pressure argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **New form of eugenics and social pressure on women to give birth to healthy and fit children only. To preserve the ESchG.**

Policy Goals: **To prevent a new form of eugenics and social pressure on women to give birth to healthy and fit children only, to preserve the right to abortion.**

WMA 10 Rita Griebhaber (SPD), MP,

Micro Frame: **Social solutions argument and reproductive rights (good society frame and autonomy frame, though these were usually contradictory).**

Issue Definition: **Women postpone the birth of children with the effect that new reproductive technologies become necessary. However, PGD is a means of more reproductive autonomy.**

Policy Goals: **To preserve the right to abortion, to enlarge women's reproductive autonomy. To deregulate the ESchG.**

WMA 11 Carola Reimann (SPD), MP, Member of the Parliamentary Study Commission

Micro Frame: **Autonomy frame.**

Issue Definition: **Interaction between the mother's body and the embryo was decisive for embryonic development, therefore embryo is no subjects of rights or dignity.**

Policy Goals: **To foster Germany's biotechnology research and industry, to deregulate the ESchG.**

WMA 12 Regine Kollek, biologist, member of the National Council on Ethics:

Micro Frame: **Instrumentalization argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **Primarily problems of PGD.**

Policy Goals: **To prevent the legalization of PGD and embryo research in order to prevent a new form of eugenics and the instrumentalization of women as egg donors, to preserve the ESchG.**

WMA 13 Sigrid Graumann, expert participant in the BMG Symposium and Member of the Parliamentary Study Commission:

Micro Frame: **Instrumentalization argument, social pressure argument (good society frame).**

Issue Definition: **New forms of eugenics, social implications of reprogenetics, such as indirect discrimination of disabled people.**

Policy Goals: To prevent the legalization of PGD and embryo research in order to prevent a new form of eugenics and the instrumentalization of women as egg donors, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 14 Ingrid Schneider, expert participant in the BMG Symposium and member of the Parliamentary Study Commission.

Micro Frame: Instrumentalization argument (good society frame).

Issue Definition: Egg donation, embryo donation, and its implications for women.

Policy Goals: To prevent women from being seen as resources of research material such as eggs and embryos, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 16 Ulrike Hauffe, expert participant in the BMG Symposium

Micro Frame: Social solutions argument (good society frame).

Issue Definition: Medicalization of Pregnancy, relations of inequality between men and women.

Policy Goals: To find social solutions for involuntary childlessness which would not require reprogenetics, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 17 Monika Fränznick, expert participant in the BMG Symposium:

Micro Frame: Social pressure argument (good society frame).

Issue Definition: Argued that genetic and reproductive technologies would impose social pressure on women to produce ‘proper’ children.

Policy Goals: To prevent that genetic and reproductive technologies impose social pressure on women to produce ‘proper’ children, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 18 Giselind Berg, expert participant in the BMG Symposium:

Micro Frame: Instrumentalization argument (good society frame).

Issue Definition: Social implications of egg donation for women.

Policy Goals: To prevent that women are seen as resources. To preserve the ESchG.

WMA 19 Magdalena Weiss, expert participant in the BMG Symposium.

Micro Frame: ‘Alienation argument’ (good society frame).

Issue Definition: Medicalization and technicalization of pregnancy.

Policy Goals: To prevent social pressure on women to have ‘proper’ children only, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 20 Monika Frommel, expert participant in the BMG Symposium,

Micro Frame: Autonomy frame.

Issue Definition: Inconsistency between embryo protection law and the right to abortion.

Policy Goals: To preserve the right to abortion, to include the right to PGD in women’s reproductive rights, to deregulate the EschG.

WMA 21 Dagmar Coester-Waltjen, expert participant in the BMG Symposium.

Micro-frame: Autonomy frame.

Issue Definition: Non-patriarchal forms of families, reproductive rights.

Policy Goals: To preserve the right to abortion, to include the right to PGD in women's reproductive rights, to deregulate the EschG.

**WMA 22 Monika Zumstein, expert participant in the BMG Symposium,
Micro-frame: Autonomy frame.**

Issue Definition: Non-patriarchal forms of families, reproductive rights.

Policy Goals: To preserve the right to abortion, to include the right to PGD in women's reproductive rights, to deregulate the EschG.

WMA 23 Christine Nüsslein-Volhard, member of the National Ethics Council:

Micro Frame: Autonomy frame.

Issue Definition: That interaction between the mother's body and the embryo was decisive for embryonic development.

Policy Goals: To foster embryo research in Germany, to deregulate the ESchG.

WMA 24 Maria Böhmer (CDU), MP, chair of the Christian Democrats Women's Union:

Micro Frame: Embryo protection frame

Issue Definition: Indirect discrimination of people with disabilities and their mothers, embryo protection.

Policy Goals: To prevent indirect discrimination of people with disabilities and their mothers, embryo protection, to preserve the ESchG.

WMA 25 Reprokult,

Micro Frame: Instrumentalization argument, social pressure argument, social solutions argument (all belonging to the good society frame).

Issue Definition: Social implications of genetic and reproductive technologies for women.

Policy Goals : Reprokult sought to reintroduce gender and women's concerns into the debate, as before their intervention, it had narrowed to focus on the humanity of the fetus. Reprokult argued against reproductive and genetic technologies because it could lead to the instrumentalization of women as egg donors or producers of embryos, and would likely apply undue social pressure to women for having healthy babies.

WMA 26 German Catholic Women's Association

Micro Frame: Embryo protection frame

Issue Definition: Embryo protection

Policy Goals :

The GCWA was opposed to genetic and reproductive technologies, although they did not advance gendered reasons for this. To preserve the ESchG.

WMA 27 German Association of Women Doctors

Micro Frame during the debate: Women's health argument, alienation argument, (good society frame).

Issue Definition: The Association pointed at the dangers PGD poses for woman's health. Furthermore, they warned that both the child and the pregnant woman might be objectified through the technicalisation of procreativity.

Policy Goals: To stop the growing technicalisation of procreativity and to make reproductive medicine more responsive to women's personal and emotional needs. To preserve the ESchG.

WMA 28 Working Group of Social Democratic Women

Micro-frame during the debate: **Social solutions argument, good society frame**

Issue Definition: The Working Group argued that PGD would not solve problems for women, such as double work load, but would instead intensify problems for people with disabilities.

Policy Goals : To improve women's position in the workplace, to reduce the double workload (family and job) for women, to support women who have children with disabilities.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: Women postpone the birth of children with the effect that new reproductive technologies become necessary. However, PGD is a means of more reproductive autonomy.

—**Egg donation, embryo donation, and its implications for women**

—**Medicalization of Pregnancy, relations of inequality between men and women**

—**Non-patriarchal forms of families, reproductive rights**

Policy Goals: To preserve the right to abortion, to include the right to PGD in women's reproductive rights, to deregulate the ESchG

—**to find social solutions for involuntary childlessness which would not require reprogenetics, to preserve the ESchG**

— **to prevent women from being seen as resources of research material such as eggs and embryos, to preserve the ESchG**

- to preserve the right to abortion, to enlarge women's reproductive autonomy. to deregulate the ESchG.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The decision affirmed the possibility of importing embryonic stem cells under certain restricted conditions, among them the provision that imported stem cells must have been produced prior to a certain deadline, so as to prevent the further production of embryonic stem cells and thus destruction of additional human embryos.'**
- 2. The Embryo Protection Act was not overturned, and the Stem Cell Act essentially supported it.**
- 3. The final outcome did not contain any explicitly gendered solutions or provisions.**
- 4. In upholding the Embryo Protection Act, Pre- Genetic Diagnosis (PGD) remained illegal.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Pia Maier

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament.**

WMA 2 Andrea Fischer

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities during the debate: **Initiating the Berlin Symposium and thereby opening the arena for feminists actors and gendered arguments, challenged the 'inconstant valuation argument' and thereby defended the right to abortion, co-authored the Stem Cell Act.**

WMA 3 Petra Bläss

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament.**

WMA 4 Herta Däubler-Gmelin

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (Government, media)**

Activities during the debate: **Challenged the 'inconstant valuation argument' and thereby defended the right to abortion.**

WMA 6 Christa Riemann-Hanewinkel

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament and in the Parliamentary Study Commission.**

WMA 7 Helga Kühn-Mengl

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament, chair of the Parliamentary Commission for Women's and Family Affairs, which performed a hearing on PGD to which a number of WMA's were invited as experts.**

WMA 8 Hanna Wolf

Form : **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament and the Parliamentary Study Commission.**

WMA 10 Rita GriebhaberForm : **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in Parliament.****WMA 11 Carola Reimann**Form : **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities during the debate: **Promoting the deregulation of the ESchG.****WMA 12 Regine Kollek**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Writing an opinion on PGD for the Hamburg City Council, gendering the debate in the National Council of Ethics.****WMA 13 Sigrid Graumann**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the Berlin Symposium and the Parliamentary Study Commission.****WMA 14 Ingrid Schneider**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the Berlin Symposium and the Parliamentary Study Commission.****WMA 16 Ulrike Hauffe**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.****WMA 17 Monika Fränznick**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.****WMA 18 Giselind Berg**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.****WMA 19 Magdalena Weiss**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.**

WMA 20 **Monika Frommel**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.**

WMA 21 **Dagmar Coester-Waltjen**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.**

WMA 22 **Monika Zumstein**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**

Activities during the debate: **Gendering the debate in the BMG Symposium.**

WMA 23 **Christine Nüsslein-Volhard**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization at commission**

Activities during the debate: **To promote embryo research in Germany, to criticize the inconsistency between abortion law and embryo protection law at National Council on Ethics and to the media.**

WMA 24 **Maria Böhmer**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities during the debate: **Co-authored the Stem Cell Act, challenged the 'inconsistent valuation argument'.**

WMA 25 **Reprokult**

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **Reprokult opposed genetic and reproductive technologies. Was founded by many of the feminist experts participating in the Berlin Symposium, served as a means for feminist experts on issues of reproductives to coach each other. Participated in the debate by making their opinions public and organizing a conference on reproductive medicine and genetics.**

WMA 26 **German Catholic Women's Association**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **GCWA participated in the debate by creating a petition to protect the existing embryo protection act.**

WMA 27 German Association of Women DoctorsForm: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**

Activities during the debate: **The German Association of Women Doctors participated in the debate by making their opinions public and publishing an opinion.**

WMA 28 Working Group of Social Democratic WomenForm: **Formal organization**Location: **In non women's movement organization**

Activities during the debate: **The Working Group participated in the debate by making their opinions public.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Disagreement as to whether or not the ESchG allows PGD led to suggestions to produce a new act on reproductive medicine in order to legalize PGD. In March 2000, a new powerful actor entered the scene: the German Chamber of Doctors (*Bundesärztekammer*, BÄK). The BÄK published a paper recommending PGD under specific conditions: application should be restricted to so-called high-risk couples; the couple should undergo counseling; and the case should be presented to an ethics committee run by the Chamber of Doctors. Opponents argued that PGD would reinforce a climate of hostility and discrimination towards people with disabilities. Legalizing it would signal that people like them were not welcome in society. To them, PGD was just a kind of 'private eugenics'. As was the case with prenatal diagnosis, opponents argued that PGD could not be limited to a small number of people. It would soon turn into a widespread screening procedure, putting social pressure, especially on women, to only give birth to genetically 'proper' children. In addition, PGD would undermine moral sentiments towards the embryo, which in turn would open the door to further ethically problematic practices such as germ line intervention.

In sum, the issue of deregulating the ESchG was put on the agenda by experts and professionals, mainly from the medical profession. The dominant actors were individual medical practitioners, organizations of the medical profession, experts and expert committees.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

From its beginning, the debate was characterized by a 'two camps' – constellation. Political parties, the administration, the Parliament, and the public were divided into a pro-biomedical alliance and an anti-biomedical alliance.

At the first stage of the debate, the dominant issue frame was that of risks-and-benefits. Both the Caesar Commission and the BÄK argued that PGD would generate enormous benefits: it would offer high risk couples the chance to have healthy children of their own and it would, as we saw above, lead to fewer abortions. On the other hand, there was the risk that PGD might be misused for eugenic

purposes. The commissions compared the risk of couples having children with a genetic disorder or disease with the risk of society encouraging a new form of eugenics. The latter risk, in their view, was extremely low. The benefits were thus thought to outweigh the risks.

The risks and benefits frame remained one of the most influential, though not the dominant issue frame.

When the debate became more public it was framed less in terms of risks and benefits and more in terms of autonomy on the one hand and non-discrimination, solidarity and absence of social pressure on the other. I call this new dominant issue frame the autonomy-vs.-the-good-society-frame.

The ‘defective’ embryo/fetus was constructed as threatening the woman’s health. Women were constructed as patients, or, more precisely, as subjects of medical protection.

In the long run, some feared, women would be held responsible for giving birth to a disabled child if they refused selective technologies such as PGD and prenatal diagnosis.

3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Defective embryo/fetus was constructed as threatening the woman’s health.

Women were constructed as patients, or, more precisely, as subjects of medical protection.

Women would be held responsible for giving birth to a disabled child if they refused selective technologies such as PGD and prenatal diagnosis.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

When it came to decision-making on the question of importing material for embryonic stem cell research, another major parliamentary debate took place on the 30th January 2002. Parliament was to decide on three inter-factional motions. One of them referred to the ‘women’s health argument’, in that ‘harvesting’ eggs would imply serious health risks for the woman, and the ‘instrumentalization argument’. The others did not address gender issues. In the plenary debate, the ideas and aspirations of the women’s movement were rarer than in the May 2001 parliamentary debate. It was mainly two women MPs from the Socialist Party who addressed gender issues. From the camp of supporters, Pia Maier again stressed the inconsistency between embryo protection and abortion law. Furthermore, she strongly rejected the ‘instrumentalization argument’, insisting that, as long as the woman gave her free and informed consent, one could not speak of instrumentalization. Putting the feminist version of the ‘autonomy frame’ in a nutshell she called for a broad interpretation of women’s reproductive autonomy. Her party colleague, Petra Bläss, countered that women would be turned into resources if embryonic stem cell research would be legalized. Apart from these two

speeches, little reference was made to gender. However, for the first and only time in both debates, men's issues were addressed when MP Monika Griefahn (SPD) maintained that the need for assisted reproduction was to a large extent caused by male infertility, which was in turn due to environmental poisoning. She argued that instead of funding reproductive medicine, politics should aim at a more healthy environment, she presented a men's version of the 'social solutions argument'.

Gendered arguments throughout the debate only rarely addressed the societal balance of power between men and women in general, but instead focused on improving women's position on the issue of genetics and in the area of reproductive medicine.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Minor attention to women as resources for eggs and concerns about women's reproductive autonomy; instrumentalization focused on women's free consent to these procedures as opposing instrumentalization effects.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth (MSFASCWY)

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 MSFASCWY

It was responsible for gender mainstreaming in the government. on many women's issues which indicates a systematic approach across issues relevant to gender equality.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 MFASCWY

One of the Ministries of the Government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Christine Bergmann**

Years in WPA: **1998-2002**

WMA activities: **She was a feminist.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement in the 1990s is best characterized as fragmented and in decline. A lack of public support contributed to its poor bargaining position vis a vis policy makers.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (post-unification)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service)**
- **Unemployment/retraining/effects of unification on eastern women was a focus of some eastern German women’s movement activism.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Countermovement was weak on the issue. There were two pro lifers in Parliament who sought to preserve embryo protection *and* to restrict the right to abortion, but they had no influence on the debate.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in sub-system

- **Green Party**
- **Social Democratic Party**
- **Christian Democrats**
- **Liberals**
- **Socialist Party**
- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Health**
- **Ministry of Justice**
- **Ministry of Research**
- **The President of State**
- **The Chancellor**
- **The National Council on Ethics**
- **The German Research Association**
- **The German Chamber of Doctors**
- **A number of individual scientists and gynecologists**
- **The Ethics Commission of the State Rhineland-Palatinate**
- **The Media and the Public**
- **A broad array of professionals and experts**
- **The Churches**
- **Disability rights groups**
- **Women’s groups and networks**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats and Greens

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: GER_PR1 1977-1988

Title: Quota Rules in the Social Democratic Party

QUAWPA: Working Group of Social Democratic Women (WGSDW)

Dates of Coding: 12/31/03, 3/04/04, 12/12/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Members of SDP Party Women’s Section and Regional Delegates

Micro Frame during the debate: **Quota proponents stressed that women live in different realms than men and that it is mostly women who have to combine family work and employment. They argued, in turn, that women – more often than their male colleagues – put topics related to the lives of women on the political agenda, thus leading to more equal policy outcomes. Proponents argued that women should have the same possibilities and political chances as men, because they had been discriminated for so long.**

Issue Definition

Policy Goals : **Focused on quota rules as a means of supporting women in the party and in politics (‘equality’).**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Support women in the party and politics; women should have the same possibilities and political chances as men.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **These quota rules applied to all positions and mandates elected from lists.**
2. **By 1993, forty percent of all internal SPD positions were to be held by women. By 1998, the same percentage of public SPD mandates were to be held by women.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Members of SDP Party Women’s Section and Regional Delegates**

Form : **Formal**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization (in SPD)**

Activities during the debate: **Expressed a position on quotas but not involved with the decision making on the quota rules or a part of party leadership.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The support of women, equality between the sexes, and women’s representation has always been a part of the SPD’s program, but the reality looked somewhat different. For example, women comprised only 5.4% of the SPD parliamentary caucus (Fraktion) in the Bundestag in 1972. Women within the SPD, especially the party’s women’s commission, the Arbeitsgemeinschaft Sozialdemokratischer Frauen (ASF), had demanded a better representation of women for decades. Yet the majority of the ASF rejected quota rules until the mid-1980s and favoured other ways of

increasing women's representation. Even at an ASF federal conference (Bundeskonzferenz) in 1977 most members endorsed the view that quota rules were not necessary, because 'good politicians,' either men or women, would make their way up through the party machinery by performing well. The conference did, however, issue a statement with several, non-binding demands and proposed correctives concerning the equality of the sexes. As it turned out these efforts to increase women's representation were hardly successful. The ASF eventually endorsed a quota rule in 1985 and pressed the topic on the SPD agenda. Other political realities also affected the agenda setting: The SPD had been losing votes throughout the 1980s. The trend was particularly evident in Bundestag elections, where the party lost large numbers of seats in both 1983 and 1987. In contrast, the Green Party, having successfully implemented a quota rule, continued to gain votes in this period.

C3A_1—Issue frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame used by actors on all sides concerned equality and quality of representation. The equality frame concerned the need to include more women in the Social Democratic party lists in order to promote it. The other concern focused on quality of representatives. Opponents worried that quotas would reduce quality. Inequalities in the representation of men and women. Some defined it as 'no problem', because even in a democracy not all groups must be represented in the political arena. Some considered the inequality as a crucial problem, because in a democracy no group should be excluded. Those who perceived a problem discussed various solutions (quota rules, support for women, special seminars for women and so on).

Women as equal to men, therefore they have the same as men to be represented.
Women as different from men, therefore it is important that female interests and perspectives are included in the political arena.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Women as equal to men, therefore they have the same as men to be represented.

Women as different from men, therefore it is important that female interests and perspectives are included in the political arena.

C3A_3—Issue frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of equality and quality. Additionally, the quality and equality terms gained a gendered component. First, actors discussed whether having more women in office would make a difference to politics ('quality'). One argument was premised on an assumption that women and men have different interests, attitudes, and experience. Quota proponents stressed that women live in different realms than men and that it is mostly women who have to combine family work and employment. They argued, in turn, that women – more often than their male colleagues – put topics related to the lives of women on the political agenda, thus leading to more equal policy outcomes.

Second, the debate increasingly focused on quota rules as a means of supporting women in the party and in politics ('equality'). Proponents argued that women should have the same possibilities and political chances as men, because they had been discriminated for so long.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women should have equal representation with men.

Women should be in politics because they are different from men and will put women's perspective on the agenda.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
QUAWPA 1. **Working Group of Social Democratic Women (WGSDW)**

Quota proponents stressed that women live in different realms than men and that it is mostly women who have to combine family work and employment. They argued, in turn, that women – more often than their male colleagues – put topics related to the lives of women on the political agenda, thus leading to more equal policy outcomes. Second, the debate increasingly focused on quota rules as a means of supporting women in the party and in politics ('equality'). Proponents argued that women should have the same possibilities and political chances as men, because they had been discriminated for so long.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Support women in the party and politics; women should have the same possibilities and political chances as men.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Policy Issues:
QUAWPA 1. **Working Group of Social Democratic Women (WGSDW)**
Multi issue focus on women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
QUAWPA 1. **Working Group of Social Democratic Women (WGSDW)**
Participated in decision-making of the party - in party leadership.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
QUAWPA 1. **Working Group of Social Democratic Women (WGSDW)**
Name: **Inge Wettig-Danielmeier**
Years in ASF: **1981-1992**
WMA Activities: **No**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Growth**
Evidence and source: **During the debate period, the women's movement was in a stage of growth, but was fragmented as described above.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Building autonomous women’s culture/institutions(local projects)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service & electoral lists) starting in the early 1980s Women & Peace (especially in the east, but also in the west)**
- **Anti-pornography campaign (initiated by *Emma*)**
- **Debates about anti-discrimination legislation**
- **Push for reforms of existing institutions to change rules to better suit women’s presence, their values, their interests.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Social Democratic Party: Party Conference, Executive Leadership and WGSDW.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats and Free Democrats

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: GER_PR2 1989-94

Title: Second Federal Equal Rights Law

WPA: Ministry for Women and Youth (MWY)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **CDU Women Parliamentary Caucus**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining career and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a reality.**

Policy goals: **Advocated a compensation clause, constitutional changes and the Equality law.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Section CDU**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining career and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a reality.**

Policy goals: **Advocated a compensation clause, constitutional changes and the Equality law.**

WMA 3

Name: **The Coalition (intra party)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining career and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a reality; The more feminist actors, including party women and women's groups, women's movement groups, and the trade unions, further looked at the underlying causes of systemic discrimination (e.g., traditional gender roles, the division of household labor).**

Policy goals: **The Coalition supported expanding the constitution to include an equality clause and also supported quotas to compensate for past discrimination against women.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining career and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a**

reality; The more feminist actors, including party women and women's groups, women's movement groups, and the trade unions, further looked at the underlying causes of systemic discrimination (e.g., traditional gender roles, the division of household labor).

Policy goals: **The Coalition supported expanding the constitution to include an equality clause and also supported quotas to compensate for past discrimination against women.**

C1A_5— Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The modification of the Basic Law declared that women and men deserve equality of rights and that the state is committed to promoting equal rights and working towards removing disadvantages.**

1994 Equal Rights Law, Article 11:

2. **Dealt with representatives on governing bodies in Germany that play a role in federal decision-making.**
3. **Article 11 requires organizations nominating candidates for positions on such bodies to name a qualified man and qualified woman for each position until parity is reached.**
4. **If a qualified representative of each sex is not named, the rationale must be justified in writing.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 CDU Women Parliamentary Caucus

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in debate; sought to influence members of parliament; within CDU/CSU party meetings; some public discussion in the media.**

WMA 2 Women's Section CDU

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in debate; sought to influence members of parliament; within CDU/CSU party meetings; some public discussion in the media.**

WMA 3 The Coalition

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Various women's movement groups and actors formed the Coalition in order to support women's movement interests in the debate. The Coalition participated in the debate by using the media.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

This policy debate has its origins in several places. The collapse of communism in the German Democratic Republic (GDR, East Germany) and German unification raised the issue of constitutional reform, because the Basic Law provided for its own revision in the event of unification. The unification treaty focused attention on

gender and women by stipulating the need for additional measures to ensure gender equality the new Germany. In May 1990, the *Bundestag* requested a study of the status of women on public governing bodies that played a role in federal decision-making (i.e., governmental and quasi-governmental commissions or advisory boards). The resulting 1991 report revealed that women held only 7.2% of positions on such bodies. Finally, unification itself raised questions about women's status in Germany. Compared to women in the FRG, women in the GDR were employed at much higher rates, had more formal legal rights vis a vis men, enjoyed more state affirmative action programs in education and the workplace, and received many social welfare benefits designed to help them combine employment and family duties. Unification threatened to remove many of these rights and benefits, including the right to legal abortion. All of these issues helped place gender equality on the political agenda in the early 1990s.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Definition of problem on which all parties agreed: women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining employment and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a reality.

Disagreement about who was to blame: Most parties did not assign blame explicitly. Advocates of a larger state role implied that the state had not done enough to make equal rights a reality. Opponents of an expanded state role implied, vaguely, that individuals were responsible for discriminating or making personal choices that led to their advantaged or disadvantaged status.

Disagreements about proposed solutions centered on 2 issues:

1) potential statement of state's commitment to effect equal rights in the constitution: Supporters argued that only inclusion in the constitution would indicate the seriousness of gender equality, demonstrate the state's responsibility for it, and protect the commitment from reversal by future governments. One set of opponents believed that proclamations about state policy goals did not belong in the constitution. They advocated writing and enforcing gender-neutral laws to effect equality and discourage discrimination. Another set simply argued that a constitutional statement was unnecessary given existing equality laws.

2) compensation clause: Compensation clause supporters wanted constitutional protection for compensatory gender preference laws (ranged from vague affirmative action goals to the inclusion of gender preferences in hiring and appointments) so they could not be construed as discrimination against men and thus violations of the Basic Law's prohibition against sex-based discrimination (Section 3, Article 3). Opponents of a compensation clause characterized all compensation measures as 'quotas' and rejected them as a form of sex discrimination against men.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women held few positions in the public sector and fewer positions of authority in the public and private sectors, they lacked support for combining employment and family, and the constitutional promise of equality of rights was not a reality.

Compensation clause supporters wanted constitutional protection for compensatory gender preference laws.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Most debate participants, even those from conservative parties, discussed women's traditional roles in family life, especially time taken off from employment to raise children, as a source of women's disadvantaged position in society. The more feminist actors, including party women and women's groups, women's movement groups, and the trade unions, further looked at the underlying causes of systemic discrimination (e.g., traditional gender roles, the division of household labor). (see solutions in A1 above) Supporters of gender preferences and/or a compensation clause gendered the debate as being exclusively about women's disadvantages and discrimination against them. Opponents of 'quotas' and a compensation clause gendered the debate in a different way: they argued that such measures were gender discrimination against men.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **women's traditional family roles a source of women's disadvantaged position**
- **look at underlying causes of systemic discrimination, traditional gender roles, division of household labor**
- **compensation clauses for previous discrimination**
- **quotas discriminate against men.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs by Acronym (include QUAPAW's)

Ministry for Women and Youth: Merkel repeatedly emphasized discrimination against women and women's underrepresentation in decision-making positions; criticized the state for failing to realize the constitutional promise of gender equality; advocated measures to help women and men combine careers and family; and argued for more state recognition of women's economic contributions through household labor.

Merkel advocated an expansion of the constitutional equality clause. She initially advocated a compensation clause, but backed away when that proposal threatened to stop all CDU/CSU discussion of equality law reforms.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Merkel repeatedly emphasized discrimination against women and women's underrepresentation in decision-making positions; criticized the state for failing to realize the constitutional promise of gender equality; advocated measures to help women and men combine careers and family.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Cross-sectional, dealing with women's affairs broadly conceived

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
The minister is a member of the Chancellor's cabinet. Ministries are frequently given the tasks of providing expertise when the government is considering policy and drafting the initial legislation (which can be revised by politicians).

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name: **Angela Merkel**
 Years in WPA: **1991-94**
 WMA activity: **No**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
 Stage: **Decline**
 Evidence and source: **The women's movement in the 1990s is best characterized as fragmented and in decline. A lack of public support contributed to its poor bargaining position vis a vis policy makers.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (post-unification)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service)**
- **Unemployment/retraining/effects of unification on eastern women was a focus of some eastern German women's movement activism**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Moderate countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The German Parliament**
- **Government Ministries**
- **Joint Parliamentary Committee on Constitutional Reform**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
The government was controlled by a CDU/CSU (Christian Democrats) coalition with the FDP as a junior partner. The SDP controlled the Bundesrat.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: GER_PR3 1998-99

Title: Reform of the German Nationality Law

WPA: Ministry for Women and Yourth (MWY)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **German Women's Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Immigration is women's issue. demanded better protection of female refugees, criticizing that persecution of women is often made light of or considered 'non-political'. The organizations charge that specifically female grounds for fleeing are rarely taken into account in asylum proceedings. With the motto 'Protect Persecuted Women' the groups intend to launch a campaign to garner support for their demands.**

Policy goals: **Supportive of easing the naturalization process, but were critical of the government's draft law for not going far enough and for not explicitly including women and their gender-specific issues in the new law.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The new legislation gives children born to non-Germans in the FRG dual citizenship until age 23, at which point they must choose one or the other citizenship.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **German Women's Council**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public in a periodical that they publish.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Several developments in the 1990s placed immigration and citizenship law on the German political agenda. First, German unification made FRG citizens of more than 17 million East Germans. Second, more than 2 million ethnic German migrated into Germany as communism collapsed throughout the continent. The automatic citizenship afforded to both of these groups increased dissatisfaction among the guestworker population and their German-born children who were denied citizenship rights — and, in turn, political representation — unless they

undertook a long, onerous, expensive naturalization process and renounced citizenship in any foreign state. Third, Germany's once-liberal asylum laws attracted 1.6 million asylum seekers from 1987-1994. These migrants, many fleeing war in the former Yugoslavia, became scapegoats for the post-unification economic hardships and unemployment. Fourth, in the late 1980s a few *Länder* and municipalities had passed legislation enfranchising permanent foreign residents in local elections. The Federal Constitutional Court's 1990 decision to overturn these laws made it clear that non-citizens did not enjoy equal political representation rights with citizens.

In the early 1990s, the CDU-led government responded to pressures with two stop-gap measures: minor liberalization of the naturalization laws and severe curtailment of the asylum policy. The 1998 federal election campaign returned the issue of reforming German citizenship laws to the political agenda. The FDP supported conditional naturalization for children born in Germany, but received no support from its senior coalition partner. The SPD and Alliance90/Greens included reform of nationality laws and an expansion of foreigners' citizenship rights in their campaign platforms. For candidate Schröder, this was an effort to make political representation in Germany more inclusive and to enlist future electoral support from foreign voters his party helped enfranchise.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered. The debate began with several overlapping meta-frames with all parties discussing questions about German national identity, who is a German, whether the country is an 'immigrant nation,' and the post-war context of the *jus sanguinis* citizenship law. Parties vied to shape the dominant frame, with the SPD focusing on the widening gap between permanent residents and citizens and CDU focusing on the question of dual citizenship. The CDU won the contest and framing increasingly focused on dual citizenship rather than more fundamental questions about German immigration and membership in the state.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In the end, the debate was framed in terms of citizenship and need to offer dual citizenship to children of German immigrants. Through the end, the debate focused on immigration issues and was not gendered overall.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. The Ministry for Family, Women and Youth: None

C5A_3—WPA feminist Micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Cross sectional policy mandate that allowed them to deal with all policies that affected women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Minister is a member of the Chancellor's cabinet (executive) and the ministry is free-standing within the government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Claudia Nolte 1994-98; Christine Bergmann 1998-02**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Nolte, none; Bergmann, yes**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement in the 1990s is best characterized as fragmented and in decline. A lack of public support contributed to its poor bargaining position vis a vis policy makers.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion (post-unification)**
- **Quotas/Affirmative Action (especially in civil service)**
- **Unemployment/retraining/effects of unification on eastern women was a focus of some eastern German women's movement activism**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The German Parliament**
- **Political parties**
- **Some immigrants rights NGOs were also active in this debate, but NOT women's NGOs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

In the beginning, the CDU controlled the executive and the lower house of Parliament. As the issue was debated, the SDP took over and it controlled both houses of Parliament.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**

- Socialist International Women’s Section
- European Women’s Lobby

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations c**

Article 9

- 1. States Parties shall grant women equal rights with men to acquire, change or retain their nationality. They shall ensure in particular that neither marriage to an alien nor change of nationality by the husband during marriage shall automatically change the nationality of the wife, render her stateless or force upon her the nationality of the husband.**
- 2. States Parties shall grant women equal rights with men with respect to the nationality of their children.**

Debate ID: GBR_AB1 1970-75

Title: Lane Commission

WPA: Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 4/11/03, 3/1/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Renee Short, MP**

Member of Parliament for Labour party; participated in floor debate on White bill

Issue Definition: **Said women in Labour and trade union movement welcomed the Lane report's proposals.**

Policy Goals: **Labour women defended the 1967 Act and opposed the White bill because it gave working class women access to abortion services previously available only to the wealthy.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Abortion and Contraceptive Campaign (WACC)**

Issue definition: **Basic tenet: women have the right to control their bodies and their fertility; abortion is positive, vital service for women Supported free contraception and a woman's right to choose abortion; opposed pressure on women to be sterilized against their will.**

Policy goals:

- 1. opposed all efforts to restrict 1967 Abortion Act**
- 2. proposed to revise statute to take control of abortion decision and give to women;**
- 3. proposed to increase services through National Health Service; expand contraceptive services.**

WMA 3.

Name: **Abortion Law Reform Association**

Issue definition: **Primary concern has always been and still is the welfare of women and the stability of the existing family when threatened by an unwanted pregnancy. The Abortion Act contributes to maternal health.**

Policy Goals: **Opposed any restrictions on the Abortion Act of 1967.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Abortion Law of 1967 remained unchanged as recommended by the Lane Committee. The Lane Committee report stated that every woman requesting abortion should have her wishes carefully considered.**

Exceptions to the criminalization of abortion practice were:

- 1. Two medical practitioners agree that:

 - a. pregnancy involved risk to life of pregnant woman or**
 - b. injury to physical or mental health or**
 - c. injury to physical or mental health of any children in her family or****

- d. if there was substantial risk that the child would be seriously mentally or physically handicapped
2. **Statistical argument: doctor could justify abortion if it were more harmful to continue the pregnancy than to terminate it.**
3. **In determining risk, doctor could take into account the ‘pregnant woman’s actual or reasonably foreseeable environment.**
4. **Doctor could refuse to perform abortions but had burden to prove that this was a conscientious objection.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Renee Short**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Member of Parliament; inside non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in floor debate on the White bill.**

WMA 2 **Women’s Abortion and Contraceptive Campaign (WACC)**

Form: **Informal organization: network of local and small groups**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized mass lobby in parliament in 1973; presented oral and written testimony to the Lane Committee.**

WMA 3 **Abortion Law Reform Association**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented testimony to the Lane committee; its leaders spoke out against any changes in the 1967 act.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

No sooner was the Abortion Act in place than the anti- abortion groups, especially the Society for the Protection of Unborn Children (SPUC), rallied to limit abortion. Newspaper reports describing thousands of foreign women, mostly from Scandinavia, who were trafficked to London for quick abortions began to appear. There were claims of taxi drivers in the employ of private abortion clinics roaming the airports to pick up clients. Opportunities to question government ministries about alleged abuses conducted under the Act gave more publicly, and 250 MPs signed a petition for a government inquiry into the charges. In 1971 Sir Keith Joseph, the Ministry of Health and Social Security, appointed a committee chaired by the only female member of the High Court: Mrs. Justice Lane. Dissatisfied with the Lane Committee report, James White introduced his own bill to restrict abortion in 1975.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Dominant frame centered on the Abortion Act of 1967 which legalized abortion in Britain. Anti-abortionists argued that the act was too liberal and allowed too many abortions, and abortion on demand.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate;
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

By the end of the debate, the dominant frame for abortion was in contention. Was it a policy problem to choose between those who claimed the abortion act was too liberal and those who claimed it answered the social needs of women. On the other hand, there was the Lane Committee, who sought to focus the debate on the ‘relief of the suffering of individuals, as opposed to the sanctity of life’.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Women not central to the debate; Some ideas:

Women are carelessly pregnant or victims abused by doctors say opponents;

Women with problems are the main people who needed help.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WNC in full support of the Abortion Act of 1967: ultimate abortion decision should remain a medical one, at the same time the view of women should be given serious consideration.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames:

WNC micro frame was expressed identity with women, was explicitly gendered, and represented women. Goals were not expressed to advance the status of women thus were not feminist.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Established as a conduit for relaying women’s opinion on public issues to the top executive levels of government. The WNC focused on all issues of interest to women. Not the status of women perse. At their founding they said that there was no need to work any more on the status of women but other issues as well.

Executive committees established ad hoc committees rather than standing committees to work on specific policy questions. Therefore policy orientation shifted from meeting to meeting. Two of the 3 branches of British women’s movement represented: equal rights organizations and traditional women’s organizations. Not the women’s liberation informal groups primarily due to ‘national scope’ requirement. (Open to maximum 50 organizations, national scope, with educational missions.)

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Created to provide upper levels of government—PM and Cabinet; Law Commission with information on women’s opinions on policy issues that affected them. Could advise top ministries and members of parliament.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Dr. Edith Young**

Years in WPA: **2 years**

WMA activity: **Active in British Federation of University Women, a traditional equal rights women's organization.**

Note: promoting equal rights with men is a feminist discourse.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **In the early 1970s, the traditional women's movement organizations were in a steady state, while both women's liberation and trade union women's activism were growing following their emergence in the late 1960s**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Child Care**
- **Abortion on demand**
- **Equal Pay**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals: **St John Stevas MP: worked to get anti-abortion private member bills introduced.**

Susan Kentish and Michael Litchfield, journalists, who wrote *Babies for Burning* which used fake information to link abortion to Naziism, murder, and fraud.

Informal Organizations:

Formal Organizations: **Society for the Protection of Unborn Children (SPUC).**

Catholic Church (driving force behind SPUC).

Church of England.

MicroFrames: **Strong opposition to Abortion Act of 1967.**

SPUC had many parliamentary contacts and could find MPs to introduce its bills; sponsored *Babies for Burning*.

Wanted to ban all abortions except to save the life of woman.

Opposition to legal abortion and to abortion based on moral dimension; concern that society become 'abortion minded'.

Wynn Report: abortion has long term bad effects on women.

The Catholic Church came out against abortion and in favor of making the law more restrictive.

The Church of England was concerned about the number of abortions taking place since the legalization in 1967.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Minister of Health**
- **Members of Parliament**
- **Lane Committee members**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Conservative party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not Applicable

Debate ID: GBR_AB2 1975-1979

Title: Corrie Bill

WPA: Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 3/02/03, 3/01/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1.

Name: **Jo Richardson (Labour MP).**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Safe contraception for women; Abortion is a matter for women to decide for themselves, in consultation with families and doctors.**

Goals: **Opposed to Corrie Bill/restrictions on 1967 Abortion Act.**

WMA 2

Name: **Renee Short (Labour MP).**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Women have terrible time getting an abortion through NHS; Chauvinist doctors keep women from having safe abortions in public sector. Restrictions affect working class women more than wealthy women who can afford abortions abroad.**

Policy Goals: **Opposed the Corrie Bill/ restrictions on 1967 Act.**

WMA 3

Name: **Maureen Coquhoun (Labour MP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Only women have the right to decide what is to happen to their bodies and have the right to control them and their lives. SPUC and other anti-abortion organizations are anti woman, using terrifying propaganda.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Corrie Bill and more generally constant attempts to change the 1967 legislation.**

WMA 4.

Name: **The National Abortion Campaign (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Free abortion on demand: A woman's right to choose. The NAC argued that abortion was a women's rights issue and argued that the law should not be reformed or made more restrictive. Women need to seize control over reproduction.**

Policy goals: **To build a mass campaign to defeat all restrictive legislation.**

WMA 5.

Name: **Labour Abortion Rights Campaign (LARC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Labour Abortion Rights Campaign helped to gender the issue and argue that the Corrie bill was an attempt by men to prevent women from exercising their right to an abortion. Supported abortion on request.**

Policy goals: **Against the Corrie Bill.**

WMA 6.

Name: **The Coordinating committee in Defence of the 1967 Act (Co-Ord)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Supported pro choice for women; no restriction on abortion Act; equitable Provision of services in the country.**

Policy goals: **Against the Corrie bill.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Name: **Jo Richardson (Labour MP).**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Safe contraception for women; Abortion is a matter for women to decide for themselves, in consultation with families and doctors.**

Goals: **Opposed to Corrie Bill/restrictions on 1967 Abortion Act.**

Name: **Renee Short (Labour MP).**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Women have terrible time getting an abortion through NHS; Chauvinist doctors keep women from having safe abortions in public sector.**

Restrictions affect working class women more than wealthy women who can afford abortions abroad.

Policy Goals: **Opposed the Corrie Bill/ restrictions on 1967 Act.**

WMA 3

Name: **Maureen Coquhoun (Labour MP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Only women have the right to decide what is to happen to their bodies and have the right to control them and their lives. SPUC and other anti-abortion organizations are anti woman, using terrifying propaganda.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Corrie Bill and more generally constant attempts to change the 1967 legislation.**

WMA 4.

Name: **The National Abortion Campaign (NAC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Free abortion on demand: A woman's right to choose. The NAC argued that abortion was a women's rights issue and argued that the law should not be reformed or made more restrictive. Women need to seize control over reproduction.**

Policy goals: **To build a mass campaign to defeat all restrictive legislation.**

WMA 5.

Name: **Labour Abortion Rights Campaign (LARC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Labor Abortion Rights Campaign helped to gender the issue and argue that the Corrie bill was an attempt by men to prevent women from exercising their right to an abortion. Supported abortion on request.**

Policy goals: **Against the Corrie Bill.**

WMA 6.

Name: **The Coordinating committee in Defence of the 1967 Act (Co-Ord)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Supported pro choice for women; no restriction on abortion Act; equitable provision of services in the country.**

Policy goals: **Against the Corrie bill.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Corrie Bill rejected—discussion ran out of time**
2. **Original Abortion Act Remained intact**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Jo Richardson**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Member of Parliament; inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Promoted amendment to Corrie bill to allow abortion during first 6 weeks regardless of approval by doctor.**

WMA 2

Name: **Renee Short**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Member of Parliament; inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in House of Commons debate on Benyon and Corrie bills; argued that nearly all Labour women supported the 1967 Act.**

WMA 3

Name: **Maureen Coquhoun**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Member of Parliament; inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in House of Commons debate on Benyon bill.**

WMA 4

Name: **The National Abortion Campaign (NAC)**

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Holds annual conferences and 6 weekly planning sessions for all members; otherwise no rules, bylaws, etc.); Non hierarchical network of nearly 350 groups, including many trade unions in major towns and cities; organized the Campaign Against Corrie; During the debate the National Abortion Campaign, which represented 350 smaller women's movement groups, was very active in staging demonstrations and trying to garner public support against changing the abortion bill. Additionally, the NAC provided support for members of parliament who were in favor of abortion rights.**

WMA 5

Name: **Labour Abortion Rights Campaign (LARC) organized by women in the Labour party**

Location: **Informal organization in the Labour party.**

Activities During the Debate: **The Labour Abortion Rights Campaign included many female members of the Labour party and was very effective in influencing other members of parliament to come out against the Corrie bill.**

WMA 6

Name: **The Coordinating committee in Defence of the 1967 Act (Co-Ord), housed in the Birth Control Trust included parties, unions, abortion providers, social workers and lawyers.**

Location: **They were part of the abortion rights movement; not clear they are women's movement organizations.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate
Began with Select Committee deliberations in 1975.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

There were two equally dominant sides in framing this debate. One side, familiar from the first debate, was claiming that the policy problem was the Abortion Act itself and the abuses - ranging from administrative abuses to the immoral killing of unborn children - that were committed under it. At the same time, an equally dominant definition was to keep the abortion act intact - because it served women who must be able to decide to have abortions and have access to them. The side opposed to abortion sought to limit the Abortion Act with new legislation, while the side in favor of abortion sought to keep the Abortion Act unchanged.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **By the side against the Corrie, Bill, women are citizens with full rights to choose.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Both sides gendered the debate. The side opposed to abortion argued that abortion clinics exploited women and did little to help them, while the side in favor of abortion argued that it was a fundamental women's right. Abortion rights MPs

affiliated with the Labour party portrayed abortion as central to women's needs and wants, making it an indispensable part of the abortion rights discourse. The debate also remained gendered and tended to focus more on the idea that men were trying to change the abortion bill to try to control women and make them feel guilty for getting abortions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Pro life side: women are victims, exploited by abortion clinics**
- **Pro choice side: women are citizens with full rights to choose to have an abortion**
- **Men were trying to control women, make women feel guilty, by adopting restrictive abortion law.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

None

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA formal/informal Policy Orientation and Policy agenda

WPA 1 WNC

To ensure by all possible means that the informed opinion of women is given its due weight in the deliberations of government and on both national and international affairs. Sub committees took up rape, violence in marriage, age of consent, youth unemployment, family planning, sex discrimination and reports on the Equal Opportunity Commission are issues taken up in the 1976-9 period.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1-WNC: Advisory Council to the government; located in the Cabinet but not attached formally to a specific ministry.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1-WNC:

Name: **Ethel Chipcase (Co chair)**

Years in WPA: **10 years**

Activity in WMA: **Secretary of Women's Advisory Committee of the Trade Union Congress, and member of EOC**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **At this time, the women's movement was in a period of growth, expanding their agenda to include seeking financial and legal information and freedom from threat or use of violence.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Child Care**
- **Abortion on demand**
- **Equal Pay**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Members of parliament who introduced and spoke in favor of restrictive bills, e.g.

Leo Abse; Bernard Braine, James Corrie.

National Pro-life Committee—forum for exchange of information.

SPUC; LIFE—Organized networks of local activists; Association of Lawyers for the Defence of the Unborn.

Restrict abortion availability; offer services to pregnant women; repeal 1967

Abortion Act.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of Parliament**
- **Any interest groups that seek to lobby MPs or present a report**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Labour Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name:

None

C26A_3- CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under-Debate:

Not Applicable

Debate ID: GBR_AB3 1987-90

Title: Human Fertilization and Embryology Act

QUAWPA: Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)

WPA: Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 4/11/03, 3/1/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Teresa Gorman, Labour MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's right to decide her own future and her own fertility**

Policy goals: **Opposed Alton bill to restrict abortion; supported Abortion Act of 1967.**

WMA 2

Name: **Harriet Harman, Labour MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Mother's right to decide whether to continue a pregnancy; early abortion is better than late abortion; women did not use abortion as casual alternative to contraception.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Alton bill to restrict abortion; supported Abortion Act of 1967.**

WMA 3.

Name: **Feminists Against Alton Bill**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's choice**

Policy goals: **Reduce numbers of late abortions through sex education, contraception, counseling. Opposed Alton bill; protect the Abortion Act of 1967; do not ban late term abortions.**

WMA 4

Name: **Pro-Choice Alliance**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is woman's choice**

Policy goals: **abortion on request in first 3 months of pregnancy; allow one doctor to authorize abortion after first 3 months; against any reduction in time limits and against upper limit on embryo research.**

WMA 5

Name: **Co-ord**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Concern about implications of Embryology Act for women; concern about shift of rights discourse to fetus and the image of woman as a passive receptacle for new life.**

Policy goals: **Do not ban late term abortions.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Name: **Teresa Gorman, Labour MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women’s right to decide her own future and her own fertility.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Alton bill to restrict abortion; supported Abortion Act of 1967.**

WMA 3

Name: **Feminists Against Alton Bill**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women’s choice**

Policy goals: **Reduce numbers of late abortions through sex education, contraception, counseling. Opposed Alton bill; protect the Abortion Act of 1967; do not ban late term abortions.**

WMA 4

Name: **Pro-Choice Alliance**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is woman’s choice**

Policy goals: **Abortion on request in first 3 months of pregnancy; allow one doctor to authorize abortion after first 3 months; against any reduction in time limits and against upper limit on embryo research.**

WMA 5

Name: **Co-ord**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Concern about implications of Embryology Act for women; concern about shift of rights discourse to fetus and the image of woman as a passive receptacle for new life.**

Policy goals: **Do not ban late term abortions.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Establishes 24 weeks as upper limit: abortion cannot be performed on fetuses 24 weeks or more except**
 - a. **danger of grave or permanent injury to the physical or mental health of the pregnant woman or**
 - b. **Substantial risk that if the child were born it would suffer serious handicap**
2. **The original bill to limit proposed by Alton (an anti-abortion leader) ran out of time. However the issues in this debate were addressed in a section of the 1990 Human Fertilization and Embryology Act (HFEA). Also, the HFEA**

effectively separated the Abortion Act from the 1929 Infant Life Preservation Act.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Teresa Gorman

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the House of Commons debate.**

WMA 2 Harriet Harman

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the House of Commons debate.**

WMA 3 Feminists Against Alton Bill

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Within informal women's movement organization—the National Abortion Campaign**

Activities During the Debate: **Mobilized demonstrations; lobbied MPs, published and distributed information.**

WMA 4 Pro-Choice Alliance

Form: **Informal organization (all party group of MPs)**

Location: **Inside formal non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Worked to promote reform of abortion act to give women free choice in the first 12 weeks of pregnancy.**

WMA 5 Co-ord

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Within formal non women's movement organization (Birth Control Trust)**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbied parliament.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

David Alton, a religious conservative, introduced a bill to reduce the upper time limit for legal abortions. The Abortion Act of 1967 had set no upper limit, so the Infant Life (Preservation) Act of 1929 prevailed, prohibiting the killing of a fetus either of 28 weeks gestation or viable, that is, able to survive outside of the womb. With more knowledge of fetal development and reduction of the age of viability, especially with advances in neo-natal care, SPUC and LIFE took the initiative to restrict abortions by focusing on what they called late abortions. The Alton bill set the definition of late at 18 weeks, and would prohibit abortions after that time except to save the life of the mother or if the child was likely to be born dead or would have extensive physical handicaps.

As usual, the government of the day took no stand on the issue of abortion or this effort to limit the time period for legal abortions. In fact, the Prime Minister, Margaret Thatcher, refused to give the time needed to complete deliberations on the Alton bill. The government did, however, take on the problems and questions raised by rapid medical advances in assisted fertility, embryology, test-tube babies, and the like. The HFEA began as a government proposal in 1990 based on the Warnock Report. In connection with this Act, the Government offered to include a Provision regarding the upper limit on abortion and to provide time for the House to debate it. Motivated either by sympathy for the struggles of the pro-life organizations or by a desire to settle a nagging and highly conflictual issue, the government provided just what was needed to settle once and for all an aspect of abortion law that had been controversial since the Lane Committee recommendations of the 1970s.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, David Alton, an anti-abortionist managed to capture the frame of the debate and he framed it in terms of medical knowledge and fetal development. Alton focused the debate on fetal rights and argued that the government should limit late term abortions to ensure that the fetuses did not feel pain. Alton focused more on medicalizing the argument and did not give much attention to gender.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Prior to the debate, that issue was framed as maintaining Abortion Act of 1967 to keep procedure safe for women.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

By the end of the debate, the dominant Frame remained the same one that had prevailed since the seventies: a contest between the women's right to decided and the life of the fetus. By the end of the debate abortion rights supporters portrayed abortion seekers as considering their options and making conscious decisions concerning abortion. Earlier, anti-abortionists had presented abortion seekers as snap decision makers, who used abortion as a casual alternative to contraception. The debate became gendered over its course and its gendering was controlled by the pro-choice groups. Abortion rights supporters promoted positive images of women and argued that abortion was a fundamental women's right. Pro-choice supporters argued that women should be allowed to have abortions later in their pregnancies, rather than prevent abortions after 18 months, as initially supported by Alton.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Positive images of women; abortion is fundamental women's rights
- Women should be allowed to have abortions later in pregnancy
- Women consider their options and make conscious decisions about abortion, not snap decision makers who use abortion as casual alternative to contraception.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

LSMWR: Women's right to decide abortion; abortion on request; women should be allowed to have abortions later in pregnancy.

WNC: No microframe

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

LSMWR: Women's right to decide abortion; abortion on request; women should be allowed to have abortions later in pregnancy.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA 1 All issues that affected women

WPA 1 Advise Government regarding women's views on a wide variety of issues; areas of key common concern. Commission steering committee selected issues of interest; also responded to specific requests from government agencies.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

QUAWPA 1 Located in the leadership of the opposition party in parliament; relies on staff of the Labour party.

WPA 1 Appointed and funded by government but independent; advisory to Government (PM Cabinet and government bodies such as Law Commission).

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

QUAWPA 1

Name: Jo Richardson

Years in WPA: In Shadow ministry from Beginning (3 years)

Activity in WMA: Active as Labour MP on women's issues.

WPA 1

Name: Kamlesh Bahl

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and Source: By the late 1980s, the autonomous women's movement-Women's Liberation- had declined. But other movements remained active, especially at the local level and in trade unions and political parties.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence – domestic violence and rape**
- **Political Representation**
- **Abortion**
- **Equal pay**
- **Childcare**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Formal Organizations **LIFE; SPUC**

Micro Frames: **Fetus is separate from the mother; mother is absent, replaced by empty space. Rhetoric couples fetal growth with uniqueness of human.**

The anti- abortion movement had declined slightly and was not as organized as it had been during the previous debates.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of parliament**
- **Conservative Government Ministers**
- **Interest groups**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Women's Global Reproductive Rights Network

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States shall take appropriate measures to assure equality of access for men and women to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: GBR_HI 1997-2003

Title: Reform of the House of Lords

WPAs: Women's Equality Unit (WEU); Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Meg Russel, leading feminist advocate of increased representation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need more representation of women**

Policy goals: **Quotas**

WMA2

Name: **Fawcett Society**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need more representation of women; disputed the contention that appointment rather than election would guarantee women's presence. Fawcett also argued on gender grounds that membership of the reformed HL should be paid. Their case was that women were less likely to have the financial resources necessary to serve on an unpaid basis.**

Policy goals: **40% quota proposal.**

WMA3

Name: **National Board of Catholic Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need greater representation of women; least emphatic of all.**

Policy Goals : **No mention of quotas, but implied support.**

WMA4

Name: **Wales Assembly of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Emphatically supported more representation of women.**

Policy Goals : **No explicit support for quotas but implied it (per JL).**

WMA5

Name: **National Federation of Women's Institutes**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **More representation for women.**

Policy Goals: **Implied support for quotas but did not explicitly state this.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **None**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Wakeham Report, 2000. Recommended the following changes:**
 - a. **a partially appointed and elected upper house of around 550 members of which about 12-35% are elected;**
 - b. **appointments that reflect a variety of interests including gender, ethnicity, religion, regions, nations and professions,**
 - c. **30% of members would be women, 20% of members would be non-partisan cross-benchers,**
 - d. **the House of Lords should have increased power.**
2. **White Paper The House of the Lords: Completing the Reform, 2001, decision. Substantive components:**
 - a. **proposed a 600 member house of 120 elected peers, 120 cross bench to be appointed by a statutory appointments commission, 12 law lords, 16 bishops and 330 nominees of political parties.**
3. **House of Commons proposal, rejected in vote on Feb 6, 2003., decision marks end point of debate, though government tabled another set of proposals later in 2003.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Meg Russel**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Special advisor to Robin Cook, Leader of the House of Commons from 2001 to 2003. Assisted in drafting the government's post-Wakeham White Paper. During the drafting stage the commitment to a minimum proportion of women was omitted. It was reinstated only after Meg Russel noticed the omission and redrafted the relevant passage.**

WMA 2 **Fawcett**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The director of Fawcett, Mary Ann Stephenson, offered evidence to the Wakeham Commission for increased representation of women. Fawcett Submitted a report that called for a 40 per cent minimum quota for women.**

WMA 3 **Catholic Women**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Expert witness at Wakeham Commission.**

WMA 4 **Wales Women**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Expert witness at Wakeham Commission.**

WMA 5 Women's InstitutesForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Expert witness at Wakeham Commission.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

Constitutional issues had been on the agenda in the early 20th century and re-emerged in the late 1980s, partly in response to worries about a system in which small electoral majorities generated by a minority of voters produced huge majorities for powerful and ever centralised governments that were elected by only a small proportion of the electorate. Moreover, unrest in Northern Ireland and demands for devolution in Scotland and Wales called the union into question. At the end of the 1980s an organisation called Charter 88 was set up to campaign for constitutional reform. This group was able to mobilise informed opinion and create coalitions of the various groups wanting change. Parliamentary reform was discussed in the press in articles, editorials and letters to the editor from private citizens. Public opinion polls included items on reform. Civic organizations and the business community were very active in lobbying government on reform. During the 1990s there was widespread acceptance of the need for parliamentary reform. The conservative government of the 1980s was not sympathetic, but New Labour adopted some of the Charter 88 proposals in the mid 1990s and in 1997 was elected on a platform that included support for many constitutional changes, including the reform of the House of Lords to an elected second chamber with the abolition of its hereditary principles, and quickly instituted many changes.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The main themes at the beginning of the debate were the modernisation and democratisation of parliament in the sense of its ability to scrutinise government and hold it into account. The main issue of contention became the choice between an elected or appointed chamber. Most positions in the House of Lords were hereditary and the remainder were appointed. Therefore, its democratic legitimacy was questionable.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained centered on modernisation and democratisation and especially on the conflict over appointed versus elected members. Recommendations for a partially elected and partially appointed House that would reflect a cross-section of society was central. Hence descriptive representation was explicitly considered in the wider debate and the discourse frame was compatible with feminist goals. The Wakeman report did have a gender balance requirement but women were discussed as a homogenous group and in conjunction with ethnic and religious minorities. Women's substantive interests were not addressed. The debate was not gendered. The Wakeman Report recommendation for adequate representation of women was

used to counter arguments for a largely elected body. It was argued that recruitment by appointment was the only way to secure a fair presence of women. This position was not supported by women's organizations. This argument was made despite the fact that assemblies in Scotland and Wales, which were elected, where women made up 36% and 38%. In other words, the criterion of gender balance was advanced in support of an undemocratic proposal.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Recommendation for adequate representation of women was used to counter arguments for a largely elected body. It was argued that recruitment by appointment was the only way to secure a fair presence of women.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1

Ministry for Women/ Women's Equality Unit (MW/WEU): Baroness Jay argued that only recruitment by appointment could secure a fair presence of women and her views were incorporated into the report. Ignoring the experience in the devolved assemblies of Scotland and Wales where women were 36% and 38% respectively of returned members, the Wakeham report stated that 'direct election delivers results that may be geographically representative but which are seldom gender balanced.'

WPA 2

EOC: None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Lead responsibility within Government on policy on women, gender equality, sexual orientation and co-ordination of equality. Provides support across the Department of Trade and Industry in ensuring that equality is integral to the development and delivery of the department's policy and services.

WNC is an advisory non Departmental Public Body which comments on government policy and represents the views of women's organizations.

WPA 2

- **to eliminate discrimination**
- **promote equality of opportunity between women and men generally**
- **promote equality of opportunity in employment and vocational training, for persons who intend to under go, are undergoing or have undergone gender reassignment**
- **to keep under review the working of the Equal Pay Act of 1970**
- **keep under review legislative provisions dealing with health and safety at work which require different treatment for men and women**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 The Women and Equality Unit was based in the Cabinet Office and was reorganized from the Women's Unit in 2001 and placed in the Ministry of Trade and Industry and the Minister is also Minister for Women.

WPA 2 The Equal Opportunities Commission is an independent, non-departmental public body, funded primarily by the government. Sponsorship transferred from Cabinet office to Department of Trade and Industry whose Minister is also Minister for Women (Baroness Jay).

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Baroness Jay**

Years in WPA: **1998-2003**

WMA activity: **None**

WPA 2

Name: **Julie Mellor, Chair**

Years in WPA: **1999—**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **By the late 1980s, the autonomous women's movement - Women's Liberation - had declined. But other movements remained active, especially at the local level and in trade unions and political parties.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence (DV, Sexual Harassment and rape)**
- **Political Representation**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Childcare**
- **Traffic**
- **Abortion/Health**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Weak counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

House of Commons Royal Commission appointed by the PM-12 member commission- drafted Wakeham report. Expert testimony given by: the National Board of Catholic Women, Wales Assembly of Women, the National Federation of Women's Institutes, Democratic Audit Task Force and Fawcett; Baroness Jay and Meg Russel also involved. (*These are Actors involved in drafting of Wakeman, House of Commons involved in subsequent reports and recommendations.*)

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Labour party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995**
- **Socialist International Women’s Section**
- **European Women’s Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: GBR_PR1 1979-1981

Title: Reform of Public Bodies—Quangos

WPAs: Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC); Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 12/25/03, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Jo Richardson, Labor MP Shadow Minister of Women's Affairs**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Women should be better represented in public appointments. She pointed out that no guidelines on public appointments existed to ensure equality and argued for equality Provision to be written into the statutes.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Equality for women in public appointments.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

The policy outcome took the form of various corrective actions, including

- 1. Review of the functions of quangos;**
- 2. Reduction of the number of quangos—abolishment of over 400 quangos**
- 3. Reduction in the budgets given to quangos**
- 4. Reduction in staff and public appointments to quangos (3700 ministerial appointments and 250 permanent posts)**
- 5. Guidelines published to for reviewing quangos in the future, this included a review of quangos at least once during the parliament to ensure they're running efficiently, effectively and economically and guidelines to ensure that quangos are accountable to parliament**
- 6. Guidelines to ensure any new quangos are evaluated before being established**
- 7. 31 new bodies established to take over the functions of the eliminated quangos.**

**** no recommendations on women's representation were made.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Jo Richardson**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Referring to the composition of the Benefits Commission, argued in Parliament that women should be better represented in public appointments.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Quango proliferation, composition, authority and accountability are regular topics of concern to guardians of British democracy. One such debate took place between 1979 and 1981. The debate was about the need to reform the Quango system which was judged to be out of control, non-accountable and costly. Prime Minister Margaret Thatcher took an interest in their reduction after her election in 1979. The debate centered on the need to cut costs of running Quangos and eliminate duplication of tasks and inefficiencies. The debate also addressed the number of Quangos to be cut, and which Quangos should be cut. Attention focused on the growth of Quangos over a ten-year period. The endpoint was the publication of the Pliatzky Report in 1980 *Report on Non Departmental Public Bodies* followed by the publication of *Non-Departmental Public Bodies* in 1981. The 1980 report recommended changes that were partly implemented in the following year. The result was a small cull of Quangos.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and was framed in terms of efficiency and the reduction of government spending. Conservatives in Parliament argued that quangos (non departmental government programs) were inefficient and that many of their services were already offered in other parts of government. Conservatives argued in favor of cutting quango budgets in order to save public money.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate in Parliament remained framed in terms of efficiency.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC)

The EOC argued that cutting quangos would adversely effect education and training programs for women.

WPA 2. Women's National Commission (WNC)

WNC took no position on the issue.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1. EOC

Oversight of sex equality legislation

WPA 2 WNC

To ensure by all possible means that the informed opinion of women is given its due weight in the deliberations of government and on both national and international affairs. Sub committees took up rape, violence in marriage, age of consent, youth unemployment, family planning, sex discrimination and reports on the Equal Opportunity Commission are issues taken up in the 1976-9 period.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1: is a quango, executive agency distant from power.

WPA 2: Advisory to government agencies.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1. EOC

Name: Betty Lockwood

Years in WPA: 5-6

WMA activity: Was previously labour party women's officer.

WPA 2. EOC

Name: Ethel Chipchase

Years in WPA: 10 years

WMA activity: Secretary of the Women's Advisory Council of the Trades Union Congress and member of the Equal Opportunities Commission.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Growth

Evidence and source: Most contemporary accounts of the women's movement suggested that it was in decline. In retrospect however, the early 1980s might be seen as a period of consolidation as feminists learned to operate in mainstream politics in order to resist new right policies that were thought to be harmful to women.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Childcare**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Abortion and contraception**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Cabinet**
- **Prime Minister**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Conservative party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not applicable

Debate:GBR_PR 2 1993

Title: Selection of Parliamentary Candidates in the Labour Party

QUAWPAs: Women's Committee of Labour NEC (WCLNEC); Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)

Date of Coding: 2/04, 3/05/04; 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1.

Name: **Anne Gibson of the MSF**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **In the course of the debate the rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted. Within the party discussion of the proposal ranged across substantive policy issues, the necessity for the party to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women. Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.**

Policy goals: **Supported the clause on all women shortlists.**

WMA 2.

Name: **Trade Union Feminists/ Equality Officers**

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: **In the course of the debate the rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted. Within the party discussion of the proposal ranged across substantive policy issues, the necessity for the party to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women. Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.**

Policy Goals: **Supported the clause on all women shortlists.**

WMA 3.

Name: **Labour Women's Action Group**

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: **In the course of the debate the rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted. Within the party discussion of the proposal ranged across substantive policy issues, the necessity for the party to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women. Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.**

Policy Goals : **Supported the clause on all women shortlists. The Labor Women's Action Group argued in favor of implementing quotas for the minimum number of women on Labor Party electoral lists.**

WMA 4.

Name: **Labour Women's Network**

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Network participated in the debate by trying to persuade other members of the Labor party to support the clause on all women shortlists. In the course of the debate the rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted. Within the party discussion of the proposal ranged across substantive policy issues, the necessity for the party to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women. Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.**

Policy Goals : **Supported the clause on all women shortlists.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

NOTE: Not overtly feminist, because no challenge to gender hierarchy.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The resolution established a system of selection in which members votes determined selection. One clause of the resolution established a system of all women shortlists in half of the party's winnable and safe seats in the next general election. This meant that local selectors in some constituencies could consider only women when they chose their parliamentary candidate. The all women shortlist clause was crucial to John Smith's victory.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Anne Gibson, member of the MSF Trade Union**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Influenced her trade union to vote for the final clause.**

WMA 2 **Trade Union Feminists/ Equality Officers**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbied their trade unions to support the all-women shortlist.**

WMA 3. **Labour Women's Action Group**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **The Action group participated in the debate by trying to influence other members of the Labour party to support all women shortlists.**

WMA 4. **Labour Women's Network: Formal, no women's movement organization**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Mobilizing support for clause in party conference and party branch and regional meetings. The Network participated in the debate by trying to persuade other members of the Labor party to support the clause on all women shortlists.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

During Labour's four successive periods of opposition after 1979 repeated debates over party organization took place in a process of modernization that afforded many opportunities for feminist advocates to intervene. Issues of descriptive political representation were addressed in terms of candidate selection and de-selection, leadership selection, the composition of the party's ruling National Executive Committee (NEC), the rules Governing election to the shadow cabinet, the enfranchisement of party members in internal decision making, the scope and role permitted to internal factions and tendencies and control over the manifesto.

After their 1992 general election defeat, Labour modernizers initiated a wave of party organizational reforms. Modernizers believed that the influence of Trade Unions, which were affiliated into the party's federal structure, was electorally damaging. They sought to reduce the influence of the unions on party decision making. Unions had special voting rights that gave them 'block votes' on important decisions at all levels of the party including leadership selection, candidate selection and policy matters. The debate on the selection of parliamentary candidates was brought to the 1993 party conference by leader John Smith as part of the drive to remove the block vote.

To understand the debate one needs to be familiar both with candidate selection and with wider debates in the Labour party between 1979 and 2001. The crucial points about British electoral candidate selection are that it is almost entirely a party matter and that the main decisions take place at constituency level in the major parties.

The One Member One Vote (OMOV) debate of 1993 was introduced by John Smith in the summer. For Smith's proposals to be successful it was necessary to persuade unions to cast their votes in favor of OMOV, thereby reducing their own power in the party. It was a controversial move that was fiercely resisted by some of the larger Trade Unions. Necessity opened the way for a variety of alliances and coalitions within the party. The party women's movement was well positioned to take advantage of the opportunities thus afforded.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate was framed in terms of party modernization and democratization. The issue of union power was central in a framework in which descriptive and substantive representation were thought to be inseparable.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
No gender ideas expressed.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

In the end, the debate remained focused on modernization, but also grew to include a gendered frame when the suggestion for granting women in at least half of the positions on appointment shortlists came up. Women in the labour party argued in favor of these quotas as a tool for improving the representation of women in the British parliament.

In the course of the debate the rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted.

Within the party discussion of the proposal ranged across substantive policy issues, the necessity for the party to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women.

Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the end of the debate

- **Quotas as a tool for improving the representation of women in the British parliament.**
- **Rights of women voters to be represented by women and the rights of women party members to be nominated were explicitly asserted.**
- **Party needs to present a women friendly image and the necessity for women to be represented by women.**
- **Claims were made that increasing women's representation would increase the party's appeal to women voters and its ability to produce policies that incorporated women's perspectives.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

QUAWPA 1 **Women's Committee of Labour National Executive Committee (WCLNEC)**

Supported policy proposals aimed at increasing the number of women on Labor party shortlists.

QUAWPA 2 **Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)**

Supported quotas for a minimum number of women on Labor party shortlists.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA 1. **Women's Committee of Labour National Executive Committee (WCNEC)**

The multi issue scope of the QAWPA was backed by the women's officer and included membership support, training, candidate matters, representation and

policy and communications, hence was relatively extensive in terms of sex equality and women's issues.

QUAWPA 2. Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)

The multi-issues scope of the QUAWPA was backed by the women's officer and included membership support, training, candidate matters, representation and policy and communications, hence was relatively extensive in terms of sex equality and women's issues.

QUAWPA 3. Labour Party Women's Officer

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

QUAWPA 1. Women's Committee of Labour National Executive Committee (WCNEC)

In principle, the NEC ran the party at this time – in practice tended to be more powerful in opposition than when party in government. As party was in opposition, was in more powerful phase.

QUAWPA 2. Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)

Part of shadow cabinet with appropriate support—money for research staff and political advisers.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

QUAWPA 1 Women's Committee of Labour National Executive Committee (WCNEC)

Name: **Clare Short MP**

Years in WPA: **2-3**

WMA Activities:

QUAWPA 2 Labour Shadow Ministry of Women's Rights (LSMWR)

Name: **Jo Richardson**

Years in WPA: **1988-93**

WMA Activities: **Active in feminist issues, abortion in the 1970s.**

C13A WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **In this debate the relevant sections of the women's movement were those mobilised within the Labour party. By 1993 there was a substantial women's movement within the party. Activists organised both to secure women's political presence and to make sure their interests were represented. Other actors included Trade Union feminists, often women's officers or equality officials who were also members of the Labour Party.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence (DV, Sexual Harassment and rape)**
- **Political Representation**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Child Care**
- **Traffic**
- **Abortion/Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

A strong countermovement existed mainly based in constituencies where the policy was likely to frustrate the ambitions of 'favorite sons'. Their voices were not decisive in the conference debate, but they became very important in the implementation process and were able to overturn the policy in the courts three years later.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Labour Party**
- **Shadow Ministry for Women**
- **NEC Women's Committee**
- **Trade Unions who were members/close to the Labour party —almost all trade unions**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Conservative Party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **EU Gender-Balance in Decision-making**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**

(c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.

Debate ID: GBR_PR3 1997-2002

Title: Modernization of the House of Commons: Parliamentary Working Hours

WPAs: Women and Equality Unit (WEU); Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Tess Kingham, Labour Party MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Evening hours and especially frequent late night sitting were unnecessary and made it very difficult for women with children to be MPs. .**

Policy goals: **Supported hours reform.**

WMA2

Name: **Joan Ruddock, former Minister for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Advocated more ‘family friendly parliamentary regime.’**

Policy Goals **Supported shorter working hours.**

WMA3

Name: **Barbara Follett, founder of British Emily’s list, MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Advocated more ‘family friendly parliamentary regime.’ to promote equal opportunity.**

Policy Goals **Shorter working hours.**

WMA4

Name: **Oona King, MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Advocated family friendly parliamentary practices, working hours. to promote equal opportunity.**

Policy goals: **Shorter working hours.**

WMA 5

Name: **Caroline Flint, MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition **Advocated family friendly parliamentary practices, working hours. to promote equal opportunity.**

Policy goals: **Shorter working hours.**

WMA6

Name: **Fawcett Society**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women were first allowed to stand as MPs at Westminster in 1918. Since 1918, only 253 women have been elected as MPs. The problem lies mainly with the political parties and their candidate selection processes. Fawcett research shows that across all the main parties, women are systematically discriminated against.**

In addition to the discrimination they face, there are four other factors that can prevent women standing for parliament - the 'four Cs' of culture, childcare, cash and confidence.

Policy Goals : **Supported more flexible hours.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Family friendly hours will promote equal opportunity, overcome discrimination against women.**

Policy goals: **Shorter working hours.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Late night sittings were abolished and the 12-week summer break was abolished.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Kingdon**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Brought press attention when she announced she would stand down at the 2001 general election because it was impossible to combine being a mother with the demands made of an MP.**

WMA 2 **Ruddock**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Member of the Select Committee on Modernisation which made proposals to change working hours.**

WMA 3 **Follett**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Member of the Select Committee on Modernisation; also active in women's committee of PLP (parliamentary Labour party).**

WMA 4 **Flint**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Discussed concerns in parliamentary debate, said she did not wish to return to her family at weekends too exhausted to be a good mother to her children. Participated in the debate.**

WMA 5 King

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Discussed concerns in parliamentary debate, drew attention to the need for MPs to fulfill their family responsibilities.**

WMA 6 Fawcett Society

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Issued reports, lobbied, aired views in press, networked with influential politicians, journalists, think tanks and experts.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

At national (Westminster) level the UK system of government is characterised by party government. Supported by a single member simple plurality electoral system that normally produces working majorities for the winning party in the House of Commons, governments are dominated by a cabinet that is in turn dominated by the prime minister and sometimes a few other senior ministers. Although formally accountable to the House of Commons the great power of the leaders of the winning party is such that the system is frequently referred to as an 'elected dictatorship'. Changes in the regulation of the political parties were described by influential commentators as amounting to constitutional change. In this system major decisions are taken at Whitehall, notionally in the cabinet, but in practice probably by a combination of a minister, her policy advisors and civil servants. Details of decisions are worked out in the civil service where legislation and other policy documents are drafted. Until 2001 the Home Office had responsibility for constitutional matters. Some decision taking powers were devolved to Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland during the 1990s. In this system, decisions taken inside political parties are of key importance. Typically such decisions are brought to the legislature in the form of bills and thus receive the assent of the elected House of Commons.

Political representation takes place in both elected and appointed bodies. The rules and procedures that determine who becomes a representative differ by sector. For elected bodies the political parties make the most important decisions about who are the elected representatives because nomination of candidates is a party matter, subject to very few external constraints. The nature of the electoral system is a constitutional matter, subject to considerable regulation. For decisions about appointed bodies political parties, trade unions, business and employers associations, interest and advocacy organizations and government departments are the main actors. Activity in support of equality of women's representation brings three international actors into the decision making frame: the United Nations, the

European Union and the Council of Europe. All the institutions affect the way in which political representation works in practice. The growth of 'governance' with its array of appointed bodies has also been an important factor. Whereas models of representative government suggest simple flows of power between the represented and their MPs, modern systems of 'governance' differentiate the represented and their relations with government.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame was the nature and future of democratic institutions, their modernisation and democratisation. The problem was that parliament was thought to be inefficient, old fashioned and not particularly successful at scrutinising government. The proposals debated in October 2002 included various measures to streamline procedures and make the Commons more efficient, including changing the hours of work, reforms to debate procedures, timetabling, the carry over of bills from one session to the next and time limits in MPs speeches. Those who favored change argued that the public was entitled to the best attention their MPs could give and that normal working hours would be more democratic and efficient, more family friendly, better suited to the media, better for the health of the MPs and better suited to the modern era. Those against changes argued the changes would marginalise Westminster and increase executive power, would make MPs look lazy, would diminish the effectiveness and importance of committee work and create a metropolitan elite of those MPs whose constituencies were near Westminster. The debate was framed in a complex set of arguments in which concern about democracy and accountability were cross cut by considerations of professionalisation and representation.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the Debate.

By the end, the debate was still framed in terms of modernisation and democratization and differences between women and men were discussed within that frame. Feminists and women MPs discussed the barriers to women presented by family hostile working hours that went into the evening and late night. They called for more family friendly arrangements that would allow women to be representatives. Their views were aired during parliamentary debates and reported in the media. Many commentaries about Commons reform made reference to its likely impact on women. But supporters of hours reform played down family friendly arguments for fear that reference to gender dimensions of the issue would cost necessary votes.

Overall, the gendering of the debate was rudimentary. The few references to difference, to sexuality and other issues of the body were made in reports from feminist organizations, not in Parliament. Public debate and media reports tended to depict women as a unitary group. Parliamentary debate did not take up issues of differences among women or of the possibility that women might bring different

perspectives to the parliamentary agenda. Gender was invoked in the dichotomous terms of equal opportunities, of removing obstacles and barriers to women most often seen as constrained by a traditional division of labor.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Barriers to women presented by family hostile working hours that went into the evening and late night. They called for more family friendly arrangements that would allow women to be representatives**
- **Gender was invoked in the dichotomous terms of equal opportunities, of removing obstacles and barriers to women most often seen as constrained by a traditional division of labor.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1

WEU: Supported modernization as women friendly; favored increased representation for women.

WPA 2

EOC: Officially supported modernisation as women friendly.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Lead responsibility within Government on policy on women, gender equality, sexual orientation and co-ordination of equality. provides support across the Department of Trade and Industry in ensuring that equality is integral to the development and delivery of the department's policy and services.

WNC is an advisory non Departmental Public Body which comments on government policy and represents the views of women's organizations.

WPA 2

- **to eliminate discrimination**
- **promote equality of opportunity between women and men generally**
- **promote equality of opportunity in employment and vocational training, for persons who intend to under go, are undergoing or have undergone gender reassignment**
- **to keep under review the working of the Equal Pay Act of 1970**
- **keep under review legislative provisions dealing with health and safety at work which require different treatment for men and women.**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 The Women and Equality Unit was based in the Cabinet Office and was reorganized from the Women's Unit in 2001 and placed in the Ministry of Trade and Industry and the Minister is also Minister for Women.

WPA 2 The Equal Opportunities Commission is an independent, non-departmental public body, funded primarily by the government. Sponsorship transferred from Cabinet office to Department of Trade and Industry whose Minister is also Minister for Women (Baroness Jay).

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Baroness Jay**

Years in WPA: **1998-2003**

WMA activity: **None**

WPA 2

Name: **Julie Mellor, Chair**

Years in WPA: **1999—**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **By the late 1980s, the autonomous women's movement-Women's Liberation - had declined. But other movements remained active, especially at the local level and in trade unions and political parties.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence (DV, Sexual Harassment and rape)**
- **Political Representation**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Child Care**
- **Traffic**
- **Abortion/Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

MPs, Select committee on Modernisation

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Labour party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby.**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.**

Debate ID: GBR_PT1 1979-83

Title: Abolition of imprisonment for prostitutes

WPA: Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 6/15/05, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **The English Collective of Prostitutes (ECP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work.**

Policy goals: **An end to illegal arrests of prostitutes and the immediate protection, welfare, housing for women who want to leave prostitution; laws should be completely decriminalized.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The new policies were aimed at reducing prison overcrowding.**
2. **The new law ended the use of imprisonment for punishing people who were convicted of prostitution.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **ECP**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by engaging in protests, and enacted LAW, a grassroots legal service for all women, and by encouraging prostitutes to plead not guilty when in court.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

There were three Private Members' Bills in the House of Lords between 1967 and 1969 concerned with deleting reference to 'common prostitutes' in the law and suggestions that the law against the client should be initiated. None of the Bills achieved a second reading. However, they reflect a growing concern with women's rights and legal inequalities. Two further Private Members' Bills in 1979 and 1981 did not receive a second reading either. Nevertheless, the latter, introduced by Clive Soley (Labour MP for Hammersmith North), on 'The Imprisonment of Prostitutes Abolition Bill' was influential in ultimately achieving the abolition of imprisonment for prostitutes convicted of soliciting. In December 1982, the Criminal Law Revision Committee (the parliamentary committee handling this legislative

change) published a working paper on ‘Offences Relating to Prostitution and Allied Offences’. From 31 January 1983, imprisonment for loitering and soliciting was abolished.

There were women’s movement organisations that campaigned for the abolition of imprisonment of prostitutes. Campaigning for the new legislation were organisations such as PUSSI (Prostitutes United for Social and Sexual Integration), PLAN (Prostitution Laws are Nonsense) and PROS (Programme for Reform of the Laws on Soliciting). Their common aim was to draw attention to the inequities and inconsistencies within the legislation. However, the legislative change was, ultimately, motivated by other concerns.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame of the Parliamentary debate in the early 1980s focused on the perceived need for penal reform. This was motivated by general humanitarian concerns and also a growing concern with a crisis in the prison system. In the beginning, the debate was framed in law and order terms and was not gendered. In order to slow prison overcrowding, those in favor of legalized prostitution suggested ending imprisonment for prostitutes.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained ungendered and focused on prison overcrowding and ending imprisonment for prostitutes throughout.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1: WNC: None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1:WNC: The formal orientation is to present information on matters of interest to women’s organization that make up the WNC.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1: WNC: Advisory to government of the day

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 WNC:

Name: **Ethel Chipchase**

Years in WPA: **Ten years**

WMA activity: **Secretary of the Women's Advisory Council of the Trades Union Congress and member of the Equal Opportunities Commission.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **Most contemporary accounts of the women's movement suggested that it was in decline. In retrospect however, the early 1980s might be seen as a period of consolidation as feminists learned to operate in mainstream politics in order to resist new right policies that were thought to be harmful to women.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Childcare**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Abortion and contraception**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Ministers**
- **Parliament**
- **Criminal Law Revision Committee.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: GBR_PT2 1984-85

Title: Kerb crawling as an offence and an arrestable offence

WPA: Women's National Commission (WNC)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/15/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **English Collective of Prostitutes (ECP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is sex work.**

Policy goals: **Government should not enact legislation that criminalized kerb crawling and it argued that kerb crawling should not be an arrestable offence.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Sexual Offences Act made persistent kerb crawling (street prostitution) illegal and created criminal penalties.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **ECP**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The ECP participated in the debate by engaging in street protests and by creating a coalition called the Campaign Against Kerb Crawling Legislation. made up of anti rape, Black and civil rights organizations, Aid prevention groups, lawyers, probation officers and Labour Party activists.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

This debate came onto the public agenda primarily via local constituency concerns about the moral and environmental 'pollution' caused by kerb crawling. Residents formed ad hoc associations and 'spokesmen' arranged public meetings to discuss the subject, so that the local community could be mobilised against it. Local residents and police, in co-operation, patrolled streets in small groups trying to dissuade prostitutes from frequenting the area. Most large metropolitan areas in Britain, including Birmingham, Bradford and Manchester, experienced such activism. These activities gained both local and then national media coverage. The debate entered parliament via the MPs of constituencies particularly affected by kerb-crawling, and legislation resulted from Private Members Bills.

In 1984 the parliamentary debate on Street Prostitution was introduced by Tom Cox (Labour MP for Tooting). He stressed the experience of ‘local residents’, the threats and nuisance they endure, and the positive action they had taken to work with local police to deal with the problem.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of prostitution as a public nuisance. In some areas, prostitution was a moral issue and there were distinctions drawn between good normal women and bad immoral prostitutes. In the beginning, prostitution was seen as a pollutant and cause for many other problems in communities. In order to stem the problems caused by prostitution, legislators introduced legislation to stop kerb crawling and make street prostitution illegal.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through to the end, the debate focused on the idea that prostitution was a public nuisance and that it was a moral threat to religious in (many Muslim) communities. In 1985 at the end of the kerb crawling debate, it was not gendered.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WNC: No micro Frame

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WNC: To advise Government regarding women’s views on a wide variety of issues; areas of key common concern. Commission steering committee selected issues of interest; also responded to specific requests from government agencies.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
Advisory to government (PM Cabinet and government bodies such as Law Commission)

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Name:
Years in WPA:
WMA activity:

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **By the late 1980s, the autonomous women's movement-Women's Liberation- had declined. But other movements remained active, especially at the local level and in trade unions and political parties.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Violence – domestic violence and rape**
- **Political Representation**
- **Abortion**
- **Equal pay**
- **Childcare**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Weak countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Cabinet**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Conservative party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **International Feminist Network Against Female Sexual Slavery**
- **International Whores Congress**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: GBR_PT3 2000-2

Title: Maintaining a person in sexual servitude

WPA: The Women and Equality Unit (WEU)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/15/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Liz Kelly**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Kelly defined sex trafficking as a form of slavery and argued that it should be ended. Liz Kelly and others in rape crisis groups argued that the abuse in sex trafficking was a result of the sexual domination that the male traffickers had over the female prostitutes. Essentially, the Gendered Frame in the debate equates sex trafficking with slavery and argues that it is a modern form of slavery.**

Policy goals: **Kelly wanted the government to take steps to end sex trafficking.**

WMA2

Name: **Rape Crisis Federation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Rape Crisis federation argues that consent of the victim of sex trafficking should not matter; so that it would be possible to convict sex traffickers of a crime whether or not the prostitutes consent to work for them.**

Policy goals: **Government should enact legislation that is tougher on sex trafficking.**

WMA3

Name: **Campaign to End Rape**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Consent of the victim of sex trafficking should not matter; so that it would be possible to convict sex traffickers of a crime whether or not the prostitutes consent to work for them.**

Policy goals: **Government should enact legislation that is tougher on sex trafficking.**

WMA4

Name: **English Collective of Prostitutes**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **'Liberating' victims of trafficking was an abuse of power. sex trafficking legislation is an excuse to give policy greater power of arrest. Consent of the woman to prostitution is important distinction. Sees prostitution as sex work and choice.**

Policy goals: **The ECP argued that sex trafficking should be considered a crime only if the prostitute involved does not give her consent to engage in sexual acts.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: Sex trafficking as a form of slavery and argued that it should be ended. Liz Kelly and others in rape crisis groups argued that the abuse in sex trafficking was a result of the sexual domination that the male traffickers had over the female prostitutes. Essentially, the gendered frame in the debate equates sex trafficking with slavery and argues that it is a modern form of slavery.

Policy goals: Government should take steps to end sex trafficking.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The White Paper provided a definition of sex trafficking as, ‘bringing or enabling a person to move from one place to another for the purposes of commercial sexual exploitation or to work as a prostitute, for reward.’**
2. **The White Paper listed six specific measures that the government would enact to stop sex trafficking.**
 - i. **It would combat illegal working through improved enforcement action**
 - ii. **Government would strengthen the law against sex trafficking.**
 - iii. **The government would deal appropriately and compassionately with victims of trafficking.**
 - iv. **The government would monitor the criminals through intelligence and enforcement operations.**
 - v. **Britain would co-operate with EU and other international partners to stop trafficking.**
 - vi. **Finally, the government would tackle organized criminal involvement in sex trafficking by using prevention strategies.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Liz Kelly

Form: Individual

Location: Academic; non women’s movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Participated in the debate by participating in the review for the white paper on sex offences.

WMA 2 Rape Crisis Federation

Form: Formal

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Consulted by the Home Office and women’s policy agencies.

WMA 3 Campaign to End Rape

Form: Informal

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Consulted by the Home office and the women’s policy agencies.

WMA 4: **ECP**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by using the media and engaging in protests of arrests made on some prostitutes engaged in sex trafficking.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

This debate entered into the UK public sphere via the International and European legislative frameworks. International actors have played a significant role in presenting many of the ideas surrounding the trafficking in women debate. In the case of Britain, the European Union and the United Nations have shaped the debate (EU actions include STOP and DAPHNE programmes, which aim at improving the position of the victims of trafficking). The Human Rights Act (1998) incorporates the European Convention on Human Rights into UK law. The Select Committee on European Scrutiny considered the Draft framework Decision on combating trafficking in human beings and the combating the sexual exploitation of children and child pornography in the spring of 2001. In addition to signing the Trafficking Protocol to the United Nations Convention of Transnational Organised Crime, the Government recognised the need for a specific offence of trafficking in human beings. It also considered it desirable to harmonise offences and penalties in this area on a EU basis.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in humanitarian terms and was non gendered. Participants saw that sex trafficking was a crime against humanity and argued that it demonstrated how inhumanely that people could treat each other. There was also a frame of the debate that focused on child welfare and argued that children were frequently the victims of sex traffickers. Virtually all sides in the debate called for legislation against sex traffickers that would outlaw the activity and create harsh penalties for sex traffickers.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on child welfare and the need to punish sex traffickers. There was also a frame that focused on child abuse involved with sex trafficking. Essentially the frame was a child welfare approach which downplays the moral agency and legal rights of prostitute women and emphasizes trafficking in women as a contemporary form of slavery. Emphasis on the abuse and coercion. All sides in the debate continued to call for harsher legislation against sex traffickers.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WEU: Came out against trafficking in women and argued that it should be outlawed.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Lead responsibility within Government on policy on women, gender equality, sexual orientation and co-ordination of equality. Provides support across the Department of Trade and Industry in ensuring that equality is integral to the development and delivery of the department's policy and services.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The Women and Equality Unit was based in the Cabinet Office

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Patricia Hewitt (2001)**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Was active on women's equality issues in the National Council for Civil Liberties; coauthored a book on representation of women in the House of Commons; led campaign for Sex Discrimination Act as part of the National Council for Civil Liberties.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and Source: **By the late 1980s, the autonomous women's movement-Women's Liberation-had declined. But other movements remained active, especially at the local level and in trade unions and political parties.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Violence (DV, Sexual Harassment and rape)**
- **Political Representation**
- **Equal Pay**
- **Childcare**
- **Traffic**
- **Abortion/Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Home Office and involved the Home Office civil servants, many NGOs including the Rape Crisis Federation and the Campaign to End Rape; Women's Unit and the Women's National Commission. Feminist academics like Liz Smith.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Labour party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **CATW**
- **International Collectives of Prostitutes**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: IRE_AB1 1983-85

Title: Constitutional Amendment to protect the unborn

WPA: Minister of Women's Affairs (MWA)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/1/05, 3/26/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Mary Robinson (Senator)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Looked at causes of abortion such as lack of sex education; argued women could be victims of circumstances, and should not be penalized for having children.**

Policy goals: **Opposed anti-abortion amendment.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Right to Choose Campaign**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that women had a right to an abortion ; however agreed not to emphasize this during the campaign. Similar to WMA 3.**

Policy goals: **Opposed anti-abortion amendment.**

WMA3

Name: **Women's Right to Choose Group (WRCC)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women had right to choose abortion; however, joined with Anti Amendment Campaign which did not argue that abortion was part of a women's right to choose, but instead tried to make their arguments against the amendment appeal to traditional Irish values. argued that the anti- abortion amendment was a waste of public money and would not solve the problem of unwanted pregnancies; unwarranted intrusion of moral issue into the constitution.**

Policy goals: **Opposed anti-abortion amendment.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **None**

NOTE: Although WRCC supported right to choose, they did not articulate these demands in the campaign.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Ban on legal abortion in Ireland**
- 2. Requires 'due regard for the right to life of the mother'**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Robinson**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Made lengthy speech in the Senate.**

WMA 2 **WRCC**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Joined public campaign against amendment; The WRCC agreed not to explicitly gender the issue with the other major groups. They thought that feminist gendering of the issue would cause them to loose support in the campaign.**

WMA 3 **WRCG**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Joined with Anti Amendment Campaign; The WRCC agreed not to explicitly gender the issue with the other major groups. They thought that feminist gendering of the issue would cause them to loose support in the campaign.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1979, the Supreme Court legalized contraception. Basing its ruling on a right to marital privacy, the Court exercised its powers, derived from a 1964 case, to determine which unspecified rights are protected by the Constitution. The legalization of contraception prompted conservative Catholics to establish the Society for the Protection of the Unborn Child (SPUC) in June 1980. SPUC sought to prevent any further escalation of liberalism, particularly with respect to women's reproductive rights, Data published by the Dublin Well Woman Center established that at least 1,000 women were annually referred to Britain for abortion, and, simultaneously, the Women's Right to Choose Group had begun to campaign for the decriminalization of abortion. SPUC's leaders feared that the right to privacy might be used by the Court to declare a woman's constitutional right to an abortion, as had been done in the US. They decided to campaign for a constitutional amendment that would prevent the legalization of abortion in Ireland and that could not be overruled by either the Supreme Court, or the European Court of Justice.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

After the Supreme Court legalized contraception in a 1979 decision Catholics and other anti- abortion groups came out against legalizing abortion rights. The dominant grame of the debate focused on the rights of the fetus to life and ignored the rights of women. The anti- abortionists argued that Ireland should enact a constitutional amendment to protect the right to life of the fetus. The debate was largely ungendered in the beginning and ignored differences between women and

men. Abortion seen in a frame of traditional Irish Catholic values versus secular inroads from abroad.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the course of the debate, women’s groups argued that there should not be a constitutional amendment enacted because it would allow no exceptions and there would be no abortions for medical reasons or in rape cases. The debate remained ungendered throughout. Women’s movement actors only tried to gender the debate insofar as to recognize that an abortion amendment would put women’s lives at risk. However, in the end the pro- life amendment activists controlled the debate and focused it on fetal rights. Still balancing the life of the mother with the life of the fetus was inserted in the debate at the very end.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Abortion amendment would put women’s lives at risk.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
MWA: Did not make proposals

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
MWA: Women’s affairs, but in practice only those issues that did not impinge on other departments; narrowed scope to family law which became the main focus.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
Ministry of State, a junior ministry located in the Prime Minister’s department.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Name: **Nuala Farrell**
Years in WPA: **DK**
WMA activity: **Identified as liberal feminist. Involved in family and domestic violence activities.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and Source: **The women’s movement was in the growth stage in the 1970s. Things changed in the 1980s; Some claimed the movement had disappeared, but this analysis did not come from the movement itself but from outside observers. The women’s movement formalized and mainstreamed throughout the 1980s. As a result feminism itself became an accepted subject of public discourse and actor in political society. The movement ‘as a whole’ scaled down, but new issues emerged.**

Decrease in local radical action. ‘The movement maintained activism in several areas (especially abortion) despite the retreat of the wider social movement sector in this period and, in some sectors, grew in strength and impact by developing organizational structures and formal leadership (such as the Rape Crisis Centres).

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equal rights in the workplace, job-sharing and career breaks**
- **Equal treatment in social welfare**
- **Family law change: divorce and domestic violence**
- **Right to divorce**
- **Right to choose**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Very strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament—Senate and Oireachtas**
- **Interest groups and campaigns for constitutional amendment referendum**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Fianna Fail, then Fine Gael

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: IRE_AB2 1992

Title: The X case, the Maastricht Treaty, and the right to travel

WPA: Joint Oireachtas Committee on Women's Rights (JOCWR)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05, 3/26/06

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **National Council for the Status of Women (federation of wm organizations)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Value of the life of the mother was the same as the life of the fetus.**

Policy goals: **Guarantee women's right to travel for abortion, guarantee women's right to information on abortion.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

NOTE: no ideas about equality with men; increasing women's self-determination; not feminist.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Amendment that guarantees travel outside of Ireland approved; no restriction on information about services abroad; rejected amendment that excluded suicide as grounds for abortion, letting decision in X case stand.**
 - a. woman can go abroad for an abortion**
 - b. no restrictions on right to travel outside Ireland in constitution**
 - c. information on abortion can be freely distributed.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 NCSW

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Worked closely with the government during the debate. In fact it negotiated the terms of the referendum; active in testifying for the government and using the media to persuade the public throughout the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Phase 1

In 1992, a crisis known as the X case put abortion once more on the political agenda. A 14 year- old school girl revealed to her parents that she was pregnant, due to a rape in December 1991 by a friend of the family who had repeatedly molested her. Her parents had already arranged for to have an abortion in England when they went to the police to report the rape and to make arrangements to procure fetal evidence that could be used in court to prosecute the case. Legal advisers informed the police that such evidence was inadmissible in an Irish Court.

The Attorney-General applied to the High Court for an injunction which was granted by Justice Costello. This actually restrained the defendant from leaving the jurisdiction for a period of nine months from the date of the court order. With this ruling, the effect of the 1983 amendment on a real person - a young girl - was evident, and there was a public outcry with meetings, protests, and a massive demonstration against the girl's internment. X was only 14, had been raped, and the public sympathized with her need to terminate the pregnancy. This afforded the Irish public the first opportunity to discuss abortion as embedded in a gendered social reality. Support and sympathy for X and her family led to questions about the fate of 4,000 other women who went annually to England for abortions. Would there now be pregnancy testing for all women leaving the country?

With the state offering to pay the costs, the family appealed their case to the Supreme Court, arguing that the rape and pregnancy had put their daughter's life at risk because she was liable to commit suicide. In a few days, by a majority of four to one, the Supreme Court decided that X could go abroad for an abortion. It concluded that 'if it established as a matter of probability that there is a real and substantial risk to the life of the mother, which can only be avoided by the termination of her pregnancy, that such termination is permissible, having regard to the true interpretation of Article 40.3.3'. The decision in this case led to a second phase of debate over the right to travel when the issue became conflated with the referendum over the Maastricht Treaty. Both phases of the framing of the debate are discussed here.

Phase 2

All sides of the debate were surprised by the court's ruling in the X case. Pro-life groups argued that nobody who had voted for the 1983 amendment could have anticipated the way it had been interpreted by the Supreme Court. They responded by proposing another amendment with a form that would preclude abortion under any circumstances be put to the people in a referendum. Liberals expressed surprise that the court had not specified any time limits on X's abortion in the judgement. Pro-choice advocates were relieved that the X case had procured the right to have an abortion under specified circumstances. However, they also realized that it was not a solution for all women with unwanted pregnancies because they would not be prepared to take their case to the Supreme Court. Of special concern was the threat to the right to travel to procure abortions abroad. In 1990, the European Community had defined abortion as a commercial service; within an internal European market Irish women had the right of access to services, including abortion, available in other Member States.

Despite the controversy raised by the X case, it is unlikely that the government would have responded were it not for the impending referendum on the Maastricht Treaty of Accession. The treaty, which promised to bind the states of the European Union even closer together in trade and policy, was due to come up for ratification in Ireland a few months after the X decision. The negotiations over the treaty had

been handled by the then Minister of Foreign Affairs Gerry Collins. Because of the X case, it was revealed that in December 1991, Collins, under pressure from pro-life groups and without any public discussion, had surreptitiously inserted the following protocol into the Treaty: 'Nothing in the Treaty on European Union, or in any other Treaties establishing the European Communities, or in Treaties or Acts modifying or supplementing those Treaties, shall affect the application in Ireland of Article 40.3.3 (the anti-abortion amendment) of the Constitution of Ireland.' If Maastricht were approved, the legal implications of this protocol would be that Irish women could not seek to assert a Community right to travel to another Member State for an abortion, or receive information about abortion services there.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate really has two phases: the X case phase and the Maastricht phase, which occurred after the X case phase. In the beginning of the X case phase, the dominant frame was that there was a need to balance the right to life of the fetus with the right to life of the mother. Effectively, there was an emphasis of the rights of the fetus over those of the mother. Also, the debate focused on the introduction of the risk of suicide as a legal reason for expectant mothers to seek an abortion. The debate was not gendered in a feminist way. However, gender was implied in the debate in terms of, 'raising the status of the woman's life to that of the unborn.'

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Balance rights of mother with rights of fetus.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the course of the X case debate, there was more value placed on the woman's rights and they became more equal with the rights of the fetus.

During the Maastricht phase of the debate, the debate shifted to include a focus on the rights of Irish citizens to travel abroad generally and specifically with regard to traveling abroad for abortions. The Maastricht treaty would make it illegal for women to travel abroad for abortions. The issue became gendered during this phase of the debate, as women's groups stepped in and argued that the treaty would deny women the right to travel. The women's groups managed to get three referendums to the treaty on the agenda that would ensure a women's right to travel, ensure that women had greater access to abortion information, and an amendment on abortion.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Treaty would deny women the right to travel**
- **Women's right to life balanced with fetus**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

JOCWR: None

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Examine or propose legislative measures that would materially affect the interests of women; consider means for eliminating discrimination against women and remove obstacles to full participation in political, social and economic life of the community; consider specific economic and social disadvantages applying to women in the home and recommend effective policy and administrative changes to overcome them.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

All party committee of the lower house of the Irish parliament. Disbanded before each Dail election; Each committee has new members, different approach and set of interests.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Teresa Ahearne**

Years in WPA: **1993-95**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **By the 1990s the established women's movement was professionalized. By 1992 the CSW was a key negotiator with the government. Also, women worked in women's studies, community based groups. Locally-based groups have been increasing in numbers since the 1980s. Some of these are informal and autonomous. Nevertheless, the more formal hierarchical aspect of the Irish women's movement has been more persistent and long-lasting in organizational terms yet has resulted in the institutionalization of the women's movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reproductive rights to choose WIN**
- **Right to travel and**
- **Right to information on abortion**
- **Childcare provision**
- **Hep C women organized for compensation for contracting Hepatitis C after blood transfusion after childbirth**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

Very strong counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Supreme Court**
- **Constitutional referendum process**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Fine Gael/ Labour-Democratic Left Coalition

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **European Women’s Lobby**
- **Socialist International Women’s Section**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: IRE_AB3 1997-99

Title: The C case and the Green Paper

WPAs: Joint Oireachtas Committee on Justice, Equality, Defense, and Women's Rights (JOCJEDWR); Department of Equality and Law Reform (DELR)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/3/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05, 3/26/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **National Organization for women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA2

Name: **National Women's council of Ireland**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger concerned about unequal access of Irish women to abortion abroad. Norren Byrne, chair, stated: 'it was assumed that the right to travel and to information had been completely clarified in 1992, but now we find those rights may not extend to the most vulnerable in society.**

Policy goals: **Ensure right to travel.**

WMA3

Name: **Women's education Research and Resource Centre**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA4

Name: **Trinity College Women's Group**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA 5

Name: **Women's Aid**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA6

Name: **Women's Counselling Network**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA7

Name: **Dublin Abortion Rights Group**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA8

Name: **Women's Health Council**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion as a women's right; that abortion was a woman's problem; need to have sympathetic response to women faced with crisis pregnancies.**

Policy goals: **Recommended legislation to uphold the X case judgment. Permit abortion when mother's life was in danger.**

WMA 9

Name: **Feminists for Life**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is dangerous for women.**

Policy goals: **Referendum to ban abortion absolutely.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Oireachtas outlined three different options for amending the Irish constitution. The first advocated an absolute ban on abortion, the second option maintained the status quo and have the state enact a program to help women with crisis pregnancies, and the third option was a law which permitted abortion in limited circumstances when the mother's life was endangered (and it included suicide as a grounds for abortion).**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **National Organization for women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 2 National Women's Council of Ireland

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented opinions in the media.**

WMA 3 Women's Education Research and Resource Centre

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to green paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 4 Trinity College Women's Group

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 5 Women's Aid

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper Committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 6 Women's Counselling Network

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 7 Dublin Abortion Rights Group

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 8 Women's Health Council

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee; testified in front of the Oireachtas committee on abortion.**

WMA 9 Feminists for LifeForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made submission to Green Paper committee.****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

In early November 1997 the Eastern Health Board (EHB) sought guidance from the High Court in relation to the case of a 13 year old member of the travelling community who was under its care. This young woman, known simply as C, was pregnant as the result of an alleged rape. She developed suicidal intentions as a result and wished to have an abortion. Despite the passage of the right to travel referendum following the X case, the EHB was informed by its legal advisors that, as a state agency, it could not assist in the procurement of an abortion. A voluntary agreement, which was drawn up between the EHB and the woman's parents allowing her to be released back into their care, quickly fell apart when the woman's father changed his mind, informing the Court that he now did not wish his daughter to have an abortion. This change of mind coincided with the appearance in Court of the woman's parents accompanied by prominent anti-abortion campaigners including the groups Family and Life and Youth Defence. Considerable confusion ensued, resulting in the Children's Court extending the EHB's care order after the young woman's legal representatives, her parents, and the EHB failed to agree on a course of action.

On November 21 1997, the case was referred to the District Court. The psychiatrist in the case gave strong evidence that the 'child is likely to commit suicide unless she has a termination of pregnancy.' Justice Mary Fahy directed that C be allowed to travel for the purpose of termination of her pregnancy while under continued supervision by the EHB. In response, the parent's legal team alleged that Judge Fahy had no jurisdiction to make this order and the case was immediately referred to the High Court. On November 29 1997, just under two weeks after this case first came to light, Mr. Justice Geoghegan upheld Judge Fahy's order and the right of the District Court to make a decision on the case. He took the view that 'the termination of pregnancy which was authorized by Judge Fahy was one which both in her view and in my view, was lawful under the Irish Constitution.' Justice Geoghegan added that he failed to see 'how any judge could have avoided the conclusion that as a matter of probability there was a real and substantial risk to the life as distinct from the health of C, which could only be avoided by termination of her pregnancy.'

This case drew attention to work under way in the Ministry of Health over the issue of abortion. In mid 1995, the Minister for Health had commissioned a study on crisis pregnancies in Ireland in order to identify the factors which contributed to the 'incidence of unwanted pregnancies.' The purpose of the research was to assist in the development and planning of future health policy with a view to reducing the incidence of abortion among Irish women. Published in 1998 under a different government, the report revealed that the majority of abortions were carried out for

social reasons, specifically the personal and family stigma of lone parenthood and its impact on women and their children, the difficulties of reconciling work and anticipated mothering or family life demands, and the financial difficulties attached to lone social motherhood. The Crisis Pregnancy Study exposed a somewhat unpalatable truth about abortions: that the majority of abortions obtained by Irish women would not be covered by limited or restrictive legislation.

The new Fianna Fail Minister for Health asked a civil service committee to produce a Green Paper on abortion, which invited submissions from interest groups. When published in 1999, the Green Paper formed another stage in the institutionalization of the issue. It was a very comprehensive document, which primarily addressed the political and legal context of the discussion of abortion in Ireland. The final chapter presented seven possible constitutional and legislative approaches that could be taken. The public interest groups were invited to make submissions focused on the seven options outlined to the All-Party Oireachtas Constitutional Committee on Abortion.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning of the debate, with the C case, the debate focused on the rights to life of the mother against those of the unborn child and on whether or not suicide was a valid reason for abortion. In the beginning, the debate was somewhat gendered, in that the rights of the mother were considered equal to the rights of the fetus. The Government framed the issue as the need to settle a contentious issue.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Rights of mother against rights of fetus.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Toward the end, the debate was opened up to the public with the publication of a Green Paper which included many interest group opinions on abortion. The Green Paper combined all micro frames submitted and presented choice to the Government. The Green Paper provided several policy options for dealing with the abortion issue, and thus there was still conflict in the frames as some of the options framed the debate in terms of women's rights, and others focused on the rights of the unborn fetus.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women's rights to abortion versus rights of the fetus.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1: JOCJEDWR: Did not take a position

WPA 2: DELR: Did not take a position

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
 WPA 1: **Joint Committee: examine or propose legislative measures that would materially affect the interests of women; consider means for eliminating discrimination against women and remove obstacles to full participation in political, social and economic life of the community; consider specific economic and social disadvantages applying to women in the home and recommend effective policy and administrative changes**

WPA 2: **DELR: To maintain and enhance community security and equality through the development of a range of policies and high quality services which underpin: the protection and assertion of human rights and fundamental freedoms consistent with the common good; the security of the State; an effective and balanced approach to tackling crime; and progress towards the elimination of discrimination and the promotion of equal opportunities and the accommodation of diversity.**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1: **JOCJEDWR: All party committee of the lower house of the Irish parliament. Disbanded before each Dail election; Each committee has new members, different approach and set of interests.**

WPA 2: **DELR: full central government agency with department and cabinet minister.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Joint Committee:

Name:

Years in WPA:

DELR:

Name: **Mervyn Taylor**

Years in WPA: **1994-97**

WPA Activity: **Probably not as career was in law and parliament; however he was an activist minister for equality; introduced divorce referendum.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **By the 1990s the established women's movement was professionalized. By 1992 the CSW was a key negotiator with the government. Also, women worked in women's studies, community based groups. Locally-based group have been increasing in numbers since the 1980s. Some of these are informal and autonomous. Nevertheless, the more formal hierarchical aspect of the Irish women's movement has been more persistent and long-lasting in organizational terms yet has resulted in the institutionalization of the women's movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Childcare**
- **Crisis pregnancy in Ireland**
- **Right to choose**
- **Right to information and abortion**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Courts**
- **Health ministry**
- **All party Oireachtas Constitutional Committee on abortion**
- **Civil Service committee on Green Paper**
- **Organizations making submissions to Committee.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Fianna Fail/Progressive Democrat Party Independent Coalition

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **European Women's Lobby**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: IRE_JT1 1981

Title: Youth Unemployment and Training Act

WPA: Employment Equality Agency (EEA)

Dates of Coding: 5/26/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05, 3/26/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Woman MP # 1 Fianna Fail**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Youth unemployment should serve females as well as males; criticize dominant assumption that problem was about male youth; Also raised the issue of whether official statistics on unemployment reflect female youth unemployment.**

Policy goals: **Proposal that the new YEA formally represent women's interests by reserved seats or a quota for women.**

WMA 2

Name: **Woman MP # 2 Fine Gael**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Youth unemployment should serve females as well as males; criticize dominant assumption that problem was about male youth; Also raised the issue of whether official statistics on unemployment reflect female youth unemployment.**

Policy goals: **The new YEA formally represent women's interests by reserved seats or a quota for women.**

WMA 3

Name: **Woman MP # 3 Labour party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Youth unemployment should serve females as well as males; criticize dominant assumption that problem was about male youth; Also raised the issue of whether official statistics on unemployment reflect female youth unemployment.**

Policy goals: **The new YEA formally represent women's interests by reserved seats or a quota for women. Also made the specific demand that there should be 5 women on the YEA.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None because there is no challenge to gender hierarchy; improve the status of women is implied but not explicit.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Best Approach to reduce youth unemployment is to centralize and to coordinate youth training programs under a single body the Youth Employment Agency.**
2. **1% tax on income to fund the policy**
3. **Guarantee to place unemployed youth in training persons and provide funding for it**
4. **Promise to access EU-ESF funding as well**
5. **Composition of YEA Board set (11 Members)—Social Partners, with no formal representation of women's organizations.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Woman MP Fianna Fail

Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke in floor debate on the bill.**

WMA 2 Woman MP Fine Gael

Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke in floor debate on the bill.**

WMA 3 Woman MP Labour party

Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke in floor debate on the bill.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Responsibility for solving this problem of youth unemployment and alienation was considered to reside with the national government. An election was held in June 1981 that resulted in a change of government, from a single-party center-right Fianna Fail government to a center-left Fine Gael/Labor party coalition. The incoming government announced the initiative on youth unemployment and blamed the outgoing Fianna Fail government for failure to tackle this problem, while opposition somewhat unconvincingly blamed the new government. In addition, the participants in the debate blamed less political factors such as the international recession and the population structure with an unusually large proportion of Irish citizens below 25 years of age.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of youth unemployment. The center-left government proposed legislation to create a new youth employment agency to stem the high rates of unemployment among youth in Ireland. Responsibility for solving the problem considered to reside with the national government. Government argued that the best approach to reducing unemployment was to centralize and coordinate youth training and employment

programs under a single state body called the Youth Employment Agency. Opposition advocated combating unemployment by promoting economic growth, especially attracting foreign investment.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.
Dominant frame unchanged from beginning of debate

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
EEA (Equal Employment Agency) did not have a formal positions on training at the time of the debate

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Employment aspects of the Employment Equality Law;

- **work toward the elimination of discrimination in relation to employment;**
- **promote equality of opportunity between men and women in relation to employment**
- **review the workings of the equal pay and equal opportunity legislation and make proposals for their amendment. Established by the Employment Equality Act of 1977.**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
EEA a bureaucratic agency located in the Ministry of Labor at a relatively low level

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Name: **Sylvia Meehan**
Years in WPA: **2 years (appointed in 1979)**
WMA activity: **Campaigned for equal pay as trade union activist.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and Source: **The women’s movement was in the growth stage in the 1970s. Things changed in the 1980s; Some claimed the movement had disappeared, but this analysis did not come from the movement itself but from outside observers. ‘The women’s movement formalized and mainstreamed throughout the 1980s. As a result feminism itself became an accepted subject of public discourse and actor in political society. The movement ‘as a whole’ scaled down, but new issues emerged. Decrease in local radical action. The movement maintained activism in several**

areas (especially abortion) despite the retreat of the wider social movement sector in this period and, in some sectors, grew in strength and impact by developing organizational structures and formal leadership (such as, the Rape Crisis Centres).

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Equal rights in the workplace , job-sharing and career breaks**
- **Equal treatment in social welfare**
- **Family law change: divorce and domestic violence**
- **Right to divorce**
- **Right to choose**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Department of Labor and Finance**
- **Members of parliament**
- **Cabinet**
- **Political parties**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Fine Gael/ Labor party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: IRE_JT2 1987-1989

Title: National Training Plan

WPAs: Equal Employment Agency (EEA); Women's Affairs Portfolio (WAP)

Dates of Coding: 5/26/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women sections in trade unions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equal employment for women; take steps to improve opportunities.**

Policy goals: **Supported positive action for women in training.**

WMA2

Name: **Council for the Status of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equal employment for women.**

Policy goals: **Supported positive action for women in training.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Equal employment for women; take steps to improve opportunities.**

Policy goals: **Supported positive action for women in training.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The plan was designed to tackle all aspects of Ireland's relative economic underdevelopment and to access the maximum level of EU funding available under the new programs.**
2. **State training policy and provision formed the main component of the human resources section of the plan, with major EU/state investment, to be spent on training and educational programs.**
3. **Emphasis was placed on improving levels of skills, especially with regard to new technologies and to languages. Also emphasized were training for self-employment, entrepreneurship, and the establishment of cooperatives.**

NO GENDERED COMPONENTS

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women's sections in trade unions**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (unions).**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not take part in the debate; no activities.**

WMA 2 **Council on the Status of Women**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not take part in debate; no activities.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1986, as the EU integration process began to accelerate, action was undertaken to obviate the potentially damaging effects of the integration process on the less developed member states. To that end, the EU's funds to promote social and regional policy were greatly increased and new regulations governing their expenditure were put in place. These regulations required a greater degree of planning by member states through agreed multi-annual national plans.

Under this development strategy, Ireland was classified in its entirety as a peripheral member state, and was allocated 6.1% of total Community Support Framework (CSF) program's budget, although its share of the EU population was only 1.07%. This represented both a significant EU investment in Ireland's development and an important component of the Irish national budget for a range of activities including job training. In 1989, the Irish state produced a national development plan for the period 1989-1993 that explained its intentions with regard to EU structural fund expenditure. The 1989 plan included an important statement of Irish national training policy and planning for the 4-year period.

The debate on action to mitigate Ireland's peripherality within the EU and the role of training in that context, therefore, began in 1986-1987 in the context of the introduction of the new EU structural fund regulations. The debate continued with the development of the Irish National Plan.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in economic terms and focused on ways that Ireland could improve its national economy, so that it could bring its economy up to speed with other EU members and compete with other countries in the EU and elsewhere. Policy suggestions focused on improving Ireland's infrastructure, increases in job training programs, and programs to develop Ireland's industry. The debate was not gendered in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on the Irish economy throughout its course. This discourse emphasized the opportunity presented by the new EU policies, and the disproportionately large funding allocation to Ireland. It also emphasized the dangers of increased competition, of national economic crisis, and especially, of potential to state bankruptcy. Unemployment was seen as a key issue. The European Commission did have an equality clause in the legislation on the use of structural funds, but even this did not serve to gender the debate in Ireland. The national development plan, including its training component had no gendered

component and none was introduced by the government in its proposals. Even when specific groups were motioned, e.g., young people and the long-term unemployed, there was no specific mention of gender issues.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 EEA: It did not have an formal positions on training at the time of the debate

WPA 2 WAP: No formal position on training

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1

EEA: Employment aspects of the Employment Equality Law:

- **work toward the elimination of discrimination in relation to employment;**
- **promote equality of opportunity between men and women in relation to employment**
- **review the workings of the equal pay and equal opportunity legislation and make proposals for their amendment.**

WPA 2

WAP: Coordinated the inclusion of ‘the gender dimensions’ across government policy.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1EEA: Agency inside the Ministry/Department of Labour

WPA 2WAP: In the Prime Minister’s office; Incumbent also held the position of Junior Minister for European Community Affairs. It was an assignment added on to the other duties of the Junior Minister.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 EEA:

Name: **Sylvia Meehan**

Years in WPA: **1981-89**

WMA activity: **Active in trade unions for equal pay**

WPA 2 WAP:Name: **Maire Geoghan-quinn**Years in WPA: **1987**WMA activity: **Possibly fellow traveler; in parliament since age of 25; first chair of Joint Committee on Women's Rights in the parliament 1982-87.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence: **The women's movement was in the growth stage in the 1970s. Things changed in the 1980s; Some claimed the movement had disappeared, but this analysis did not come from the movement itself but from outside observers. 'The women's movement formalized and mainstreamed throughout the 1980s. As a result feminism itself became an accepted subject of public discourse and actor in political society. The movement 'as a whole' scaled down, but new issues emerged. Decrease in local radical action. 'The movement maintained activism in several areas (especially abortion) despite the retreat of the wider social movement sector in this period and, in some sectors, grew in strength and impact by developing organizational structures and formal leadership (such as, the Rape Crisis Centres).**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reproductive rights to choose WIN**
- **Right to travel and**
- **Right to information on abortion**
- **Childcare provision**
- **Hep C women organized for compensation for contracting Hepatitis C after blood transfusion after childbirth**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Prime Minister's department**
- **Department of Finance**
- **Social partners (employers, farmers; trade unions)**
- **Programme for National Recovery (corporatist)**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Fianna Fail

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

European Commission Advisory Committee on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men set up in 1982.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: IRE_JT3 1995-97

Title: Retraining for globalization

WPA: Department of Equality and Law Reform (DELR)

Dates of Coding: 5/26/05, 6/13/05, 3/26/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **National Women’s Council of Ireland**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need to address inequality for women in work through government programs for training.**

Policy goals: **Backed the positions of the CSW 1993 report and the women’s movement derived Partnership 2000 Plan. Both of these documents had identified the growth of women employment in the service sector, and the need to address gender inequality in employment through implementing government run training programs.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women’s Sections of Political Parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need to address inequality for women in work through government programs for training.**

Policy goals: **Backed the positions of the CSW 1993 report and the women’s movement derived Partnership 2000 Plan. Both of these documents had identified the growth of women employment in the service sector, and the need to address gender inequality in employment through implementing government run training programs.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women’s Sections of Trade Unions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need to address inequality for women in work through government programs for training.**

Policy goals: **Backed the positions of the CSW 1993 report and the women’s movement derived Partnership 2000 Plan. Both of these documents had identified the growth of women employment in the service sector, and the need to address gender inequality in employment through implementing government run training programs.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Need to overcome gender inequality in work**

Policy goals: **Implement government run training programs for women.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **General: sought to make Ireland more competitive in the international economy by emphasizing human resources development.**
2. **The White Paper illustrated nine objectives for human resources development, and one of these objectives stressed the need for gender equality in job training policy. The gender dimension was central to white paper**
3. **The main task was to invest in the skills and knowledge of work force, concentrating especially on in-service training, management for unemployed people, and equality promotion.**
4. **A key target group, according to the White Paper, in the development of new training programs was women.**
5. **Additionally to target women, the White Paper proposed emulating the success of special women's training programs funded through the EU New Opportunities for Women initiative, as well as mainstreaming equal opportunities, providing childcare, and promoting attitudinal changes.**
6. **Took a position on life-long learning (a women friendly position).**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **National Women's Council of Ireland**Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated as one of the 'new social partners' in the partnership process; lobbied government institutions.**WMA 2 **Women's sections of political parties**Form: **Formal**Location: **Inside non women's movement organizations**Activities During the Debate: **Did not have access to the debate directly except through governing parties indirectly.**WMA 3 **Women's sections of trade unions**Form: **Formal**Location: **Inside non women's movement organizations**Activities During the Debate: **Access through unions who participated the social partnership process.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The center-left Fine Gael/Labor Party/Democratic Left coalition government produced a White Paper on Human Resources Development in 1997. Debates on the issue of training, retraining, and globalization had become more prominent on the political agenda during the mid-1990s in the context of a rapidly growing economy, falling unemployment, and emerging labor shortages. The White Paper represented the government's response to the shifting global economic environment and Ireland's changing position within the global economy. Once again, economic

discourse dominated the debate. The main focus was on Ireland's position within the global economy and the importance of human capital for maintaining that position in a context of fierce international competition. The White paper was preceded by an agreement among social partners called Partnership 2000 in 1996. The European Social Fund funded training and made Ireland subject to more overt and developed equal opportunity requirements confirmed on the second CSF for 1994-99.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in economic terms and focused on improving Ireland's position in the international economy. In order to do this, proponents of government action argued that Ireland would have to improve its job training programs and focus on developing human resources policy. There was no mention of any gendered aspects of the problem in the beginning of the debate.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In response to the absence of any discussion of the growth in female service sector employment and any other references to gender in the economic frame of the debate, a focus on disparities between men and women in the job training market and the use of job training policy could be used to promote equality between the sexes was introduced into the frame of the debate. The debate was gendered to reflect the 'feminist agenda' from the women's movement and captured in the 1993 Commission on the Status of Women report. Noted negative findings of evaluations carried out during the 1990s regarding women's participation in state training; proposed increasing women's participation, mainstreaming equal opportunities, providing childcare, promoting attitudinal changes.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women have lower status in the work force than men**
- **Women are under represented in state training programs**
- **Need to increase women's participation**
- **Need to mainstream equal opportunities**
- **Support women workers with childcare**
- **Need to promote changes in attitude about women in the work force to support their participation and equality**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

DELR: supported women's movement goals elaborated in the Partnership 2000 plan by arguing in favor of job training policies that promoted equality between men and women.

From the Partnership report:

Equity in access to labour market opportunities requires that women should not be penalised in the availability of employment supports, including training. Participation by women in mainstream vocational education, training and employment programmes will be reviewed with a view to increasing gender equity in access to such programmes and better job opportunities.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Participation by women in mainstream vocational education, training and employment programmes will be reviewed with a view to increasing gender equity in access to such programmes and better job opportunities.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The DELR focused on gender equality issues across all policy fields.

Mission: To maintain and enhance community security and equality through the development of a range of policies and high quality services which underpin:

- **the protection and assertion of human rights and fundamental freedoms consistent with the common good;**
- **the security of the State;**
- **an effective and balanced approach to tackling crime; and**
- **progress towards the elimination of discrimination and the promotion of equal opportunities and the accommodation of diversity.**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

Established in 1995 as full central government department/ministry

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Mervyn Taylor**

Years in WPA: **1995-97**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **By the 1990s the established women’s movement was professionalized. By 1992 the CSW was a key negotiator with the government. Also, women worked in women’s studies, community based groups. Locally-based groupw have been increasing in numbers since the 1980s. Some of these are informal and autonomous. Nevertheless, the more formal hierarchical aspect of the Irish women’s movement has been more persistent and long-lasting in organizational terms yet has resulted in the institutionalization of the women’s movement.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Childcare**
- **Crisis pregnancy in Ireland**
- **Right to choose**
- **Right to information and abortion**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet/Ministers**
- **Social partners which included business, labor, National Women’s Council.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Fine Gael/ Labor Party/ Democratic Left

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

European Women’s Lobby

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: ITA_AB1 1971-78

Title: Legalization of abortion

WPA: None

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Movimento per la Liberazione della Donna (MLD)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Any law on abortion will give state power to decide for us; we don't want laws on our bodies.**

Abortion should be not only on demand, but free but not compulsory abortion. We accept another person's conscience as we want other people to respect our wish to become mothers only when we want to.

Policy goals: **We don't want any law that defines abortion as a crime; decriminalize abortion and contraceptive use.**

WMA 2

Name: **Rivolta Femminile**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **We shall achieve free abortion, rather than new legislation; turn battle for abortion by undermining structure of male domination**

- liberation means freely chosen procreation
- when woman gets pregnant without wanting to she has adapted herself to the patriarchal male structure where women are inferior and servile condition.
- conception is the fruit of the violence of male sexual culture at the expense of women.

Policy goals: **Asking male for legalized abortion has a sinister aspect; we consider the abortion law no longer valid; reject the state's power to regulate abortion because whatever the law it will be used to codify passivity and vaginal sexuality as the expression of female sex.**

Decriminalize abortion (although it's more a rejection of the state's power over the issue altogether).

WMA 3

Name: **Collettivo Femminista Milanese**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion should be a woman's choice**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 4

Name: **Autocoscienza group**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Legalization of abortion considered another way for patriarchal society to dominate once again the body of women. Women continued to be colonized by patriarchal system.**

Repossession of the body a basis for a new female subjectivity.

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 5

Name: **Lotta Femmenista**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Legalization of abortion considered another way for patriarchal society to dominate once again the body of women. Women continued to be colonized by patriarchal system.**

Repossession of the body a basis for a new female subjectivity.

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 6

Name: **UDI women's organization of the PCI**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Subordination of women derived from division of roles in masculinist society. Wanted contraception, saw abortion as a last resort. women should make decision; stressed importance of women's clinics as places for women to discuss maternity, sexuality, and contraception.**

Policy goals: **Make abortion legal.**

WMA 7

Name: **Women MPs (Radical and PCI)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women should have freedom of decision in abortion.**

Policy goals: **Opposed PCI bill requiring 3 doctors to give permission; make abortion legal.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abortion should be not only on demand, but free but not compulsory abortion. We accept another person's conscience as we want other people to respect our wish to become mothers only when we want to.**

We shall achieve free abortion, rather than new legislation; turn battle for abortion by undermining structure of male domination

- liberation means freely chosen procreation
- when woman gets pregnant without wanting to she has adapted herself to the patriarchal male structure where women are inferior and servile condition.
- conception is the fruit of the violence of male sexual culture at the expense of women.

legalization of abortion considered another way for patriarchal society to dominate once again the body of women. Women continued to be colonized by patriarchal system.

Repossession of the body a basis for a new female subjectivity.

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **After much debate, law 194 was passed into law on 22 May 1978. Under law 194, abortion was not removed from the criminal code, but it was officially permitted in several circumstances.**
 - a. **conditional abortion in first 90 days for physical or mental health dangers, in relation to her economic social and family conditions, circumstances in which conception happened, fetus malformation.**
 - b. **conscience provision for doctors to decline to perform abortion.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Movimento per la Liberazione della Donna (MLD)**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Initiated pro abortion activities in the early 1970s; demonstrations; closely connected to Radical party. Issued Manifesto in 1978. Arranged safe abortions for women organizing trip to Great Britain; at the forefront of the battle.**

WMA 2 **Rivolta Femminile**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **First feminist collective to take public position on abortion; central role in campaigns do decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3 **Collettivo Femminista Milanese**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Publishing a leaflet that demanded the end of all laws against abortion and supported the creation of an autonomous women's organization. The CFM openly criticized the left wing parties for not focusing enough of their attention on women's issues. The CFM publicly advocated that abortion should be a woman's choice and that it should be decriminalized.**

WMA 4 **Autocoscienza group**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in campaigns.**

WMA 5 : **Lotta Femmenista**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in campaigns.**

WMA 6: UDI women's organization of the PCIForm: **Formal**Location: **Insider non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Pressured PCI men as the parliament debated abortion law.****WMA 7 Women MPs (Radical and PCI)**Form: **Individuals**Location: **Non women's movement organization (parliament)**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke on floor of parliament.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

In the 1970s, the abortion issue was part of a broader socio-political conflict related to civic campaigns struggling against both the confessional power of the Catholic Church over society and class/patriarchal domination over women's sexuality. The first 'revolution' in Italian family law was legal divorce in 1970. There was also an approval of a new family law acknowledging equal rights and duties of women and men. Family planning became a public issue and led to a 1975 law to permit contraceptive services. The first bill to decriminalize therapeutic abortion was submitted to Parliament in 1971 by a socialist MP, Loris Fortuna. The proposal immediately raised constitutional questions since abortion was a crime. When the court ruled the old law was unconstitutional because it did not allow a woman to voluntarily interrupt her pregnancy, it opened the way for advocates of reform to move ahead with proposals. A pro reform coalition developed composed of Communists, socialists, Social Democrats and liberals who reached an agreement and unified their different proposals for a single text.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The Constitutional Court provided the first official framing of the abortion reform issue. The 1975 ruling confirmed both the legitimacy of therapeutic abortions and the priority of the right to health of the mother, who is a born person, over that of the fetus, which has yet to be born. In the beginning, the dominant frame supported abortion reform to end illegal abortions which were very dangerous to the health of women. From the outset, the debate was gendered because it focused on abortion as a women's issue and it sought to find ways to eliminate the threat that illegal abortions posed to women's health.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Right to health for the mother**
- **Illegal abortion threat to women's health**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Throughout its course, the debate remained focused on women's rights and concerned with the life of the mother over that of the fetus. In the end, the debate was gendered and, permitted the emergence of new female identities, the recognition of the centrality of women as a political subject, and the affirmation of feminism as

a public discourse. Throughout the debate, women's movement actors argued that abortion should be decriminalized.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women's rights**
- **Life of mother over life of fetus**
- **Abortion is a women's issue**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
No WPA

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Not applicable

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Growth**
Evidence and source: **The abortion debate of the 1970s coincided with the emergence and growth of the women's movement in Italy.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Abortion**
- **Divorce**
- **Women's Liberation, Self Consciousness**
- **Women's Sexuality And Health**
- **Violence Against Women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Weak countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Party leaders**
- **Chamber of Deputies**
- **Senate**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Christian Democrats

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate
Not applicable

Debate ID: ITA_AB 2 1980-81

Title: Popular referendum to repeal legal abortion

WPA: None

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/14/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Radical Groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Supported extreme genderings of the abortion issue, arguing that abortion had to be decriminalized so that the patriarchal state could not take advantage of women.**

Policy goals: **Referendum that would completely decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **Movimento di Liberazione della Donna**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Current law is mixture of fake morality and political balancing acts; it crushes women and their dignity; leads to back street abortions; self determination for women.**

Policy goals: **No restrictions on minors; eliminate conscientious objection. Abolish the entire Article 9 except the part that obligates doctors and hospitals to perform abortions.**

WMA3

Name: **Integrated groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Emphasizing that the value of the life of the mother was greater than that of the fetus.**

Policy goals: **Vote no on referendum that would abrogate legal abortion.**

WMA4

Name: **Udi: Women's section of the PCI**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Subordination of women derived from division of roles in masculinist society; wanted contraception, saw abortion as a last resort. women should make decision; stressed importance of women's clinics as places for women to discuss maternity, sexuality, and contraception.**

Policy goals: **Opposed referendum that would overturn legal abortion.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Decriminalize so that the patriarchal state could not take advantage of women.**

Current law is mixture of fake morality and political balancing acts; it crushes women and their dignity; leads to back street abortions; self determination for women.

Subordination of women derived from division of roles in masculinist society; wanted contraception, saw abortion as a last resort. Women should make decision
Policy goals: **Referendum that would completely decriminalize abortion no restrictions on minors; eliminate conscientious objection. Abolish the entire Article 9 except the part that obligates doctors and hospitals to perform abortions**
opposed referendum that would overturn legal abortion.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The voters overwhelmingly defeated the anti-abortion referendum and abortion remained legal in Italy under limited circumstances.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Radical groups**

Form: **Informal/ formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Radical/ autonomous feminists participated in the campaign by introducing a referendum that would completely decriminalize abortion The radical groups promoted their law by using the Italian media.**

WMA 2 **MLD**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **1979 manifesto on abortion law; established self help groups.**

WMA 3 **Integrated groups**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organizations (parties)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the campaign by urging Italian voters to vote no on the referendum that would place more restrictions on abortion.**

WMA 4 **UDI**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Both PCI and UDI were united in supporting the law against the referendum. There was an agreement also with the radicals, with whom the law on abortion was agreed and passed thanks a mutual support, although divergences regarding the decriminalization.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The second debate involves the attempt by pro-life forces to abrogate the abortion law by means of a referendum. The approval of law no.194 in 1978 did not bridge the deep social divisions over abortion. On the contrary, the law left much discontent and many seemingly unresolvable questions. Based on proposals from the Catholics and the Radicals, the 1981 referendums offered voters the opportunity both to restrict and to liberalize the law. This section focuses on the proposal to restrict the law because this was by far the more important debate for the women's movement.

In the *Libro bianco sull'aborto* (White Book on Abortion), published in 1977, Christian Democrats in the Chamber of Deputies called abortion a 'tragedy for the Italian conscience.' This book collected all documents related to parliamentary debates in legislatures VI (1972-6) and VII (1976-9) on abortion, reporting the reactions and speeches of interested MPs. These documents confirm how parliamentary debates reflected the increasing tension between the state, the government, and civil society. As soon as constitutionally permitted, those groups unhappy with the 1978 abortion reform proposed nullifying referendums to change it. By 1980 there were seven different referendum requests: four by the Radical Party to remove restrictions and three by the Christian Democrats in collaboration with the pro-life movement to prevent the institutionalization of a System of legal abortion.

The maximal proposal was identified to completely erase the law while the minimal proposal was intended to modify it in a restrictive way. The contents of these proposals were similar in their reference to the protection of the unborn, defined as human life since its conception. The Constitutional Court rejected the maximal proposal presented by the MpV because it would have meant the total abrogation of law no. 19, which had been previously judged as constitutionally sound and legally enacted. Therefore, only the minimal proposal aimed at reducing the impact of the law was submitted to the voters. It would reject the principle of the woman's self-determination and permit abortion only for therapeutic reasons, giving the physician the power to make the decision.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

With the decision to legalize abortion 2 years prior to this debate, the original frame placed emphasis on the rights of women over the rights of the unborn fetus. The frame of the abortion issue was gendered based on the notion of women's prior needs. According to this frame, abortion law should place a woman's life and health before that of the fetus, and the state had to be involved by providing information, social services, and assistance to women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Place a woman's life and health before that of the fetus.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Anti-abortionists tried to shift the dominant frame to focus on the rights of the unborn fetus. Toward the end of the debate, there were competing frames which focused on the rights of the fetus against those of the pregnant mother. Ultimately, the original frame won out. The women's movement actors switched their strategy to use gender to defend the existing law and argue that women should have access to abortions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the end of the debate
Place a woman's life and health before that of the fetus.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
No WPA during the debate

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Not applicable

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **During the second debate, both women's movements-socialist/communist and radical/ separatist were in the growth stage.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Women's identity and sexuality**
- **Violence against women**
- **Reconciling family and professional life**
- **Equality and no discrimination at work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Political parties**
- **Social movement actors**
- **Interest groups**
- **Catholic Church**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Christian Democrats, Social Democrats and the Republicans.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name **None**
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: ITA_AB3 1996-99

Title: In-vitro fertilization and abortion

WPAs: Ministry for Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women MPs in Left parties (PdS & DS)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Woman has the right to the first word and the last word regarding her reproductive decisions and life.**

Policy goals: **Avoid approval of any amendments which would threaten the 1978 law; protect its fair application.**

Another view: no law on abortion at all; complete decriminalization.

WMA2

Name: **Radical and Moderate Feminist Groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Opposed the ‘new patriarchal’ intention ‘to dominate once again the female body and to control all reproductive processes.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize all abortion laws;**

No to the law! No to any reductive and restrictive revision of the law no. 194 (1978 abortion law).

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Woman has the right to the first word and the last word regarding her reproductive decisions and life opposed the ‘new patriarchal’ intention ‘to dominate once again the female body and to control all reproductive processes.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion laws.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Law 194 (Abortion Act) remained in force.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women MPs in Left parties (PdS & DS)**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women’s movement organizations (parties and parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented ideas in debates.**

WMA 2 **Radical and Moderate Feminist Groups**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized demonstrations; wrote new proposals for definitely removing abortion altogether from the penal code and or/ criticizing radically liberal laws on abortion and reproduction.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Divisions over abortion and social modernization revealed by the 1970s debates persisted into the 1990s. Unlike the debate on abortion, which started in the civil society and was later taken up in parliament, the debate on IVF began with a governmental bill and later became a controversial issue for public opinion. A bill concerning (norms about artificial insemination, in vitro fertilization and transferring of gametes and embryos) was announced in Parliament on 20 June 1996. Abortion opponents found the occasion an opportunity to push back the liberal abortion law. Women's organizations moved to protect women's rights. The familiar battle was waged in a very new political territory. With the demise of the polarization between Communists and Christian Democrats under the change of ideologies and the growing scandal of corruption and ineptitude, all old parties transformed their previous names, composition, and political alliances. Christians from the former DC split into several smaller often conflicting parties (PPI, UDEUR, CCD). While PPI and UDEUR joined a center- left coalition called Ulivo (olive tree), CCD allied with the renamed right wing Alleanza Nazionale, conservative (Forza Italia, led by Silvio Berlusconi) and separatist (Lega Nord per l'Indipendenza della Padania) parties, constituting a coalition called Polo before and casa delle Liberta later.

The front in favor of maintaining a liberal law on IVG and approving tolerant legislation on IVF was composed of Democratici di Sinistra (part of the former PCI), Verdi (Greens), Partito dei Comunisti Italiani, Rifondazione Comunista, and a part of the 'gruppo misto,' a mixed parliamentary grouping of liberals, socialists, republicans, and so on.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Early in the debate, anti- abortionists framed it in terms of ethics and morals. The anti-abortionists argued that women who received in vitro fertilization should not be able to have abortions. The anti-abortionists de-gendered the issue and focused it on the rights of fetuses, rather than those of women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The anti-abortionists retained control over the dominant frame through most of the debate, however, in the end women's movement actors regendered the dominant frame. WMAs reacted to the anti- abortionists by gendering the issue and arguing that abortion was necessary to ensure that men did not have control over women's bodies. WMAs proposed policies that sought to reject the restrictions on abortion and sought to remove abortion laws from the penal code.

What this means is that legal abortion was raised in the context of the IVF law; while originally focusing on the fetus, women's movement actors were able to insert women's interests into the frame on keeping abortion legal. the debate on IVF itself was not gendered.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Women have interests in keeping abortion legal

(not clear that the dominant frame was gendered in feminist terms).

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 MEO: Against changing the abortion law to deny abortions to mothers who received IVF.

WPA 2 NCEO: None

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 MEO: Mainstreaming the principle of equal opportunities in all policies adopted by the government.

WPA 2 NCEO: Promote equality between the sexes.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 MEO: Minister without portfolio

WPA2 NCEO: Advisory commission to Prime Minister

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 MEO:

Name: **Anna Finocchiaro**

Years in WPA: **1995-99**

Laura Balbo 1999

WMA activity: **AF: Active in the PCI and a feminist**

LB: Yes

WPA 2 NCEO:

Name: **Silvia Costa**

Years at WPA **DK**

WMA activity: **Feminist sociologist**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The characteristics of the women's movement at the time of the debate on IVF 1996-99) were quite different from those in previous controversies on abortion in Italy. Indeed, a strong autonomous feminist movement**

no longer existed. Although feminists organized demonstrations, they lost their capacity to mobilize public support. Rather, the movement was at the consolidation stage as, with increases in the number of women secretaries of state, femocrats, an feminist advisers, gender issues and concepts became part of the state.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender Equal Political Representation**
- **In Vitro Fertilization**
- **Abortion Rights**
- **Equal Opportunities At Work**
- **Social Services**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Very strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Party leaders**
- **Chamber of Deputies**
- **Senate**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Olive Tree, with Social Democrats and Communists, among a host of others.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Dbate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: ITA_HI 1997-2001

Title: Constitutional Decentralization

WPAs: Ministry for Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/21/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Women MPs from all parties: Rifondazione Comunista, DS (Democrats of the Left), UDEUR (a formation of former Christian Democrats, member of the left-wing majority), some women from the Lega Nord (the Lega Nord had given free choice of vote on the amendment), the women of Forza Italia; some from Alleanza Nazionale.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Since the reform was designed to reorganise and modernise the country, it had to enclose the principles of gender mainstreaming and empowerment of women as elements of authentic democracy.**

Policy goals: **Promotion of equal opportunities in the policy areas assigned by the laws to the regions (labour market, economic development, etc.)**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Empowerment of women as elements of authentic democracy**

Policy goals: **Promotion of equal opportunities in the policy areas assigned by the laws to the regions (labour market, economic development, etc.)**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Regional legislation was placed on the same level as national State legislation**
2. **Regional laws are no longer submitted for government control although, should a regional law be considered contrary to the Constitution, it can be contested before the Constitutional Court.**
3. **State has exclusive legislative powers in the matters listed in detail: the list includes a regulation that gives the State the power to establish the basic levels of service in terms of civil and social rights that must be guaranteed throughout the country.**
4. **About thirty policy areas (including legislation concerning work and safety, education, pensions, health and commerce) are subject to ‘concurrent legislation’ by which the central State establishes the general principles of a given law, and the regions legislate within the established limits, although there is no list of issues on which the regions enjoy ‘exclusive’ legislative powers.**
5. **The law also contains reference to taxation federalism, including a commitment to economic solidarity for weaker regions that are at an economic disadvantage.**

6. **Administrative functions are entrusted to the municipalities, except in the case of metropolitan cities, provinces and regions when it is necessary to ensure consistent exercise of these functions, in line with the principle of subsidiarity.**
7. **The financial autonomy of local authorities is more pronounced. They are assigned not simply their own taxation rights and revenues; for now they have their own autonomous resources and establish and apply their own taxes and revenues as well as taking their share of the income from taxation from their own territory.**
8. **The law has a clear limitation: no representation of the regions is foreseen at the parliamentary level, through an upper chamber.**
9. **A clause concerning equal opportunities in terms of access to electoral posts was included. Indeed, Art. 3 of the law (which replaces the text of Art. 117 of the Constitution), clause 1, paragraph 7, states that regional laws shall remove all obstacles to equal opportunities between men and women in social, cultural and economic life, and promote equal opportunities for the access of women and men to electoral posts.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women MPs from all parties**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **In non women's movement organization (parliament: women MPs)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participate in floor debates and parliamentary deliberations; presentations to the d'Alema Commission.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

As was the case in other European countries, the factors that affected the reorganisation of local governments were, on the one hand, the crisis in the welfare state and, on the other, the demands made by pro autonomy forces.

After the 1996 elections, which brought good results for the Northern League, victory to the Olive Tree Coalition and the creation of a centre-left government, the reform on decentralisation became one of the priorities to be tackled. The debate outlined the need to decentralise and to simplify administrative and policy-making functions in order to make the State more efficient and citizen-friendly.

In 1997-98, a series of reforms (referred to as the 'Bassanini reforms' after the Minister for the Civil Service of the centre-left government headed by Prodi) provided for the decentralisation of State functions to the regions and local authorities while control and interference with local authorities were to be reduced. They provided for the devolution of functions from the centre to the periphery in particular areas of policy-making: economic development and production, the labour market, the territory, environment and infrastructures, services for the person and for the community, administration police.

In the same years (1997-1998), the constitutional reform of the State System was included in the third Bicameral Commission for Constitutional Reforms presided over by Massimo D'Alema, leader of the Democratic Party of the Left. The Commission drafted a number of proposals such as the assignment of full regulatory autonomy to the local authorities, fewer controls and the abolition of the System of State transfers. Even so, the crucial decisions that would lead to the effective exercise of power by the regions and local authorities were entrusted to the national parliament. Parliament could thus continue to establish the outline legislation for all areas of regional law and establish what level of government (municipality, province, region, state) should be responsible for each individual policy, regulate regional and local taxes and allocate equalizing transfers. Although the project intended to rename the second part of the Constitution as the 'federal organisation of the Republic' (the '*ordinamento federale della repubblica*'), it put forward a basically centralised structure, with administrative decentralisation stills Subject to the decisions taken by the centre. This was not a federalist re-formulation of the State. The creation of a second Chamber, a 'federal Senate' representative of local authorities, was strongly opposed by several sectors including most of the senators, groups of party leaders, trade unions and employers' associations, etc. The project put forward by the Commission was never approved by the Parliament due to disagreements between the political parties.

The starting date to be when the debate was launched in the Third bicameral Commission presided over by D'Alema), in other words in 1997. It is true that the text of the D'Alema Commission (which already contained the amendment on equal access to elective posts) was never approved by Parliament, but only by the Chamber of Deputies. Even so, the bill presented by the D'Alema government (signed by the President of the Cabinet Council, D'Alema, and Minister Amato in March 1999, which started off the parliamentary process that led to the adoption of the 2001 reform) took up the text already approved by the Bicameral Commission and contained the amendment on equal access to elective posts.

Since the text of the Bicameral Commission had not been approved by Parliament, the D'Alema government aimed to have it approved even if only with the majority of votes of the left-wing parties.

Parliamentary procedures got under way in March 1999 when the Commission for Institutional Affairs of the Chamber examined the draft law put forward by the D'Alema government.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

The dominant frame of the public actors that mobilized around the issue stressed the need to make the decision-making process more efficient and to democratize public policy, bringing it closer to the citizenry through greater autonomy of local powers. The dominant frame of the debate matched women's demands for increasing representation, both descriptive and substantial, as a matter of democracy.

The initial frame of the debate was about the necessary degree of decentralization. ‘Decentralisation’ is interpreted in different ways, ranging from a simple form of ‘advanced decentralisation’, more administrative than legislative, simply a method for bringing about reorganisation of the public and administrative system, to a concept of a ‘competitive federalism’ based on the political and legislative autonomy of the communities.

**C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women’s demands for increasing representation, both descriptive and substantial, as a matter of democracy.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Still the decentralization debate, but also the importance of paying attention to women and women’s representation in the regions of the decentralized System. Gender issues were mentioned in the debates in the Third Bicameral Commission for the reforms (1997-1998) and on the ‘Bassanini reforms’. The need for women to be involved in drafting the reform, both in the case of the Constitution, and in that of ordinary laws was outlined. The President of the Third Bicameral Commission, Massimo D’Alema, emphasized how there are too few women in the Commission and how this showed the ‘insufficient attention paid by political parties to the political and civic participation of women’. He again stressed the need for consultation with women representatives and with women in Parliament, so that the reform could be drafted with ‘the objective of obtaining a more open State, closer to its citizens, able to better respond to the needs of a society in the process of change’.

Following on from the 1999 law that established that the regional governments could adopt their own statutes, women’s advocates (women elected at local level, experts, women of political parties, femocrats) required that the new regional statutes should enclose, among their objectives, the achievement of gender equal opportunities in social, economic and political life and in access to regional elective posts.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Emphasized how there are too few women in the Commission and how this showed the insufficient attention paid by political parties to the political and civic participation of women.**
- Stressed the need for consultation with women representatives and with women in Parliament, so that the reform could be drafted with ‘the objective of obtaining a more open State, closer to its citizens, able to better respond to the needs of a society in the process of change.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCEO: Principle of gender balance should be included in the laws for the regions; new regional electoral laws should include suitable mechanisms to ensure equal access and equal presence of the two sexes (50/50) in the lists of candidates; regional statutes should include programmes and initiatives to ensure a balanced presence of

women and men at work, in care-taking activities, and in participation in social and cultural life.

MEO: Principle of gender balance should be included in the laws for the regions; new regional electoral laws should include suitable mechanisms to ensure equal access and equal presence of the two sexes (50/50) in the lists of candidates; regional statutes should include programmes and initiatives to ensure a balanced presence of women and men at work, in care-taking activities, and in participation in social and cultural life.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Equal access and equal presence of the two sexes (50/50) in the lists of candidates; regional statutes should include programmes and initiatives to ensure a balanced presence of women and men at work, in care-taking activities, and in participation in social and cultural life.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

NCEO: Provide guidance and consultation on the activities to be carried out to achieve equality between the sexes and equal opportunities for men and women.

MEO: Gender mainstreaming.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

NCEO: Advisory commission in the Prime Minister's office.

MEO: Cabinet level ministry without portfolio.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Sylvia Costa 1997-2000; Marina Piazza 2000-2002**

Years in WPA:

WMA Activity:

Costa: In the 1970s Silvia Costa had been 'Incaricata nazionale per le giovani del movimento femminile Dc (national director-officer for the young women's section in the Women's Movement of the Christian Democratic Party). In the 1980s she had been a member of the National Executive of the 'Movimento Femminile' (Women's Movement of the DC (Christian Democratic Party)) and, in the same decade, had been a member of the CNPPO, before becoming its president.

Silvia Costa had contributed to 'Donna e Società', the magazine of the Women's Movement of the DC.

Piazza: She was a feminist sociologist, academic (University of Rome) and active in gender research networks.

Starting from 1978, Piazza has been a member of GRIFF (Research Group on family issues and women's status) at the University of Milan (Laura Balbo has been a member of the same group).

Piazza has published several publications on women's issues.

Name: **Anna Finocchiaro**

Years in WPA: **1998-2001**

WMA Activity: **Before taking office as Minister for Equal Opportunities, she was a member of the ‘CoordiNamento nazionale donne DS’ (National Coordination of DS Women’), a body set up to promote the status and agenda of women in the party. She had no prominent role in the ‘National Coordination of DS women’.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The differences with the past are the product of an ongoing process of formalization of the organizational structure and professionalization. What remains from the past is, however, the prevalence of the decentralized small groups, with a strong capacity for networking.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equal political representation**
- **In vitro fertilization**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Social services**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Presidents of Regions**
- **La Conferenza Stato Regioni (*Conference State-Regions*)**
- **ANCI (*Associazione Comuni Italiani- Association of Italian Municipalities*)**
- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet**
- **Parliament**
- **Party leaders in the parliament.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Olive Tree Coalition of d’Amato (Left)

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men (Italy is a member)**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women (Italy not a member)**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995. (Italy participated)**
- **Socialist International Women’s Section (Italy has member organization)**
- **European Women’s Lobby (Italy has member organization. EWL founded 1990.**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 2

States Parties condemn discrimination against women in all its forms, agree to pursue by all appropriate means and without delay a policy of eliminating discrimination against women and, to this end, undertake:

- (a) To embody the principle of the equality of men and women in their national constitutions or other appropriate legislation if not yet incorporated therein and to ensure, through law and other appropriate means, the practical realization of this principle;**
- (b) To adopt appropriate legislative and other measures, including sanctions where appropriate, prohibiting all discrimination against women;**
- (c) To establish legal protection of the rights of women on an equal basis with men and to ensure through competent national tribunals and other public institutions the effective protection of women against any act of discrimination;**
- (d) To refrain from engaging in any act or practice of discrimination against women and to ensure that public authorities and institutions shall act in conformity with this obligation;**
- (e) To take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women by any person, organization or enterprise;**
- (f) To take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to modify or abolish existing laws, regulations, customs and practices which constitute discrimination against women.**

Debate ID: ITA_JT1 1983-84

Title: Job Training to Reduce Unemployment

WPA: National Committee for Equal Opportunities Ministry of Labor (NCEOML)

Dates of Coding: 5/27/05, 6/13/05, 12/1/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Women MPs in left wing parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are under represented in good jobs; training opportunities are unequal; need to overcome this.**

Policy goals: **Quota for women in work training contracts; also supported proposal regarding parity councilors to monitor implementation of equality principles in companies.**

WMA 2

Name: **Feminist groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are under represented in good jobs; training opportunities are unequal; need to overcome this; criticized the 1977 equality of treatment law because it did not provide mechanisms for retraining women in new skills and therefore reinforced existing roles in the market.**

Policy goals: **Quota for women in work training contracts.**

WMA 3

Name: **Women in trade unions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are under represented in good jobs; training opportunities are unequal; need to overcome this**

Policy goals: **Quota for women in work training contracts;**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women are under represented in good jobs; training opportunities are unequal; need to overcome this; criticized the 1977 equality of treatment law because it did not provide mechanisms for retraining women in new skills and therefore reinforced existing roles in the market.**

Policy goals: **Quota for women in work training contracts.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **In general, measures to support and increase levels of employment.**
2. **Regulation of solidarity contracts, training and work contracts, and part-time work.**

3. **Training programs were to be presented and approved by the Regional Labor Commission, in return for which firms received financial benefits.**
4. **Additional programs provided for particular target groups: unemployed young people, women and Southern Italians.**
5. **A measure to prevent sex discrimination in hiring**
6. **Parity councilors with no enforcement power, only consultative, were established in the Regional Labor commissions. No specific definition of their role and no oversight mechanism to make sure councilors were appointed.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Women MPs in left wing parties

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organizations (parties in parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the parliamentary debate.**

WMA 2 Feminist groups

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not participate in the debate.**

WMA 3 Women in trade unions

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Within non women's movement organizations (unions)**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not participate in the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Law 863/1984 on 'Urgent measures to sustain and increase employment levels' was adopted in order to address growing levels of unemployment caused by the economic crisis and restructuring of industry. Policymakers stressed the need to facilitate labor mobility and access by disadvantaged workers to jobs while introducing elements of flexibility into the market. The new law was preceded by an agreement on the labor costs dated 22 July 1983. It included a package of measures to ensure greater flexibility in the labor market. These included selective hiring for young people with training contracts and for half of all workers to be taken on, greater use of part-time work, and other innovations.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate focused on trying to reduce unemployment rates in the context of the economic crisis and the restructuring economy by facilitating ' labor mobility and access by disadvantaged workers to jobs while introducing elements of flexibility into the market. There was no mention of gender in the beginning of the debate.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The social partners agreed to a certain degree on the problem of unemployment and the solutions contained in the labor agreements and the new law. One of the major trade unions, the CGIL opposed cuts in automatic wage adjustments. Also, the other major trade union, the CISL, strongly favored targeting specifically youth unemployment through solidarity contracts. None of the other tri-partite actors opposed this position. There were no references to gender made in the general frame of the debate in the collective agreements in parliament, even though women members of parliament tried to introduce amendments to address the greater participation of women in training programs and to bring in parity councilors that would oversee the new training contracts in terms of gender equality.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCEOML: proposal for amendment on a parity councilor to sit on the Regional Labor commissions that would have authority to oversee that job training programs would address gender equality.

C5A_3—WPA feminist Micro Frames

No feminist Frames.

The idea came from the EC program of action; not based on micro frame analysis of gender inequality and improving the status of women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

All measures to achieve equal employment between men and women

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

attached to the Ministry of Labor. It includes representatives of trade unions, employer associations and social movements; advisory to the Minister of Labor.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Elena Marinucci**

Years in WPA: **1983-84**

WMA activity: **Fellow traveler in Socialist party.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement was in decline and job training was given low priority. By the beginning of the 1980s, mass feminist mobilization had come to an end and the feminist movement began to experience an internal and external crisis.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Women's identity and sexuality**
- **Violence against women**
- **Reconciling family and professional life**
- **Equality and no discrimination at work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Weak

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

For the Collective Agreement and Social Pact:

Trade Unions, Employer Associations, Cabinet of the Labor Minister

For the Law

MP's Two Houses of Parliament and Five Party Coalition Cabinet under

Craxi

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

**Christian Democrats, Socialists (PM a Socialist); Liberals; Social Democrats;
Republican Party**

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Further development of the equal employment TAN at the EU member state level

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment to ensure on the basis of equality of men and women, the same rights; in particular:

Inter alia

Right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: ITA_JT2 1993-1997

Title: Vocational Training in Employment Framework Law

WPAs: Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Committee for Equal Opportunities in Ministry of Labor (NCEOML); National Commission for Equal Opportunities in the Prime Minister's Office (NCEOPM)

Date of Coding: 6/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Women's Movement Advocates**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Provide work opportunities for women.**

Policy goals: **Proposals for flexibility in work (temporary work, part time, job sharing, etc.), which was seen as an opportunity to reduce unemployment; discussions of developing entrepreneurial activities by women.**

WMA 2

Name **Women's Advocates**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Provide work opportunities for women.**

Policy goals: **Part time work is bad for women: saw it as pushing women out of mainstream employment, excluding them from better jobs, and making them into housewives.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

The 'Treu package' codified by the Framework Law of June 1997 on regulations promoting employment based on national-level tri-partite agreement signed in September, 1996 and protocol of understanding signed by the social partner in July 1993

- 1. In general it focused on the concept of vocational training as an active policy for promoting new employment in the context of new measures to increase labor market flexibility.**
- 2. Created new part-time jobs**
- 3. Established incentives for reducing working hours and making jobs more flexible**
- 4. Restructured vocational training and targeted apprenticeships, job placement, and initial and continuing training.**
- 5. Decentralized vocational training planning and coordination to regions and to the local level by the establishment of new organizations that oversaw training and placement issues.**

6. **Principles of non discrimination, stipulated in the 1991 equal opportunity law, need to be applied to work and training programs (but not the Equality Clause)**
7. **Women's advocates to be formally brought in implementation. Formally assigned the Minister of Equal Opportunities to participate in the design of new implementation regulations.**
8. **Parity councilors were also to be included in the new local bodies that oversaw vocational and job training programs.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Women's Movement Advocates

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing outside of the policy sub-system, collective bargaining**

Activities During the Debate: **Took positions in the media and the press.**

WMA 2 Women's Advocates

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing outside of the policy sub-system, collective bargaining**

Activities During the Debate: **Took positions in the media and the press.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After the intervention of 1993, the problem of reorganizing vocational and job training acquired increasing importance in the political and economic debate; so much that, in the summer of 1996, the Minister of Labor and the Minister of Public Education jointly presented the social partners and the government with a project for sweeping and innovative reform of training and school education, which was to be included in the labor pact the following September. What made that agreement particularly significant was the interconnection between the innovation provided for in training and employment and the new measures to be taken in setting up and organizing school curricula. It finally appeared that there was now an awareness that it would not be possible to reform vocational and job training without affecting the old education system.

As far as professional qualifications were concerned, the July 1996 agreement provided for the extension of apprenticeship contracts to all sectors of production (and thus to agriculture too), a review of the framework law of 1978 and the introduction of continuing training (*formazione continua*), using a company contribution of 0.30% of total wages. For education, the agreement outlined the basic principles for the reform of the school system, particularly by raising compulsory education to the age of 16, the establishment of a National Fund for the right to study at university, a reform of the tax system and an increase in the amount of resources earmarked for research and innovation. Post compulsory school training curricula were then to be reorganized into different channels: one for those who intended to continue their studies and another with a very work-oriented content, closely linked to the world of industry.

All these proposals were accepted in the first part of the labor pact in September 1996. But the September agreement went beyond these proposals. It fully took-up the concept of vocational training as an active policy for promoting new employment. With this in mind, the main aim was to shift investment and planning initiatives from initial training, on which the Italian System relies completely, towards continuing and in-service training which, had always played an ancillary role. Continuing training should involve managers, executives, office and shop-floor workers throughout their careers. The agreement did not define a precise model, but it laid out some principles in a very flexible context, paving the way for effective coordination between the institutions which are to any extent responsible (State, the regions, local authorities, associations). Continuing training was linked to the development of a system for formal recognition of training credits. In-service training on the other hand was associated with tools such as leave, sabbaticals, and training scholarships which were already widely used in the most important European countries.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate focused on how to re-organize vocational training to promote new employment and improve the general employment situation. There was no mention of gender issues in the beginning of the debate with the adoption of the first protocol of understanding in 1993.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

The debate focused on four major themes: ‘the need to make the labor market more flexible; the need to provide measures to safeguard the interests of disadvantaged groups; the need to reform the education and vocational training system; and the need to decentralized employment policy planning and implementation. In spite of the introduction of an equality clause in the 1996 agreement there were no efforts to gender the public debates. Gender issues were not raised in the debates on the 1997 law either, even though there had been an equality clause in the tri-partite agreement that had preceded the law. The parliamentarians neither discussed the gender issues raised by the clause nor carried over the clause into the final law. As one parliamentarian asserted there was a whole series of silent forms of resistance to the inclusion of the equality clause on part of all of the policy actors involved with law in the cabinet and the bureaucracy.

There is also evidence that the debate was Gendered in the social partner Sub-system where the 1996 pact included ideas of gender mainstreaming goals from EU and indicated a shift from defining women’s policies at the margins of employment politics, as a means of addressing a disadvantaged group, to bringing gender equality into the core of continued training issue.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Ideas of gender mainstreaming goals from EU indicated a shift from defining women's policies at the margins of employment politics, as a means of addressing a disadvantaged group, to bringing gender equality into the core of continued training issue.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA1 Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO)

Within the context of a formal mainstreaming approach, developed measure to integrate a gender viewpoint in the implementation of all employment measures with a strong emphasis on promoting a culture of gender difference. Specific programs included funding for women' employment in areas of the country in economic crisis and Southern Italy; job training programs tailored for women to promote the transition from school to work and the promotion of women owned business.

**WPA 2 National Committee for Equal Opportunities (Ministry of Labor)—
 NCEOML**

**WPA3 National Commission for Equal Opportunities (Prime Ministers Office) –
 NCEOPM**

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 MEO Pursued a mainstreaming approach to gender in the area of all policies adopted by the government.

WPA 2 NCEOML To promote equality in area of employment

WPA 3 NCEOPM Promote equality between the sexes.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 MEO Minister without portfolio

WPA 2 NCEOML Advisory to the Minister/Ministry of Labor

WPA 3 NCEOPM In the Prime Minister's Office

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 MEO

Name: Anna Finocchiaro

Years in WPA: 1995-1997

WMA Activity: None

WPA 2 NCEOML

Name:

Years in WPA:

WMA Activity: **Yes**

WPA 3 NCEOPM

Name: **Livia Turco**Years in WPA: **1994-97**WMA Activities: **No**

C13A_1—Dates, evidence, citation for wma stage

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence: **The characteristics of the women's movement at the time of the debate on IVF (1996-99) were quite different from those in previous controversies on abortion in Italy. Indeed, a strong autonomous feminist movement no longer existed. Although feminists organized demonstrations, they lost their capacity to mobilize public support. Rather, the movement was at the consolidation stage as, with increases in the number of women secretaries of state, femocrats, an feminist advisers, gender issues and concepts became part of the state.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Positive actions**
- **Reconciling family and professional life**
- **Social services**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Weak counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

For the Collective Agreement and Social Pact:**Trade Unions, Employer Associations, Cabinet of the Labor Minister****For the Law:****Two Houses of Parliament and Cabinet**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

There was a center-left coalition in power that included the Communists.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Equal Employment TAN at the EU level

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment to ensure on the basis of equality of men and women, the same rights; in particular:

Inter alia

Right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: ITA_PR1 1989-91

Title: Creation of Democratic Party of the Left

QUAWPA: National Commission for Women's Emancipation and Liberation (NCWEL)

Dates of Coding: 11/22/05, 12/02/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Individual activists in the PCI/PDS; prominent women in the party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are a unique group with particular interests that can only be represented by women. Power of women can only come from women themselves.**

Policy Goals **Quotas for women in party decision-making bodies and candidate lists and inclusion of point of view of women in party program.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **A new party was formed with a new name, symbol, ideology and organization. The demands for women's representation were accepted, as seen in three features of the regulations adopted in 1991:**
 - i. **The PDS defined itself as a party of women and men that proposed to create a society made to the measure of both sexes and achieving full equal opportunities between women and men.**
 - ii. **It established quotas for the representation of women in all party's decision-making bodies, delegations at congresses, and in candidate lists (in which neither of the sexes could be represented by less than 40%.**
 - iii. **The PDS provided for the establishment of women's committees and sections within the party.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Individual activists in the PCI/PDS; prominent women in the party**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Worked to gender the debate in the party at the Rimini conference and other party meetings.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The renovation of the PCI (Communist Party) was on the party's agenda all through the 1980s, particularly after the death of its charismatic leader, Enrico Berlinguer, in 1984. During those years, the party experienced repeated electoral defeats (1979, 1983, 1987), as well as loss of membership. It was confined to political opposition and had no chances of participation in national government. The

Socialist Party (PSI) led by Bettino Craxi fiercely opposed an alliance with the PCI. The PSI was in government in a coalition made up by centre parties. Until Achille Occhetto was appointed its party secretary (1988), the PCI internal organization rested on the principle of ‘democratic centralism’ a characteristic of the Marxist-Leninist party. The distinctive features of the organisation were a strong centralization of the decision-making process, the subjection of deliberative to executive organs, the control from above and prohibition of any dissident group or faction. The fall of the Berlin wall and the collapse of the Eastern communist regimes accelerated the process of reform. In 1989 Occhetto presented a proposal, to be discussed at the next party congress. The proposal was to create a new reformist party. The new party would differ greatly from the Marxist Leninist working-class party of the previous years. It would accept the logic of the free market economy and would be a reformist party, similar to the Social Democratic parties of other European countries.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning the debate focused on whether or not to abandon ideological and organizational tradition along with name and symbol of the PCI. The question divided the party and the debate led to the formation of two new political forces. The debate was gendered by women from the beginning. In 1986, the women’s section of the PCI published a document that stated the ‘power of women can only come from women themselves’...only women can represent women since sexual differences must be considered as one of the elements upon which society is founded. When the PCI began its reformation, the women demanded both descriptive and substantive representation.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Power of women can only come from women themselves. Only women can represent women since sexual differences must be considered as one of the elements upon which society is founded.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

By the end, the PDS debate focused on the ideological redefinition of the party and on the reform of internal organization to bring about democratization of the decision-making process, a streamlining of the bureaucratic apparatus and a turnover of the political elite. Matters concerning political representation included the procedures for the election of decision-making bodies, the selection of candidates, and promotion of members’ participation in decision-making. A central issue was ‘who’ the party should represent and how representation should be guaranteed in a bottom up rather than top down decision-making process. The new party embraced as its fundamental values freedom, equality and equal opportunities. Therefore, women’s demands for representation were compatible.

Women activists, officials and MPs wanted the PDS to include quotas for women in the party’s decision-making bodies and candidate lists and also wanted women’s point of view expressed in the party program. A number of party leaders and

officials, other than those in the women's section, were supportive because they thought it would help consolidate the party's new image and attract women voters.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Include quotas for women in the party's decision-making bodies and candidate lists**
- **Women's point of view should be expressed in the party program**
- **Quotas and more women would help consolidate the party's new image and attract women voters.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCWEL (QUAWPA): Only women can represent women since sexual difference must be considered as one of the elements upon which society is founded.' Wanted descriptive and substantive representation. Advocated quotas and expression of women's point of view in PDS policy program.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Its task was advocacy for women in the party: to make decisions about proposals submitted by the Central Committee, about the convening agenda of the CC, and to propose criteria for the inclusion of women in candidate lists.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

A section of the PCI; Advisory to the Central Committee, the executive body of the party.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Livia Turco**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Active for women's issues during her political career according to her website bio.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **During the period of the debate, the women's movement was re-emerging, but it was fragmented, divided into two broad segments of integrated and autonomous feminisms. Heir to the 1970s, autonomous feminists were active in local women's projects and important cultural centres.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Positive actions**
- **Reconciling family and professional life**

- **Social services**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **PCI party leaders and members**
- **NCWEL**
- **Some MPs.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Coalition of the Christian Democrat party, the Socialist Party, the Social-democrat party, the Liberals and Left-wing Independents.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men (Italy is a member)**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women (Italy not a member)**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995. (Italy participated)**
- **Socialist International Women's Section (Italy has member organization)**
- **European Women's Lobby (Italy has member organization.) EWL founded 1990.**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: ITA_PR2 1991-93

Title: Quotas in Electoral Law

WPA: National Committee for Equal Opportunity Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/22/05, 11/30/05, 12/01/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Livia Turco, prominent PDS MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Adoption of a majority system would penalize women's representation.**

Policy Goals **Gender quotas in new electoral system.**

WMA2

Name: **Fidapa, Italian Women in the Arts, Business and the Professions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Fidapa argued that the problem of the lack of female representatives was indicative of the glass ceiling, which prevented women from being promoted to powerful positions.**

Policy goals:

WMA 3

Name: **Donne in carriera, Women Entrepreneuers**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the problem of the lack of female representatives was indicative of the glass ceiling, which prevented women from being promoted to powerful positions.**

Policy Goals :

Donne in carriera supported policies that sought to increase the political representation of women.

WMA 4

Name: **Aidda, Women entrepreneurs and managers**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the problem of the lack of female representatives was indicative of the glass ceiling, which prevented women from being promoted to powerful positions.**

Policy Goals :

Aidda supported policies that sought to increase the political representation of women.

WMA 5

Name: **Libreria delle Donne**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Libreria delle Donne argued that the problem of the lack of female representatives could be attributed to the fact that women were not interested in politics, and that women's politics were different than men's politics. Libreria delle Donne argued that overturning the current system was the solution to the problem.**

Policy Goals :

Libreria delle Donne were hostile to quotas, arguing that they were useless in trying to improve the representation of women.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Argued that the problem of the lack of female representatives was indicative of the glass ceiling, which prevented women from being promoted to powerful positions.**

Policy Goals : **Supported policies that sought to increase the political representation of women.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The law established that 25% of the seats in the Chamber of Deputies would be assigned through a proportional representation system, while the remaining 75% of the seats would be assigned through a majority representational system. The law also included a clause which stated that women and men had to be represented on party lists in alternate order, called 'zipping'.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Livia Turco**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Advocated a provision for gender quotas in new electoral laws; one of the centre-left MPs who first submitted the quota proposal to the Commissione affari costituzionali.**

WMA 2 **Fidapa**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Fidapa sponsored conferences, debates, and courses on politics for women and supported the initiative for a quota.**

WMA 3 **Donne in carriera**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Donne Cariera sponsored conferences, debates, and courses on politics for women and supported the initiative for a quota.**

WMA 4 **Aidda**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Sponsored conferences, debates, and courses on politics for women and supported the initiative for a quota.**

WMA 5 **Libreria della Donne**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Libreria delle Donne participated in the debate by making their opinions public.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Changes in the voting system for the election of local and national assemblies was on the agenda since the end of the 1970s. In the 1980s a parliamentary ‘Joint Commission for Reforms’ was set up to address the issue. Due to disagreements between political parties no decision was adopted on the type of the electoral system to be chosen. So, a ‘Committee of electoral reforms’ was created in 1990 to get the reform adopted by a referendum. The first referendum in 1991, approved the reduction of the number of preferences votes from three or four to one. 1992 upheavals accelerated the reform process. In March 1993, the National Assembly approved a new electoral system for the election of mayors, municipal councilors, the presidents of provincial governments and provincial councilors. In April 1993, a second referendum concerning electoral laws was held. This referendum proposed the elimination of a short clause in the existing electoral law for Senate that would have made it impossible to possible to transform the electoral system for the Senate into a primarily majority system. Considerable participation in the referendum and the high number of votes in favor of the reform compelled parties to implement the Senate reform according to the will of the voters, but also change the voting system for the Lower Chamber.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate focused on the electoral ramifications of the changes in electoral laws. In mainstream debate, the key word was ‘governability’ and the need to have safer, more stable parliamentary majorities. The objectives were the creation of alternating party coalitions in government; direct responsibility of representatives to their electors, who chose them on the basis of their personality and qualities; weakening the dominion of the party ‘barons’ and the entire party organizations.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate became gendered. Many participants in the debate recognized that women were underrepresented in the Italian parliament. Proponents of the changes to the electoral laws argued that there should be quotas for the sexes to ensure greater representation of women on party lists.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women were underrepresented in the Italian parliament**
- **There should be quotas for the sexes to ensure greater representation of women on party lists**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCEO: Advocated quotas to overcome women's underrepresentation and supported goals of the integrated women's movement.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

NCEO: Promoting equality between sexes, eliminating any direct and indirect discriminations against women and any obstacles limiting equality.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

NCEO: Acts as an advisory and supporting body to the government in general, and to the PM in particular through proposals pursuing adjustment of laws and rules governing social, economic, and cultural policies to the equality principle.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Tina Anselmi**

Years in WPA: **1989-94**

WMA activity: **Fellow traveler; perhaps active in Christian Democratic circles.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **During the period of the debate, the women's movement was re-emerging, but it was fragmented, divided into two broad segments of integrated and autonomous feminisms. Heir to the 1970s, autonomous feminists were active in local women's projects and important cultural centres.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Positive actions**
- **Reconciling family and professional life**
- **Social services**
- **Violence against women**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Moderately strong counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **PM/Cabinet MPs**
- **CNPPO**

- **Party leaders**
- **Senate and chamber committees**
- **Constitutional court**
- **The Committee for Electoral Reform (COREL), which collected signatures to promote the referendum on the reform of the electoral system for the Senate, proposing the abrogation of a paragraph in the existing law. The COREL included some representatives of government parties (while most members of the government parties were against any modification to the law)**
- **Most members of the PDS**
- **Many members of Confindustria – the general confederation of Italian industries – of the trade unions, and of associations such as ACLI (Christian associations of Italian workers), of other Catholic associations, and women’s association such as ANDE (the association of women electors).**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Coalition of the Christian Democrat party, the Socialist Party, the Social-democrat party, the Liberals and Left-wing Independents.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men (Italy is a member)**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women (Italy not a member)**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995.(Italy participated)**
- **Socialist International Women’s Section (Italy has member organization)**
- **European Women’s Lobby (Italy has member organization. EWL founded 1990.)**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) **To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: ITA_PR3 1999-2003

Title: Affirmative action Amendment to Constitution

WPAs: Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/22/05, 11/30/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Claudia Mancina, DS (formerly PDS) MP**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition/ **The law should promote equality of access for both women and men to public posts and elective office.**

Policy Goals **Amendment of the constitution to allow for affirmative action.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women MPs in the centre parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **It is necessary to achieve equal representation by gender as this means:**

– **bridging the gap in democracy and making the political system more open to the requirements of all, and therefore more democratic;**

- **bringing Italy into line with other European countries, where the presence of women in decision-making positions has increased over recent years;**

- **responding to the requests put forward by the UN and the EU.**

It's a question of justice: women are a majority among electors, but they are absent in decision-making positions.

Policy Goals: **Amendment to constitution to allow affirmative action.**

WMA 3

Name: **Left-wing women MPs**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Greater emphasis on the fact that women are different and that, if there were more women in decision-making positions, they would be able to:**

- **represent the demands and interests of women, which cannot be fully represented by men alone;**

- **improve the quality of democracy. Women are more pragmatic, and closer to the needs of everyday life. Women could therefore bring greater attention to the demands and needs of citizens into decision-making arenas, tackling the issues in a more concrete and effective manner.**

A greater presence of women in decision-making positions might help put politics back in touch with citizens once again, at a time when there is less participation in politics, and encourage greater involvement.

It is said that women are not interested in politics and take part in it even less. This happens because women perceive politics as a male-dominated preserve, a world

that excludes them. If women were more present in decision-making arenas, this would encourage them to participate more and be more involved.

A recurrent argument among women in left-wing parties, and in *associations* linked to these parties is that it is necessary to increase not only the *quantity* of women in decision-making arenas, but also to monitor the *quality* of the women entering elected bodies. Elected women need to work hard to improve the quality of political work and bring politics more in line with the demands and needs of the population.
Policy Goals Amendment of the constitution to allow for affirmative action.

WMA 4

Name: **Women MPs in the right wing parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They supported the amendment in order to achieve equal opportunities, and because it is not right that there should be so few women in decision-making positions.**

A recurrent argument was the following:

It is true that women do not need special safeguards, but it is also true that if it is necessary to wait for attitudes to change or for men to make room for women, one would have to wait for too many years. Italy is behind other advanced democracies and also with regard to the recommendations made by the United Nations and the EU. The reform of Art. 51 enables quotas to be adopted: these are a necessary step to be adopted as a transitional measure until the system is normalised.

Policy goals: **Amendment to the constitution to allow for affirmative action.**

WMA 5

Name: **Women experts in constitutional law**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They supported the reform with arguments based on the concept of equality.**

A recurrent argument was the following: The law must reflect changes in society. It is necessary to adopt regulations that guarantee equal representation by gender to adapt the law to the different and decisive role that women now play in society.

Policy Goals: **Amendment to the constitution to allow affirmative action for women.**

WMA 6

Name: **Il Branco Rosa', close to Forza Italia**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They supported the amendment in order to achieve equal opportunities, and because it is not right that there should be so few women in decision-making positions.**

A recurrent argument was the following:

It is true that women do not need special safeguards, but it is also true that if it is necessary to wait for attitudes to change or for men to make room for women, one would have to wait for too many years. Italy is behind other advanced democracies and also with regard to the recommendations made by the United Nations and the

EU. The reform of Art. 51 enables quotas to be adopted: these are a necessary step to be adopted as a transitional measure until the system is normalised.

Policy goals: **Amendment to the constitution to allow for affirmative action.**

WMA 6

Name: **FIDAPA (the women's federation in the arts and professions),**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They supported the amendment in order to achieve equal opportunities, and because it is not right that there should be so few women in decision-making positions.**

A recurrent argument was the following:

It is true that women do not need special safeguards, but it is also true that if it is necessary to wait for attitudes to change or for men to make room for women, one would have to wait for too many years. Italy is behind other advanced democracies and also with regard to the recommendations made by the United Nations and the EU. The reform of Art. 51 enables quotas to be adopted: these are a necessary step to be adopted as a transitional measure until the system is normalised.

Policy goals: **Amendment to the constitution to allow for affirmative action.**

WMA 7

Name: **ANDE (the national association of women voters)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They supported the amendment in order to achieve equal opportunities, and because it is not right that there should be so few women in decision-making positions.**

A recurrent argument was the following:

It is true that women do not need special safeguards, but it is also true that if it is necessary to wait for attitudes to change or for men to make room for women, one would have to wait for too many years. Italy is behind other advanced democracies and also with regard to the recommendations made by the United Nations and the EU. The reform of Art. 51 enables quotas to be adopted: these are a necessary step to be adopted as a transitional measure until the system is normalised.

Policy goals: **Amendment to the constitution to allow for affirmative action.**

WMA 8

Name: **Emily-Italia left**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Greater emphasis on the fact that women are different and that, if there were more women in decision-making positions, they would be able to:**

- represent the demands and interests of women, which cannot be fully represented by men alone;

- improve the quality of democracy. Women are more pragmatic, and closer to the needs of everyday life. Women could therefore bring greater attention to the demands and needs of citizens into decision-making arenas, tackling the issues in a more concrete and effective manner.

A greater presence of women in decision-making positions might help put politics back in touch with citizens once again, at a time when there is less participation in politics, and encourage greater involvement.

It is said that women are not interested in politics and take part in it even less. This happens because women perceive politics as a male-dominated preserve, a world that excludes them. If women were more present in decision-making arenas, this would encourage them to participate more and be more involved.

A recurrent argument among women in left-wing parties, and in *associations* linked to these parties is that it is necessary to increase not only the *quantity* of women in decision-making arenas, but also to monitor the *quality* of the women entering elected bodies. Elected women need to work hard to improve the quality of political work and bring politics more in line with the demands and needs of the population. Policy Goals Amendment of the constitution to allow for affirmative action.

WMA 9

Name: UDI left

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Greater emphasis on the fact that women are different and that, if there were more women in decision-making positions, they would be able to:**

- represent the demands and interests of women, which cannot be fully represented by men alone;

- improve the quality of democracy. Women are more pragmatic, and closer to the needs of everyday life. Women could therefore bring greater attention to the demands and needs of citizens into decision-making arenas, tackling the issues in a more concrete and effective manner.

A greater presence of women in decision-making positions might help put politics back in touch with citizens once again, at a time when there is less participation in politics, and encourage greater involvement.

It is said that women are not interested in politics and take part in it even less. This happens because women perceive politics as a male-dominated preserve, a world that excludes them. If women were more present in decision-making arenas, this would encourage them to participate more and be more involved.

A recurrent argument among women in left-wing parties, and in *associations* linked to these parties is that it is necessary to increase not only the *quantity* of women in decision-making arenas, but also to monitor the *quality* of the women entering elected bodies. Elected women need to work hard to improve the quality of political work and bring politics more in line with the demands and needs of the population. Policy Goals Amendment of the constitution to allow for affirmative action.

WMA 10

Name: ARCI Donna left

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Greater emphasis on the fact that women are different and that, if there were more women in decision-making positions, they would be able to:**

- represent the demands and interests of women, which cannot be fully represented by men alone;

- improve the quality of democracy. Women are more pragmatic, and closer to the needs of everyday life. Women could therefore bring greater attention to the demands and needs of citizens into decision-making arenas, tackling the issues in a more concrete and effective manner.

A greater presence of women in decision-making positions might help put politics back in touch with citizens once again, at a time when there is less participation in politics, and encourage greater involvement.

It is said that women are not interested in politics and take part in it even less. This happens because women perceive politics as a male-dominated preserve, a world that excludes them. If women were more present in decision-making arenas, this would encourage them to participate more and be more involved.

A recurrent argument among women in left-wing parties, and in *associations* linked to these parties is that it is necessary to increase not only the *quantity* of women in decision-making arenas, but also to monitor the *quality* of the women entering elected bodies. Elected women need to work hard to improve the quality of political work and bring politics more in line with the demands and needs of the population. Policy Goals: Amendment of the constitution to allow for affirmative action.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **It is said that women are not interested in politics and take part in it even less. This happens because women perceive politics as a male-dominated preserve, a world that excludes them. If women were more present in decision-making arenas, this would encourage them to participate more and be more involved.**

Policy goals: **Constitutional amendment.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **To the statement ‘All citizens of either sex can have access to public offices and elective posts under equal conditions’ it added the following sentence: ‘For this purpose the Republic promotes, by means of special measures, equal opportunities for women and men’. It gave policymakers the power to adopt adequate measures to promote equal opportunities in access to elective bodies.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Claudia Mancina, DS (formerly PDS) MP**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **In non women’s movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Proposed first bill, along with other center-left MPs.**

WMA 2 **Women MPs in the centre parties**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **In non women’s movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Proposed first bill, along with other center-left MPs.**

WMA 3 Left-wing women MPs**Form: Individual****Location: In non women's movement organization (parliament)****Activities During the Debate: Proposed first bill, along with other center-left MPs.****WMA 4 women MPs in the right wing parties****Form: Individual****Location: In non women's movement organization (parliament)****Activities During the Debate: Participate in parliamentary deliberations.****WMA 5 Women experts in constitutional law****Form: Individual****Location: In non women's movement organization (parliament)****Activities During the Debate: Promoted debate, helped in proposal of first bill.****WMA 6 Il Branco Rosa', close to Forza Italia****Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing****Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform. They also put pressure on women MPs.****WMA 7 FIDAPA (the women's federation in the arts and professions),****Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing****Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform. They also put pressure on women MPs.****WMA 8 ANDE (the national association of women voters****Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing****Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform. They also put pressure on women MPs.****WMA 9 Emily-Italia left****Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing****Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform. They also put pressure on women MPs.**

WMA 10 UDI left**Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform.

They also put pressure on women MPs.

WMA 11 ARCI Donna left**Form: Formal organization****Location: Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: Promoted a series of initiatives (conferences, seminars, and meetings, television debates, newspaper articles, etc.) to raise public awareness about the need to adopt the amendment and to give support for the reform.

They also put pressure on women MPs.

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After the 1995 decision by the Constitutional Court as the number of women elected at all levels continued to drop, a debate began on the need to modify the Constitution in order to make it possible to adopt affirmative action without stirring up controversies about its constitutionality. The success achieved by the ‘parity movement’ in France in obtaining in 1999 a constitutional amendment that made it possible to adopt positive actions in the electoral laws to guarantee sex equality in the candidate lists gave impetus to the debate. A number of Constitution revision bills were put forward to introduce the principle according to which the law should promote equality of access for both women and men to public posts and elective offices. The first bill (2 March 1999) was proposed by Claudia Mancina, a DS MP, together with other centre-left members of both chambers. Other bills were subsequently introduced by MPs of the centre-left parties. In 2001, when Berlusconi was the head of government, a bill was submitted, signed by various members of the government: by Prime Minister Berlusconi himself and by the Minister for Equal Opportunities, Stefania Prestigiacomo (Forza Italia) and the Minister for Constitutional Reform, Umberto Bossi (Lega Nord).

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

After the rejection of quotas by the constitutional court, the number of women in elected office declined, causing women to be further under-represented. Those in favor of the constitutional amendment argued for equality, equal opportunity and democracy. They supported affirmative measures to counteract the effects of the new electoral systems and parties’ resistance to select women candidates. By this time, even center-right parties, who had previously opposed affirmative action, were supportive because they saw how difficult it was to increase women’s representation, and saw it declining. There was not much opposition because the amendment stated a general principle, not a plan of action, and allowed the center-right parties and government to seem woman-friendly without committing to a specific plan of action like quotas. Therefore, there was no argument against the

amendment. The debate was inherently gendered as it concerned a law designed to promote equal representation of both sexes.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Women are under represented**
- **Difficult to raise women's representation without positive measures**
- **Should be equal representation of both sexes.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

The frame of the debate was the same throughout. It remained the same as above.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women are under represented**
- **Difficult to raise women's representation without positive measures**
- **Should be equal representation of both sexes.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

MEO: Necessary to amend the Constitution, in order to adopt affirmative action in the electoral laws to guarantee equal opportunities of access to elective positions, especially for the following reasons:

- because a more balanced presence of women and men in decision-making arenas is essential for the full achievement of democracy.

NCEO: Maintained it was necessary to amend the Constitution, in order to adopt affirmative action in the electoral laws to guarantee equal opportunities of access to elective positions, especially for the following reasons:

- because a more balanced presence of women and men in decision-making arenas is essential for the full achievement of democracy;

- it applies the principle of equality decreed by the Constitution (the under-representation of women violates the principle of equality provided for by the Constitution);

- it gives greater legitimacy to the institutions by making them stronger, more open, and more authoritative;

- it makes the institutions more representative since they are closer to the social composition of the country, which consists of both men and women;

- there is no justice in the fact that, while women are making advances in all social fields, they are still excluded from political representation;

- Italy must conform to the recommendations of the UN and the EU, which have made the equal representation of women and men a priority objective.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

There is no justice in the fact that, while women are making advances in all social fields, they are still excluded from political representation.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: Mainstreaming the principle of equal opportunities in all policies adopted by the government.

NCEO: Provide guidance and consultation on the activities to be carried out to achieve equality between the sexes and equal opportunities for men and women. It had a purely advisory mandate on all issues not concerning employment.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

MEO: Minister without portfolio in the Cabinet

NCEO: advisory and supporting body to the government in general, and to the PM in particular through proposals pursuing adjustment of laws and rules Governing social, economic, and cultural policies to the equality principle.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

MEO:

Name: **Stefania Prestigiacomo**

Years in WPA:

WMA experience: **Not involved in the feminist movement. A member of Forza Italia.**

NCEO:

Name: **Marina Piazza**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **She was a feminist sociologist, academic (University of Rome) and active in gender research networks.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The differences with the past are the product of an ongoing process of formalization of the organizational structure and professionalization. What remains from the past is, however, the prevalence of the decentralized small groups, with a strong capacity for networking.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equal political representation**
- **In vitro fertilization**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Social services**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Experts**
- **MPs**

- **Political parties**
- **WPAs**
- **Government/ministers**
- **Chamber and senate committees.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Debate started during center-left government and ended during a government composed of Forza Italia, Alleanza Nazionale, Lega, and CCD-CDU.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAN on gender balance in decision-making through the EU, Council of Europe and UN**
- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men (Italy is a member)**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women (Italy not a member)**
- **United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, September 4-15, 1995.(Italy participated)**
- **Socialist International Women's Section (Italy has member organization)**
- **European Women's Lobby (Italy has member organization. EWL founded 1990.)**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: ITA_PT1 1996-99

Title: Protection for Victims of Trafficking

WPAs: Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/24/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Feminist scholars**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Minimal intervention by law on questions that should be left to the free choice and conscience of the individual. Counteract pervasiveness and inefficiency of the Italian legal system.**

Policy goals: **In defense of the Merlin law.**

WMA 2

Name: **MEP Maria Paola Colombo Svevo of Italian People's Party; president of NGO IRENE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Promoted actions against trafficking based on promotion of equality opportunities and help to women escaping forced prostitution; had abolitionist stand.**

Policy goals: **Supported measures against trafficking.**

WMA 3

Name: **IRENE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Abolitionist policy; help to women trying to escape forced prostitution.**

WMA 4

Name: **Feminist NGOs**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Trafficked women are victims of male violence.**

Policy goals: **Issue protection permits for trafficked women.**

WMA 5

Name: **Women's Shelter workers (also called *Centri antiviolenza*)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Empower women who have experienced violence by having them make their own decisions about how to deal with their batterers.**

Policy goals: **Some activists in these shelters, which were originally based on volunteer work by feminists (and still partly so), joined the voices to demand state intervention for victims of trafficking to allow them to stay in the country, even if they do not denounce their traffickers.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Promotion of equality opportunities; prostitution is oppression of women; trafficked women are victims of male violence**

Policy goals: **Defense of Merlin law; help trafficking victims escape force prostitution.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The law raises the penalties for recruiting and trafficking foreigners with the intent of exploiting them as prostitutes or inducing them into the exploitation of prostitution.**
2. **The law grants victims of traffickers in general, not only for prostitution, a permission to stay and work or study in the country. These protection permits are granted by the Questore on humanitarian grounds, and their only condition is that the victim must follow special courses for job training.**
3. **The law gives funding to programs aimed at helping victims of trafficking leave prostitution.**
4. **The conditions for protection under the Turco law is that the victims have to show that they are indeed victims of trafficking and they must renounce prostitution and discontinue their involvement in it.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Feminist scholars**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **In non women's movement organizations (universities/ journals)**

Activities During the Debate:

WMA 2 **MEP Maria Paola Colombo Svevo of Italian People's Party; president of NGO IRENE**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **In non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in promoting new measures against trafficking in parliament.**

WMA 3 **IRENE**

Form: **Organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Took public stand on the issue.**

WMA 4 **Feminist NGOs**

Form: **Organizations**

Location: **Formal**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public in the media.**

WMA 5 Women's Shelter workersForm: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public in the media.****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

The idea of granting protection permits for victims of trafficking was put forward at the beginning of the 1990s in international institutions. such as the Council of Europe, the UN and the European Union. The European Commission approved and recommended its adoption by member states in 1996. An Italian MEP, Maria Paola Colombo Svevo (Partito Popolare Italiano - PPI, Italian People's Party, a centre Catholic party) was very active in putting forward the issue of new measures against trafficking. President of the NGO 'Irene', based in Milan, she acted both at the European and Italian levels. Irene is an organisation whose goal is the promotion of equal opportunities, including information and assistance to foreign women escaping forced prostitution. It has quietly adopted a strict abolitionist stand, disseminating information that equates prostitution with violence against women among volunteers and operators but it is apparently reluctant to launch press campaigns with these contents. However, it is not alone: the proposal to fight trafficking more efficiently has been pushed by other and more powerful Catholic NGO's such as Caritas and by 'lay' NGO's dealing with prostitution, including some feminist ones.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning the dominant frame of the debate focused on fighting foreign criminality-petty crime and big Mafia like organizations and trafficking was seen as example of 'imported criminality'. Further, the dominant frame focused on the female prostitutes as victims of male deceit and violence on behalf of the sex traffickers. In the beginning, the debate focused on ways to end sex trafficking and forced prostitution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- Female prostitutes as victims of male deceit and violence on behalf of the sex traffickers.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on the need to fight foreign criminality and was at least implicitly gendered—female prostitutes as victims of male deceit and violence on behalf of the sex traffickers. Policy suggestions revolved around outlawing the actions of sex traffickers and helping the prostitutes who were seen as the victims of sex trafficking.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Female prostitutes as victims of male deceit and violence on behalf of the sex traffickers**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

MEO: Prostitution was considered a women's issue; advocated permits to allow victims of sex trafficking to stay in Italy.

NCEO: Trafficked women need protection from male violence; provide protection permits.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: Mainstreaming the principle of equal opportunities in all policies adopted by the government.

NCEO: Provide guidance and consultation on the activities to be carried out to achieve equality between the sexes and equal opportunities for men and women. It had a purely advisory mandate on all issues not concerning employment.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

MEO: Minister without portfolio in the Cabinet

NCEO: In PM's office

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

MEO:

Name: **Anna Finocchiaro 1995-99**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Finocchiaro was active in the PCI and a feminist; fellow traveler.**

NCEO: Silvia Costa

Years in WPA: **1996-99**

WMA activity: **She was a feminist sociologist, academic (University of Rome) and active in gender research networks.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The characteristics of the women's movement at the time of the debate on IVF (1996-99) were quite different from those in previous controversies on abortion in Italy. Indeed, a strong autonomous feminist movement no longer existed. Although feminists organized demonstrations, they lost their capacity to mobilize public support. Rather, the movement was at the consolidation stage as, with increases in the number of women secretaries of state, femocrats, a feminist advisers, gender issues and concepts became part of the state.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equal political representation**
- **In vitro fertilization**
- **Abortion rights**

- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Social services**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Equal Opportunities**
- **Ministry of Social Affairs**
- **Minister for Social Solidarity.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Olive Tree, with Social Democrats and Communists, among a host of others.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women,**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: ITA_PT2 1998

Title: Criminalization Of Clients Of Underage Prostitutes

WPAs: Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/24/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Feminist groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Some view prostitution as oppression of women; in general, they view prostitution as a cultural problem, not one the state can do much about.**

Policy goals: **Some want to punish clients; some are against it.**

WMA 2

Name : **Women's anti abuse shelter/ Bologna**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is oppression of women.**

Policy Goals: **Opposed increase in repressive measures in Bologna when the Mayor did it because they worsened the working conditions of women on the street and the client represents an important point of contact for giving information to victimized prostitutes on how to escape their oppressors.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is oppression of women.**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **With regard to the clients of prostitutes, the law provides, a stiffer prison sentence (6 to 12 years) and a fine from 15 to 150,000 euros for exploiting minors, and a prison from 6 months to 3 years or a fine of up to 5,000 euros for those who pay a minor between 14 and 16 for sex, unless the accused is underage (less than 18), which reduces the penalty by one third.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Feminist groups**

Form: **Formal organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Neither (autonomous or integrated) part of the movement took part during the debate.**

WMA 2 **Anti abuse shelter**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities: **Did not participate in the national debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The decision to make laws against what is called the ‘sexual exploitation of minors’ was largely due to the pressure exerted by international organizations concerned with sex tourism regarding minors such as UNESCO and End Child Prostitution and Trafficking (ECPAT).

Clients of prostitutes are no longer considered sacred cows whose behaviour must never be questioned. Blaming clients for the existence of prostitution is now a common discourse among both feminists and Catholics. Catholics have hailed the city mayors who, since 1994, have ordered the municipal traffic police to fine clients in order to reduce street prostitution. There were also signs of approval from feminists: the fact that the target of police action shifted from women to men was greeted with some satisfaction. But the part of the feminist movement operating in this field has been fiercely opposed to the mayors' initiative: in 1998, when fines were imposed on clients in Bologna, the women’s anti-abuse shelter (Case delle donne per non subire violenze) protested and abandoned the City Coordinating Committee on Prostitution, together with the Comitato and the MIT, an organisation of transsexuals. They held that an increase in repressive measures only worsened the working conditions of women on the streets and that the client represents an important point of contact for giving information to victimised prostitutes on how to escape their oppressors. But the criminalisation has been put on the policy agenda with an entirely different framing.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of ending child prostitution. The proposed legislation sought to criminalize clients of child prostitutes. The debate was more connected to the need to end child molestation than any debate over adult prostitution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

Over its course, the debate remained focused on ending child prostitution and criminalizing its clients. In the end, the debate was only implicitly gendered. Those involved in the debate implicitly recognized that men were usually the clients of prostitutes. The policy suggestions tended to criminalize the activities of the clients, while they did not criminalize the underage prostitutes. Clients seen as exclusively male. Prostitutes implicitly female.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

MEO: None

NCEO: None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: Mainstreaming the principle of equal opportunities in all policies adopted by the government.

CNPPO: Provide guidance and consultation on the activities to be carried out to achieve equality between the sexes and equal opportunities for men and women. It had a purely advisory mandate on all issues not concerning employment.

multi issue: promote equality between the sexes.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

MEO: Cabinet level Ministry without portfolio

CNPPO: In PMs office

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

MEO

Name: **Anna Finocchiaro 1995-99**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Finocchiaro was active in the PCI and a feminist; fellow traveler.**

CNPPO:

Name: **Silvia Costa**

Years in WPA: **1996-99 (?)**

WMA activity: **She was a feminist sociologist, academic (University of Rome) and active in gender research networks.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The differences with the past are the product of an ongoing process of formalization of the organizational structure and professionalization. What remains from the past is, however, the prevalence of the decentralized small groups, with a strong capacity for networking.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equal political representation**
- **In vitro fertilization**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Social services**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Equal Opportunities**
- **Ministry of Social Affairs**
- **Minister for Social Solidarity.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Olive Tree, with Social Democrats and Communists, among a host of others.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women,**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: ITA_PT3 1998-99

Title: Financing projects to help prostitutes

WPAs: Ministry of Equal Opportunities (MEO); National Commission for Equal Opportunities Between Men and Women (NCEO)

Dates of Coding: 11/24/05, 12/2/05, 3/14/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Elsa Antonioni, representative from the anti abuse shelter; also other shelters represented.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Defended prostitutes whose civil rights are incomplete; little difference between sex with or without payment; both should be free from government control; underlined the continuity between sex for which women get paid and sex without payment. She defended prostitutes whose civil rights are still incomplete; for example, they face the risk of having their children taken away from them.**

Policy goals: **Guarantee civil rights of prostitutes.**

WMA 2

Name: **Nardini, MP of RC party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **References to the 'male issue of sexuality in prostitution, and in connection with the health hazard of men refusing to use condoms and offering a higher price for sex without condoms.**

Policy goals: **Protect health of prostitutes.**

WMA 3

Name: **Taziana Valpiana MP of RC party**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Valpiana spoke about the degradation inflicted by the male gender on prostitutes, and at a certain point complained about the insufficient gendering of the debate: the fact that exploiters were men and the victims women, was in her opinion, systematically overlooked.**

Policy goals: **Protect health of prostitutes.**

WMA 4

Name: **Bolognese feminist groups**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Defended prostitutes whose civil rights are incomplete; little difference between sex with or without payment; both should be free from government control; underlined the continuity between sex for which women get paid and sex without payment. defended prostitutes whose civil rights are still incomplete; for example, they face the risk of having their children taken away from them.**

Policy goals: **Guarantee civil rights of prostitutes**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **The continuity between sex for which women get paid and sex without payment degradation inflicted by the male gender on prostitutes; the fact that exploiters were men and the victims women is systematically overlooked.**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Commission adopted three principles in the report**
 - i. **Harm reduction for reducing health hazards.**
 - ii. **Education of clients via information campaigns.**
 - iii. **Maintenance of the Merlin law [the abolitionist law that made prostitution legal].**
2. **Other measures to finance projects were taken at the ministerial level:**
 - i. **informal campaigns in the ‘sending countries’ to warn young women**
 - ii. **courses to help police improve their methods of intervention and to oblige them to inform the women of the possibility of obtaining a protection permit.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Antonioni**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **In non women’s movement organization (in parliamentary commission)**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified at parliamentary commission.**

WMA 2 **Nardini**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization (MP)**

Activities During the Debate: **Debated in parliamentary commission.**

WMA 3 **Valpiana**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Debated in parliamentary commission.**

WMA 4 **Feminist groups**

Form: **Organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Invited but did not participate in the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The third debate started in Parliament occurred in 1998 when the XII Commission (Justice) of the Chamber of Deputies ordered an inquiry called ‘Inquiry to increase knowledge about the social and sanitary aspects of prostitution’, to meet the need of facing the increased presence of foreign prostitutes in the streets. The Minister for

Equal Opportunities, Finocchiaro, had actively promoted the initiative, and opened the first meeting. The president of this commission, Marida Bolognesi (DS) had already been very much in contact with the co-ordination of the NGO's , both Catholic and non-Catholic, dealing with prostitution.

During these hearings the deputies, mostly on the centre-left, listened to and interrogated experts, issue caretakers, local administrators, mayors, members of organisations dealing with prostitution (harm reduction or 'salvation' work), including priests, and representatives of the Committee for Prostitutes' Civil Rights, were called to inform the MPs of the current facts. The Anti-Abuse shelter of Bologna and the Bolognese feminist association Orlando were also invited, though in the parliamentary acts only an intervention of a member of the first association is registered. No other women's policy agencies' representatives except the minister took part in the gatherings.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant Frame centered on the issue of foreigners invading the streets: many local administrators were primarily concerned with the disturbance to public order and citizen's protests. The debate focused on the harms caused by prostitution in the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate became gendered. In the end, there was also a focus on the idea that men, as clients, were also responsible for many of the public health and other problems caused by prostitution. They refused to use condoms, offered higher price for sex without condoms. The debate also tended to focus more on distinguishing prostitution from forced prostitution and eliminating forced prostitution.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Men, as clients, were also responsible for many of the public health and other problems caused by prostitution.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

MEO: Promoted the initiative to finance projects to help prostitutes; referred to the 'issue of male sexuality in prostitution' and conceived the proposal in term of giving opportunities for self determination to female victims of male violence; distinguished between free and forced prostitution.

NCEO: None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Issue of male sexuality in prostitution and conceived the proposal in term sof giving opportunities for self determination to female victims of male violence.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

MEO: Mainstreaming the principle of equal opportunities in all policies adopted by the government.

NCEO: Provide guidance and consultation on the activities to be carried out to achieve equality between the sexes and equal opportunities for men and women. It had a purely advisory mandate on all issues not concerning employment.

Multi-issue: promote equality between the sexes.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

MEO: Cabinet level Ministry without portfolio.

NCEO: In PMs office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

MEO

Name: **Anna Finocchiaro 1995-99**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Finocchiaro was active in the PCI and a feminist; fellow traveler.**

NCEO:

Name: **Silvia Costa**

Years in WPA: **1996-99 (?)**

WMA activity: **She was a feminist sociologist. academic (University of Rome) and active in gender research networks.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The differences with the past are the product of an ongoing process of formalization of the organizational structure and professionalization. What remains from the past is, however, the prevalence of the decentralized small groups, with a strong capacity for networking.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Gender equal political representation**
- **In vitro fertilization**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Equal opportunities at work**
- **Social services**

C20A_1—Counter Movement Actors; MicroFrames

Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Commission for the XII chamber of Deputies**
- **Minister of EO.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Olive Tree, with Social Democrats and Communists, among a host of others.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women,**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: NLD_AB1 1971-1973

Title: The Cabinet Proposal for Abortion Reform

WPA: None

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/05/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Man-Women-Society**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Woman and her doctor should decide.**

Policy goals: **Demanded total legalization, support from insurance companies and national health to cover costs.**

WMA 2

Name: **Dolle Mina**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Baas in eigen buik (boss over one's body) which superseded its earlier position that women should be able to enjoy sex like men, and not be the only one to have to pay for the consequences of sex, around 1970.**

Policy Goals: **Demanded total legalization, support from insurance companies and national health to cover costs.**

WMA 3

Name: **Conglomerate of consciousness-raising groups (overlapping with Dolle Mina and MVM but also attracting non-aligned women).**

Issue Definition:

Policy Goals: **Supported legalization.**

WMA 4

Name: **Traditional women's organizations – catholic, protestant, housewives and rural women**

Issue Definition:

Policy Goals: **Supported legalization.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Baas in eigen buik (boss over one's body) which superseded its earlier position that women should be able to enjoy sex like men, and not be the only one to have to pay for the consequences of sex, around 1970.**

Policy Goals: **Demanded total legalization, support from insurance companies and national health to cover costs.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **No change in policy**
2. **The proposal would have restricted abortion to therapeutic grounds to be assessed by a team of medical experts, but Bill died after Cabinet fell.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Man-Women-Society

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate:

WMA 2 Dolle Mina

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Staged ‘zap actions’ in the street successfully aiming at the media; non-aligned feminists disturbed the yearly conference of gynecologists in 1971 with baas in eigen buik written on their bare stomachs – the most famous picture of the second wave of feminism and its best known slogan. Famous TV program op de vrouw af (head on women) in which dolle mina women disturbed programme by displaying telephone number of abortion clinic!**

WMA 3

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities: **The conglomerate of consciousness-raising groups, partly overlapping with dolle mina and mvm but also attracting non-aligned women.**

WMA 4

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women’s movement organizations**

Activities: **Came out in favor of legalizing abortion during the debate. there was a number of big ‘traditional’ women’s organizations tied to the old pillar System of the Netherlands; Catholic, two varieties of protestants, a secular one of housewives and a secular one organizing rural women.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

This debate started during the national election campaign of April 1971. A cabinet reform had become inevitable because of social developments, including the increasing sympathy of doctors to women’s demands for abortion. However, it was a Social Democrat private member bill in parliament that would have legalized abortion on demand which pushed the cabinet to action. The cabinet leaders realized that, based on the Liberals support for women’s self-determination, there was a possibility of a majority in favor of what they considered a radical reform. The Christian Democrats, of course, were loath to reform, but realized that a modest reform bill as part of the cabinet coalition pact would prevent more sweeping change. A small working party from the elites of the three major confessional parties and the Liberals- all men- drew up the rough outline for the abortion paragraph of the pact. The result was a compromise that would allow abortion only where pregnancy posed a threat to women’s physical or mental health. The Liberal Party reneged on its own party program, which saw abortion as a private affair between the doctor and the ‘married and unmarried people’

involved, an interesting gender- neutral definition, letting socio-economic issues prevail in its decision to stay in power.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Upon introduction of the abortion liberalization bill, abortion was framed as a moral issue. Anti-abortionists argued against the issue on moral grounds, citing that abortion was immoral and resulted in the death of the fetus. The cabinet pact defined the problem as a medical-psychiatric issue to be solved by allowing for a limited number of deserving women. Image of women was split: those in need who deserve our compassion and should be helped. Men not mentioned. No link to social relations or any inkling of gender system.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Some women deserve compassion and should be helped.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The proponents for legalization attacked the bill as being too narrow, only allowing abortion on therapeutic grounds. They had already been arguing for total legalization since 1970. When two Social Democrat mp's entered a private members bill into parliament for which there was a potential Majority part of their support was from doctors who hoped to help women without running the risk of prosecution. By the end of the debate all pro choice argued that women should be the one to decide about an abortion. The framing was not in terms of rights at that time but in terms of power over decision.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Women should be the one to decide about abortion, not doctors**
- **Frame did not include idea of women's rights**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

No WPA in existence

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Not applicable

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The period of the first debate coincided with the rise of the women's movement, generating huge publicity. The first groups, Man- Woman-Society and Dolle Mina were soon surrounded by a proliferation of other groups, making for loose temporary coalitions.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Adult education**
- **Childcare**
- **Domestic violence**
- **Women on welfare**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Weak

Several well known professors of gynecology specially Prof. Plate (gynecologist to the royal family) and ethics (both Roman Catholic and strict Protestant).

Stiching voor het ongeboren kind (SOK) (Foundation for the Unborn Child). The Roman Catholic church came with a pastoral letter against abortion. The Dutch reformed churches organized commissions to study the issue but except for the orthodox branches did not come out strongly against, allowing for generous therapeutic abortion.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Party leaders**
- **Ministers of Justice and Public Health**
- **Cabinet**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

It was a five party cabinet; the three major religious parties, which formed the Christian democratic party in 1977, the liberal party and a right wing split off from the Dutch Social Democrat party, called democratic socialists 70 (named after year it split off).

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not applicable

Debate ID: NLD_AB2 1977-1981

Title: Reform of Abortion Law— Legalization

WPA: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **WVE: We Women Demand**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women should have the final say over whether or not she wanted an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Abortion should be removed from the penal code, it should be financed by the national health insurance.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women should have the final say over whether or not she wanted an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Abortion should be removed from the penal code, it should be financed by the national health insurance.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Allows legal abortion up to viability**
2. **Requires ‘emergency situation’ of the woman**
3. **Doctor determines if she acts out of free will and has considered other alternatives**
4. **5 day waiting period**
5. **If doctor refuses, must refer her to another doctor**
6. **Must be performed in hospital or licensed clinic**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **WVE: We Women Demand**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in debates through protests and influencing secular political parties.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Abortion remained a major issue n national politics between 1972 and the 1977 election. It had been agreed during the cabinet formation of 1973, in the absence of a consensus between the cabinet partners, that abortion reform would be left to the parliament. In the meantime there would be no prosecution of the clinics except in cases of medical malpractice. Although Parliament had the initiative of submitting reform bills in that period, all attempts at reform failed. A combined Social Democrat- Liberal private member bill was passed by the Second Chamber in 1976 with a comfortable majority, but if failed that same year in the First Chamber,

when the Liberal vote split. Major upheaval was also caused in 1976 by two attempts by the Minister of Justice, Van Agt, to shut down a clinic performing second trimester abortions. A sit in by feminists from the movement frustrated the minister's efforts. Many parliamentarians held Van Agt to have contravened the cabinet pact, but the majority of the Social Democrats were not willing to risk a cabinet crisis and refused to vote for a motion of confidence against him.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The cabinet bill framed the issue in terms of the rule of law, defining the policy problem as the discrepancy between the restrictive legal situation and the rather liberal practice of abortion in the Netherlands. Also liberals and feminists managed to argue that women (not doctors) should make the final decision as to whether or not they would have an abortion. The new framing invented the concept of the emergency situation to justify an abortion, and its determination was left to the dialogue of physician and the woman asking for an abortion.

Women were seen as deserving if they were in a state of distress, but also irrational because of this, therefore the five-day wait had to be observed to avoid 'rash' decisions.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Women were seen as deserving if they were in a state of distress, but also irrational because of this, therefore the five-day wait had to be observed to avoid 'rash' decisions

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Control over an abortion remained the overriding issue. The anti-abortionists portrayed abortion seeking women as untrustworthy and irresponsible. In the end, the feminists managed to gender the debates in a more positive fashion. The feminists presented the image of abortion seeking women as moral people who make their own responsible decisions. Feminists argued that abortion should be a women's choice and that the abortion law should be liberalized.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Competing images of women: either as untrustworthy and irresponsible or moral and responsible. All related to debate over whether women should make the choice to have abortions.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Multi-issue. Heavy emphasis on awareness raising about women's status and setting up institutions at provincial level to establish policy network.

Policy Issues: In the first (1977) government plan for women's policy the WPA was given a wide mandate to cover all issues, but abortion was not one of them.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

The DCEP was located in the ministry of culture, recreation and social work, it was part of the directorate-general for social work. It was a new unit, emanating from an unit of family affairs, the unit fell directly under one of the directorates of the ministry. It was not well-known yet but did have direct access to its junior minister.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Name: Director, Dineke Mulock Houwer.

Years in WPA: 1978- late 1980s

WMA Activity: The director had been the permanent secretary to the emancipation commission from 1975 and previous to that a regular civil service career (when it was established) which had excellent feminist connections. She became one of the first women top civil servants after her time at the DCEP.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Growth

Evidence and source: The movement, although at its zenith, remained an 'archipelago of many islands'.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job training and sexual violence**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Social security**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

Strong

The most important one is the vereniging voor de bescherming van het ongeboren kind (VBOK) founded in 1971, and uniting orthodox protestants. It joined forces in the platform organization of the comite redt het ongeboren kind (Campaign to Save the Unborn Child (CROK)) founded in 1974, uniting the vbok, stirezo and the nederlandse artsen vereniging (NAV) which united the dissidents on the issue of abortion who thought that that the royal Dutch association for medicine was too liberal. All anti groups wanted to restrict abortion to only the 'vital' indication – in fact that the 1911 statute should be maintained, only allowing abortion if a woman's life is in danger.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Party leaders**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The government was a Majority coalition (Liberals, Christian Democrats)

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: NLD_AB3 1981-1984

Title: Implementing the Abortion Law

WPAs: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP);
Emancipation Council (EC)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **WVE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women should have the final say over whether or not she wanted an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Abortion on demand.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women should have the final say over whether or not she wanted an abortion.**

Policy goals: **Abortion on demand.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Network of clinics and hospitals provided abortion on demand after woman consulted with doctor.**
2. **Licensing System which left all abortion facilities intact.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **WVE**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing (although as umbrella organization has groups from within the parties)**

Activities During the Debate: **Maintaining a presence. Members of the Emancipation Council and others in government recognized the potential of women's movement actors to remobilize and they respected their earlier demands for abortion.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The third debate selected covers the implementation measures which had to be taken before the 1981 Act could take effect. The act left several technical points, such as the licensing of abortion facilities and the registration and monitoring of the incidence of abortion, to be operationalized in an executive order. A draft version of the order was published in the week the act passed. During the debates on the 1981 act in the second chamber it emerged that these matters were not to remain technical because the hard-liners in the Christian Democratic Party intended to use the order to restrict the scope of the act.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning of the debate, the frame was a contest between the pro abortion groups who defined abortion as a regular medical procedure, while the anti-abortion groups sought to define abortion as a special medical procedure (and shift the decision to abort to doctors, rather than women). Anti-abortionists argued that the abortion act should only allow women abortions in emergency situations and sought to narrow the scope of the act in a way that would limit abortion in the Netherlands- and would give doctors more control over the abortion decision.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Whether women should have control over abortion decision.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on the nature of the abortion procedure and whether or not it was a special medical procedure. Both sides sought to de-gender the issue- the women's movement actors sought to argue that abortion was no different from other medical procedures and defined women as normal patients; they defended their gendered issue (women's right to abortion) by degendering the debate (women are normal patients) . Those opposed also de-gendered abortion by arguing that abortion decisions should be handled by doctors. Framing of the issue in terms of women's control remained intact at the end of the debate.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women's control over abortion decision

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

**WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Council (DCEP)
Support abortion and argued that abortion laws should not be limited by administrative regulations; agreed with WVE position.**

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

Support abortion and argued that abortion laws should not be limited by administrative regulations; agreed with WVE position.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

**Women should have the final say over whether or not she wanted an abortion.
Abortion on demand in clinics.**

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy(DCEP)

The DCEP had a cross-sectional mandate. Emphasis in this period was on developing the beleidsplan, which aimed at an overall analysis of the position of women and was the fundament for dce's cross-sectional interventions. Special emphasis was on sexual violence and women's labor.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

Multi-issue—it covered many different areas of policy for women but did not systematically do so.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA**WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

The DCEP was shifted to the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment. With this move, the DCEP hoped to gain access to crucial policy arenas to improve women's status; the ministry handled all labour market policy and all of social security issues.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

The EC as an advisory body within the corporatism of the day had members appointed by the cabinet on the basis of expertise, while at the same representativeness across the major parties was ensured. It also always had a token man! And usually one non-party affiliated member from the autonomous women's movement. It has a professional staff to prepare the reports covering all relevant fields of expertise.

Autonomous from government. But is funded by government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership**WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

Name: Annelien Kappeyne van de Coppello, Liberal party, was the political head (1983-1986) the civil service director was Dineke Mulock Houwer.

Years in WPA: Mulock Houwer;1978-1987

WMA activities: None

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

Name: Dianne Van Leeuwen (Liberal Party)

Years in WPA: 1981-1987

WMA activity: None

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and sources: In this third debate, the women's movement was in the consolidation stage, and continued to stay non- aligned.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job training and sexual violence**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Social security**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

Strong

There was an organized counter- movement that included Orthodox Protestants

among other religious groups. The VBOK remained very active.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Ministry of Health**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The cabinet was controlled by a CDA (Christian Democrat)- Liberal coalition, with the Social Democrats in opposition.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

The women's global reproductive rights network took off in 1982.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: NLD_HI 1997-2001

Title: Home Care

WPA: Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/16/05, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women's Studies scholars (Dr. M. Moree, Drs M. Vulto, Drs M. Been, Drs. C. van den Herik) Researchers, employed by University, independent research institutions and/or freelance.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Home care affects the position of women in two ways: if formal care is not provided women will continue to be hampered in their careers; the lack of respect for care work has negative effects on the job satisfaction of home care workers. Lack of financial remuneration impedes their chances of ever becoming economically independent.**

Policy Goals: **Attention to the many facets of care work by policymakers; both technical and psychological skills are needed. Better working conditions for care workers. A fair wage for a difficult job.**

WMA 2

Name: **Feminist leaders of STING**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **STING emphasized the importance of the work of home careers and tried to make the public and policy makers aware that both technical and psychological skills were necessary ingredients in their education. They pleaded for better education and fairer wages.**

Policy Goals :

Better working conditions for care workers.

Education for care workers.

A fair wage for a difficult job.

WMA 3

Name: **Women's Alliance**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Women's Alliance defended the position of informal carers (mostly women). They are under pressure to enter the labour market to become economically independent, but are also expected to care for dependents.**

Policy Goals : **Women's Alliance defended the interests of informal care workers by arguing in favor of increased funding for formal care.**

WMA 4

Name: **National Platform of Women 50+,**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **It defended the position of informal carers, traditionally women. They are under pressure to enter the labour market to become economically independent, but are also expected to care for dependents.**

Policy Goals : **National Platform of Women 50+ argued in favor of increasing the funding for formal care, so that the burden would be taken off of women, who were traditionally responsible for providing informal care.**

WMA5

Name: **Network of Wise Old Women (WOUW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **It defended the position of informal carers. They are under pressure to enter the labour market to become economically independent, but are also expected to care for dependents.**

Policy Goals : **WOUW argued in favor of increasing the funding for formal care, so that the burden would be taken off of women, who were traditionally responsibility for providing informal care.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **None**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Wages for home care workers were not increased by the government, but rather, the matter was left to the social partners.**
2. **Informal care is still the cornerstone of the home care system; despite numerous attempts at recruiting more care workers, there are still shortages in nursing and home care, with policies to make the work attractive mainly targeting working conditions, flexible hours, leave and childcare.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women's Studies scholars**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Research, publications in professional press and participation in advisory councils.**

WMA 2 **Leaders of STING**

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Organizing home care workers, stimulating research and media attention, participating in advisory councils.**

WMA 3 **Women's Alliance**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Women's Alliance participated in the debate by organizing the National Debate on Care.**

WMA 4 **50+ women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public in the media.**

WMA 5 **WOUW**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their opinions public in the media.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Home care has been an issue since the 1970s, when the incumbent cabinet changed its policy on the elderly in an attempt to curb state expenditure. While previously residential care had been the major goal of policy after the Second World War, the elderly were now encouraged to stay in their homes as long as possible. Home care was to provide the services to facilitate this, but over the years it neither expanded nor modernized to accommodate the new demand. Instead, a new type of home care worker was introduced in the mid 1970s, the so-called alpha workers, who work on 12 hour-contracts for their clients, so that they could be excluded from social security and were thus cheaper to employ. The idea was to recruit married women, who were thought not to need social benefits, as they had a breadwinner entitled to social security. This made the work unattractive, so that even with the high unemployment of the 1980s, shortages of homecare workers occurred. To make up for the lack of care, successive cabinets then started to promote informal care, to be provided by family members and neighbors. Formal care became redefined as supplementary to informal care. The move was ideologically legitimated in terms of informal care being more humane and 'warmer' than professional care.

The demographic shift and the increasing number of elderly people started to cause concern in policy circles in the mid 1980s: a plethora of official reports ensued. An early report by a government commission (Commissie Dekker), *Bereidheid tot verandering* (1987) (Readiness for change) recommended substituting intra-mural care by extra-mural care, to be supplied by 'self-care'. Another commission looked into the structure of the profession of nurses and formal care workers (Commissie Werner 1991), advocating more attention for professionalization of care work. Other reports recommended more efficiency and the cutting of costs to meet the rising demand for the different types of care. In 1991 a cabinet policy paper *Ouderen in tel* (The elderly count) addressed the matter of the supply of carers for the first time. Under the label of the need to 'participate more fully in society', middle-aged women were encouraged to take on more informal care work – although it emerged they were already providing the lion's share.

By the early 1990s policy-makers tried to expand services by a number of reorganizations of the care work sector to improve performance and efficiency. Different types of home care were centralized into large organizations covering a larger territory. Under influence of the new management ideology, these were quite hierarchical, with financial-economic experts (mainly men) moving in for the top positions, leaving the middle level of management to the original directors with their field knowledge (mainly women). The alpha workers continued to do the field work, but were now faced with increasing taylorization of their work, leading to dissatisfied clients, high turnover and absenteeism, and problems in recruiting new workers. There was an increasing amount of studies and reports describing the situation in home care, and workers' and clients' complaints received wide coverage in the media.

The first major paper on home care by the Christian Democrat-Social Democrat cabinet Lubbers III (1989-1994) was published in 1991: *Thuiszorg in de jaren negentig* (Home Care in the 1990s), placing it firmly on the political agenda.

(The second Purple cabinet (1998-2002) produced a *Zorgnota 2001* (policy paper on Care) (2000), which sticks to a gender-neutral frame and analysis.)

Its successor, the two cabinets of the 'Purple Coalition' (Liberal – Social Democrats) (1994-1998; 1998-2002) produced a paper specifically on this issue: *Home Care and Care at Home* (Thuiszorg en zorg thuis 1997) and the *policy paper on Care 2001* that paid ample attention to home care. All three were debated in parliament, and all three received wide publicity and criticism. As the 2001 paper hardly mentioned the issue of informal care, several MPs forced the cabinet to produce a separate paper on the topic in 2001 (*Zorg Nabij* – Care at hand), the last paper produced by the cabinet, before its resignation in April 2002. In this way the issue has maintained agenda-status for succeeding cabinets.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame in home care (and health care more generally) in the 1990s can be characterized as economic: budgetary problems were the centre of attention and the driving force behind policy. The demographic shift and the emancipation of citizens - carefully kept gender neutral - was portrayed as the main threat to budget control. Underlying the discussions is the fear that citizens (female citizens) will shirk their responsibility for giving care, thus adding to the financial burdens of the state.' Generally left wing parties came out in favor of large budget increases in order to raise wages for home care workers, and right wing parties came out in favor of privatization and only modest budget increases.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of economics and budgets. The debate also remained gender neutral. The 2001 policy paper on informal care recognizes that most informal care workers are women. However, the paper uses male pronouns and treats informal care workers as if they are all men. Further, much the chagrin of feminist groups, the paper encourages increases in informal care and thus encourages women's traditional roles as informal care workers.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

DCEP: the DCEP did not have a position, but some inside the agency were interested in the new direction of the home health care debate.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The DCEP had a cross-sectional policy focus and dealt with all issues affecting women; mainstreaming.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

DCEP was a directorate in the ministry of Social Affairs.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Ina Brouwer 1995-2000; Gabrielle Bekman 2000-2003** (*Civil service heads of DCEP*)

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **Not feminist**

Elske Ter Veld, Junior Minister 1989-99; political head of DCEP

WMA activity: **Active in Rooie Vrouwen of PvdA, head of the women's section of the major trade union federation and in organization of female parliamentarians; leading feminist.**

After 1998: Annelies Verstand (D66 – Social Liberal), junior minister, prior to this mayor of middle-sized town, no previous affiliation to women's movement actors.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Decline**

Evidence and source: **In the nineties the women's movement was in a state of undeniable decline. After its high profile during the 1970s and its firm consolidation in the 1980s, activities declined and organisations declined.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reconciliation work/family life**
- **Childcare**
- **Care**
- **Political representation**
- **Migrant women.**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Dutch Parliament**
- **Department of Health Welfare and Sport**
- **Social Partners**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

1994-2002: VVD/PvdA/D66 (purple coalition)

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

UN

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: NLD_PR1 1966-1977

Title: New Social Democratic Party Platform

QUAWPA: Women's Contact (WC)

Dates of Coding: 03/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Hedy D'Ancona**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are relegated to the household and have no chances to get a decent job or a position in politics because of that. Women themselves are too meek. They must be stimulated to demand better conditions: abortion on demand, childcare, better education and jobs and they must become active in politics. A Social Democratic party should be aware of their position and support them.**

Policy Goals: **Support for equality issues and quota for the party lists.**

WMA 2

Name: **Joke Smit**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are relegated to the household and have no chances to get a decent job or a position in politics because of that. Women themselves are too meek. They must be stimulated to demand better conditions: abortion on demand, Childcare, better education and jobs and they must become active in politics. A Social Democratic party should be aware of their position and support them.**

Policy Goals: **Support for equality issues and quota for the party lists.**

WMA3

Name: **MVM**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are relegated to the household and have no chances to get a decent job or a position in politics because of that. Women themselves are too meek. They must be stimulated to demand better conditions: abortion on demand, childcare, better education and jobs and they must become active in politics. A Social Democratic party should be aware of their position and support them.**

Policy goals: **MVM drew attention to women's issues and demanded better education and more opportunities for women. MVM participated in a campaign to encourage Social Democrats to choose women as political representatives.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women are relegated to the household and have no chances to get a decent job or a position in politics because of that. Women should demand better conditions: abortion on demand, childcare, better education and jobs and they must become active in politics. A Social Democratic party should be aware of their position and support them.**

Policy Goals: **Support for equality issues and quota for the party lists.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **In the end, the women's auxiliary organisation (WC) was not abolished; the Vrouwenkontakt and its successor 'Red Women' even managed to get more facilities. In 1973, women managed to get a substantial representation (6 of 26 members) in the committee that would design a new party platform.**
2. **In 1975, the WC successfully lobbied the party executive for a target of 25% women on party lists. The party executive decided to ask the candidate selection committees in 1977 to strive for 25% women, while the 1977 congress also adopted 25% as a target.**
3. **However, human relations too, should be democratized radically. Hierarchical and elitist relations, sustained and amplified by capitalism, cannot be justified. The struggle over equal rights for women is, in this perspective, a socialist goal.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Hedy D'Ancona

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (party committees)**

Activities During the Debate: **She was one of the founders of Man-Woman-Society and a member of the Social Democratic party. She lobbied the auxiliary organization Vrouwenkontakt to become involved in the feminist struggle. She made a questionnaire to be distributed to members, reworked the results into a report to be discussed at a meeting. Together with Joke Smit, she incited the organization to become a major factor in the party. She took part in many committees in which the new ideas on women's representation were discussed and canvassed for positions in the party herself.**

WMA 2 Joke Smit

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote an article on women's equality that ignited the women's movement in the Netherlands. She was one of the founders of Man-Woman-Society and a member of the Social Democratic party. She lobbied the auxiliary organization Vrouwenkontakt to become involved in the feminist struggle and incited the organization to become a major factor in the party. She became a member of the Amsterdam city council and left in 1971, making a famous speech about political culture. She was a member of the Emancipation Council and was an important influence in it's final report.**

WMA 3 MVM

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **MVM participated in the debate by working with Women's Contact and by trying to influence members of the Social Democratic Party. They had a very active media presence.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Between 1963 and 1966 the Social Democratic party lost about a quarter of its followers. A group of younger party members, calling themselves the New Left (Nieuw Links) blamed the older generation of politicians for the party's electoral demise. They were, allegedly, too inclined to accommodation and compromise. The party would have to win back the young voters participating in grass roots organisations. The relationship between the party and flourishing grass roots organisations, like the student and the feminist movements, however, was a complex one. The occupation of the main office of the Amsterdam university by students was a divisive issue for the party in 1969, the issue of abortion would lead to problems in the 1970's. In 1971, the party executive studied the party's position on 'direct action' at a weekend meeting and in 1973 it pleaded for a reorganisation to turn the party into an 'action party'. In 1977, a new party platform was accepted that incorporated these ideas.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and focused on the desire of young members of the Social Democratic Party, the 'New Left', to incorporate newer, activist types of ideas into the party. Some members of the New Left wanted more regional types of representation and wanted to create an elective system that would polarize the Dutch political landscape, by forcing voters to choose between conservative and progressive candidates. Women were seen as 'emancipated' and not in need of a separate organization within in the party. Consequently, the party executive paid less attention to representation of women than had been the case in the 50's and proposed to disband the auxiliary organization Vrouwenkontakt (in 1966 still called Vrouwenbond) because it was seen as outdated. Candidate selection was considered to be on the basis of 'ability' and women should not be on the list because they were women. This would endanger the quality of Social Democratic candidates.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women are emancipated, don't need separate organization.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In the end, the dominant frame continued to focus on including social movement groups into the Social Democratic Party. The demands of the women's movement for representation fitted very well in this frame, because they quickly became a very successful grass roots organization. The feminists' argument that women suffered from inequality between the sexes in society was slowly accepted by most party members. Through the end, the debate became gendered and party leadership and members began to share the opinion that the party sponsored too few women in political positions. Under the gendered frame, the Social Democrats began to focus on ways that the party could improve its representation of women and introduced targets and later quota.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
**Women suffer from inequality between the sexes; too few women in political positions in the Social Democratic party.
 How can party improve representation of women?**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
 QUAWPA 1 **Women's Contact (WC)**

Women's Contact voiced their concerns over women's issues to others in the party, advocating more political representation of women, better educational opportunities, and better social services for women. Women's Contact also conducted a campaign to encourage others in the Social Democratic Party to choose women as political representatives. They supported members to get positions in party committees and in the party executive and on party lists.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
 None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
 QUAWPA 1. **Women's Contact (WC)**

The formal role of the organization within the party was to stimulate female members (all of whom were automatically members of Vrouwenkontakt) to become active in society. To this end their main activity was to provide educational activities for women.

WC's formal role after 1975: to end the unequal position of women they will give solicited and unsolicited advice to and put pressure on institutions inside and outside the party, disseminate information, organize meetings and involve female members in party activities.

During the 60's the main interest of the auxiliary organization (called Vrouwenbond until 1969) were women's opportunities in paid labor. During the sixties, labor issues were dominant in the activities of the auxiliary organization. They were of the opinion, however, that men's wages should be high enough to cover the expenses of a family, to make paid labor a real free choice and not a necessity for women. They pleaded for part time work, equal pay, services to facilitate work and care and educational opportunities for older women.

Representation of women became less of a priority during the '60's, probably because the ideology that was dominant in the party was taken for granted, that women were now equal and candidate selection should be on the basis of 'ability'. The discussions at the end of the '60's and at the beginning of the '70's resulted in more attention to the unequal position of women within the party and put the necessity to have more female candidates for party leadership as well as for parliamentary positions at the top of the agenda.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

QUAWPA 1 **Women's Contact (WC)**

Separate organization, on and off ties to the executive, as members they have of course the right to make themselves heard at congresses.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

QUAWPA 1. **Women's Contact (WC)**

Name: **Ien van den Heuvel (1969-1974)**

Pijkel Schröder (1974-1980)

WMA Activity: **No**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

Evidence and source: **The women's movement during the seventies was growing fast and this made them into a much coveted group.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Adult education**
- **Childcare**
- **Domestic violence**
- **Women on welfare**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Social Democratic Party**
- **MVM**
- **Women's Contact**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

It was a five party cabinet; the three major religious parties, which formed the Christian democratic party in 1977, the liberal party and a right wing split off from the Dutch Social Democrat party, called democratic socialists 70 (named after year it split off).

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

The 1975 International Women's Year Conferences

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the

maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: NLD_PR2 1981-1985

Title: Women's Representation in the Equality Plan

WPAs: Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP);
Emancipation Council (EC)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Monique Leijenaar**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Selection procedures are not fair to women.**

Policy Goals: **They must be studied and changed; quota would be a very good idea.**

WMA 2

Name: **Sawitri Saharso**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The powerlessness of women in politics is a reflection of their position in society; we must study their marginalization in all kinds of discourses to find ways to remedy the situation.**

Policy Goals: **Not very concrete.**

WMA 3

Name: **Trees Mom, Hanneke Stasse and Mieke Eijkmans**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Politics (formal) determine the conditions of women's lives; therefore they must engage with politics to further their interests.**

Policy Goals: **Convince women to start bothering with formal politics, without abandoning 'the movement'.**

WMA 4

Name: **Joyce Outshoorn**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Even left wing parties are not always kind to women, but movement activity and formal politics should not be seen as antithetical.**

Policy Goals: **Descriptive representation is necessary, but do not forget that substantive representation is the most important goal.**

WMA 5

Name: **Anarca feministes, De Bonte Was, Landelijk Stakingskomitee, Lesbies Netwerk, Vrouwen Tegen Seksueel Geweld, Vrouwen Voor Vrede.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally: Women are oppressed by men and this oppression is present in all parts of society, including formal politics. It is useless for women to try to influence politics; because it is dominated by men it will take ages to change anything. It is more fruitful for women to change their own situation by chucking**

men out, arranging services for women themselves, protecting women and by generally building a female society within society.

Policy Goals : None

WMA 6

Name: **Traditional Women's Groups; Nationale Vrouwen Raad, Plattelandsvrouwen, Nederlandse Vereniging van Huisvrouwen**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are indeed not heeded enough by men, and we should unite to better our positions, but the radical women make it hard to work together because of their arrogance, their bad manners and their separatist tendencies.**

Policy Goals :**Better representation of women on all fronts.**

WMA 7

Name: **Women's groups from political parties and trade unions.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Most organizations agreed with the policy plan; it's stance on politics was not in discussion. Hot issue was the focus on work: PvdA and D66 spokespersons stated that the plan was 'Too little, too late'; CDA women pointed to the importance of pluriformity (meaning that housewives must not be forced to go out to work); (future) Green Left women say that the focus is too much on work, while measures to make the combination possible are nowhere in sight. The only discussion on politics is with the far right ultra-Christian members of parliament.**

Policy goals: **More women, but no idea how.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women are oppressed by men and this oppression is present in all parts of society, including formal politics. It is useless for women to try to influence politics; because it is dominated by men it will take ages to change anything. It is more fruitful for women to change their own situation by chucking men out, arranging services for women themselves, protecting women and by generally building a female society within society.**

The powerlessness of women in politics is a reflection of their position in society; we must study their marginalization in all kinds of discourses to find ways to remedy the situation.

Policy Goals: **Not very concrete; None**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The paper largely followed recent feminist theorising on gender inequalities. Positions of influence in society and in politics still form male territory, the document states, and this is seen as one of the reasons why women are as yet unable to realise the changes they desire.**
- 2. But formal politics are stalled under the heading 'representations of masculinity and femininity', a title further dedicated to problems like representations of women in culture and the media.**

3. **In contrast to the aims of the overall analysis to alter the perspective of women's backwardness to that of unequal power relations, under representation in politics is still presented as a problem of the backwardness of women. Women must be made aware of their position and helped to gain insight, the document states. They must organise socially and politically to realise the aim of structural change in society.**
4. **The Dutch government also began to grant subsidies to organisations to encourage more women to become involved in politics.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Monique Leijenaar**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academy, party ministries)**

Activities During the Debate: **Researcher on women in politics (the only feminist at that point in time who could do statistics), author of trend report on women and political power, member of writing committee for the policy plan and active member of Social Democratic party.**

WMA 2 **Sawitri Saharso**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academy)**

Activities During the Debate: **Researcher on women in politics, author of trend report on women and political power.**

WMA 3 **Trees Mom, Hanneke Stasse and Mieke Eijkmans**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academy)**

Activities During the Debate: **Published a book on women and politics.**

WMA 4 **Joyce Outshoorn**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academy; ministry)**

Activities During the Debate: **Edited a feminist academic journal; had published a book on social democracy and women and made a speech at a conference at the ministry of the interior on representation.**

WMA 5 **Anarca feministes, De Bonte Was, Landelijk Stakingskomitee, Lesbies Netwerk, Vrouwen Tegen Seksueel Geweld, Vrouwen Voor Vrede**

Form: **Informal organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participating in discussion meetings, publishing their own books, journals and leaflets.**

WMA 6 **Traditional Women's Groups; Nationale Vrouwen Raad, Plattelandsvrouwen, Nederlandse Vereniging van Huisvrouwen**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Plattelandsvrouwen participated in the public debate; the others commented on the Conceptplan when it was presented to parliament.**

WMA 7 **Women's groups from political parties and trade unions**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in public debate and in reactions on policy plan.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Though the Netherlands had a junior minister and an agency in charge of equality policy from 1975 onwards, women's movement activists were dissatisfied with their accomplishments. The issue of women and politics re-emerged on the media agenda at the beginning of the 1980's when Joke Smit, by then terminally ill, pleaded for an independent women's party. In reaction to this, female members of parliament united in an 'All Parties Women's Caucus' (Kamerbreed Vrouwenoverleg) and agreed to work together on women's issues across party lines. Independent feminist intellectuals organised two conferences under the title 'Feminism and political power'. The abortion campaign that mobilised many women resulted in 1981 in a compromise law that was unsatisfactory for feminists, but did provide a liberated practice.

In September 1981 the Social Democratic party entered the cabinet again in a coalition with the Christian Democrats and D66. Hedy D'Ancona became junior minister for equality policy. She initiated a new policy plan, incorporating recent theorising about gender inequality. Unfortunately, the cabinet fell in May 1982 and remaining parties moved on without the labour party until a rightwing coalition took over in November 1982. Equality policy was taken over by liberal Mrs Kappeyne van de Coppello, who proceeded with the program left by her Social Democratic predecessor. The diagnosis was translated into a policy paper in 1984, discussed with women's organisations and adopted by the cabinet in 1985.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the dominant frame in government memoranda was gendered, but took a very paternalistic approach to women. Initially the gendered frame presented a negative image of women as backward and uneducated. Participants argued that women would first have to be educated about politics before they could claim positions in Dutch politics. Suggestions for quotas for female representatives were rejected, because debate participants argued that they would compromise the quality of the candidates.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Women are backward and uneducated; need to be educated about politics before they can participate.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained gendered throughout, but it lost the paternalistic lens and focused less on educating women before they became involved in politics. The frame at the end of the debate focused more on the balance of power between women and men and sought to find ways to use political representation to give women more power vis a vis men. Under the final frame, women's movement actors intervened and argued that structural discrimination was the reason that so few women were political representatives. WMA actors differed however in their ideas about formal politics; one section was of the opinion that the feminist struggle should concentrate on changing society, the other that formal politics too should be conquered by feminists.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Should be balance of power between women and men; find ways to use political representation to give women more power vis a vis men.

Structural discrimination keeps women out of politics (not ignorance).

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

DCEP supported women's movement goals and sought to change the discourse in the debate by supporting conferences and research on politics. This means that they supported the idea of women's equality with men in politics.

On this issue: Formal orientation was still the one described in the old policy plan 'Emancipatie, Proces van verandering en groei'.

Political parties are autonomous.

A quota system is not compatible with our democratic-political system.

We do need more women in delegations and committees.

We subsidize 'education'.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

No position taken.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Equality for women and men in politics; give more power to women vis a vis men.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality policy (DCEP)

Cross sectional; heavy emphasis on raising awareness about women's status and setting up institutions at provincial level to establish policy network;

Probably in discussion on this issue: the Werkgroep Theoretisch Kader was clearly influenced by the societal turn in politics as exemplified by Althusser and Miliband; two influential civil servants wrote an interesting article in the Soc-Fem teksten, arguing for an 'Iron Ring' of parliamentarians, civil servants and movement organizations.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

Multi-issue—it covered many different areas of policy for women but did not systematically do so.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

DCEP was located in the Ministry of Social Affairs. It was a directorate under a junior minister.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

The EC is as an advisory body within the corporatism of the day had members appointed by the cabinet on the basis of expertise, while at the same representativeness across the major parties was ensured. It also always had a token man! And usually one non-party affiliated member from the autonomous wm. It has a professional staff to prepare the reports covering all relevant fields of expertise. Autonomous from government. But is funded by government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Department for the Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Name: 1981-1982 D’Ancona (female Social Democrat and feminist),

Years in WPA: 9 months in office,

WMA activity: Leader of MVM, founder of Opzij, active feminist from 1966 till today.

Name: Lou de Graaf 1982-1982 (male, christian democrat, trade union man, no feminist at all)

Years at WPA: 6 months in office

WMA activity: None

Name: Annelien Kappeyne van de Coppello 1982-1986 4 years in office; died soon afterwards

Years at WPA: 1982-86

WMA activity: female, conservative (VVD), feminist and member of ‘Vrouwenbelangen’.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and sources: The women’s movement had been at its zenith in the 1970s; in the early 1980s it had consolidated its position when many movement groups set up formal organisations and started to specialise in various issue areas.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Abortion**
- **Job training and sexual violence**
- **Political representation of women**
- **Social security**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system
– **The Dutch Cabinet**
– **Government ministries**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
November 1981-May 1982: CDA/PvdA/D66
May 1982-November 1982: CDA/D66
November 1982-July 1986: CDA/VVD

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
UN International Women's Year 1975

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:
(a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;
(b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;
(c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.

Debate ID: NLD_PR3 1989-1997

Title: Reform of Corporatist System

WPA: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/04/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **D’Ancona and Dales**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are not seen as serious political actors; their interests are neglected. Only more women in politics can remedy this.**

Policy Goals: **Quota, monitoring, attention to selection procedures.**

WMA 2

Name: **Vrouwenbelangen**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **More women and attention to women’s issues are both vital for furthering women’s position.**

Policy Goals : **More women and more expertise on women in committees.**

WMA 3

Name: **Arachne**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **No specific frame, or goals, just generally concerned with women**

Policy goals: **None**

WMA 4

Name: **Leijenaar**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Selection procedures are biased against women**

Policy Goals: **Fair procedures, quota, monitoring.**

WMA 5

Name: **Oldersma, University Leiden**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Not only are there too few women, because of biased selection; women’s interest and expertise on gender issues are also neglected.**

Policy Goals: **Quota for women, monitoring; more attention to and incorporation of women’s organizations and gender expertise.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women are not seen as serious political actors; their interests are neglected. Only more women in politics can remedy this.**

More women and attention to women's issues are both vital for furthering women's position.

Policy Goals: More women and more expertise on women in committees.

Quota, monitoring, attention to selection procedures.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Committee sought to reform existing corporatist structures. To achieve this, it introduced the Desert Law which:**
 - a. **abolished all existing advisory bodies as of January 1, 1997**
 - b. **In the new situation every department would have only one advisory body for strategic long term planning, consisting of leading experts in the field.**
2. **The Home Office, concerned with implementing the reform of corporatism, installed a helpdesk to aid selectors to find women with expertise in their field. 'Top link', an organisation sponsored by DCEP, helped to find women, if the resources of the ministries fell short. Installation of some committees had to be postponed until a satisfactory percentage of women had been found. The new committees averaged 40% women.**
3. **Substantive representation measures did not fare as well as descriptive representation measures. The Emancipation Council lost a third of its members and was ultimately abolished in 1997 and replaced by a smaller panel of experts that lasted only three years.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 D'Ancona and Dales

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organizations

Activities During the Debate: Scheming and plotting with colleague Ter Veld to give women in politics a giant push during their time in office (1989-1993/94); Ministries, parliament. D'Ancona was very present in the media; Dales made sure attention was paid to the position of women in debates about this issue.

WMA 2 Vrouwenbelangen

Form: Formal organization

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Disseminating information through their bulletin; The bulletin was sent to members who are often involved in local or national politics.

WMA 3 Arachne

Form: Formal organization

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Disseminating information through their monthly bulletin; The bulletin was sent to a wide range of organizations and individuals involved with the issue.

WMA 4 LeijenaarForm: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Wrote influential dissertation and report for ER on women in politics and public administration in which advisory circles were criticized for having to few women an having not a clue as to why they should be there.**

WMA 5 Oldersma, University LeidenForm: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Writing dissertation on women in corporatism and report for ER on women's plight in advisory circles after Raad op Maat; Report was sent to cabinet and members of parliament; articles in Vrouwenbelangen and other venues.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the 1970's corporatism appeared on the policy agenda when 'Iron Rings' were blamed for frustrating 'progressive' politics. In the 1980's the corporatist channel seemed to form an obstacle to retrenchment policies and gradually the thought occurred that abolishing commissions might in itself be a way to cut costs. As a result of diligent weeding by a number of committees, the committee System slimmed down to about half its size during this decade. Failed attempts to restructure the welfare state resulted in 1992 in a parliamentary enquiry: the main conclusions were that responsibilities of politicians and represent of economic interests had been obscured. In 1989, D66 managed to put constitutional reform on the parliamentary agenda in the form of the Deetman-committee, formed by the leaders of all parties. In the wake of this committee, the committee-De Jong, consisting of parliamentarians, was asked to propose a renovation of the corporatist channel resulting in drastic restructuring.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate was non gendered and focused on the dangers of corporatism and allowing too many interest groups into the state. Opponents of corporatism thought that the influence of interest groups would overload the state. Rather than corporatist types of interests, the opponents of corporatism argued that the state should appoint panels of experts to advise them on policy matters. The emancipation commission was one of the advisory groups to be disbanded; though it consisted officially of independent experts, it was seen as an interest intermediating committee.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through its course, the debate became gendered and focused on letting women on advisory bodies. There were two aspects to this frame: one which focused on descriptive representation and one that focused on substantive representation; i.e. the emancipation commission or expertise on gender issues in the new committees. The frame that focused on descriptive representation won out, as it was easier to create policies that encourage the descriptive representation of women and the head of the WPA was not interested in the issue.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Bring more women onto advisory bodies (descriptive).

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

Ter Veld wanted to keep the ER and had made women's representation one of three priorities for her time in office; her successor Wallage (she stepped down in 1993) tried to rescue Substantive representation; i.e. specific advising on women's issues, when it became clear that the ER was going to be abolished. Melkert, who took over in 1994 prioritized labor market issues and was not interested in policy network building.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

Note: no evidence of emphasis on gender equality and challenges to male dominance; rather substantive representation 'women's issues' is emphasized.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation policy (DCEP)

DCEP was still cross sectional; their formal brief was still the policy plan adopted in 1985. In 1992, however, priority was given to three issues: the combination of work and care, women in politics and 'beeldvorming' (a Foucauldian notion of representation; best translated maybe as 'framing').

During this period DCEP was struggling with its policy; three 'projectgroepen', advisory groups of civil servants and independent experts were asked to make concrete proposals to integrate women's policy issues in 'normal' politics. The politics group took the ER report by Leijenaar as its starting point and set up a policy of lobbying and monitoring. The 'beeldvorming' (or framing) group spent much time to figure out how this issue might be put to practical use and came up with proposals to pay more attention to policy discourse. Their work coincided with the development of the Emancipation Effect Report by Verloo and Roggeband; a practical way to directly influence policy discourse before decisions are taken. In 1994 this orientation changed; labor market issues were prioritized. The policy network of the agency itself was disrupted by an attempt to 'renew' and reshuffle the organizations it dealt with. Women's organizations were kicked out while

captains of industry were invited (out went the women; in came the men in suits, one civil servant said).

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

DCEP was still a directorate in the ministry of Social Affairs.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

Name: **Elske ter Veld (PvdA)**

Years in WPA: **Nearly 4; stepped down in last year because of disability insurance proposals.**

WMA activity: **Active in Rooie Vrouwen of PvdA, in women's section of labor union and in organization of female parliamentarians, probably from high school; leading feminist.**

Jacques Wallage (PvdA): five or six months; married to a known feminist.

Ad Melkert (PvdA) 1994-1998; took the position on as part of his duties as Minister of Social Affairs; left most of the work to his Director of the agency, Ina Brouwer; no known feminist affiliations.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **The women's movement had been at its zenith in the 1970s; in the early 1980s it had consolidated its position when many movement groups set up formal organisations and started to specialise in various issue areas.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reconciliation work/family life**
- **Childcare**
- **Care**
- **Political representation**
- **Migrant women.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Home Office**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

1989-1994: CDA/PvdA

1994-1998: VVD/PvdA/D66 purple coalition

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAN on gender balance in decision-making through the EU**
- **Council of Europe and UN**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

(a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;

(b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;

(c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations concerned with the public and political life of the country.

Debate ID: NLD_PT1 1983-1989

Title: Failure of Bill to Repeal Brothel Ban

WPAs: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP);
Emancipation Council (EC)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/03, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Andree van Es (PSP)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **She also stuck to elements of the sexual domination frame when talking about trafficking.**

Policy goals:

WMA 2

Name: **Wijnie Jabaaij (Social Democrat party)**

Micro Frame

Issue definition: **Also used sexual domination frame when talking about trafficking.**

Policy goals:

WMA 3

Name: **Len Rempt-Halman de Jongh (Liberal party)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Somewhat more emphasis on regulation of sex business, but stuck to sex work frame as well.**

Policy goals:

WMA 4

Name: **Anti-Sex Tourism Group**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Framed trafficking in terms of sexual exploitation of third world women by European men. They were combating trafficking by prosecuting sex tourists and traffickers.**

Policy goals: **Raising the penalty for trafficking, divert more money and give priority to finding traffickers and bringing them into court.**

WMA 5

Name: **The Pink Thread**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Accepting sex work and making it a normal profession is only way to improve sex workers' position.**

Policy goals: **Lift the brothel ban.**

WMA 6

Name: **The Foundation Against Trafficking in Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **STV focused on trafficking, which it saw as a consequence of the unequal division of wealth between poor and rich countries.**

Policy goals: : **Lift the ban on brothels to make prostitution normal work, help trafficked women, set up info centers in Thailand and Philippines to inform women about trafficking and abuse, give priority to finding and sentencing traffickers and raise the penalty in order to hold traffickers in remand. Give temporary residence permits to victims so they can witness at trials and inform police.**

WMA 7

Name: **Red Thread**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The stigmatizing of sex workers and exploitation by sex bosses, turn it into sex work.**

Policy goals: **Lift ban on brothels, regulate sex work as normal work.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Trafficking is form of sexual domination; current situation stigmatizes and exploits sex workers by bosses.**

Policy goals: **Turn it into sex work; lift ban on brothels; find and sentence traffickers, raise penalties and punish them.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **No change in law; brothels still banned**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Andree van Es (PSP)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **As MP, spoke in parliament.**

WMA 2 **Wijnie Jabaaij (Social Democrat party)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **As MP, spoke in parliament.**

WMA 3 **Len Rempt-Halmann de Jongh (Liberal party)**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **As MP, spoke in parliament.**

WMA 4 **Anti-Sex Tourism Group**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the Hague conference in raising the issue, and held demonstrations at schiphol airport which made the press.**

WMA 5 The Pink Thread

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Was a support group for the red thread, helping them in mobilizing sex workers. it consisted of feminists from the autonomous movement who had been active in radical feminism and consciousness raising. Some of them were also active in the Dutch sex debates about lesbian sex, vanilla sex vs. s&m.**

WMA 6 The Foundation Against Trafficking in Women

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by using the media.**

WMA 7 Red Thread

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities during the debate:

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1983 the Liberal Minister of Justice, Korthals Altes (cabinet Lubbers II – CDA/VVD)(not to be confused with his later successor Korthals) submitted a bill (18202) to parliament to modernise the Penal Code, one of which was to remove the outdated penalty of work camps for pimps. During the parliamentary debate, the Christian Democrats proposed to lift the ban on brothels so that municipalities would be able to regulate prostitution more effectively. A majority supported the proposal, so that the Minister revised his bill. He resubmitted the bill in 1985, from then on labelled the ‘Repeal of the brothel ban’.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

There were three competing frames under the dominant frame. One frame focused on prostitution as a moral vice and argued that the state should focus on abolishing prostitution as it was immoral. A second frame focused on sexual violence and domination and argued that should regulate prostitution to ensure that it was not forced activity and try to eliminate sexual violence in this way. A third frame was the sex work frame and it stressed that prostitution was a private affair and argued that the state should intervene to eliminate forced prostitution and to ensure that prostitutes had good working conditions. All of these frames were gendered, the main difference being that the traditional moral frame and the sexual domination frame view women as victims, while the sex work frame allows for a modern sex worker who knows what she is doing.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Women as victims who need protection**
- **Women as modern sex workers who know what they are doing**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The bill meant that the sex work perspective gained the upper hand, but it did not mean that the moral framing disappeared and that there was no opposition based on it. It resurfaced with the attempt of the minister of justice to undo the dichotomy between forced and voluntary prostitution. The sexual domination did fade away, along with radical feminism in the Netherlands.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Woman is a modern sex worker who knows what she is doing, not a victim.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 **Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

The DCEP released several policy papers during the debate and it made crucial distinction between forced prostitution and voluntary prostitution. The DCEP also supported lifting the brothel ban, arguing that it would help to improve the lives of prostitutes.

WPA 2 **Emancipation Council (EC)**

Not applicable

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 **Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

The DCEP had a cross-sectional mandate. Emphasis in this period was on developing the beleidsplan, which aimed at an overall analysis of the position of women and was the fundament for dce's cross-sectional interventions. Special emphasis was on sexual violence and women's labour.

WPA 2 **Emancipation Council (EC)**

Multi-issue—it covered many different areas of policy for women but did not Systematically do so.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 **Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

The DCEP was shifted to the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment. With this move, the DCEP hoped to gain access to crucial policy arenas to improve women's status; the ministry handled all labour market policy and all of social security issues.

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

The EC as an advisory body within the corporatism of the day had members appointed by the cabinet on the basis of expertise, while at the same representativeness across the major parties was ensured. It also always had a token man! And usually one non-party affiliated member from the autonomous wm. It has a professional staff to prepare the reports covering all relevant fields of expertise. Autonomous from government. But is funded by government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership**WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)**

Name: Annelien Kappeyne van de Coppello, Liberal party, was the political head (1983-1986) the civil service director was Dineke Mulock Houwer.

Years in WPA: Mulock Houwer;1978-1987

WMA activities: None

WPA 2 Emancipation Council (EC)

Name: Dianne Van Leeuwen (Liberal Party)

Years in WPA: 1981-1987

WMA activity: None

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and sources: The women's movement had been at its zenith in the 1970s; in the early 1980s it had consolidated its position when many movement groups set up formal organisations and started to specialise in various issue areas.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- Abortion**
- Job training and sexual violence**
- Political representation of women**
- Social security**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

Religious parties were all opposed, and indeed at the local level always tried to prevent the spread of prostitution as it was seen as socially undesirable as well as morally wrong. There were no separate new organizations set up to maintain the ban, but in local communities citizen's groups in the neighborhood against prostitution were very common. But few of them had a long life. Their framing would typically be law and order and nimby behavior.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- The Ministry of Justice**
- Ministry of Health and Welfare**
- DCEP**

– **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The government was led by a Christian Democrat- Liberal coalition.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

– **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women**

– **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: NLD_PT2 1989-1993

Title: Law on Trafficking of Persons

WPA: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Action of Feminist Lawyers**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Distinction between voluntary and forced prostitution; forced prostitution a violation of human rights.**

Policy goals: **Supported a distinction in the anti trafficking law.**

WMA 2

Name: **The Foundation Against Trafficking**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Trafficking was seen as a consequence of the division between rich and poor countries in the world, and women migrate to do sex work to help their families back home. Enterprising criminals make use of this division, forcing some of the potential group into prostitution.**

Policy goals: **Lift the ban on brothels, help victims of trafficking, give them temporary residency permits to stay to testify during trials of traffickers. In the course of the debate it demanded working permits for sex workers from non eu countries and legalization of illegal sex workers in the Netherlands.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist
No feminist ideas.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Law included a revised definition of sex trafficking to distinguish it from normal prostitution. The bill defined trafficking as when a person, brings another by way of violence, threat of violence or takes advantage by abuse of authority or deceit, into the prostitution business, or any action undertaken of which her or she knows or in reason can be aware of that the other will land up in the prostitution business.**
2. **The Law also increased the penalty for trafficking from five years prison to six years.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Action of Feminist Lawyers**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Only a few of its members were interested, but these were very active, following the issue in its journal.**

WMA 2 The Foundation Against TraffickingForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **The Foundation participated in the debate by supplying the First Chamber of parliament with research and information.****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

The Working Group Against Sex Tourism had started the debate on trafficking in 1982 at the Hague Conference. The issue made its way into the DCEP policy papers, where it was defined as the prime example of forced prostitution and as a contravention of the basic human rights of sexual self-determination and bodily integrity of women. It also became evident that effective action against trafficking encountered barriers at the local level. Police were not giving it priority, and victims of trafficking, mainly women from the Far East and Latin America, were reluctant to report the offence as they were often without papers. Complaints from feminist activists and sympathetic police officers led to a working party established by the five attorney-generals of the Netherlands. It came up with new directives to facilitate prosecution of traffickers and a feasible definition of trafficking. Moreover, temporary residency permits became obtainable to victims willing to witness at trials against their traffickers in 1988 after pressure from the DCEP and the Foundation against Trafficking of Women.

Legal change remained necessary to insert a broader definition of trafficking in the Penal Code and to raise the sentences for traffickers. At first the Minister of Justice, Korthals Altes (Liberal party) was reluctant to move on the issue, but after pressure in the Second Chamber from the Standing Group for Women's Equality policy (who in turn had been lobbied by femocrats from the DCEP) in 1988, he introduced bill 21027 on the Trafficking of Persons in 1989. The bill included a revised definition of the offence and a higher penalty, raising it from five to six years of imprisonment.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate was framed in terms of trafficking as forced prostitution, distinguishing it from voluntarily prostitution; forced prostitution was in conflict with human rights.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end of the debate the framing has become partly undone, as the distinction was not thought to apply for 'third world' women, who were thought of as

trafficked by definition. The images of the latter women was again in terms of victims.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women as victims

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)
DCEP supported the distinction between voluntary and forced prostitution

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality policy (DCEP)
Cross-Sectional. Dealt with women's policy issues across all ministries.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality policy (DCEP)
It was located in the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment as a directorate directly under the political head.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)
Name and years: **Political Head 1989- 1994: Elske Ter Veld(Social Democrat Party)**
Director: Annemarijke Steen (1987-1994)
WM activities: **Ter Veld came from the federation of dutch trade unions where she had been head of the women's secretariat, she then was an MP for the Social Democrats, and was spokesperson for social security issues.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and sources: **Only a number of specialised interest groups and professional organisations, many of them state-funded, remained functioning, although a broader and well-informed feminist public continued to exist.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Reconciliation work/family life**
- **Childcare**
- **Care**
- **Political representation**
- **Migrant women.**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength
No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Minister of Justice**
- **Parliament.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

There was a Christian Democrat- Social Democrat coalition.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: NLD_PT3 1997-2000

Title: Repeal of the Brothel Ban

WPA: Department for Coordination of Equality Policy (DCEP)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/06/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Foundation Against Trafficking in Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Problem was the bad situation of sex workers and illegal sex clubs. Voluntary prostitution should be legal, and brothels.**

Policy goals: **The foundation argued that illegal prostitutes should be legalized and argued that the Netherlands should grant work permits to prostitutes from non- EU countries. It supported lifting the ban and turning prostitution into sex work.**

WMA 2

Name: **Red Thread**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Problem was the bad situation of sex workers and illegal sex clubs. Voluntary prostitution should be legal, and brothels.**

Policy goals: **Backed legalization of brothels and making prostitution sex work.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

No challenge of gender hierarchies in these microframes.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The bill sought to control and regulate the exploitation of voluntary prostitution.**
2. **Brothels are legal but have to conform to a number of standards set by the municipality in which they are located**
3. **The bill aimed to fight forced prostitution more effectively, to protect minors from sexual abuse and to protect the position of prostitutes. It also aimed to attack criminals in the sex world.**
4. **Additionally, the repeal would allow for setting of standards and licensing at the local level. Decriminalizing voluntary prostitution and turning it into work would lead to the normalization, control, cleansing, and regulation of the sex business.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Foundation Against Trafficking in Women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Foundation participated in the debate by making their opinions public. It lobbied as well, targeting MPs; joined the National Platform in policy sub-system.**

WMA 2 **Red Thread**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Trade union of prostitutes; lobbying. Joined the National Platform—in policy sub-system.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After the elections of 1994 the repeal became part of the coalition pact of the new ‘purple’ cabinet (Kok I). The lobby for repeal remained strong; the sex entrepreneurs had united in an Association of Entrepreneurs of Relax Businesses (Vereniging van Exploitanten van Relax bedrijven) for this purpose and the Foundation Against Trafficking of Women lobbied for legalisation of illegal prostitutes. Local authorities started to anticipate on the repeal by setting standards for sex clubs and occasionally raiding their premises in search of under age prostitutes or women without valid papers. The bill was introduced in the Second Chamber in 1997.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of sex work. Prostitution was conceptualized as hard work which demanded certain skills and a degree of toughness. Additionally, the frame distinguished between forced and voluntary prostitution. The debate was gendered in that it recognized that sex workers (who were primarily women) should be treated like other workers. Also, the debate was gendered in that it recognized that females were the prime victims of sex trafficking. The proponents of the sex work frame argued that the government should repeal the ban on brothels in order to improve the position of prostitutes.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Sex workers are women who should be treated like other workers**
- **Women are the prime victims of sex trafficking.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In the end, the debate was still framed in terms of sex work. The end of the debate brought new images of prostitutes: as someone who engaged in a job that was demanding and involved much hard work. The debate also remained gendered through the end. The frame at the end also included a distinction for paid sex with a minor, which was defined as forcing minor into prostitution.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Sex workers are women who should be treated like other workers**
- **Women are the prime victims of sex trafficking.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 The Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

The DCEP supported the repeal of the ban on brothels and was silent on the issue of granting citizenship to illegal immigrants who were the victims of sex trafficking.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation policy (DCEP)

Cross sectional.

In this period mainstreaming had taken off; shifting a number of issues to other ministries (notably health, education, legal affairs and social security) but it still had its coordination function. Issues mainly handled were issues around the combination of work and family life.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

The DCEP was located within the Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment, as part of the civil service of that ministry; it was a directorate directly under the minister.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 Department for Coordination of Emancipation Policy (DCEP)

Name: Political Head; Ad Melkert, Minister Of Social Affairs, Social Democratic Party, 1994-1998; 1998-2002 A Junior Minister Took Over Women's Affairs; Annelies Verstand (D66), (Social Liberals)

Name: Director; Ina Brouwer

Years in WPA: 1995-2000

WMA activities: No, Brouwer was originally a non-feminist communist but became acquainted with feminism when she became one of the leaders of the succeeding green left party, her new junior minister Verstand had no Women's Movement connections. Minister Melkert was sympathetic towards feminism and realized he could 'score' with the issue.

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Decline

Evidence and source: By the mid 1990s a mobilised women's movement had disappeared and the institutionalised organisations were directly affected by the reorganisation of the women's policy network, leading to loss of access and expertise when jobs were cut.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

– Reconciliation work/family life

- **Childcare**
- **Care**
- **Political representation**
- **Migrant women**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate.

The orthodox protestant parties, who not only opposed in parliament but activated the grass roots in those municipalities where they were in the local council and had aldermen.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Ministry of Justice**
- **DCEP**
- **A group of prostitution NGOs united under the National Platform for Prostitution**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

There was a coalition of Social Democrats, Social Liberals, and Liberals in the majority.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking of Women,**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SPA_AB1 1983-85

Title: Decriminalization of Abortion

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Deputy Pelayo Duque Union of Democratic Center**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Under the current law rich women could afford safe abortions performed abroad while poor women had to suffer unsafe clandestine abortions at home: socio economic injustice.**

Policy goals: **Supported Socialist conditional abortion bill.**

WMA 2

Name: **Senator Ruiz-Tables Morales**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Under the current law rich women could afford safe abortions performed abroad while poor women had to suffer unsafe clandestine abortions at home: socio economic injustice.**

Policy goals: **Supported Socialist conditional abortion bill.**

WMA 3

Name: **Senator Sauquillo Perez del Arco. PSOE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Under the current law rich women could afford safe abortions performed abroad while poor women had to suffer unsafe clandestine abortions at home: socio economic injustice.**

Policy goals: **Supported Socialist conditional abortion bill.**

WMA 4

Name: **Pro-Abortion Commission (*Comisión Pro-Derecho al Aborto*)**

This is one of several feminist organizations with an estimated 3 to 5 in all.

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right.**

Policy Goals: **demanded complete decriminalization.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right.**

Policy goals: **Demanded complete decriminalization.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Decriminalized abortion on the grounds of physical and mental health of the mother, deformity of the fetus, and pregnancy due to rape.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Deputy Pelayo Duque Union of Democratic Center**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Spoke on floor in favor of Socialist bill.**

WMA 2 **Senator Ruiz-Tables Morales**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Spoke on floor in favor of Socialist bill.**

WMA 3 **Senator Sauquillo Perez del Arco. PSOE**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (parliament)**

Activities During the Debate: **Spoke on floor in favor of Socialist bill.**

WMA 4 (5, 6, 7) **Pro-Abortion Commission (*Comisión Pro-Derecho al Aborto*)**

This is one of several feminist organizations with an estimated 3 to 5 in all.

Form: **Formal (in Madrid)**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized pro choice street demonstrations in favor of complete decriminalization.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Although the socialist party- Partido Socialista Obrero Espanol, PSOE- had not included references to abortion in its 1977 and 1979 electoral programs, other party documents issued in the 1970s, such as the resolutions of federal congresses, advocated radical reforms, for example, abortions provided free of charge by the public health system. Nevertheless, the party was divided mainly between supporters of a broad abortion liberalization and supporters of a more limited reform. In the context of electoral competition, PSOE leaders took the latter position. This was part of their overall strategy to convert the PSOE into a moderate catch- all party capable of achieving power.

In order to fulfill a compromise included in its 1982 electoral program, the socialist government presented a bill on the reform of the Penal Code on 25 February 1983. The bill contained an article that decriminalized abortion on ethical, therapeutic, and eugenic grounds. This parliamentary debate began six years after the first democratic elections were held in Spain, and four months after the PSOE first came to power, which it retained until Spring 1996. The debate started eight months before the Women's Institute was established.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate:

A debate between the need to modernize Spanish law by decriminalizing abortion and adapting law to the social reality that abortions would take place no matter

what VERSUS the defence of fetus' rights through continued criminalization. The frame was not gendered at the beginning.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.
Only a few references to women during the debate; the dominant frame remained unchanged.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WI: WI urged government to move rapidly to solve the grave problem that criminalization of abortion caused many women. The position was allied with the women's movement. The Women's Institute argued that abortion should be allowed under certain circumstances CV says that Bustelo (head) supported a more liberal law than the Socialists proposed. We don't know if it was a periodic law or a complete decriminalization.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None; no evidence that WI articulated pro choice position.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
The Women's Institute had a focus on all issues that affected women; helping to improve the status of women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
The Women's Institute was created in 1983 as a bureaucratic agency inside the Ministry of Culture, one of the lowest agencies within the Spanish government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Name: **Carlota Bustelo**
Years in WPA: **1983-88**
WMA activity: **Member of the Women's Liberation Front (Frente de Liberacion de la Mujer, FLM) prior to becoming the leader of the Women's Institute. Former socialist Deputy and feminist activist.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Stage: **Consolidation**
Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Divorce**
- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of Parliament**
- **Party leaders**
- **Prime Minister**
- **Cabinet Ministers**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE: Socialist party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: SPA_AB2 1986

Title: The Regulations of the 1985 Abortion Act

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Pro-Abortion Commission (*Comisión Pro-Derecho al Aborto*) (representative of other radical groups.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right.**

Policy goals: **Abortion on demand, free of charge in the health system.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right.**

Policy goals: **Abortion on demand, free of charge in the health system.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The outcome involved scaling back the most restrictive regulations issued by the Minister of Health:**
 - a. **Suppress assessment committees (which Ministry of Health had proposed to decide whether women could get abortions).**
 - b. **Reduce material and human resources required for clinics to have the right to perform abortions up to 12 weeks of pregnancy.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 (**Representative of several radical groups**)

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Were critical of WI; accused it of 'deradicalization'; These groups boycotted some activities convoked by the Women's Institute on abortion.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The Ministry of Health and Consumption- hereafter called the Ministry of Health- had the responsibility of issuing the regulations. First, the ministry set forth the material and human resources required in clinics for the performance of abortion. These clinics were required to have a doctor specializing in obstetrics and gynecology; several nurses and nursing assistants; adequate facilities and tools to perform abortions; a clinical analysis laboratory; a unit for anesthesia and resuscitation; a blood bank; and a hospitalization unit. Clinics were also required to have a social service unit themselves or to have access to external social services. These requirements were more extensive than what was necessary from a health point of view. The Ministerial Ordinance also established that an assessment

committee composed of five members selected from health personnel must be present during the process leading to each induced abortion. The purpose of these committees was officially to facilitate the implementation of the act and to inform and give advice on problems of implementation.

In August 1985, the Ministry of Health made public a very broad conscience clause. According to this policy, health personnel, without giving concrete reasons, could refuse to help in abortion cases pertaining to any of three grounds. They could express this refusal in writing or by any other means, provided that the refusal was made directly to the head of the clinic, and could refuse to perform either specific abortions or abortions in general.

The Women's Institute (WI) monitored the implementation of the 1985 abortion act, and according to Victoria Abril, the technical adviser to the Institute's director, found grave insufficiencies. In September 1985 the WI drafted the first of a series of internal reports on the problems of the implementation of the 1985 abortion act to be sent to the Ministry of Health. On 10 July 1986 the WI sent to the Ministry of Health draft legislation on the implementation of the abortion act.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The dominant frame of the debate at the beginning was how restrictive or liberal the regulations should be implementing the abortion reform. This included requirements for doctors, clinics, assessment committees, conscience clauses.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

At the end of the debate, the issue frame focused on administrative regulations that would advance women's rights, enhancing the free decision of the pregnant woman. The focus was women's rights against physicians rights. In most cases this included more attention to liberalizing the Ministry's regulations.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Administrative regulations to advance women's rights**
- **Enhance the free decision of pregnant women**
- **Women's rights privileged against physicians' rights**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPAs by Acronym (includes QUAWPAs)

WI: liberalization of abortion law(before viability) central to 'fundamental right of the free development of personality of the woman.

- a. assessment committees exercised too great powers, powers that were not given them by law;**
- b. excessive resource requirements meant that few public clinics and no private clinics could perform abortions**

c. conscience clauses meant that few abortions were performed in public hospitals with adequate facilities.

WI asked the government to further decriminalize abortion.

Goal: facilitate access to abortion by suppressing the assessment committees. Also proposed change in the statute to add 4th ground for abortion: socio economic circumstances of the pregnant woman.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WI: liberalization of abortion law(before viability) central to ‘fundamental right of the free development of personality of the woman.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

Women's Institute had a cross sectional mandate to deal with issues that effected women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Women's Institute was created in 1983 as a bureaucratic agency inside the Ministry of Culture, one of the lowest agencies within the Spanish government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Carlota Bustelo**

Years in WPA: **1983-88**

WMA activity: **Member of the Women's Liberation Front (Frente de Liberacion de la Mujer, FLM) prior to becoming the leader of the Women's Institute. Former socialist Deputy and feminist activist.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Divorce**
- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

Strong counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Officials and agencies in the Ministry of Health**
- **Women’s Institute**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE-Socialist party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, access to health care services, including those related to family planning.

Debate ID: SPA_HI 2002

Title: Unemployment Insurance Reform

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/16/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women's Secretary of the UGT, Trade Union**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women would be particularly worst hit by the governmental reform because they comprise (together with young people, immigrants, disabled individuals and other citizens) the sector of the labor force in the weakest position.**

Policy goals: **Defeat the Royal Decree.**

WMA2

Name: **Dolores Liceras, Women's Secretary of the CCOO**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are among the weakest sector of the labor force and especially vulnerable to unemployment; thus they would be the hardest hit by this proposal.**

Policy goals: **Defeat the Royal Decree.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **None**

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

These were the government's proposals for the restriction of unemployment benefits, but were withdrawn and not adopted.

- 2. First, conditions to reject job offers by unemployed individuals would be tightened. Before the reform, the unemployed person decided which job offers were adequate to him/her (*colocación adecuada*). The reform would transfer the responsibility of this decision to employment services after unemployed people have received unemployment benefits for a year.**
- 3. Non- contributory means tested unemployment benefits for short- term agrarian workers in Andalusia and Extremadura would be ended for some length of time.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women's Secretary of the UGT**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **The Women's Secretary of the UGT argued that women should participate in the general strike and oppose the government's royal**

decree on unemployment. Further, the UGT secretary released a document on the potential effect of the royal decree on women.

WMA 2 Dolores Licerás

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Licerás participated in the debate by making her opinions public and by meeting with state authorities. Licerás encouraged women to participate in the general strike and was against the government proposal to reduce unemployment benefits.

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

On 11 April 2002, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs of the conservative government, Juan Carlos Aparicio Pérez, announced that the government was preparing a reform in the employment protection system. The main details of the reform were known in the following days. The reform would change the unemployment protection system in three regards. First, conditions to reject job offers by unemployed individuals would be tightened. Before the reform, the unemployed person decided which job offers were adequate to him/her (*colocación adecuada*). The reform would transfer the responsibility of this decision to employment services after unemployed people have received unemployment benefits for a year. A new definition of adequate job offers would be established. Before the reform, an adequate job offer was one corresponding to the job or profession usually performed by the unemployed person. Now, an adequate job offer would also be any offer corresponding to any job or profession that: can be performed by the unemployed person given his/her education level; is paid above the minimum wage (*salario mínimo interprofesional*); is available at a distance from the home of the unemployed person equal or shorter than 50 kilometers, provided that the unemployed individual needs no longer than three hours a day to go to and return from work; and is regulated by any type of work contract (whether temporary or permanent, part-time or full-time). If the unemployed person rejects an adequate job offer, s/he will be penalized with a reduction of three months of the period of entitlement of unemployment benefits. If s/he rejects a second adequate job offer, this reduction would be of six months. If s/he rejects a third adequate job offer, s/he would no longer be entitled to unemployment benefits

Second, the scheme of non-contributory means-tested unemployment benefits for short-term agrarian workers living in Andalusia and Extremadura would cease to exist in the medium-term. The scheme would remain in place for current beneficiaries, but new entrants would not be permitted. Instead of this scheme, a new scheme of unemployment benefits for agrarian workers active in the whole Spain would be established. These benefits would be given to unemployed agrarian workers who have contributed to the system for at least 12 months. These contributions could correspond to agricultural and non-agricultural work. The proportion between the period of reception of this benefit and the period of contribution to the system would be 1/4.

Third, the reform proposed a sharp reduction of the payment that an unemployed person receives when s/he sues her/his employer on the grounds of illegal dismissal (*salario de tramitación*). Up to the decision of the Court (if it is favorable to the worker), the employer has to pay up to 60 days of salary, while the state paid the salary during the remaining period. The reform would abolish this payment altogether except in the minority of cases in which the court decided that the dismissal is not illegal but void (*nulo*), and therefore the worker has to be reinstated into her/his job.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of ending state dependence and encouraging unemployed individuals to find work. The Spanish government argued that the current unemployment insurance system encouraged unemployed individuals to reject jobs and they set out to reform the system so that it would encourage unemployed people to be more active in their search for work. The government argued that many unemployed individuals were abusing the current system by continuing to collect government benefits and finding jobs in the shadow economy.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate remained framed in terms of dependence and unemployment benefits, with the conservative government pushing reforms, and the left wing parties and unions vehemently opposing them. The debate remained gender neutral throughout, however there were some scant and negative references to women. Particularly, some special attention was given to females engaged in unemployment benefit fraud. Through these few references, women were portrayed as cheaters and fraudulent collectors of unemployment benefits.

Note: these references are all in the newspaper, not the policy sub-system.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The scope of the WI is very broad, because the WI has five comprehensive goals: to promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements; to study all aspects of women's situation in Spain; to oversee the

implementation of women's policy; to receive and handle women's discrimination complaints; and to increase women's knowledge of their rights.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Women's Institute is usually formed as a unit within a government ministry, the Ministry for Labor and Social Affairs.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Carmen de Miguel y Carcia 2002-2003;**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Highly ranked politicians and bureaucrats in the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs**
- **UGT trade union**
- **CCOO trade union**
- **CEOE employers' organization**
- **CEPYME employers' organization**
- **The political party in power**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Partido Popular

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 11

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights, in particular:

- (a) The right to work as an inalienable right of all human beings;**
- (b) The right to the same employment opportunities, including the application of the same criteria for selection in matters of employment;**
- (c) The right to free choice of profession and employment, the right to promotion, job security and all benefits and conditions of service and the right to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training;**
- (d) The right to equal remuneration, including benefits, and to equal treatment in respect of work of equal value, as well as equality of treatment in the evaluation of the quality of work;**
- (e) The right to social security, particularly in cases of retirement, unemployment, sickness, invalidity and old age and other incapacity to work, as well as the right to paid leave;**
- (f) The right to protection of health and to safety in working conditions, including the safeguarding of the function of reproduction.**

Debate ID: SPA_JT1 1985

Title: EU Funding in the 1985 national plan

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/13/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **UGT Confederal Department of Women (trade union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Training is a means to narrow the difference in education and skills between women and men.**

Policy goals: **Place women in traditionally underrepresented professions and upper management positions in all occupations.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Secretariat of the Workers' Commissions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Occupational training currently was of little use to women in finding a job or in improving individual job prospects.**

Policy goals: **Training programs should provide women with more useful skills to compete in the labor market; job training should reorient women toward traditionally male occupations and some should target women.**

Actually, creation of jobs in the public sector is more effective means of promoting employment equality between men and women.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Job training to reorient women toward traditionally male occupations.**

Policy goals: **Promote employment equality between men and women.**

Improving the status of women in relation to men; undermining male privilege.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. National Training Plan to qualify for EU funding; no references to gender or women in the policy.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **UGT Confederal Department of Women (trade union)**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (Union)**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

WMA 2 **Women's Secretariat of the Workers' Commissions**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (workers commissions)**
Activities During the Debate: **None**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

On October 9, 1984 one of the main trade unions (the UGT) and the main employers' associations (the CEOE and the CEPYME) signed the Social and Economic Agreement (AES). The AES followed other tripartite and bipartite corporatist pacts endorsed in the preceding years. The AES mainly focused on unemployment issues. It also contained some training objectives including the promotion of youth entry into the labor market through occupational programs.

In the context of Spain's entry into the EC in 1986, policymakers knew that the European Social Fund financed up to 65% of occupational training activities in EC member states, provided that member states financed the remaining part. Top-level politicians and bureaucrats realized that Spain would risk missing the opportunity to receive European money in the absence of a comprehensive job training policy. Prior to 1985, piecemeal measures had articulated national job training policies. In 1985, the government adopted the National Plan of Professional Training and Insertion, or the National Plan.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate was framed in terms of labor market concerns- namely the need to reduce Spain's high unemployment rate. Spain saw that it needed to develop a comprehensive job training policy in order to take advantage of the funds from the European Union. The issue frame of the debate was gender-neutral.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on unemployment and the need to create job training programs and use the EU funds. The debate was entirely gender neutral and no one sought to introduce gender over its course. The unemployed, for example were referred to without any reference to whether they are men or women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WI: No micro frame

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WI: To deal with all policy issues with regards to women.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

**A permanent bureaucratic agency located in the Ministry of Culture
Director directly responsible to Minister.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Carlota Bustelo**

Years in WPA: **1983-88**

WMA activity: **Member of the Women's Liberation Front (Frente de Liberacion de la Mujer, FLM) prior to becoming the leader of the Women's Institute. Former socialist Deputy and feminist activist.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Divorce**
- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Major Trade Unions**
- **Employers Organizations**
- **Government—Minister of Labor**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE, Socialist party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: SPA_JT2 1985-86

Title: Creation of the General Council for Professional Training

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/13/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **UGT Confederal Department of Women (trade union)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Training is a means to narrow the difference in education and skills between women and men.**

Policy goals: **Place women in traditionally underrepresented professions and upper management positions in all occupations.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women's Secretariat of the Workers' Commissions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Occupational training currently was of little use to women in finding a job or in improving individual job prospects.**

Policy goals: **Training programs should provide women with more useful skills to compete in the labor market; job training should reorient women toward traditionally male occupations and some should target women.**

Actually, creation of jobs in the public sector is more effective means of promoting employment equality between men and women.

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Job training to reorient women toward traditionally male occupations.**

Policy goals: **Promote employment equality between men and women. improving the status of women in relation to men; undermining male privilege.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Creation of General Council For Professional Training**
2. **To oversee the implementation of job training programs in Spain to ensure that the programs matched the needs of employers.**
3. **Composition: 36 representatives, 13 from the government, labor and management; Ministers of Labor and Education appointed government representatives; presidency to alternate between the Ministries of Labor and Education; Four Vice Presidents – Minister of Labor, Agriculture or Industry, management and organized labor.**

No representatives from the Institute of Women, Parent Ministry at the time – the Minister of Culture was not on the Council.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 UGT Confederal Department of Women (trade union)

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **inside Non women's movement organization (Union)**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

WMA 2 Women's Secretariat of the Workers' Commissions

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (workers commissions)**

Activities During the Debate: **None**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the year following the adoption of the National Plan, Act number 1/1986 of 7 January created the General Council for Professional Training, or General Council. The General Council's purpose is to advise the government regarding occupational (and also vocational) training. It also elaborates policies since it proposes and approves regularly a plan on professional and vocational training and controls the implementation of the plan. The relatively short parliamentary discussions that led to the 1986 Act took place in the plenary session of the Congress of Deputies in June 27, 1985 and in subsequent sessions of the Commission of Education and Culture of the Congress of Deputies in November 26, 1985 and of the Commission of Education, Universities, Research, and Culture of the Senate in December 5, 1985.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Members of parliament from the Socialist Party argued that one of the causes of the high level of unemployment in Spain was the fact that the skills of the active population did not match the needs of employers. MPs from the main party in opposition, the Conservative Party, argued that the cause of the high unemployment rate was the lack of incentives for entrepreneurial activity and not so much the characteristics of job training programs.

The frame in the beginning of the debate was gender neutral and focused on the implementation of job training programs and economic issues.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue frame at the beginning of the debate

None

C3A_3—Issue frame at the end of the debate.

The debate retained its focus on job training and economic issues and was not gendered throughout. More specifically, it was argued that the high levels of unemployment were in large part due to the disconnect between the skills of workers and the needs of employers and the degree to which training programs did not address that gap. As a result, the new training authority should be managed by the state, management and labor. In addition to the appointment of tri-partite actors to the new authority, regional MPs were able to secure the inclusion of regional representatives on the new Council.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WI: No micro frame

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda
WI: To deal with all policy issues with regards to women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of wpa
**A permanent bureaucratic agency located in the Ministry of Culture
 Director directly responsible to Minister.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name: **Carlota Bustelo**
 Years in WPA: **1983-88**
 WMA activity: **Member of the Women's Liberation Front (Frente de Liberacion de la Mujer, FLM) prior to becoming the leader of the Women's Institute. Former socialist Deputy and feminist activist.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
 Stage: **Consolidation**
 Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Divorce**
- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
No countermovement

C23A_1—List of policy actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament: Congress of Deputies (Commission of Education and Culture)**
- **Senate (Commission of Education, Universities, Research and Culture)**
- **PSOE/ Socialist Majority in Parliament/Cabinet**
- **Organized Labor**

- **Organized Management**
- **Ministry of Labor**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE Socialist party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: SPA_JT3 1990-92

Title: Management of Program Delivery in the 1992 Agreements

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 5/28/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05, 2/4/06

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Women's commissions in trade unions**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are discriminated against in access to job training; occupational courses have been of little help for women in finding jobs or improving their positions in the labor market because the skills acquired in the courses were not those in short supply in the labor market; women took courses in traditionally female occupations, associated with low salaries and scarce promotion**

Policy goals: **More money should be spent on women's training; childcare should be available for women with family responsibilities; courses should redirect women toward professions where jobs are available.**

WMA2

Name: **Women's Foundation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equal opportunities for women; challenge domination by men in job training and advocate equality for women.**

Policy goals: **Improve women's situation in employment; improve job training for women.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women are discriminated against in access to job training; equal opportunities for women; challenge domination by men in job training and advocate equality for women.**

Policy goals: **More money should be spent on women's training; improve women's situation in employment; improve job training for women.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **On December 16, 1992, two agreements were signed by the state and the social partners: the National Agreement on Continued Training signed by the trade unions and employer's organizations, and the Tripartite Agreement on Continued Training for the Employed signed by the state, trade unions, and employer's organizations. The 1992 Agreements reformed the system of managing the delivery of public job training programs. The 1992 Agreements established that the National Institute of Employment would be in charge of the management of training programs only for unemployed individuals, while trade unions and employers' organizations would jointly administer job training for**

employed people. Bipartite foundations with representatives of workers and employers were created for this purpose. The foundation at the national level was called the Foundation for the Continuous Training in the Firm. The 1992 Agreements also established the promotion of on the job training activities in big firms, and in groups of small or medium firms.

- a. System for managing job training in Spain.**
- b. Newly established National Institute of Employment would be in charge of job training for unemployed people.**
- c. Labor unions and employers would be in charge of job training for employed people.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Women's sections in trade unions

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization (unions)**

Activities During the Debate: **Attended workshops sponsored by Women's Institute. made their views public on job training.**

WMA 2 Women's Foundation

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized training courses for women.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the early 1990s, it was clear that the training of the employed had been neglected in previous decades in favor of the training of the unemployed, somewhat understandably given the double-digit unemployment rates. It also became evident that the training of the unemployed needed more attention.

The debate that preceded the 1992 Agreements was triggered by soaring unemployment rates. The discussions were undertaken by policymakers mostly from the Ministry of Labor, trade unionists, and employers.

C3A_1—Issue frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The debate focused on job training and economic concerns and did not include gender issues. The debate focused on creating job training programs for people that were currently employed- an aspect of Spanish job training that had been traditionally ignored.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the debate.

The debate remained focused on job training issues and was not gendered over its course. Trade unionists and the Socialist party argued that inadequate training

was one of the major causes of unemployment; employers and the conservative party asserted that high salaries and lack of incentives for private investment were contributing factors.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

Training was the key to striking down sex based inequities between men and women in paid labor, particularly the problem of occupational segregation. Importance was placed on the need to make training programs fit into the schedules of working mothers.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Training was the key to striking down sex based inequities between men and women in paid labor, particularly the problem of occupational segregation.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The Women's Institute has a broad scope, with five major policy goals:

- 1. To promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements;**
- 2. To study all aspects of women's situation in Spain;**
- 3. To oversee the implementation of women's policy;**
- 4. To receive and handle women's discrimination complaints;**
- 5. And to increase the knowledge of their rights.**

Covers a broad range of women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Bureaucratic agency within the Ministry of Social Affairs responsible directly to the minister.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

a. Name: **Purificación Guttierrez**

b. Years in WPA: **1991-93**

WMA activity: **Lawyer and women's movement activist; belonged to AUPEPM and to the Front of Women's Liberation (*Frente de Liberación de la Mujer, FLM*).**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy actors in Sub-system

- **Labor Ministry (PSOE Majority)**
- **Two Major Trade Union Confederations**
- **Employers Associations**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE: Socialist party

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Further development of the equal employment TAN at the EU member state level.

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Part II, Article 11.1: State parties shall take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure on a basis of equality of men and women the same rights: in particular: to have the same rights as men: to receive vocational training and retraining, including apprenticeships, advanced vocational training and recurrent training.

Debate ID: SPA_PR1 1987-88

Title: Endorsement of a 25 percent quota for Women in the Socialist Party

QUAWPA: Socialist Party Women's Secretariat (SPWS)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Feminists: feminist branch of women's movement, individuals and organization who consider themselves feminist.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Equality for women can only be achieved through state action.**

Socialist party in power unique opportunity to improve women's rights and status.

Policy goals: **Support quotas.**

WMA2

Name: **Feminists in PSOE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in subtle and not so subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates; without the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others. PSOE feminists believed and hoped that left-wing parties would have the potential to be women-friendly because of their general commitment to equality They reminded their opponents that the Socialist International recommendation on the measures to increase women's presence in political decision-making positions should be adopted by member parties. Finally, pragmatic arguments were made. Quotas are gender equality measures that hence could help the PSOE win a higher share of the women's vote in subsequent elections by presenting a more feminized image and attracting more women's votes.**

Policy goals: **Support quotas.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in subtle and not so subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates; without the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.**

Policy goals: **Quotas**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **At the 31st PSOE Federal Congress, delegates passed the 25 percent women's quota for party positions and electoral lists.**

2. **Since then, the proportion of PSOE women MPs has almost constantly increased, to reach the level of 28 percent of PSOE deputies and 23 percent of PSOE senators in the 1996 election.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Feminists individuals and groups

Form: **Individuals, formal organizations**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Made statements of support**

WMA 2 Feminists in PSOE

Form: **Individuals and informal groups**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities: **Supported proposal from PSOE women's secretariat; lobby others.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In the 1970s, but specially in the 1980s, feminists within the PSOE had continuously denounced the low presence of women in top political decision making positions. In the 1977, 1979, 1982 and 1986 general elections, the percentage of women out of members of the Congress of Deputies had constantly been 6 percent. The PSOE had not been what we can call an achiever regarding women's political representation, because in the aforementioned elections, the proportions of women out of PSOE deputies were 9, 5, 9, and 7 percent respectively. As a result of feminists' pressures, the draft of the 1987 document to be discussed in January 1988 at the 31st PSOE Federal Congress contained a proposal of a 25 percent women's quota for party positions and electoral lists (Partido Socialista Obrero Español-Secretaría de Participación de la Mujer 1988.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning the debate was focused squarely on women's representation. 'The debate focused on the following questions: was it a grave problem that in the first decade of the Spanish democracy the presence of women in political decision-making positions was very low? If so, what were the causes of this problem? Could this problem be solved? Is it fair to reserve a proportion of political positions to a sector of the population (women)?' Through the debate quotas were offered as a solution to the low number of women in politics. In the beginning, the debate was gendered on both sides, but especially by the advocates of quotas.

Those against quotas relied on two types of arguments. One argument stressed that feminist demands for quotas were particularistic and bourgeois deviations from the main objective of the socialist party, which was to help the working class. Others opposed to quotas argued that there were few women in politics because women lacked the necessary qualifications and were not interested in politics. Feminists and others in the PSOE in favor of quotas argued that they were necessary to combat structural discrimination in the party, which prevented women from reaching positions as representatives. Further they argued that quotas were good because they would likely help the PSOE garner more of the female vote during elections.

Also: insufficient supply of female candidates; without quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Was it a grave problem that in the first decade of the Spanish democracy the presence of women in political decision-making positions was very low? If so, what were the causes of this problem? Could this problem be solved?**
- **Is it fair to reserve a proportion of political positions to a sector of the population (women)?**
- **Quotas are necessary to combat structural discrimination in the party, which prevented women from reaching positions as representatives**
- **Insufficient supply of female candidates; without quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake.**

C3A_3—Issue frame at the end of the debate.

Over its course, the debate remained gendered (mainly in the arguments of quota advocates) and focused on increasing women's political representation.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Was it a grave problem that in the first decade of the Spanish democracy the presence of women in political decision-making positions was very low? If so, what were the causes of this problem? Could this problem be solved?**
- **Is it fair to reserve a proportion of political positions to a sector of the population (women)?**
- **Quotas are necessary to combat structural discrimination in the party, which prevented women from reaching positions as representatives**
- **Insufficient supply of female candidates; without quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

QUAWPA: SPWS: Secretariat of the PSOE: women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in Subtle and not so Subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates. Advocates argued that in the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in Subtle and not so Subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates. Advocates argued that in the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA: **SPWS: To promote the status of women in the Socialist party.**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

QUAWPA: **SPWS permanent bureaucratic agency of PSOE part of the Federal Executive Committee of the party.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

QUAWPA

Name: **Matilde Fernandez**

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **She was active in the unions and women's sections; leading socialist feminist.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. Many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Divorce**
- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Women's Secretariat of the PSOE**
- **PSOE**
- **PSOE Federal Congresses**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE (not applicable)

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: SPA_PR2 1992-97

Title: Endorsement of a 40 percent women's quota in the Socialist party

QUAWPA: Socialist Party Women's Secretariat (SPWS)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Carmen Martínez-Ten**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Party policies needed to take into account women's disadvantaged position in relation to men.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 2

Name: **Purificación Gutiérrez**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Party policies needed to take into account women's disadvantaged position in relation to men.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 3

Name: **Matilde Fernandez**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Party policies needed to take into account women's disadvantaged position in relation to men.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 4

Name: **Cristina Alberdi**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Party policies needed to take into account women's disadvantaged position in relation to men.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 5

Name: **Federation of Progressive Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

List the Policy goals/proposals advanced by the WMA: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 6

Name: **Dolores Ibarruri Foundation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

List the Policy goals/proposals advanced by the WMA: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 7

Name: **Forum of Feminist Politics**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

List the Policy goals/proposals advanced by the WMA: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA 8

Name: **Amalia Gomez PP government**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Wrong to intervene in the recruitment process in order to elect more women. dismiss parity proposals as ‘wonderbra quota’. See this as a form of discrimination; want to give women real opportunities to gain centers of power. process must be fair and neutral so the best people can be elected.**

Policy Goals: **Oppose quotas.**

WMA 9

Name: **Women for Democracy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Wrong to intervene in the recruitment process in order to elect more women. dismiss parity proposals as ‘wonderbra quota’. See this as a form of discrimination; want to give women real opportunities to gain centers of power. process must be fair and neutral so the best people can be elected.**

Policy Goals: **Oppose quotas.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Party policies needed to take into account women’s disadvantaged position in relation to men.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The increase of party quotas to 40 percent.**

2. **Subsequently, the proportion of women out of PSOE deutes increased from 28 percent in 1996 to 37 percent in 2000, although the percentage of women among PSOE senators decreased from 23 percent to 17 percent between 1996 and 2000.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Carmen Martínez-Ten

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in the PSOE; had been high in the Women's Institute as femocrats.**

WMA 2 Purificación Gutiérrez

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in the PSOE; had been high in the Women's Institute as femocrats.**

WMA 3 Matilde Fernandez

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in the PSOE; had been high in the Women's Institute as femocrats.**

WMA 4 Cristina Alberdi

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active in the PSOE; had been high in the Women's Institute as femocrats.**

WMA 5 Federation of Progressive Women

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by pressuring left wing parties (it was close to the PSOE.)**

WMA 6 Delores Iburri

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Foundation participated in the debate by pressuring left wing parties (it was close to the IU).**

WMA 7 Forum for Feminist Politics

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their views public.**

WMA 8 Amalia Gomez, General Secretariat for Social Affairs in the PP government in 1997.

Form: **Formal within non WMA**

Location: **Within Non women's movement organization**

Activities: **Not in the debate; rather took a position.**

WPA 9 Women's associations close to the PP (conservative party) Women for Democracy

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities: **Took a position on the issue in public.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

At the European Summit of Women in Power held in Athens in 1992, the concept of 'parity democracy' was coined. In Spain, the expression 'parity democracy' has generally been used to Name a situation in which no sex occupies more than 60% of political decision-making positions. PSOE feminists took up the parity democracy issue, provoked a continuous debate within the party, and pressurized the party hierarchy to revise the 1988 quota of 25%.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was gendered and focused on issues surrounding parity democracy and women's representation. The discussion of parity democracy in the 1990s responded to the questions already raised in debate 1 and also others, including whether it was the right moment to increase the women's quota, and whether the party would better concentrate on the resolution of presumably more pending problems. To take steps toward parity democracy, feminists and others in favor of improving women's representation recommended increasing the quota for women in elected positions to 40%.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Need to increase women's representation**
- **Take steps toward parity democracy by approving 40% quota.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through its course, the debate remained focused on parity democracy and improving women's political representation. The debate was gendered by both sides, but those in favor of quotas referred to gendered notions more than those opposed. Those in favor of increasing the quota argued that it was necessary to prevent the socialist PSOE from resembling the Social Darwinistic aspects of right wing parties. Under this argument left wing parties should never adhere to Social Darwinist theses, because these parties are (or should be) more sensitive and critical to pre-existing inequalities that impede some groups to compete with others in life. A frame of recruitment on merit and qualifications and recruitment to represent women for equality/parity.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Need to increase women’s representation**
- **Take steps toward parity democracy by approving 40% quota.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

QUAWPA: SPWS Secretariat of the PSOE: women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in Subtle and not so Subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates. Advocates argued that in the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.

C5A_3—WPA feminist Micro Frames

Women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in subtle and not so subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates. Advocates argued that in the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA: SPWS: To promote the status of women in the Socialist party

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

SPWS QUAWPA: Permanent bureaucratic agency of PSOE part of the Federal Executive Committee of the party.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

SPWS:

QUAWPA

Name: Micaela Navarro; also an MP

Years in WPA: 1997-2004

WMA activity: Feminist

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: Consolidation

Evidence and sources: There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**

- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy actors in Sub-system

- **PSOE**
- **Party Leaders**
- **Women’s Secretariat**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
The 1993-1996 PSOE government was a minority government supported in parliament by the regionalist Catalan Coalitions, Convergence and Union. Between the elections of Spring 1996 and Spring 2000, the PP formed a minority government with the support in parliament of three regional parties or coalition of parties, CiU, the Canary Coalition, and the Basque Nationalist Party, although the latter withdrew to support the government in the middle of the legislative term.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women’s Section**
- **European Women’s Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) **To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: SPA_PR3 1998-2003

Title: Bill on mandatory quotas of women candidates (40%) for all parties.

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 6/6/05, 6/16/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Micaela Navarro**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Democracy of high quality is one in which half the population (women) is politically represented by significant proportions of women.**

Policy goals: **Navarro supported the bill to make all political parties in Spain have a 40% quota for women in elected offices.**

WMA2

Name: **Maria Teresa Fernandez de la Vega**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Democracy of high quality is one in which half the population (women) is politically represented by significant proportions of women.**

Policy goals: **de la Vega supported the bill to make all political parties in Spain have a 40% quota for women in elected offices.**

WMA3

Name: **Women MPs Socialist**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **To fight for right of women to be elected because it was a matter of justice, an end in itself. the other was to claim that women maintained a broader social and a feminist agenda. If women were represented equally in the political arena, outcomes would be different, more positive, and meet the particular needs of women. policies would be more consensual and public measures would include the interests of women as well as other less privileged groups. Political decision making should not be the monopoly of men just a family should not be the monopoly of women.**

Policy goals: **Support 40% quota**

WMA4

Name: **Women MPs PP Conservatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Wrong to intervene in the recruitment process to elect more women. Process had to be 'fair' and 'neutral' so the best people could be elected. Only PP gives women real opportunity to gain the centers of power (after PP won).**

Policy goals: **Oppose quotas (a hard measure) supported soft measures such as encouraging women to stand for office.**

WMA5

Name: **Federation of Progressive Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA6

Name: **Dolores Ibarruri Foundation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA7

Name: **Forum of Feminist Politics**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Generally followed parity arguments of need to use quotas to overcome male discrimination.**

Policy goals: **Supported parity democracy and argued in favor of increasing political party quotas for female representatives.**

WMA8

Name: **Women for Democracy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Wrong to intervene in the recruitment process to elect more women. process had to be 'fair' and 'neutral' so the best people could be elected. Only PP gives women real opportunity to gain the centers of power (after PP won).**

Policy goals: **Oppose quotas (a hard measure) supported soft measures such as encouraging women to stand for office.**

WMA 9

Name: **Women's Section of PSOE**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women were absent from the hierarchy of the party and the state because they were discriminated against in Subtle and not so Subtle ways, and not because there was an insufficient supply of potential female candidates. Advocates argued that in the absence of quotas men would never voluntarily release power, since many party men seek power for its own sake, while numerous women want power to improve society and help others.**

Policy goals: **Support quotas.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: To fight for right of women to be elected because it was a matter of justice, an end in itself. the other was to claim that women maintained a broader social and a feminist agenda. If women were represented equally in the political arena, outcomes would be different, more positive, and meet the particular needs of women. policies would be more consensual and public measures would include the interests of women as well as other less privileged groups. Political decision making should not be the monopoly of men just a family should not be the monopoly of women.

Policy goals: Support 40% quota.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. Rejected the bill April 2003; no change in policy; no general quota.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate**WMA 1 Navarro**

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization (parliament)

Activities During the Debate: Participated in the debate by introducing the quota legislation in Parliament.

WMA 2 de la Vega

Form: Individual

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Participated in the debate by introducing the quota legislation in Parliament.

WMA 3 Social MPs

Form: Individuals

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Played a central role in the parliamentary debate on the bill as is usually the case when the legislature is considering women's issues.

WMA 4 PP MPs

Form: Individuals

Location: Non women's movement organization

Activities During the Debate: Played a central role in the parliamentary debate on the bill as is usually the case when the legislature is considering women's issues.

WMA 5 Federation of Progressive Women

Form: Formal

Location: Free standing

Activities During the Debate: Participated in the debate by pressuring left wing parties (it was close to the PSOE).

WMA 6 Dolores IburrariForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **The Dolores Ibarruri Foundation participated in the debate by pressuring left wing parties (it was close to the IU).****WMA 7 Feminist Forum**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their views public.****WMA 8 Women for Democracy**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Supported Conservative MPs in parliament.****WMA9: Women's Section of PSOE**Form: **Formal**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**Activities **Defended the Socialist bill for the quota.****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

In August 1998, the press declared that the PSOE would submit a bill to reform the electoral Act in order to require all electoral lists to limit their candidates of the same sex to no more than 60 percent. The IU supported the idea, but the Governing PP strongly opposed it.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate focused on parity democracy and improving women's political representation. In order to improve female representation, feminists in the PSOE and others in left wing parties recommended that all parties should have quotas for the percentage of women in elected positions. Those against quotas argued that they were unconstitutional. Further, those opposed to quotas argued that one party should not have the right to impose candidate selection rules on other parties.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

- **Need to improve women's representation through quotas.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

Over its course, the debate remained focused on improving women's political representation. The debate was gendered, with most gendered references coming from those in favor of quotas for women in political parties. Those in favor of quotas argued that they were necessary to ensure greater equality of women. Further, quota supporters argued that governments with a balanced proportion of women and men would produce policies that better served the needs of women and other

underprivileged groups. Those against quotas largely made their arguments in gender-neutral terms. Quota opponents argued that it was fundamentally wrong for government to interfere in party recruitment processes in order to elect more women. Further quota opponents argued that party selection processes had to be 'fair' and 'neutral' and they argued that quotas constituted a form of discrimination.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Quotas necessary to ensure greater equality of women**
- **Balanced representation of women and men would serve the needs of women and other underprivileged groups.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

Rejected the idea of quotas for women in political parties. the goal in the Third Equality Plan was to achieve 'balanced participation' of women in politics; soft measures such as improvement of statistics and research but not targets.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The Women's Institute has a broad scope, with five major policy goals:

- 1. To promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements;**
- 2. To study all aspects of women's situation in Spain;**
- 3. To oversee the implementation of women's policy;**
- 4. To receive and handle women's discrimination complaints;**
- 5. And to increase the knowledge of their rights.**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The Women's Institute is usually formed as a unit within a government ministry, the Ministry for Labor and Social Affairs.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Concepcion Dancausa 1997-2000, Pilar Davila des Cerro (2000-2002);**

Miriam Tey de Salvador (2002-2003)

Years in WPA:

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament MPs and parties**
- **Private Members Bill proposed by PSOE**
- **PSOE minority member**
- **PP – absolute parliamentary majority**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Party Popular is in the Majority.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Council of Europe Steering Committee for Equality between Women and Men**
- **United Nations Commission on the Status of Women**
- **Socialist International Women's Section**
- **European Women's Lobby**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) **To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: SPA_PT1 1994-95

Title: The elaboration of the 1995 Penal Code

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 6/3/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA 2

Name: **Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA3

Name: **Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social Services**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA4

Name: **Collective in Defence of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system.**

WMA5

Name: **Forum de Política Feminista**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition: **Prostitution is an extreme form of women’s exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The 1995 reform of the penal code passed the findings of a 1994 project into law:**
 - a. **Except in the case of minors and legally incapacitated people, the 1994 project no longer defined as criminal behavior promoting prostitution of others or benefiting from it.**
 - b. **The PSOE project punished people who force others to be prostitutes.**
 - c. **This project abolished the 1970 Social Menace and Rehabilitation Act which considered prostitutes and other categories of people as dangerous for society.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Commission delivered a report in the Chamber of Deputies, met with individual members of Parliament, and lead public conferences on prostitution.**

WMA 2 **Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Deliver services to prostitutes.**

WMA 3 Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social ServicesForm: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Provide services to prostitutes.****WMA 4 Collective in Defence of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made views know; tried to influence.****WMA 5 Forum de Politica Feminista**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Their members tried to influence the policy-making process. One of their most characteristic activities is the organization of debates about specific topics and the subsequent publication of the interventions in these debates. In 1991 they published the interventions into a debate on prostitution among members and leaders of the feminist movement (Forum de Política Feminista 1991).**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1994 the socialist government presented a new Penal Code as a legislative project. The existing code was a substantially modified version of the one instituted in 1848. This PSOE project contained reforms regarding prostitution. First, except in the case of prostitution of minors and legally incapacitated people, this 1994 project no longer defined as criminal behaviour promoting the prostitution of others or benefiting from it. Second, the PSOE project punished people who force others to be prostitutes. Therefore, this project implicitly distinguished between voluntary and forced prostitution. This project also tacitly stated that the role of the penal law was to fight the latter (but not the former) and to combat any type of prostitution performed by minors or incapacitated people. Finally, this project abolished the 1970 social menace and rehabilitation Act which considered prostitutes and other categories of people as individuals dangerous for society.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame of the debate over prostitution was general agreement that prostitution should be out of the penal code, unless prostitution was forced. So the implicit frame was to distinguish between voluntary and forced prostitution. Other issues involved when government should intervene, such as for protection of minors and prosecuting rape crimes when victim is prostitute.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on issues like rape and sex trafficking and was not gendered throughout. References to prostitution were in general terms and used gender neutral language.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WI: Supported the abolitionist position. In its gender equality plan of 1988-1990, the Women's Institute argued that generally prostitution involved exploitative relationships and ended in the exploitation of the prostitutes. The Women's Institute supported two policies: reforming the Penal Code to ensure that underage prostitution was illegal, and to remove prostitution from the 1970 social menace and rehabilitation act.

Note: This does not count as a gendered frame.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The Women's Institute has a broad scope, with five major policy goals:

- 1. To promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements;**
- 2. To study all aspects of women's situation in Spain;**
- 3. To oversee the implementation of women's policy;**
- 4. To receive and handle women's discrimination complaints;**
- 5. And to increase the knowledge of their rights.**

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

Permanent bureaucratic agency created in 1983 and during the debate it was part of the Ministry of Social Affairs, which is one of the least powerful in the Spanish state.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Marina Subirats**

Years in WPA: **1993-96**

WMA activity: **Links to feminist movement and PSOE.**

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. My knowledge of the feminist movement makes me think that the movement is consolidated. As previously explained, many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Government/Cabinet**
- **Party leaders in parliament**
- **Representatives**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

PSOE Socialists

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAMPEP (European organizations for counseling prostitutes)**
- **Femmigration**
- **OSZE**
- **Terre de Femmes**
- **Women Watch**
- **CATW – radical feminist in 1989 and affiliated with UN**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SPA_PT 2 1997-99

Title: Spain - the 1999 reform of the Penal Code

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA 2

Name: **Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA 3

Name: **Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social Services**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA4

Name: **Collective in Defense of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system.**

WMA5

Name: **Forum de Politica Feminista**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition: **Prostitution is an extreme form of women’s exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Organic Act increased civil and criminal penalties in four types of prostitution related crimes. It specifically did not define promotion of adult prostitution as a crime and it did not define prostitution either:**
 - a. **the crime of promotion of prostitution of minors and legally incapacitated people.**
 - b. **the crime of forced prostitution when perpetrated by public authorities or civil servants taking advantage of their positions within the state.**
 - c. **prostitution crimes committed with the purpose of profit.**
 - d. **the circumstance when the person who has parental authority, guardianship, or fosterage over a prostitution younger than 18 years old or legally incapacitated does not actively attempt him/ her from acting as a prostitute.**
2. **The bill also included a definition of trafficking and included it as a crime.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 2 **Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 3 Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social Services

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 4 Collective in Defense of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 5 Forum de Politica Feminista

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

On October 17, 1997, the conservative government (in power since 1996) presented in Parliament a bill on the reform of the section of the 1995 Penal Code on crimes against sexual freedom. This reform referred to many issues (such as sexual harassment) and not only to prostitution. Regarding prostitution, the proposal increased the penalties in four cases: the crime of promotion of prostitution of minors and legally incapacitated people; the crime of forced prostitution when perpetrated by public authorities or civil servants taking advantage of their positions within the state; prostitution crimes when committed with the purpose of profit; and the circumstance when the person who has parental authority, guardianship or fosterage over a prostitute younger than 18 years or legally incapacitated does not actively attempt to stop him/her acting as a prostitute. The bill defined a new crime: that of trafficking people with the purpose of sexually exploiting them. The proposal explicitly referred to the frequency with which crimes related to prostitution were linked with the execution of sexual attacks and abuses against victims. The reform extended the prescription periods for prostitution crimes when victims were minors. The bill included a definition of prostitution: acts of sexual meaning performed with a person or more people in exchange of an economic reward of any type. Finally, the proposal classified as a crime a behaviour that had been illegal up to 1995, but was legal since then: the promotion of adults' prostitution.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The issue was whether or not the definition of prostitution was so imprecise that the bill would criminalize clients; whether or not the definition should be the exchange of sex for money alone or required more. Debate over the definition of prostitution itself.

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and tended to focus on issues other than adult prostitution, like child prostitution and sex trafficking. With regard to prostitution, conservatives sought to reform the penal code so that there were stiffer penalties for sex trafficking and youth prostitution. Additionally, the conservatives sought to outlaw the advertisement of adult prostitution. Socialists and other leftists argued that the conservatives did not properly define prostitution in their penal code and they also argued that adult prostitution was a private issue and that prostitution advertisement should not be criminalized.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate was framed in the end in terms of whether adult prostitution should be a crime; whether to maintain the distinction between forced and free (private) prostitution. The debate remained focused on child prostitution and sex trafficking and was not gendered throughout.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

In the 1997-2000 gender equality plan, the Women's Institute focused on violence and argued that the government should fight sex trafficking of women and girls. Trafficked women in an extremely vulnerable position that makes them potential victims of physical violence. recommended measures to eliminate traffic in women with the aim of sexual exploitation.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The Women's Institute has a broad scope, with five major policy goals:

- 1. To promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements;**
- 2. To study all aspects of women's situation in Spain;**
- 3. To oversee the implementation of women's policy;**
- 4. To receive and handle women's discrimination complaints;**
- 5. And to increase the knowledge of their rights.**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Women's Institute was a permanent bureaucratic agency created in 1983 and during the debate it was part of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, which is one of the least powerful in the Spanish state.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Concepcion Dancausa**

Years in WPA: **1996-?**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. Many characteristics of the feminist movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.**

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Government/Cabinet**
- **Party leaders in parliament**
- **Representatives**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Partido Popular, CC, CiU and the PNV (which dropped out in the middle of the legislative term).

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAMPEP (European organizations for counseling prostitutes)**
- **Femmigation**
- **OSZE**
- **Terre de Femmes**
- **Women Watch**
- **CATW – radical feminist in 1989 and affiliated with UN**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue under debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SPA_PT3 1998-2000

Title: The 2000 Immigration Act

WPA: Women's Institute (WI)

Dates of Coding: 6/4/05, 6/14/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

Criticized the state emphasis on the fight against trafficking using two types of arguments. On the one hand, the combat against trafficking contains an implicit assumption: that there are two types of prostitution (free and forced). Forced prostitution is what trafficked women perform. But these abolitionist feminists do not recognize the distinction between free and forced prostitution. On the other hand, state policy seems to argue that the main problem of women who have been trafficked and forced into prostitution is that they have been trafficked. In contrast, these abolitionist feminists think that the problem of trafficked women forced to prostitution is that they are prostitutes.

WMA 2

Name: **Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA 3

Name: **Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social Services**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abolitionist; prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). Argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

WMA 4

Name: **Collective in Defence of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work; the Collective agrees that some prostitutes are victims of trafficking. However, the collective insists that other women freely work as prostitutes.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system. The collective demands that free prostitutes are treated as other workers. The emphasis in the combat against trafficking may give the state incentives to ignore free prostitutes.**

WMA 5

Name: **Forum de Politica Feminista**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is a form of work.**

Policy goals: **Treat prostitutes as other workers, allowing them to contribute to the social security system.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue definition: **Prostitution is an extreme form of women's exploitation which undermines the status of all women in society whether prostitutes or not.**

Policy goals: **The Commission held the position that the state should help to abolish prostitution (which it saw as something that was exploitative of women). The Commission argued against changes in the penal code which would legalize activities surrounding prostitution, like pimping and promoting prostitution. Fight any type of prostitution, not just the forced.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Under the Act, illegal immigrants who have been trafficked into Spain and forced into prostitution would not be expelled from Spain in two circumstances: if they denounce their traffickers; or if they co-operate with public authorities in the prosecution of these traffickers providing relevant information or testifying against them.**
2. **The victims of sex trafficking will be allowed to choose between returning to their country of origin or remaining in Spain with residence and work permits.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 The Commission for the Investigation of Violence Against Women

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Lead public conferences on prostitution.**

WMA 2 Association for the Prevention, Reinsertion and Attention of Female Prostitutes (APRAMP).

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 3 Institute for the Promotion of Specialized Social Services

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 4 Collective in Defence of Prostitutes' Rights Hetaira

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

WMA 5 Forum de Politica Feminista

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **No activities during the debate.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In February and March 1998, the IU, the CiU and the mixed parliamentary group presented in Parliament three bills on a new Immigration Act. At that time, the older Immigration Act of 1985 was, according to many policy and social actors, outdated and no longer in line with the social reality of increasing numbers of immigrants coming to Spain. The three bills did not contain any reference to prostitution. On 18 November 1998, the PP in government presented an amendment to the three bills. According to this amendment, illegal immigrants who have been trafficked into Spain and forced into prostitution would not be expelled from Spain in two circumstances: if they denounce their traffickers; or if they co-operate with public authorities in the prosecution of these traffickers providing relevant information or testifying against them. These illegal immigrants will be allowed to choose between returning to their country of origin or remaining in Spain with residence and work permits.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in gender-neutral terms and it largely focused on immigration.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The PP proposed an amendment to the Immigration Act that sought to eliminate sex trafficking. There was little opposition to the amendment and it sought to allow victims of sex trafficking to remain in Spain if they denounced their traffickers. However, the terms used were ‘foreigners’ not ‘women’ so remained gender neutral.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

In the third gender equality plan, the Women’s Institute recommended granting temporary residence permits to women who were victims of sex trafficking. The Women’s Institute spoke of victims of trafficking as women and they related sex trafficking to wider forms of violence and sexual exploitation of women. It successfully pressured law makers to insert its demands into state legislation.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

The Women’s Institute spoke of victims of trafficking as women and they related sex trafficking to wider forms of violence and sexual exploitation of women. It successfully pressured law makers to insert its demands into state legislation.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

The scope of the WI is very broad because the WI has five comprehensive goals: to promote policy initiatives for women through formal enactment of policy statements; to study all aspects of women’s situation in Spain; to oversee the implementation of women’s policy; to receive and to handle women’s discrimination complaints; and to increase women’s knowledge of their rights.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The Women’s Institute was a permanent bureaucratic agency created in 1983 and during the debate it was part of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, which is one of the least powerful in the Spanish state.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Concepcion Dancausa**

Years in WPA: **1996-?**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Consolidation**

Evidence and sources: **There is a debate on feminist circles on whether the movement is consolidated or simply non-active. Many characteristics of the feminist**

movement changed with the consolidation of democracy. The feminist movement is now less-protest oriented.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Education**
- **Political representation**
- **Reproductive rights**
- **Violence against women**
- **Work**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Government/Cabinet**
- **Party leaders in parliament**
- **Representatives**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Partido Popular, CC, CiU and the PNV (which dropped out in the middle of the legislative term).

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **TAMPEP (European organizations for counseling prostitutes)**
- **Femmigration**
- **OSZE**
- **Terre de Femmes**
- **Women Watch**
- **CATW – radical feminist in 1989 and affiliated with UN**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking of Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SWE_HI 1991-94

Title: Child Care Allowance

WPAs: Minister and Division for Gender Equality (MDGE); Equality Opportunities Ombudsman (EEO)

Dates of Coding: 6/8/05, 6/9/05, 6/16/05, 12/01/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Maj-Inger Klingvall, Social Democratic Member of Parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Klingvall saw the care allowance as a threat to women's rights on the labor market and to gender equality. Klingvall was against the family care allowance. Childcare allowance threat to women's rights on the labor market and to gender equality; it would also reduced support for childcare centers. Gender equality is about being able to reconcile work and family; this is possible only if women and men share responsibilities in the home. The real problem is having enough childcare places.**

Policy Goals **Opposed the childcare allowance.**

WMA 2

Name: **Margareta Winberg.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Childcare allowance threat to women's rights on the labor market and to gender equality; it would also reduced support for childcare centers. Gender equality is about being able to reconcile work and family; this is possible only if women and men share responsibilities in the home. The real problem is having enough childcare places.**

Policy Goals **Oppose childcare allowance.**

WMA 3

Name: **Mona Sahlin, Social Democratic Member of Parliament**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Childcare allowance threat to women's rights on the labor market and to gender equality; it would also reduced support for childcare centers. Gender equality is about being able to reconcile work and family; this is possible only if women and men share responsibilities in the home. The real problem is having enough childcare places.**

Policy goals: **Sahlin came out against the allowance and promised to remove it as soon as the Social Democrats made it back into the Governing Majority.**

WMA 4

Name: **Support Stockings**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Support Stockings argued that the family allowance would be harmful to women's rights.**

Policy goals: **Against family allowance; and argued in favor of continuing the current system of publicly funded daycare facilities.**

WMA 5

Name: **Social Democratic Women's Federation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Agreed on the importance of high quality and publicly financed childcare facilities for children's well being and possibilities for their parents to combine family and employment.**

Policy goals: **Opposed family allowance**

WMA 6

Name: **Christian Democratic women's organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They maintained that a childcare allowance would favor ordinary women who wanted to stay at home with their children.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of childcare allowances.**

WMA 7

Name: **Center party women's organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **They maintained that a childcare allowance would favor ordinary women who wanted to stay at home with their children.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of childcare allowances.**

WMA8

Name: **Tjejligan the Girls' Gang of the LO**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Family allowances harmful to women's rights.**

Policy Goals : **They supported the women's movement position on childcare allowances (opposed and favored childcare centers).**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Gender equality is about being able to reconcile work and family; this is possible only if women and men share responsibilities in the home.**

Policy goals: **Favor childcare centers.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The bill allowed a new family care allowance, for families with children between one and three and it took steps toward privatizing childcare. It was designed more as a childcare check than as a mother's wage. The allowance could either make it possible for one of the parents to stay at home for a longer period than the regular parental leave period, or be used to 'purchase' public or private forms of childcare.**

2. **In order to pay for the family care allowance, the bill reduced the replacement level in the parental leave benefit from 90% to 80%.**
3. **The bill provided for the daddy month— a month of maternity leave for fathers.**

NOTE: The Social Democrats eventually took power again and they eliminated the family care allowance. However, they supported some privatization of childcare by further reducing the parental leave replacement and by supporting more deregulated and decentralized childcare providers.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Klingvall**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in parliamentary debates over the family care allowance.**

WMA 2 **Winberg**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in parliamentary debates over the family care allowance.**

WMA 3 **Sahlin**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in parliamentary debates over the family care allowance.**

WMA 4 **Support Stockings**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Support Stockings participated in the debate by making their opinions public.**

WMA 5 **SD women's organization**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Made their views public**

WMA 6 **Conservative party women's org**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **They had an active role in the design of the proposal.**

WMA 7 Center party women's organizationForm: **Formal**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **They had an active role in the design of the proposal.****WMA 8 Girls Gang**Form: **Informal**Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Took a position.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1991 a center-right coalition government led by the Moderate Party took over after almost ten years of Social Democratic governments. One of the ambitions of the government was to engineer a 'system shift' in the public sector allowing a higher degree of decentralization, deregulation and privatization. They aimed at implementing a 'revolution of choice'. During their period in office—1991 to 1994—they introduced a childcare allowance (*vårdnadsbidrag*), which gave financial compensation for one of the parents (usually the mother) to stay at home for a longer period of time than the existing parental leave legislation allowed. The childcare allowance was a means to privatize childcare responsibilities back to the family. In the long run the purpose of the 'system shift' was to downsize public spending and public institutions. In the short run, however, the childcare allowance would be a rather expensive reform and its main purpose was to shift family policies in a new ideological direction.

During the 1991 election campaign the issue of a childcare allowance became a highly contested issue. After the 1991 elections a bourgeois minority coalition took over after almost ten years of Social Democratic minority governments. For the first time the Christian Democratic Party was included in the government. They participated in the new right-wing led government coalition together with the three other bourgeois parties, the Moderates, the Liberals and the Center Party. For the Christian Democrats a childcare allowance had been one of their top priorities in the election campaign. The former Farmer's Party, the Center Party, regarded the introduction of a childcare allowance as the best way to support families outside urban areas. A change of the prevailing family policy model and the introduction of a childcare allowance were now high on the political agenda, and the heated debates about the issue continued in Parliament where the Social Democrats and the Left Party vigorously opposed the childcare allowance.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Initially the dominant frame of the debate concerned the principles of the welfare state and the direction of the Swedish family policy model. How much and what kind of responsibility should the state take for family policies? Conflict involved the presentation of a new family policy model which would increase choices in terms of childcare. Debate was not gendered initially.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Debate became gendered in that it included a conflict over the effects of the childcare allowance on gender roles in the family and whether the childcare allowance would undermine gender equality. It was argued that men would not use the allowance to stay home.

Proponents of the family care allowance carried out their discourse in gender neutral terms, always referring to parents, rather than mothers and fathers. Opponents to the family allowance gendered their comments. Those in the women's movement opposed to the issue argued that it would create a trap for women and force more of them to stay home and out of careers. Further, many feminist women's movement actors argued that the family care allowance would be pose a threat to women's rights and to equality between men and women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- **Would childcare allowance undermine gender equality?**
- **Men would not use allowance to stay home**
- **Allowance a trap for women and force them to stay home and out of careers**
- **Threat to women's rights**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA1: MDGE: Opposed the family care allowance. However, after the Majority in government accepted family care allowances, Bengt Westerberg, leader of the WPA, realized that he had to accept it. His view was to limit the negative effects on gender equality. supported gender equality.

WPA 2: EOO: None

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Family allowances undermined gender equality.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA1: MDGE: Has mainstreaming responsibility

WPA 2: EOO: Gender discrimination in the workplace. Primary task is to ensure compliance with Equal Opportunities Act, ensuring equality in the workplace, and in some areas of education.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA1: MDGE: The Division of Gender Equality was located within the Ministry of Social Affairs.

WPA 2: EOO: Located in the Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications, but also under the Minister for Gender Equality, who at the time (1998 –1999) was also the Minister for Agriculture, Food and Fisheries.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1

Name: **Bengt Westerberg—Minister of Gender Equality**

Years in WPA: **1991-94**

WMA activity: **None**

WPA 2

Name: **Gun Neuman**

Years in WPA: **1988-93**

WMA activity: **Lawyer for the Employers' Association and the Swedish Federation of Industry. She seems to have spoken up for women's interests in those organizations but I do not know if she had any direct ties to women's movement organizations.**

Name: **Lena Svenaeus 1994-2000;**

WMA activity: **Widely regarded as having her roots in the movement. She had her degree in labor law, and was the legal advisor of the Nurses' Union and then LO the Trade Union Confederation. She took a much more activist stance as JämO compared to her two predecessors and waged a major campaign against wage differentials.**

C13A_1—Dates, Evidence, Citation for WMA Stage

The 1990s witnessed a resurgence of the women's movement. The impressive mobilization across classes and generations was heralded as a 'new women's movement'.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women's representation in political and union offices**
- **Women's representation in the universities and private companies**
- **Fighting welfare cutbacks and welfare state restructuring**
- **Equal pay**
- **Violence against women and prostitution**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Minister/Division of Gender Equality**
- **Social Democratic Party**
- **Center Party**
- **Liberal Party**
- **Christian Democratic Party**
- **Conservative Party**
- **Parliament**
- **Intellectuals and childcare experts through Commissions**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

From 1991- 1994, there was a bourgeois government which was a coalition of Liberals, Center Party, Conservative Party, and the Christian Democratic Party.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
European Women's Lobby

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Article 11 sec. 2

In order to prevent discrimination against women on the grounds of marriage or maternity and to ensure their effective right to work, States Parties shall take appropriate measures:

- (a) To prohibit, Subject to the imposition of sanctions, dismissal on the grounds of pregnancy or of maternity leave and discrimination in dismissals on the basis of marital status;**
- (b) To introduce maternity leave with pay or with comparable social benefits without loss of former employment, seniority or social allowances;**
- (c) To encourage the Provision of the necessary supporting social services to enable parents to combine family obligations with work responsibilities and participation in public life, in particular through promoting the establishment and development of a network of child-care facilities;**
- (d) To provide special protection to women during pregnancy in types of work proved to be harmful to them.**

Debate ID: SWE_PR1 1967-1972

Title: Creation of First WPA

WPA: None

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/08/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Fredika Bremer Association**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Association brought up the issue of quotas and argued that the parties should include more women on their electoral lists.**

Policy goals: **Party quotas.**

WMA 2

Name: **Social Democratic Party Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Social Democratic women demanded greater political representation for women.**

Policy goals: **Argued in favor of quotas that stated that no more than 60% of the Social Democratic representatives should be of the same sex. Also the Social Democratic women argued in favor of a cabinet level task force to monitor and promote women's equality issues.**

WMA 3

Name: **Center Party Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Center Party women's organization brought up the issue quite early, mainly because their representation lagged behind the other parties' women's representation in parliament.**

Policy goals:

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

No expression of gender-hierarchy, male domination, or gender equality in micro-frames.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. In response to the debate, the Swedish government created a women's policy agency: the Advisory Council to the Prime Minister on Equality between Men and Women. The agency was established to promote gender equality in all spheres of society, including political life.**
- 2. The first outcome in this debate was the initial adoption by the political parties of guidelines for women's representation in party and elected office. In 1972 the Liberals were the first party to adopt such guidelines. The party conference**

recommended that women were entitled to at least 40 % of the posts in all party bodies.

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Fredika Bremer Association

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **The Association participated in the debate by mounting a campaign to promote including more women in politics.**

WMA 2 Social Democratic Party Women's Section

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **The Social Democratic women participated in the debate by trying to influence other members of the Social Democratic Party.**

WMA 3 Center Party Women's Section

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Brought up issue in the party.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Making women's representation an issue grew out of a larger project to get gender equality on the public agenda. The push to put gender equality on the agenda came from two sources: 1) a network of academics who launched a debate on sex roles in the early 1960s and 2) the women's sections of the political parties. Of the women's sections, the efforts of the Social Democratic Women's Federation (SSKF) were the most important. In the mid-1960s it published Women's Equality (*Kvinnans jämlikhet*), an ambitious program of reform. Its proposals dealt with taxation, labor market policy, family law, education, social security and public services; and they were eventually incorporated in the Towards Equality program, adopted by the 1969 party congress. Ironically, the demand for women's representation was not included in the 1964 women's program, and the problem of under-representation of women in public office was only briefly mentioned in the Towards Equality Program. Emphasis on other reforms to achieve gender equality initially eclipsed the issue of women's representation.

Among the first to voice the demand for increased political representation for women were the reform communists. The 1967 program of the Left Party-Communists (VPK) 'Socialist Alternative' contained a strong plank calling for the equality of the sexes. It proclaimed, 'Women are also under-represented in the leadership of the Labour Movement organisations. It is a blatant injustice and a threat to democracy that half of the population of Sweden is poorly represented on boards and executive committees'. The Center party women, who had the poorest representation in parliament in the 1960s, were also very early in pointing to women's under-representation as a contradiction in democratic principles. By 1968

the demand began to gain momentum, and it was raised in many quarters and across the political spectrum.

C3A_1—Issue frame at the beginning of the debate

From the outset, the debate was framed in terms of democratic representation. The debate focused on the failure of the Swedish government to represent women. Women were roughly half of the population, yet they only comprised a small portion of the individuals in public offices.

C3A_2—List of gendered ideas in the issue frame at the beginning of the debate

Women were half the population but only small proportion of people in public office.

C3A_3—Issue frame at the end of the debate.

In the end, the debate was framed in terms of democratic representation and somewhat gendered. The women's movement gendered the overall debate by bringing attention to the fact that women were vastly underrepresented in positions of power throughout the Swedish government. However, the women's movement voiced their claims in non gendered terms- as voters and citizens. Rather than explicitly talk about the power struggle between the sexes, the women's movement focused on the need for greater equality and equal representation in the Swedish government.

C3A_4—List of gendered ideas in the issue frame at the end of the debate

Need for greater equality and equal representation of women and men in government.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

No WPA at the time of the debate

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal policy orientation and Policy Agenda

Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional setting of wpa

Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Not applicable

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Stage: **Growth**

The demand for political representation was originally overshadowed by other reforms but by 1972 it was a top priority and a pan-partisan concern. Its increasing

priority paralleled the early growth of the movement and the political mobilization of women.

C16A_1—List of policy agendas of WMAs for the period of the debate

- **Abortion**
- **Day care**
- **Employment issues (jobs, equal pay, unemployment benefits, equal conditions for part-time workers)**
- **Political representation**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of policy actors in Sub-system

Social Democratic; Major Political Parties and their Women's Sections

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by name

- **Work with other Nordic Countries**
- **Early UN Network on Women in Power**

C26A_3—CEDAW provision on the policy issue under debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: SWE_PR2 1985-87

Title: Ministry of Equality Recommendations for Quotas in Appointed Positions

WPA: Minister of Gender Equality (MGE)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/08/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Fredika Bremer Association**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Demanded greater political representation for women.**

Policy goals: **Increasing women's presence in public bodies.**

WMA 2

Name: **Social Democratic Party Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Social Democratic women demanded greater political representation for women.**

Policy goals: **Increasing women's presence in public bodies.**

WMA 3

Name: **Two members of Commission of Inquiry**

Micro Frame: **Greater political representation of women.**

Policy goals: **Quotas for increasing presence of women in public bodies**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

No expression of gender-hierarchy, male domination, or gender equality in micro-frames.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The commission stated its firm conviction that only quotas would achieve quick results. However, as a concession, it had chosen a 'softer' approach as a sign of its confidence in the nominating organizations' assurances that they only needed more time. Accordingly, the commission recommended that the government give the organizations a chance to show their good intentions by nominating more women. Strategically, the commission's concession put the onus on the nominating organizations. Quotas could be avoided if they nominated women.**
2. **The commission also laid down specific targets for women's representation on administrative bodies and inquiry commissions: 30% by 1992, 40% by 1995 and 50% by 1998.**
3. **If the goal of 30% was not reached by 1992, the commission proposed the introduction of legislated quotas.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Fredika Bremer Association

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Had issue on agenda.**

WMA 2 Social Democratic Party Women's Section

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Had issue on agenda.**

WMA 3 Two members of Commission of Inquiry

Form: **Individuals**

Location: **Inside non women's movement organization**

Activities during debate: **Members of the Minister's Inquiry Commission on women's representation.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Reports to the UN offered opportunities for agenda setting and advancing positions for negotiations. *Step by Step*, a national plan for gender equality that also served as the report to the 1980 United Nations women's conference, stressed the necessity to improve women's representation in the corporatist and bureaucratic channels. The Swedish government's report to the 1985 UN Women's Conference in Nairobi, *Side by Side*, also brought up the issue, contrasting the poor representation of women on national administrative boards, regional bodies and inquiry commissions with their advances in elected office. The stated goal of the government was to increase women's representation so that both sexes were included in *all* administrative bodies by 1991. It identified the problem as the freedom of organizations and their failure to nominate women despite the government's request that a man and a woman be nominated for each position. The same year, the Minister of Gender Equality, Anita Gradin, appointed an inquiry commission to propose measures to increase women's representation in the state bureaucracy.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was gendered and framed in terms of representative democracy. Debate participants recognized that true representative democracy requires that equal proportions of women and men participate in decision making. Participants in the debate saw that women made up a smaller proportion of the people in appointed positions than in elected positions. In the beginning, the debate focused on the need to increase the representation of women in appointed positions within the Swedish government in order to improve the equality of women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

**For democracy, need equal proportions of women and men in decision making
Need to increase representation of women to improve equality of women.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on increasing women's representation and became quite gendered. Proponents of reform stressed the idea that women promote different policy issues than men and that they tend to represent and women's interests while in government. Further, reformers argued that increasing women's representation was a necessary step in creating increasing the power of women and encouraging a greater balance of power between the sexes.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

**Women promote different policy issues than men and represent women's interests
Increasing representation a necessary step toward increasing women's power and balance of power between the sexes.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 **Minister of Gender Equality (MGE)**

Supported proposals to improve the representation of women in the Swedish government. Helped to gender the debate by supporting the idea that increasing the number of women in government would help to create a better balance of power between women and men.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Create a balance of power between women and men by increasing the number of women in government.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 **Minister of Gender Equality (MGE)**

Multi-issue — Responsible for promoting gender equality in all spheres of society, including in the family.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 **Minister of Gender Equality (MGE)**

The minister is a member of the cabinet, and the cabinet is based on collective responsibility rather than individual ministerial responsibility. However, the general rule is that the minister in charge of a particular piece of legislation has great authority.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Anita Gradin**

Years in WPA: **1982- end of debate**

WMA activity: **She was also vice-president of the women's party organization at least when she was appointed in 1982. Earlier she had been president of the Stockholm district of the women's party organization. So her roots were in the movement and she had good contacts with movement actors.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

The 1980s stand out as a period of consolidation for several reasons. Women continued to consolidate their positions at all levels of elected office. New feminists organizations, such as the women's shelter movement, were growing, and women in trade union organizations made steady gains.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Peace in the early 1980s**
- **Rape**
- **Sexual harassment**
- **Violence against women**
- **Six hour work day**
- **Women's representation.**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Weak

The countermovement consisted of opponents to quotas. The final report defused the countermovement whose impact is thus characterized as low.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Parliament**
- **Minister of Gender Equality**
- **the Inquiry Commission (from the Minister of Gender Equality)**
- **Unions and employers who appoint persons to inquiry commission and the boards of administrative agencies.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The Social Democrats formed a minority government during the debate, and there was a left Majority in parliament.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **UN Women in Power Network at Nairobi**
- **Nordic Women's Network**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government.**

Debate ID: SWE_PR3 1991-1994

Title: SDP Adopt Quota for Women on Party Lists

QUAWPA: Social Democratic Women's Section (SDWS)

Dates of Coding: 12/27/03, 3/08/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Support Stockings**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need more women in Swedish government 'More specifically, they argued that a male political culture pervaded the parties. Rallying cry, 'half the power full pay.'**

Policy goals: **Support Stockings argued in favor of policies that would increase the number of women in the Swedish Government. If the political parties refused to nominate more women to political office, Support Stockings threatened to create their own all women's party.**

WMA 2

Name : **Tjejligan (Girls' Gang)**

Issue Definition: **The problem is not women, but a political culture that has failed to take women's views seriously; it has failed to realize that women's exclusions from political bodies is a problem for democracy.**

Policy goals: **Nominate more women to office.**

WMA 3

Name: **Margot Wallstrom, former minister of gender equality**

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Social Democratic party should include more women on its electoral lists, in order to improve its representation of women. If the Social Democrats did not nominate more women, the SDWS threatened to create their own electoral lists.**

Policy goals: **Include more women on electoral lists.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Male culture pervaded the parties.**

Policy goals: **Nominate more women to office.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Social Democrats changed their by-laws to ensure that their party lists equally represented women and men.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Support Stockings**

Form: **Informal Organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Support Stockings participated in the debate by trying to influence members of political parties. Sticker and button campaign; women's tribunal in Stockholm and across the country to scrutinize non Socialist government's roll back of the public sector.**

WMA 2 Tjejligan (Girls' Gang)

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (party)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by trying to influence other members of the Social Democratic Party.**

WMA 3 Margot Wallstrom

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities in the Debate: **In charge of an investigation on women's representation in the Social Democratic Party, she was also a member of the working group evaluating party losses in the 1991 election.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Women's representation in parliament fell from 38% to 34% in the 1991 election; it was the first time since 1928 that there was a major setback. Women were both angered by their weakened position in parliament and fearful of the consequences. Immediately after the election, women formed a network, 'Support Stockings' (*Stödstrumporna*) whose rallying cry was 'Half the power, full pay'. Their goals included improving women's representation in parliament and preventing the new coalition government headed by the Conservatives from dismantling the public sector and women friendly policies.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate was gendered and focused on women's representation. In the beginning, the frame focused on the fact that men made up a greater proportion of political representatives than women. The problem was that the parties had failed to nominate enough women to political office.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Men make up the greater proportion of political representations than women.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Over its course the debate remained gendered and focused on increasing women's representation. Through the end, Support Stockings argued that the reason that there were so few female political representatives was that the party power structures were dominated by men and the traditional parties chose not to nominate women. To solve this problem, Support Stockings proposed to create female political party. Foundation of democracy is equal worth of all human beings. Gender equality entails the same rights, obligations, and opportunities for men and women.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Traditional parties dominated by men; need to increase women’s representation with a female political party.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
 QUAWPA 1: **Social Democratic Women’s Section (SDWS)**
The SDWS argued that the Social Democratic party should include more women on its electoral lists, in order to improve its representation of women and achieve gender equality. It also identified the male culture of the party. If the Social Democrats did not nominate more women, the SDWS threatened to create their own electoral lists.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames
Achieve gender equality.
Male culture of party.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
 QUAWPA 1: **Social Democratic Women’s Section (SDWS)**
To promote women’s rights, bring women into the party and maintain their support.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
 QUAWPA 1: **Social Democratic Women’s Section (SDWS)**
The organization of the SDWS is patterned after the party organization. The highest decision making body is the SDWS congress which adopts major policy guidelines and programs and elects its officers—the president, governing board, executive committee and major administrative officer. At the local level women’s clubs are affiliated to the local party organization—*arbetarekommun*—and this is also the case for the district level which is the parliamentary constituency organization. At the national level the president of SDWS has had the right to attend and to speak but not vote at the party congress and the party governing board.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name: **QUAWPA 1 SDWS: Margareta Winberg**
 Years in WPA: **1991-94**
 WMA Activity: **WM Activity**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Growth
The 1990s witnessed a resurgence of the women’s movement. The impressive mobilization across classes and generations was heralded as a ‘new women’s movement’.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women’s representation, in political and union offices**
- **Women’s representation in the universities and private companies**

- **Fighting welfare cutbacks and welfare state restructuring**
- **Equal pay**
- **Violence against women and prostitution**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate

There was a fairly strong countermovement against forming a women’s party but not against women’s representation.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

The Social Democratic Party Congress, Party Leaders The Support Stockings, the Social Democratic Women’s Section (SDWS).

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

The government was a minority center-right coalition composed of the Conservatives, Liberals, Center party and Christian Democrats. The Conservatives held the post of Prime Minister, and the government’s parliamentary base included the rightwing populist New Democrats.

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **EU Network on Gender Balance in Decision-Making**
- **UN Gender Mainstreaming Network**
- **Socialist International**
- **Nordic Women’s Council Network**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved.

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) **To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) **To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government.**

Debate ID: SWE_PT1 1981-82

Title: Law Prohibiting Public Displays of Prostitution

WPAs: Equal Opportunities Ombudsman (EOO); Minister for Gender Equality (MGE)

Date of Coding: 2/04, 6/15/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Conservative Party Women's Federation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Frame: **Assume that they supported the liberal view that prostitution could be woman's choice.**

Policy goals: **Against criminalizing prostitution.**

WMA 2

Name: **Liberal Party Women's Federation**

MicroFrame:

Issue Frame: **Prostitution is a social problem; supported preventative measures.**

Policy goals: **In favor of criminalizing the activities of johns.**

WMA 3

Name: **Group 8**

Micro Frame:

Issue Frame: **Prostitution is a social problem.**

Policy goals: **Want special government attention to the problem.**

WMA 4

Name: **Fredrika Bremer förbundet**

Micro Frame:

Issue Frame: **Prostitution is a social problem; criminalize john.**

Policy goals: **Want special government attention to the problem.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The new law prohibits public pornography shows.**
2. **It also provided state financial support for the organization of a co-ordination group for questions on prostitution, and for research projects concerning the clients and young women at risk of becoming prostitutes.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Conservative Party Women's organization**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active during the remiss process and presented their opinions on prostitution laws to Parliament.**

WMA 2 **Liberal Party Women's organization**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active during the remiss process and presented their opinions on prostitution laws to Parliament.**

WMA 3 **Group 8**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the protests that lead to the investigation into prostitution.**

WMA 4 **Frederika Bremer**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the protests that lead to the investigation into prostitution.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

One of the reasons for the appointment of a commission to investigate prostitution was the criticism of another commission investigating sexual offences in 1976. Among other things the commission wanted to soften the rape charge, and lower the penalties. How the woman had behaved and had been dressed before the crime was to be taken into account when deciding upon the penalty. The investigation was severely criticised, above all by the women's movement. Twelve different women's organisations (including both autonomous groups and the political party women's organisations) came together and demanded a new official commission. One suggestion was to make changes in the law concerning procuring, and to analyse prostitution in a separate investigation before doing so. There was a big media debate. The topic of economic crimes, such as the black economy surrounding the sex industry, and young girls being used in prostitution was given space leading to repercussions within the police force.

In 1977 the Minister of Social Affairs initiated an investigation into prostitution, appointing a conservative member of parliament as special commissioner. The commission was to map out the problems of prostitution, especially child and youth prostitution, procuring and whether this was increasing. The reasons for prostitution were also to be discussed, as were the measures to be taken. Further, the law concerning public pornographic exposures was to be investigated, and sex clubs mapped out. The one-woman commissioner had a committee of ten experts and a secretarial staff, but there were only two women among them. The

commission finished its work in 1981, and its official report was published in 1981. However, after a disagreement with the commission, all experts except one had left the commission and published their work separately. The results were made available to a larger public only after pressure from women's organisations in 1980. A separate publication later also came from the only remaining expert in the commission. The debate began when the report was presented to parliament in 1981.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame of the debate when the commission was appointed was to map out the problems of prostitution, especially child and youth prostitution and the increasing problem of procuring. Commissioner reported that problem of prostitution was one of human dignity, not a 'woman question' or a gender equality question. In her opinion women were in prostitution due to free will. The experts advising the commissioner filed a separate report which was also debated in parliament. They saw prostitution as exploitive and their recommendation was not to criminalize but to adopt preventive measures. The issue frame showed disagreement on the nature of the problem and was gendered.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women were in prostitution due to free will versus prostitution exploited women

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

As a result of the parliamentary debate, the issue frame focused on the problem of prostitution as a human question, including both men and women, men as clients. The reasons for prostitution were a combination of patriarchal society and an economic restructuring of society, along with the commercialization of sexuality and human beings. both men and women are seen as victims.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Both men and women victims of prostitution, caused by patriarchal society.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1: The Equal Opportunities Ombudsman: It supported preventative measures and opposed criminalization of prostitution.

WPA 2: The Minister for Gender Equality: No microFrame on issue.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 EOO: Gender discrimination in the work place; ensures compliance with Equality Act.

WPA 2 MGE: cross sectional

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 EOO: Independent state agency under Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications and under Minister for Gender Equality, who is also fills another position in the government.

WPA 2 MGE: Responsibility given to a minister in the Cabinet to be responsible for gender equality policy along with other duties.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 EOO:

Name: **Inga Britt Törnell**

Years in WPA: **1981-87**

WMA Activity: **No WM activity**

WPA 2 MGE:

Name: **Karin Andersson**

Years in WPA: **1979-82**

WMA Activity: Karin Andersson was from the Center Party, formerly the Agrarian party. She was an officer of the Center Party Women's Federation and very active in the campaign to increase women's representation.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

During the first debate the women's movement can be considered as consolidated in the sense that the 'old' movement had institutionalised organisations. The 'new' women's movement has also consolidated its structure and had the endurance and the strength to mobilise the different organisation around a mutual issue.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Peace in the early 1980s**
- **Rape**
- **Sexual harassment**
- **Violence against women**
- **Six hour work day**
- **Women's representation**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Parliament**
- **The Ministry of Social Affairs commission to investigate prostitution**

– **Women's Groups and Experts in remiss process**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

**In early 1981: Coalition of Liberals, Center Party, and Moderate Party
From 1981-2, A coalition of Liberals and Center Party.**

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SWE_PT2 1995-98

Title: The second commission on prostitution and proposal for a Violence Against Women's Act

WPAs: Minister for Gender Equality (MGE); Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Date of Coding: 6/5/05, 6/15/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Women MPs of all parties**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **They opposed criminalizing both because they said prostitutes and their clients would not become more equal if they were both criminalized.**

WMA 2

Name **National Organization for Women's Shelters and Young Womens' shelters in Sweden ROKS**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

WMA 3

Name **Fredrika Bremer Association**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

WMA 4

Name **The Liberal Party Women's Organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

WMA 5

Name **The Center Party Women's Organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

WMA 6

Name **The Social Democratic Party Women's Organization**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Prostitution was oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the client, and not the prostitutes.**

:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Violence Against Women's Act was proposed in 1998 with Proposition 97/98. Along with other proposals concerning violence against women, it also suggested the criminalization of the client, or rather the buying of sexual services. The penalty would be fines or imprisonment for no more than six months.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Women MPs**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the parliamentary debate.**

WMA 2 **ROKS**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by having annual meetings with women in parliament from the different parties and by engaging in the remiss process to rebut the findings of the parliamentary commission.**

WMA 3 **Frederika Bremer**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Actively involved in the remiss process (to rebut the assertions of the 1995 parliamentary commission) and presented its opinions on prostitution to parliament.**

WMA 4 **Liberal party**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Actively participated in the remiss process and presented its opinions to the parliament.**

WMA 5 **Center party**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Actively participated in the remiss process and presented its opinions to the parliament.**

WMA 6 **SD**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Actively participated in the remiss process and presented its opinions to the parliament.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

After the proposal and the ensuing law of 1982 a number of bills were introduced in parliament in which the request to criminalise the client recurred frequently. During the period 1983-1993 more than 50 party and member bills concerning prostitution were proposed in parliament, and of those about 30 proposed the criminalisation of the john. These came from representatives of all parties, sometimes both men and women from the same party, sometimes only women, but never groups of only men.

The periods 1984-1987 and 1990-92 were intense periods of parliamentary party and member bills. These were of three types: requests to criminalise only the client, to criminalise both parties, and requests calling for a new official investigation into prostitution. To criminalise only the prostitute, regardless of sex, was never an option. In 1993 the Parliamentary Committee's of Justice (Justitiekottet) 'remiss' recommended that the matter be further investigated.

The Minister for Social Affairs and Gender Equality, Bengt Westerberg (Liberal Party) officially set the commission its task on 11 March 1993. It was to map the prevalence of both hetero- and homosexual prostitution in Sweden, and discuss the problem and reasons for prostitution. Furthermore, the commission had to investigate whether criminalisation could be an appropriate measure to fight prostitution or if other solutions were to be recommended. It also had to investigate how to conduct informative work to the general public on prostitution nationally and internationally. The Commission was another so-called 'one-woman commission' headed by a senior civil servant from the Department (formerly the Equal Opportunities Ombudsman), and her expert group contained an equal number of women and men.

Soon after it had become known that there was to be an official commission, another bill was put forward in parliament. This bill was different in character from the earlier bills proposed by parties. Its support cut across party lines and the proposers of the bill were women from the SDP, the Left Party and the Liberals. They argued that there were already sufficient grounds for criminalisation of the john. This should not have to wait until after the commission had reached its conclusions. Nevertheless, the Parliamentary Committee on Justice later rejected the bill on exactly these grounds; there was no reason for parliament to make a statement in a question, which was under investigation.

After two years of investigation the report from the one-woman commission proposed that both parties, the prostitute and the client, should be

criminalised. It would be ‘peculiar’ if only one party was seen as guilty of crime, while the other was innocent. The effect of a criminalisation would also be greater if both parties were included. The commission also suggested using another term to describe prostitution: sex-trade (*könshandel*). This would focus on both parties in the transaction, the seller and the client. Since prostitution traditionally signified the woman in a heterosexual sex-trade, this new term would also make it possible to include homosexual prostitution. Two of the experts on the commission disagreed on the final result.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The issue frame at the beginning was set forth in the deliberations and report of the commission and its 1995 report. In the beginning, the debate focused on the criminalization of prostitution and whether to criminalize the both parties or only the client. The majority criticized the parliamentary commission recommendation to criminalize prostitution outright, and instead argued that only the actions of johns should be criminalized if prostitution was to be criminalized at all.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the end of the debate.

By the end the debate was gendered. When the report from the commission was presented, a major characteristic of the debate was rather what one saw as an attempt at de-gendering, or neutralizing the question by the suggestion to criminalize both parties would repress the women in prostitution even more. Female MPs united to criminalize the john. For them, prostitution was a question of oppression of women and prostitutes and their clients would not become more equal if both were criminalized. The debate remained focused on criminalizing the actions of johns through the end and it also remained gendered.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

**Prostitution a question of oppression of women and prostitutes.
Women and men would not be more equal if both are criminalized; criminalize the john only.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1 MGE/EAD: prostitution seen in terms of gendered power hierarchy—the imbalance in the power relationships of the sexes, where the most extreme imbalance is men’s violence towards women, and this is barrier to gender equality.

WPA 2 EO: None

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Prostitution seen in terms of the imbalance in the power relationships of the sexes, where the most extreme imbalance is men’s violence towards women, and this is barrier to gender equality.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 **MGE: The Minister is responsible for promoting gender equality in all spheres of society, including in the family.**

WPA 2 **EO: Gender discrimination in the workplace.**

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 **MGE: Minister is member of cabinet assigned gender equality responsibility; Equality Division is the administrative support unit for minister.**

WPA 2 **EO: Located in the Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications, but also under the Minister for Gender Equality, who at the time (1998–1999) was also the Minister for Agriculture, Food and Fisheries.**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 **MGE**

Name: **Ulrica Messing**

Time in WPA: **3/96-10/98**

WMA Activity: **Fellow traveler (describe self as feminist before appointment).**

WPA 2 **EO**

Name: **Lena Svenaeus**

Time in WPA: **1994-98**

WMA Activity: **Regarded as having ‘roots in the movement’.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

The strength to join forces on this question across party lines suggests that the movement was in a stage of consolidation.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women’s representation, in political and union offices**
- **Women’s representation in the universities and private companies**
- **Fighting welfare cutbacks and welfare state restructuring**
- **Equal pay**
- **Violence against women and prostitution**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Cabinet**
- **Parliament**
- **Ministry of Gender Equality Commission to Investigate Prostitution.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democrats after 1994

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **CATW**
- **Pro Sex Work - represented by the Global Alliance Against Trafficking Women**
- **EUROPAP: European Network for STD-HIV Prevention**
- **TAMPEP: European Project that combines research and active intervention,**
 - **with the direct involvement of sex workers.**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: SWE_PT3 1997-99

Title: Law against Purchasing Sexual Services

WPAs: Minister of Gender Equality (MGE); Equality Ombudsman (EO)

Dates of Coding: 6/5/05, 6/15/05, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Chairwoman of the SD Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the john.**

WMA 2

Name: **National Organization for Women's Shelters and Young Women's Shelters in Sweden (ROKS)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Prostitution is oppression of women.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize the john, not the prostitute.**

WMA3

Name: **Center Party Women's Federation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Saw prostitution as oppression of women; women have the right to be mistresses of their own sexuality, but prostitution is not about sexuality.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize clients but keep prostitutes from criminal sanction.**

WMA 4

Name: **Left Party Women's Federation**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Saw prostitution as oppression of women; women have the right to be mistresses of their own sexuality, but prostitution is not about sexuality.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize clients but keep prostitutes from criminal sanction.**

WMA 5

Name: **Social Democratic Women's Section**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Saw prostitution as oppression of women; women have the right to be mistresses of their own sexuality, but prostitution is not about sexuality.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize clients but keep prostitutes from criminal sanction.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition: **Saw prostitution as oppression of women; women have the right to be mistresses of their own sexuality, but prostitution is not about sexuality.**

Policy goals: **Criminalize clients but keep prostitutes from criminal sanction.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The bill included criminalization of the client, and parliament subsequently voted for the law to criminalize the buying of sexual services.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Head of SD women's section

Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Pushed through the issue of prostitution in the SDP against party leaders.**

WMA 2 ROKS

Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by making their views known in the media and influencing public opinion.**

WMA 3 Center party women

Form: **Formal**Location: **In non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by aiding in pushing the issue of prostitution to the top of the agenda in parliament, supporting the Social Democratic Women.**

WMA 4 Left women

Form: **Formal**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by aiding in pushing the Issue of prostitution to the top of the agenda in parliament, supporting the Social Democratic Women.**

WMA 5 SD women's section

Form: **Formal**Location: **Non women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by trying to convince SD men in parliament.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The proposal for a Violence Against Women's Act came in February 1998 and was presented by the Minister for Gender Equality, Ulrika Messing, and the Prime Minister, Göran Persson. It was debated in parliament at the end of May that same year. The bill contained suggestions to counteract violence against women, sexual harassment in the work-life and prostitution. It received attention in the media, and one of the conservative editorials, written by a woman, stated that the government 'confessed to radical feminism'.

After the proposal had been presented it was followed by a number of party and member bills. The Greens, the Centre Party, the Social Democrats and the Left were all in support of the proposal, the Christian Democrats, the Conservatives and the Liberals were against. However, the Liberals were divided according to sex, and the Liberal women delivered a bill supporting the proposal. On 24 March 1998, the Parliamentary Committee on Justice considered and recommended the government proposal, but also stated that a criminalisation alone could not reduce prostitution.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In parliament, participants framed the debate by comparing Sweden's prostitution laws to those in the rest of the Europe. In many of these comparisons, the debaters focused on finding ways to improve the conditions of prostitutes. In the media (and not so much in parliament) the sex- work frame arose. Under sex work, prostitution is framed as a form of work and proponents argue that the state should treat prostitution like any other occupation. From the outset, the debate was also gendered in that it focused on the roles of women and men in prostitution. Additionally, many of the participants recognized that prostitutes were oppressed and that this often occurred as a result of the actions of men. Prostitution was connected to violence against women, and included under the specific proposal concerning laws focusing on violence against women.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

**Women prostitutes oppressed as a result of men's actions.
Prostitution connected to violence against women.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained framed in terms of sex work on the one hand, and abuse and exploitation of women on the other hand in the media. In parliament it was framed in terms of improving conditions for prostitutes in the parliament throughout, although the actual proposed ways of accomplishing this (criminalization of the john or not) varied according to party orientation. Additionally, the debate remained gendered and recognized that prostitutes could often be found in poor conditions.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Abuse and exploitation of women.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1: MGE actively supported the proposal to criminalize only the clients of prostitutes; criminalizing the clients of prostitutes (and not the prostitutes themselves) would promote greater gender equality.

WPA 2: EO: None

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

Criminalizing the clients of prostitutes (and not the prostitutes themselves) would promote greater gender equality.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
WPA 1 MGE: Cross sectional

WPA 2 EO: Gender discrimination in the workplace. Primary task is to ensure compliance with Equal Opportunities Act, ensuring equality in the workplace, and in some areas of education.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

WPA 1 MGE: inister is member of cabinet assigned gender equality responsibility; Equality Division is the administrative support unit for minister.

WPA 2 EO: Located in the Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications, but also under the Minister for Gender Equality, who at the time (1998 –1999) was also the Minister for Agriculture, Food and Fisheries.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 MGE

Name: **Ulrica Messing**

Time in WPA: **3/96-10/98**

WMA Activity: **Fellow traveler (describe self as feminist before appointment).**

WPA 2 EO

Name: **Lena Svenaeus**

Time in WPA: **1994-98**

WMA Activity: **Regarded as having ‘roots in the movement’.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

The women’s movement in parliament was still consolidated. Women from different parties forged alliances, and some even went against their party’s line to vote according to their feminist views on the matter.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Women’s representation in political and union offices**
- **Women’s representation in the universities and private companies**
- **Fighting welfare cutbacks and welfare state restructuring**
- **Equal pay**
- **Violence against women and prostitution**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Moderate countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **The Cabinet**
- **Ministry for Gender Equality**
- **Parliament**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Social Democratic Party formed a minority government

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **CATW**
- **Pro Sex Work - represented by the Global Alliance Against Trafficking women**
- **EUROPAP: European Network for STD-HIV Prevention**
- **TAMPEP: European Project that combines research and active intervention,**
 - **with the direct involvement of sex workers.**
- **Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 6: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

Debate ID: USA_AB1 1970-1973

Title: Criminal Abortion Laws Declared Unconstitutional

WPA: Secretary's Advisory Committee on the Rights and Responsibilities of Women (SACRRW)

Dates of Coding: 4/03/03, 9/13/03, 3/1/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name : **Sarah Weddington. Attorney for plaintiff Jane Roe**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Impact of pregnancy on woman can disrupt life; raising a child a serious responsibility; all problems of woman, personal and family life, bound up in the problem of abortion. Abortion rights of fundamental and basic concern that women should make choice.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **American Medical Women's Association.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Illegal abortion interferes with constitutionally protected right to privacy. Women should have freedom to be master of her own body and of her own fate. As fundamental a right as a woman can possess; without it women forced to function as a baby factory.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name : **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Involuntary pregnancy and child bearing is involuntary servitude. Women's bodily integrity to be fostered. Abortion restriction presses women into repeated reproductive service. Rights of individual pregnant woman no longer can be ignored.**

Policy goals: **Overturn Texas abortion law.**

WMA 4

Name : **Women's Health and Abortion Project and National Abortion Action Coalition**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Laws basically violate the basic constitutional rights of women to control and direct their lives, equal protection. Men and women have equal responsibility for acts of sexual intercourse; women should be able to choose whether they wish to bear the burdens of pregnancy. Forcing a woman to bear a child against her will is a form of punishment. Results in the total destruction of a**

woman's status in society by compelling her to take sole responsibility of having an illegal abortion or an unwanted child.

Policy goals: **Goal to eliminate all abortion laws.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name : **Sarah Weddington. Attorney for plaintiff Jane Roe**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Impact of pregnancy on woman can disrupt life; raising a child a serious responsibility; all problems of woman, personal and family life, bound up in the problem of abortion. Abortion rights of fundamental and basic concern that women should make choice.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 2

Name: **American Medical Women's Association.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Illegal abortion interferes with constitutionally protected right to privacy. Women should have freedom to be master of her own body and of her own fate. As fundamental a right as a woman can possess; without it women forced to function as a baby factory.**

Policy goals: **Decriminalize abortion.**

WMA 3

Name : **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Involuntary pregnancy and child bearing is involuntary servitude. Women's bodily integrity to be fostered. Abortion restriction presses women into repeated reproductive service. Rights of individual pregnant woman no longer can be ignored.**

Policy goals: **Overturn Texas abortion law.**

WMA 4

Name : **Women's Health and Abortion Project and National Abortion Action Coalition**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Laws basically violate the basic constitutional rights of women to control and direct their lives, equal protection. Men and women have equal responsibility for acts of sexual intercourse; women should be able to choose whether they wish to bear the burdens of pregnancy. Forcing a woman to bear a child against her will is a form of punishment. Results in the total destruction of a woman's status in society by compelling her to take sole responsibility of having an illegal abortion or an unwanted child.**

Policy goals: **Goal to eliminate all abortion laws.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

Set guidelines for state regulation on abortion:

- 1. States could not prohibit in the first trimester.**
- 2. In second trimester states could regulate health conditions of procedure.**
- 3. States could prohibit in third trimester but must retain exceptions for the threats to the life and health of the mother.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1

Form: **Individual**Location: **Plaintiff's attorney; inside non women's movement organization—U.S. Supreme Court**Activities During the Debate: **Presented brief and oral argument to the U.S. Supreme Court.**

WMA 2

Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Presented brief to the Supreme Court.**

WMA 3

Form: **Formal organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Presented brief to the Supreme Court.**

WMA 4

Form: **Informal organization of women's groups and individual women**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Presented brief to the Supreme Court.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Came to public agenda in 1959 when doctors began discussing the question of liberalizing abortion laws.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Framed as a desire for giving expanded discretion to the medical profession and was opposed by groups who saw abortion as murder; allow abortion for medical reasons.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Debate was not gendered at the beginning of the debate.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Two sides: pro abortion argued that women had a right to abortion and that this was protected by privacy rights that were guaranteed in the Constitution. Anti-

abortion argued that keeping abortion illegal helped to protect the right to life of the fetus.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women had a right to abortion; women victims of abortion laws; these laws forced women to carry pregnancy to term even if they wanted to terminate it. Anti-abortionists portrayed women as mothers and carriers of life.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
SACRRW
Abortion should be a woman's choice

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames (pending)
Abortion should be a woman's choice

NOTE: This is feminist because it empowers women in relation to men in government and male doctors.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

Campaign to eliminate all discrimination based on sex; focus on Title IX (education); national health insurance and impact on special health needs of women; social security's treatment of women; career advancement for clerical and secretarial employees in the department.

Informal: family planning programs at home and abroad administered with respect to women's rights.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
In an administrative agency and included representatives of other government agencies and some non government organizations. Advisory to the Secretary of Health, Education and Welfare.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Name: **Elizabeth Anthanasakos**
 Time in WPA: **1 year**
 WMA Activity: **In Business and Professional Women's clubs; National Women's Political Caucus; member and leader of Republican party women's activism in the late 1960s and early 1970s.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Growth
In 1959-72, the women's movement was emerging, the autonomous movement was in its heyday with vast expansion of local women's liberation groups.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **ERA (Equal Rights Amendment)**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Rape/sexual violence law reform**
- **Equal Employment**
- **Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

**Americans United for Life; American College of Obstetrics and Gynecology;
National Right to Life Committee.**

Micro Frames: **Child in the womb is a person; right to life more basic than right to procreate; protecting live of the unborn child; society should assist both mother and child; life must be preserved over alleged privacy. Uphold the Texas statue which does this.**

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Supreme Court justices and their staff**
- **Lawyers for plaintiffs and defendants**
- **Friends of the court—individuals and organizations state and non state who file briefs.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican

Senate: Democrat

House: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID:USA_AB2 1974-1977

Title: Federal Funding of abortion

WPA: National Commission for the Observance of International Women's Year (NCOIWY)

Date of Coding: 4/11/03, 9/13/03, 3/1/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Elizabeth Holzman; Member, House of Representatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Hyde Amendment, not funding abortions sacrifices lives of poor mothers.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

WMA 2.

Name **Yvonne Braithwaite Burke; Member House of Representatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Hyde Amendment, not funding abortions, sacrifices lives of poor mothers.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

WMA 3

Name : **Pat Schroeder, Member, House of Representatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Amendment will interfere with health for poor women only; disastrous consequences: illegal or self induced abortions; unwanted or mistimed births; out of wedlock births; school dropouts; suicides and precipitous marriages; health and social problems. Every woman regardless of economic status should have legal with respect to abortion consistent with sound medical practice and in accordance with her conscience.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

WMA 4

Name **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right; state should fund abortions.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

WMA 5

Name **National Women's Political Caucus**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Ban on abortions by Medicaid discriminates against poor women.**

Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 4

Name **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Abortion is women's right; state should fund abortions.**Policy goals: **Opposed Hyde Amendment.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Prohibited using Federal Medicaid funds to pay for abortion procedures.**
2. **Exception if abortion necessary because of danger to the life of the mother.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Elizabeth Holzman**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization —House of Representatives**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke out in public against the Hyde Amendment.**WMA 2 **Yvonne Braithwaite Burke**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization —House of Representatives**Activities During the Debate: **Spoke out in public against the Hyde Amendment.**WMA 3 **Pat Schroeder**Form: **Individual**Location: **Non women's movement organization —House of Representatives**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in floor debate on Hyde Amendment.**WMA 4 **National Organization for Women**Form: **Formal women's movement organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Took stand on issue; articulate position at meetings and in the press.**WMA 5 **National Women's Political Caucus**Form: **Formal women's movement organization**Location: **Free standing**Activities during the debate: **Took stand on issue; articulate position at meetings and in the press.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Roe v Wade set the guidelines that prohibited States from proscribing abortion before the third trimester of pregnancy and stimulated opponents of legal abortion to action. A strategy of the so-called pro-life movement was to use federal laws to restrict access to abortion in every way possible. By 1974 there were proposals in Congress to restrict Medicaid funds along with discussions of a constitutional amendment to return power to the States to make abortion illegal. Here we examine

the debate over what came to be known as the Hyde Amendment after its chief sponsor, Representative Henry Hyde of Illinois. Rather than a separate bill, this proposal was a floor amendment to the annual appropriations bill for the Department of Health, Education and Welfare. It prohibited Medicaid funds to be used to pay for abortions. Therefore there were no public hearings; senators and representatives articulated their views on the floor.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

From the Roe decision, the dominant frame in the beginning of the debate was that abortion was a women's privacy rights issue. The frame was gendered and focused on the idea that abortion was a fundamental women's right. The pro-choice groups argued that the state should help poor women to pay for their abortions.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Abortion is fundamental women's right.

State should help poor women pay for their abortions.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Opponents of the Hyde Amendment (which sought to limit abortion by denying state money for abortions for poor women) tried to defend the dominant frame established in the Roe decision and argue that poor women should have the right to have an abortion. Through the course of the debate over the Hyde amendment, the dominant frame shifted to focus more on the right to life of the fetus. Supporters of the Hyde Amendment argued that the life of the fetus should be equal to that of the mother. Hyde Amendment supporters argued that abortion was murder and was very morally wrong.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

The debate remained gendered throughout. Hyde Amendment supporters portrayed a positive image of women as mothers who should give themselves to their children. The supporters also portrayed a very negative image of abortion seeing women as mothers who did not care for the life of their unborn children. Opponents of the Hyde Amendment focused their gendering on poor women who were forced to carry unwanted pregnancies to term because they could not afford to pay for abortions.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCOIWY: State should provide funding for abortions for poor women.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)

Not feminist in that discourse does not include the notion of improving the status of women or rights for women.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Cross sectional; all issues relating to International Women's Year conferences on advancing the status of women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

The IWY was established by congress to prepare for US participation in the UN's International Women's Year conference. The IWY sought to gather information on a variety of women's issues and it was created so that the US could properly represent the women's movement at the UN conference. Advisory to the Federal Government.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Bela Abzug**

Time in WPA: **2 years**

WMA Activity: **Active feminist in New York women's movement organizations before becoming member of Congress.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Growth

At this time, the women's movement was in a period of growth, expanding their agenda to include seeking financial and legal information and freedom from threat or use of violence.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **ERA (Equal Rights Amendment)**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Rape/sexual violence law reform**
- **Equal Employment**
- **Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals **Henry Hyde. Member of HR**

Informal Organizations

Formal Organizations **National Right to Life Committee**

Micro Frame: **Ending pregnancy is an immoral taking of human life. Support Hyde Amendment, but ultimate goal is constitutional amendment banning abortions.**

The pro-life movement became much stronger during the debate and was supported by the Republican party.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of Congress**
- **Committees and committee chairs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not applicable

Debate ID: USA_AB3 1995-98

Title: Partial Birth Abortion Ban Act

WPA: White House Office of Women's Initiatives and Outreach (WHOWIO)

Date of Coding: 4/12/03, 9/13/03, 3/01/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Pat Schroeder, Member of House of Representatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Fundamental right of women to receive medical treatment that they and doctors determine is best for them; description fo 'partial birth' procedure is so terrible that only women who are demons would do it; makes women seem like witches.**

Is this a life saving procedure/ women exercise their rights with great responsibility.

Policy goals: **Do not ban partial birth abortion.**

WMA 2

Name **Kate Michelman, Head of NARAL**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **PBAB has enormous consequences for American women's reproductive health and privacy and for some women their very lives; debate must focus on the lives of those women; legislation is a threat to women's health and constitutional right of choice.**

Policy goals: **Opposed PBAB bill.**

WMA 3

Name **National Abortion Rights Action League**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need to focus on lives of women who need the pb procedure; this legislation is a threat to women's choice, a constitutional right. Abortion is a private medical decision, should not be subject of legislation. This bill is first step toward banning all abortion.**

Policy goals: **Supports balance reached in Roe v. Wade between right of women to choose abortion in early stages of pregnancy and states' interest in protecting fetus after viability, as long as woman's life and health are protected. Opposes PBAB.**

WMA 4

Name **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Supports Roe v. Wade**

Policy goals: **Opposed partial birth abortion ban as detrimental to women's health because they do not allow exceptions for women's health, only life.**

WMA 5

Name **Center for Reproductive Law and Policy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Pro-choice: do not restrict women's abortion rights**

Policy goals: **Against PBAB.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name **Pat Schroeder, Member of House of Representatives**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Fundamental right of women to receive medical treatment that they and doctors determine is best for them; description fo 'partial birth' procedure is so terrible that only women who are demons would do it; makes women seem like witches.**

Is this a life saving procedure/ women exercise their rights with great responsibility.

Policy goals: **Do not ban partial birth abortion.**

WMA 2

Name **Kate Michelman, Head of NARAL**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **PBAB has enormous consequences for American women's reproductive health and privacy and for some women their very lives; debate must focus on the lives of those women; legislation is a threat to women's health and constitutional right of choice.**

Policy goals: **Opposed PBAB bill.**

WMA 3

Name **National Abortion Rights Action League**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Need to focus on lives of women who need the pb procdure; this legislation is a threat to women's choice, a constitutional right. Abortion is a private medical decision, should not be subject of legislation. This bill is first step toward banning all abortion.**

Policy goals: **Supports balance reached in Roe v. Wade between right of women to choose abortion in early stages of pregnancy and states' interest in protecting fetus after viability, as long as woman's life and health are protected. Opposes PBAB.**

WMA 4

Name **National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Supports Roe v. Wade**

Policy goals: **Opposed partial birth abortion ban as detrimental to women's health because they do not allow exceptions for women's health, only life.**

WMA 5

Name **Center for Reproductive Law and Policy**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Pro-choice: do not restrict women's abortion rights**

Policy goals: **Against PBAB.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Partial birth on Abortion Act was passed twice by congress, but it was vetoed by the President. After some states enacted bans on partial birth abortions, the Supreme Court declared the bans unconstitutional.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Pat Schroeder**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Member of Congress; non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Commented at hearing before the committee on the Judiciary.**

WMA 2 **Kate Michelman**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Leader of NARAL; a women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented testimony at hearing on the Partial Birth Abortion Ban Act in 1997.**

WMA 3 **National Abortion Rights Action League**

Form: **Formal Organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbied Congress on bill; organized member campaigns.**

WMA 4 **National Organization for Women**

Form: **Formal Organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Spoke out and demonstrated against late term abortion bill.**

WMA 5 **Center for Reproductive Law and Policy**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Brought suit against partial birth abortion bans enacted in the states as violating the constitutional guarantees.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

With the decision in Casey and defeats in efforts to obtain a return to criminalization of all abortion, the pro-life advocates switched their strategy. In 1992, Martin Haskel, MD presented a paper titled 'Dilation and Extraction for Late

Second Trimester Abortion’ at a seminar sponsored by the National Abortion Federation, a provider group. It described an alternative to the standard dilation and extraction (D and X) surgical procedure for ending second trimester pregnancies, and the author claimed to have performed 700 of these procedures with few complications. Both standard and modified D and X procedures, faster than other methods and performed in doctors’ offices under local anesthesia, were developed in response to the lack of hospital facilities for second trimester abortions. The National Conference of Catholic Bishops, aiming to persuade nominally pro-choice voters that abortion was abhorrent, distributed articles describing D and X in extremely gruesome terms. They renamed this procedure partial birth abortion and, taking advantage of the Republican majority both houses of Congress after 1994, pro-life representatives introduced a bill that would bring criminal prosecution to any doctor using this procedure.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

Three Supreme Court justices provided the dominant frame for this debate, ‘regulating the legality of abortion was to find the proper balance between women's liberty to make decisions about their pregnancies . . . and the obligations of the state to protect the life of the fetus.’ The debate was gendered in the beginning, as there was recognition that abortion was a women's rights issue. Anti-abortionists argued that there should be a ban on late term abortions, and pro-choice people argued that there should be no ban on late-term abortions.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women’s liberty to make decisions about pregnancies.

Abortion is a women’s rights issue.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

As the debate progressed, proponents of the partial birth abortion act tried to frame abortion as a very gory and unnecessary procedure. Anti-abortionists argued that in the late term fetuses were fully developed and that late term abortion was essentially the same as murder. Opponents of the ban framed the issue in terms of women's rights, arguing that the ban would interfere with women's rights to abortion. Additionally opponents of the ban argued that the ban would increase the medical risks to women, because it would force them to carry their pregnancies to term, even if it would cause them severe medical problems. As the debate passed in Congress, proponents of the legislation largely ignored gender and focused the debate on the right to life of the fetus. After the bill passed, President Clinton (responding to a White House group that included many feminists) re-gendered the debate and focused it on the idea that banning partial birth abortion would be detrimental to women's health. At the end the debate was framed as a question of women’s health in balance with the rights of the fetus to life.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Ban on late term abortions increase medical risks to women.

Women have right to abortion.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WHOWIO: Prohibitions on late term abortion should allow exceptions to preserve pregnant woman's life or health.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

Not explicitly feminist.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 WHOWIO

To bridge the gap between women's groups and the administration; across a number of issues with different groups.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

Advisory to the Advisors to the president; primarily an outreach or liaison function.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Betsy Myers**

Time in WPA: **1995-1997**

WMA Activity: **No women's movement actor experience; worked to promote women small business owners in previous job in government.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

Since the early 1980s, both the pro-choice movement and the women's movement had become institutionalized, regular participants in policy communities relating to abortion issues.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Human rights for women**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Welfare reform**
- **Lesbian/gay rights**
- **Women in politics**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals: **Henry Hyde, Member of House of Representatives; participated at hearings before Congressional committees.**

Informal Organizations

Formal Organizations: **National Right to Life Committee; Christian Coalition**

Micro Frames: **Pregnant woman should be natural protector of her child in the womb; when she becomes the child's deadly adversary, the Government out to intercede to protect the weak; there's nothing weaker than a defenseless preborn child, from the strong.**

Partial Birth abortion procedure is infanticide. Protect the life of the fetus from this terrible death. The main issue is the right to life of the unborn/preborn child.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Congressional committees**
- **Members of Congress**
- **Interest groups**
- **President/Executive**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Democrat

House: Republican

Senate: Republican

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

Women's Global Reproductive Rights Network

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: USA_HI 1992-96

Title: Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act

QUAWPA: Congressional Caucus on Women's Issues (CCWI)

WPA: Women's Bureau (WB)

Date of Coding: 1/31/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1: Kate Michaelman , leader of the National Abortion and Reproductive Rights League

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: Compelling need for comprehensive welfare reform that helps women make responsible and deliberate decisions about child bearing, rewards and encourages economic self sufficiency and helps reduce teenage pregnancy.

Women should not be punished for deciding to have a child while on welfare.

A compassionate government should not deny low income women the option of abortion, force them into child birth and then cut off assistance.

Most women who receive public assistance want to get off welfare and rebuild their lives.

Policy goals: Opposes family cap; need access to abortion services. Also contraception, family planning and pregnancy programs for healthy planned families. Programs to help women attain economic independence.

WMA 2: Catherine Young, Women's Freedom Network.

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: While taking care of children is certainly very important work, participation in the workforce is a wonderful building of discipline, self-confidence and self worth.

The present welfare system enables women to bear children they and the men in their lives they would never marry and don't expect to support.

As perverse incentives of the welfare state are dismantled, women and children need a system of aid that emphasizes education, job skills, and delaying parenthood until one is able to take care of one's children.

Further, Young argued that not every single teenage mother should be allowed to rear children on state money and that some should be put in group homes.

Policy Goals : Give more flexibility to states; Break of AFDC into different services for different populations; Not every family should be preserved; group homes for teenage mothers and children is a good idea.

WMA 3. Martha Davis, member of the National Organization of Women Legal Defense Fund.

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Davis's Family Violence Option** sought to ensure that welfare mothers could continue to receive benefits if they were in a situation in which denial of benefits would make it more difficult for them to leave relationships with domestic violence.

Policy Goals : **Family Violence Option.**

WMA 4: JEDI Women

Issue Definition:

Policy Goals : **JEDI women were against proposals for drastic cuts in welfare.**

WMA 5: NOW

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Real causes of poverty: changes in the economy and education; pay inequity between men and women. Bills feed on myths that welfare mothers are lazy and have children in order to receive benefits and that women themselves are the primary causes of poverty. This is not the case.**

Punitive welfare proposals would inflict further violence against women who are victims of domestic violence and desperately trying to become self sufficient.

Policy Goals : **Retain AFDC; provide parenting education, job training, childcare, health care; oppose lifetime limits on welfare benefits, oppose women having to identify paternity and requiring teen mothers to live with parents or group home. expand waivers for domestic violence; urged Clinton not to sign bill.**

WMA 6: NOW LDEF

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Oppose new paternalism that addresses social behaviors—failure to marry, irresponsible child bearing, etc—through financial incentives and penalties that link public benefit levels with appropriate congress.**

Concern with women facing violence; a major hurdle for women trying to move to a job.

Policy Goals : **NOW-LDEF was against the Provisions of the PRWORA that would deny benefits to welfare mothers. NOW-LDEF sought to retain many of the federal welfare entitlements. Oppose family cap; oppose requirements of establishing paternity; oppose denial of benefits to unmarried teenage mothers.**

WMA7: Institute for Women's Policy Research

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **No simple or inexpensive ways to make welfare mothers self-sufficient over the long term. A majority of welfare recipients are in the labor force, but have trouble finding adequate income from work.**

Liberals, progressives, and feminists who oppose stigmatizing single mothers, and who support making work pay by reforming the low wage labor market, creating jobs, and providing higher benefit levels and universal childcare have been largely unheard in the current debate.

Policy Goals : The Institute was against totally cutting federal welfare entitlements but they, ‘accepted the notion that paid work for welfare mothers was a top goal.’ AFDC should not be time limited. Job training, childcare.

WMA 8: Wider Opportunities for Women (WOW)

Micro-Frame:

Issue Definition: Accepted the notion that paid work for welfare mothers was a top goal.’ Low wage employment experience is different for men compared to women—chutes and ladders. Work as first requirement not appropriate to the diverse caseload in welfare policy.

Policy Goals : WOW was against completely cutting federal welfare entitlements; Support comprehensive childcare to allow mother to enter training and employment; health care; public investment in training for nontraditional and other well paid jobs; basic skills enhancement.

WMA 9: National Black Women's Health Project

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: A stereotype that women on welfare have children to increase benefits; paternity establishment requirements discriminate against poor women; only asked of them. Not an effective mechanism to provide support for poor women to follow.

Policy Goals : Oppose family caps; refusing aid to teen mothers; paternity establishment requirements; life time limits on benefits.

Propose: comprehensive job creation strategy; universal health care reform; housing; childcare; child support enforcement; education/training.

WMA 10: Women’s Committee of 100

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: A war against poor women is a war against all women; was nearly alone in claiming the right of welfare mothers not to work and be supported by government programs. improve women’s wages and benefits only way out of poverty.

Policy Goals : Oppose PROWRA as punitive policy. Supported: access for poor women to contraception, family planning and abortion services; childcare and health care; strong child support enforcement; against paternity identification requirement; investment in quality education and training essential.

WMA 11: National Coalition on Women, Work and Welfare Reform Composed of 27 organizations in 1987.

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: Problem is poverty, not welfare. Solution to transform welfare system into one which enables recipients to become economically self-sufficient, not to reduce welfare rolls.

Reform should respect dignity of welfare recipients and strengthen their capabilities for determining choices in their own lives. Recognizing that most welfare recipients want to work outside the home, voluntary education, employment and training programs are the most efficient and effective approach.

Policy Goals : Maintain federal guarantee of entitlement; achieve adequate income maintenance System; adequately funded education, employment and training programs; childcare, health care; effective child support enforcement to enhance collection from non-custodial parents; state should improve paternity establishment administration.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Issue Definition:

Most women who receive public assistance want to get off welfare and rebuild their lives; contrary to the proposed bill they are not lazy or have children in order to receive welfare. Instead, the real causes of poverty are changes in the economy, educational opportunity and pay inequality between men and women. Paid work for welfare mothers should be a top goal, but should not be a first requirement.

Opposes new paternalism that addresses social behaviors—failure to marry, irresponsible child bearing, etc—through financial incentives and penalties that link public benefit levels with appropriate congress.

Policy goals:

Opposition to family cap; need access to abortion services. Also contraception, family planning and pregnancy programs for healthy planned families: Programs to help women attain economic independence.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The new law largely reflected the Republican position on welfare: it ended the federal entitlement AFDC with Temporary Assistance to Needy Families (TANF) funded through block grants to the states. Furthermore, the policy held that the poor should be individually responsible for ending their poverty.**
- 2. The new policy required welfare recipients to get jobs within 2 years of receiving benefits and take community service jobs before that. No more life long dependency, the Act imposed a life time limit of welfare eligibility of five years and denied support altogether for legal immigrants not yet citizens.**
- 3. The Act did not guarantee childcare although it provided funds for that purpose.**
- 4. To promote child support, welfare recipients were required to name fathers of out of wed lock children to get payment. Failure to cooperate would reduce benefits at least 25% and maybe eliminate them altogether.**
- 5. Republicans did not win federal controls over the most punitive proposals, however, since the Act gave states wide discretion over a variety of restrictions.**

6. **States could impose family caps- denying increased benefits for more children, deny welfare benefits for unmarried mothers under 18, and there were financial incentives for states to reduce the number of illegitimate children without increasing abortion, states could eliminate the \$50 child support to TANF recipients, and states could choose whether or not to provide any extra funds for childcare programs.**
7. **In some respects, the Act did not reflect Republican desires, as it preserved Medicaid health care insurance for poor women and children, and it allowed states some discretion to exempt some mothers from the work requirements and other punitive facets of the new program. For example, the Family Violence Option allowed states to waive time limits, child support/paternity establishment cooperation requirements and family cap provisions where it would ‘make it more difficult for individuals receiving assistance to escape domestic violence, defined as battered or subjected to extreme cruelty.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Kate Michaelman**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Kate Michaelman participated in the debate by testifying in the 1995 congressional hearings on welfare reform.**

WMA 2 **Catherine Young**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Congressional Committee.**

WMA 3 **Martha Davis**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Drafted legislation for the Family Violence Option.**

WMA 4 **JEDI Women**

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Motivated demonstrations and marches to protest drastic welfare cuts.**

WMA 5 **NOW**

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Involved with the ‘Up and Out of Poverty, Now’ policy campaign, by staging protests, and by engaging in a hunger strike to protest the signing of the PRWORA. Worked closely with National Welfare Rights Union; action alert system to generate calls to representatives and senators against punitive welfare measures.**

WMA 6 NOW LDEFForm: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by supporting the ‘Up and Out of Poverty, Now’ policy campaign. Sent statement to Congress.****WMA 7 Institute for Women’s Policy Research**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made group’s opinion public. Group representative testified at Congressional committee.****WMA 8 Wider Opportunities for Women (WOW)**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made group’s opinion public. Group representative testified at Congressional committee.****WMA 9 National Black Women's Health Project**Form: **Formal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made group’s opinion public. Group representative testified at Congressional committee.****WMA 10 Women’s Committee of 100**Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Made group opinions public; lobbied Congress; Member of Congress was spokesperson in floor debates.****WMA 11 National Coalition of Women, Work and Welfare Reforms**Form: **Informal**Location: **Free standing**Activities During the Debate: **Lobbying; making proposals public.****C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

In the 1960s, welfare reform meant efforts to expand support for the poor, while helping them to work. Typically, however, work programs exempted women with children under six years of age, the majority of AFDC recipients. By the 1980s, welfare reform had come to mean proposals to move people off welfare and reduce costs. The 1988 Family Support Act (FSA) had bipartisan support to allow states to experiment with programs to move welfare clients into jobs. One of the chief advocates and beneficiaries of the FSA was Governor Bill Clinton of Arkansas. FSA marked a new consensus between the left and right that the poor should work. Many concepts, such as *self-sufficiency* and *parental responsibility* that were later to become entrenched in the 1990s, were first introduced in the hearings in 1988. As

President of the National Governors' Association (NGA), Clinton lobbied Congress to pass the FSA. As Governor, he used the options of FSA to craft a policy in Arkansas that provided job training and health care to welfare recipients and then required them to work after two years, providing community jobs if private jobs were not available. Tougher child support enforcement was a requirement for states under FSA.

Between 1988 and 1992, reports showed increases of 30% in AFDC cases as well as more and more out of wedlock births. There were declining rates of AFDC recipients getting work and evidence of generations of grandmothers, mothers, and daughters on welfare. The concept of *dependency* was increasingly used to describe this particular pathology. In addition, there were many studies that claimed to document the negative effect on children of growing up in families headed by single, never married, mothers. Increasingly, experts saw welfare clients in two categories: short-termers, who were white, divorced, with high school educations and work experience, and long-termers, who were mostly black, single, with little education and no job skills. For many, these data documented the failures of social programs under the War on Poverty of the 1960s as well as giving credibility to works by Charles Murray that it was the welfare program itself that caused poverty. Both Democrats and Republicans were receptive to this shift in knowledge about welfare. The program had few supporters left or right; President Clinton gave it the necessary push to the Congressional agenda during his campaign and in the first few months in office.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the two sides (Democrats and Republicans) believed that the welfare system was too costly and that it should be reduced by having the welfare recipients take jobs. Initially, Democrats controlled the definition of the issue and argued that welfare problems stemmed from the failure of the Aid to Families with Dependent Children Program (AFDC) which had not been changed since its establishment in 1935. Democrats argued that the best way to reduce welfare roles was to provide welfare recipients with tools to get jobs, like education, training, childcare, and health insurance. In the beginning of the debate, the Republicans did not have much control over the dominant frame, but they did argue that poverty came from immorality and that the best way to reduce welfare roles was simply to eliminate welfare programs and rely on more punitive measures.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, although the participants frequently referred to the clients of welfare as mothers, these references carried little gendered meaning and the debate was not overtly gendered in the beginning. The issue was however implicitly gendered.

- a. Studies showed that most of the people on welfare roles were single black mothers.**
- b. Republicans implicitly blamed poverty on the poor character and immorality of the (mostly black female) welfare recipients**

- c. Democrats tended to focus their explanations of poverty on structural inadequacies like poor education and lack of jobs.**

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through its course the focus of the debate changed. Democratic control over the dominant frame reached its zenith in 1994 with the Clinton proposal entitled the Administration's Work and Responsibility Act, which sought to 'make work pay' by offering job training, childcare, and health insurance to welfare recipients who looked for jobs. However, After the 1995 and through the end of the debate, the control over the dominant frame went to the Republicans. The Republican approach placed morality and behavior at the center of the discussion. Specifically, poverty and a number of other social ills were blamed on increases in illegitimacy and families headed by single mothers. They would stamp out immorality and require responsibility and work through federal regulations. Republicans argued that programs that sought to assist the poor in getting jobs (like job training and childcare) were a waste of money and offered that the best way to reduce welfare roles was through punitive measures. The Republican proposal also ran counter to the desires of the National Governors Association (NGA) which argued that administration of welfare programs could be decentralized more to the states and that the states could provide programs to help the poor get off welfare.

Through the end, the debate also became more gendered. Republicans continued to present the image of welfare mothers as immoral and lazy. Democrats did little to gender the debate, but many women's organizations reacted to the republican claims. Women's organizations argued that welfare mothers were already working, because they had children, and that they were not immoral or lazy. Mainstream women's movement actors, like Kate Michaelman, argued that the purpose of welfare reform should not be to punish women on welfare, but rather should be to make women self sufficient and encourage them to make good decisions regarding child bearing. More right-wing women's interests gendered the debate by arguing that welfare mothers and their children were victims of welfare, as they were dependent on it, and they criticized that welfare mothers should not be allowed to have children with men that they would not marry. Finally, father's rights advocates contributed to the gendering by focusing on the idea that fathers were being driven away from their children by welfare policies that focused on mothers. Father's rights advocates argued that men should not just be forced to pay child support for their children, but should also have a right to custody or some access to them.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

- Welfare mothers as immoral and lazy.
- Welfare mothers were already working, because they had children, and that they were not immoral or lazy.
- Women on welfare have the potential to be self sufficient and to make good decisions regarding child bearing.
- Welfare mothers and their children are victims of welfare, as they were dependent on it.

- **Welfare mothers should not be allowed to have children with men that they would not marry.**
- **Fathers are being driven away from their children by welfare policies that focused on mothers. Men should not just be forced to pay child support for their children, but should also have a right to custody or some access to them.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

QUAWPA 1: Congressional Caucus for Women’s Issues (CCWI)

The CCWI argued in favor of policies that would offer state funding for childcare and that would encourage better enforcement of child support from fathers.

WPA 1 Women’s Bureau – WB

No micro Frames with regards to the debate.

C5A-3 WPA Feminist Micro Frames

None.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

QUAWPA 1 CCWI

Multi-issue, as CCWI involved itself with a wide range of issues pertaining to economic, social and political interests of women and their families.’

WPA 1 - WB

The Women’s Bureau is formally charged to cover women’s work issues.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

QUAWPA 1 - CCWI

The CCWI was only as influential as its members. If they were on important committees, had influence; some were between 1992-96. As a legislative organization, its members were close to the power centers as policy makers and members of committees and policy sub-systems.

WPA 1- WB

The agency was moderately close to centers of power as its director was close to the Secretary of Labor, which is in the president’s cabinet.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

QUAWPA 1 CCWI

Name: Connie Morella

Years in WPA:1994-96

WMA Activities: Worked for women’s equality through her career in politics; fellow traveler.

Name: **Nita Lowey**

Years in WPA: **1994-96**

WMA Activities: **Record of supporting women's rights legislation as member of Congress.**

WPA 1-WB

Name: **Karen Nussbaum**

Years in WPA: **1993-96**

WMA Activities: **Organized 9 to 5, a women's rights labor union. Women's activist in AFL CIO.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

By the 1990s, the women's movement sectors at the national level were found in well-organized interest groups and inside government institutions; as a result of the 1992 election there was a significant increase in the number of women's advocates in the Congress itself.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Human rights for women**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Welfare reform**
- **Lesbian/gay rights**
- **Women in politics**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Strong

Newt Gingrich and the Republican Party.

In the Contract with America Gingrich and the Republicans came out in favor of drastically cutting welfare programs. The contract framed the issue in terms of morality and blamed poverty on the moral and character inadequacies of welfare mothers.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **National Governors Association**
- **House of Representatives**
- **Senate**
- **Presidency**
- **Department of Health and Human Services**
- **Committees in the House and Senate**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Democrat

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 1

For the purposes of the present Convention, the term ‘discrimination against women’ shall mean any distinction, exclusion or restriction made on the basis of sex which has the effect or purpose of impairing or nullifying the recognition, enjoyment or exercise by women, irrespective of their marital status, on a basis of equality of men and women, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural, civil or any other field.

Article 13

1. States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in other areas of economic and social life in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the some rights, in particular:

(a) The right to family benefits;

(b) The right to bank loans, mortgages and other forms of financial credit;

(c) The right to participate in recreational activities, sports and all aspects of cultural life.

Debate ID: USA_JT 1 1976-1978

Title: CETA Reauthorization

WPA: Women's Bureau (WB)

Date of Coding: 4/13/03, 9/13/03, 3/1/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Ester Watternberg, Associate Professor of Social Work**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Poor people are chiefly women and their dependent children; with training women can get families out of poverty; women in intact families with unemployed husbands need programs as well. CETA is not serving these women well because they are trained for low paid female dominated jobs.**

Policy goals: **CETA need to respond and serve these women better.**

WMA 2

Name: **Ann Schmidt, Director of Women in Employment; women's lobby.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **CETA must address problems of women who are a significant portion of the poor.**

Policy goals: **Need stronger affirmative action language; stronger enforcement language; AFDC preference for job training; include displaced homemakers under section for Federal funds.**

WMA 3

Name: **Joyce Hartwell, Marilyn Adams, represented National Women's Political Caucus**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in dead end low paying jobs; must be given the opportunity to upgrade their skills; women are large group of the poor; want training for women in the skilled trades and related work areas. Women have been affected by sex role stereotyping in education; adult women are especially affected. We need to gender the skilled trades.**

Policy goals: **Strengthen affirmative action goals; special training centers for training women.**

WMA 4

Name **Laurie Shields, head of Alliance for displaced homemakers**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Displaced homemakers are women over 40; need help, not because of marital status but because of years of dependency on spousal and government assistance; left with deep sense of inadequacy.**

Policy goals: **Displaced Homemaker Assistance Act to be placed as amendment to the CETA which will be authorizing the Secretary of Labor to fund and carry out the program.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 3

Name: **Joyce Hartwell, Marilyn Adams, represented National Women’s Political Caucus**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women are in dead end low paying jobs; must be given the opportunity to upgrade their skills; women are large group of the poor; want training for women in the skilled trades and related work areas. Women have been affected by sex role stereotyping in education; adult women are especially affected. We need to gender the skilled trades.**

Policy goals: **Strengthen affirmative action goals; special training centers for training women.**

WMA 4

Name **Laurie Shields, head of Alliance for displaced homemakers**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Displaced homemakers are women over 40; need help, not because of marital status but because of years of dependency on spousal and government assistance; left with deep sense of inadequacy.**

Policy goals: **Displaced Homemaker Assistance Act to be placed as amendment to the CETA which will be authorizing the Secretary of Labor to fund and carry out the program.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The 1978 reauthorization of the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act added some provisions to the act that were favorable to women. These provisions included:**
 - a. **special funds for displaced homemakers**
 - b. **requiring job training providers to provide equal opportunities for women**
 - c. **funding for childcare for women seeking training in non- traditional jobs.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Ester Watterberg**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Informal women’s movement organization: coalition of women who monitor success and access of women to job training and work opportunities in Minneapolis.**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified at Congressional hearings on the CETA reauthorization held in Chicago.**

WMA 2 Ann SchmidtForm: **Individual**Location: **Director of Women in Employment; Women's Lobby; formal women's movement organization**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Congressional hearings on CETA reauthorization.****WMA 3 Joyce Hartwell, Marilyn Adams**Form: **Individual**Location: **Represent National Women's Political Caucus (NWPC) a formal women's movement organization.**Activities During the Debate: **Testified before congressional hearings.****WMA 4 Laurie Shields**Form: **Individual**Location: **Represented Alliance for Displace Homemakers. An informal women's movement organization.**Activities During the Debate: **Wrote letter to Committee considering reauthorization of CETA.****C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate**

By the time of the Comprehensive Employment and Training Act in 1972 the dominant job training frame shifted to a view that it was the federal government's responsibility to deal with unemployment and to provide the poor with jobs and job opportunities. Sponsors argued that government must step in where the economy had failed and drafted the CETA to address problems of the unemployed and economically disadvantaged. Opponents countered that government should leave job training, and especially job creation, to the private sector.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the frame of the debate was gender neutral and focused on economic issues. The debate was over the reauthorization of the 1972 Comprehensive Employment and training act. The proponents of the reauthorization thought that the federal government should use job training policy to deal with unemployment and help the poor, while opponents of the legislation argued that the government should leave job training to the private sector.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
No gendered ideas.**C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.**

Through the end the frame focused on using job training to solve unemployment and also gained a special focus on women. At the end of the debate in 1978, the prevailing definition of the problem CETA was to solve was unemployment, especially among the poor and disadvantaged, to be addressed through a combination of job creation and training programs. In its elaboration, this problem

included references to the special needs and groups of women. Through the end, testimony during the debates focused on the differences between men and women and the disadvantages that women faced in the job market.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Special needs and groups of women in job creation and training recognized; men and women have different needs with respect to job training.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
WB promoted the displaced homemakers agenda and proposals for affirmative action in promoting non-traditional occupations for women.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames (pending)
**WB promoted the displaced homemakers agenda and proposals for affirmative action in promoting non-traditional occupations for women.
 Feminist because women in non-traditional occupations overcomes job segregation and gender hierarchy.**

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 Single issue focus on status of women in the work force.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
In the office of the Secretary of Labor, reporting to the Secretary.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Alexis Herman**

Years in WPA: **1977-81**

WMA Activity: **Advocate for poor women into training programs through advocacy organizations.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Growth

At the time of its success in obtaining a dual response from the state on the CETA job training debates of 1976-8, the women's movement was in a stage of growth.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **ERA (Equal Rights Amendment)**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Rape/sexual violence law reform**
- **Equal Employment**
- **Health**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

Chairs of congressional committees, members of congress and agencies of the Department of labor and some interest associations.

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Democrat

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable.

Debate ID: USA_JT2 1980-1982

Title: Job Training Partnership Act

WPA: Women's Bureau (WB)

Date of Coding: 4/13/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Ms. Fleming of WOW, representing informal coalition**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **None of the proposals before the committee adequately targets women; men are given the first priority unless women are specifically targeted. No attention to non traditional occupations or activities to overcome artificial barriers to employment in such things as sex stereotyping or family responsibilities.**

Policy Goals: **Need special programs for AFDC women; Displaced Homemakers need to be included as they were under CETA.**

Need childcare; public sector has to monitor public private partnerships to be sure women are served.

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name **Ms. Fleming of WOW, representing informal coalition**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **None of the proposals before the committee adequately targets women; men are given the first priority unless women are specifically targeted. No attention to non traditional occupations or activities to overcome artificial barriers to employment in such things as sex stereotyping or family responsibilities.**

Policy Goals: **Need special programs for AFDC women; Displaced Homemakers need to be included as they were under CETA.**

Need childcare; public sector has to monitor public private partnerships to be sure women are served.

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The Reagan administration sought to devolve authority for job training to the states (and to privatize some aspects of it) with the Job Training Partnership Act of 1982. The final version of the act included displaced homemakers along with others facing special barriers to employment and envisioned a much reduced role for special federal support for these disadvantaged groups. Most of the funds were to be distributed directly to the states and to be administered by new private industry councils dominated by private sector employers. The act prohibited discrimination against women, but there were no affirmative action steps to bring women into non traditional jobs.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Ms. Fleming**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Informal women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified before Congressional hearing on Job Training Partnership Act.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Before the CETA came up for the scheduled reauthorization hearings, President Ronald Reagan and the new Republican majority in the Senate elected in 1980 put the issue on the agenda. They defined the job training problem to be the CETA itself and its approach to the role of government.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was framed in terms of new federalism and devolving authority for programs to the state level. President Reagan, a major proponent of the legislation, sought to respond to unemployment problems by devolving authority for job training programs to the state level and including more privatization of the programs.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

The frame in the beginning of the debate was non-gendered. Rather, 'the dominant Frame of the debate over job training policy in this second debate was how to bring the private sector into a major role.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate remained focused on privatization and devolving authority to the states.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

In spite of the efforts of the women's movement, the debate was not Gendered at its end.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

No position

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames (pending)

WB No position in debate

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

To formulate standards and policies to promote the welfare of wage-earning women, improve their working conditions, increase their efficiency and advance their opportunities for profitable employment.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

In the office of the Secretary of Labor.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Leonore Cole Alexander**

Years in WPA: **1981-86**

WMA Activity: **No women's movement activity.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Growth

Evidence and source: **The women's movement was in a state of growth, although it was at the end of the growth phase.**

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Pro-choice**
- **Pornography debates**
- **Comparable worth/pay equity**
- **Woman battery**
- **Family/medical leave**

C20A_1—Counter movement Strength

No counter movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Chairs of congressional committees**
- **Members of congress**
- **Agencies of the Department of Labor**
- **Some interest associations.**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican

House: Democrat

Senate: Republican

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: USA_JT3 1989-90

Title: Vocational Training and Worker Productivity Act of 1990

WPA: State Sex Equity Coordinators (SSEC)

Date of Coding: 4/15/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Ms. Arrindell, Director of Public Policy for Wider Opportunities for Women (WOW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Have closely monitored the implementation of sex equity in the 1984 Perkins act and homemaker set asides; the were ‘enormously successful’. Historically vocational education has reinforced occupation segregation. ; many of the students are women with at least one dependent child. There is a clear demand for support services like childcare.**

Policy goals: **Maintain homemaker set asides, childcare and other support services for women.**

WMA 2

Name **Jill Miller, Chair, National Coalition for Women and Girls in Education**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Sex equity set asides are end product of a carefully crafted bipartisan compromise in 1984. Our assessment is they have been very effective and we want them in the new act.**

Two thirds of the new entrants to work force in next decade will be women; women and girls tracked into dead end low paid female jobs; women and families they support are increasingly at risk of living in poverty, without access to education and training.

Policy goals: **Sex equity and single parent/homemaker set asides are key to opportunity to make vocational education of means of opportunity. Re-authorize them.**

WMA 3

Name: **Displaced Homemakers Network**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Set asides for displaced homemakers even more critical for women in 1989 than they were when authorized in 1984. More women entering the labor force, and many will continue to be displaced homemakers (mid life and older women who have lost their primary source of income because of separation or divorce, death, etc of a spouse.)**

Policy Goals: **Reauthorize sex equity set asides; increase 3.5 sex equity set asides to 8% and target to girls and women under 25. focus on single parents along with displaced homemakers.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name **Ms. Arrindell, Director of Public Policy for Wider Opportunities for Women (WOW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Have closely monitored the implementation of sex equity in the 1984 Perkins act and homemaker set asides; they were ‘enormously successful’. Historically vocational education has reinforced occupation segregation. Many of the students are women with at least one dependent child. There is a clear demand for support services like childcare.**

Policy Goals: **Maintain homemaker set asides, childcare and other support services for women.**

WMA 2

Name **Jill Miller, Chair, National Coalition for Women and Girls in Education**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Sex equity set asides are end product of a carefully crafted bipartisan compromise in 1984. our assessment is they have been very effective and we want them in the new act.**

Two thirds of the new entrants to work force in next decade will be women; women and girls tracked into dead end low paid female jobs; women and families they support are increasingly at risk of living in poverty, without access to education and training.

Policy goals: **Sex equity and single parent/homemaker set asides are key to opportunity to make vocational education of means of opportunity. Re-authorize them.**

WMA 3

Name: **Displaced Homemakers Network**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Set asides for displaced homemakers even more critical for women in 1989 than they were when authorized in 1984. More women entering the labor force, and many will continue to be displaced homemakers (mid life and older women who have lost their primary source of income because of separation or divorce, death, etc of a spouse.)**

Policy goals: **Re-authorize sex equity set asides; increase 3.5 sex equity set asides to 8% and target to girls and women under 25. Focus on single parents along with displaced homemakers.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The 1990 Perkins Act was a reauthorization of the Vocational Education Act. The act focused on adjusting the level of ‘set asides’ or funding for special vocational education for disadvantaged groups. The Perkins Act:**
 - a. **retained the specific allotments [of set asides] for women with only a slight reduction from those in the 1984 Act**

- b. retained the network of state- based equity coordinators and their financial support. The coordinators have the responsibility to review, comment on, and make recommendations about the plans of any educational institution receiving federal funds to ensure that the needs of women and men for training in nontraditional jobs are met.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Ms. Arrindell

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Free standing formal women’s movement organization (WOW)**

Activities During the Debate: **Presented testimony at congressional hearings.**

WMA 2 Jill Miller

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Free standing informal women’s movement organization: National Coalition for Women and Girls in Education; coalition of 60 diverse national organizations.**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified at Congressional Hearing.**

WMA 3 Displaced Homemakers Network

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Submitted written testimony to Congressional Committees debating vocational education bill.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

In 1976 the Vocational Education Administration responded to the growing women’s movement by including special programs for women: set asides for displaced homemakers and single parents, set asides to eliminate sex stereotyping and teach girls and women skills for non-traditional occupations; and strong language prohibiting sex discrimination in vocational education. To back it up, the VEA required states to assign full time personnel – sex equity coordinators – to oversee efforts to eliminate sex discrimination. The 1984 reauthorization strengthened the programs for women and required states to provide funds for the sex equity coordinators. These victories, in spite of the chilly climate of the Reagan administration, were due to work of women’s advocacy organizations and the sex equity coordinators. This debate occurred when the act came up for reauthorization in 1989.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

Debate frame remained unchanged since the 1960s: purpose of vocational education to train people to be productive workers and the federal role to direct states and local school officials to pay attention to special groups needing job training through set asides. Conservatives tried to eliminate set asides for special groups Displaced homemakers and single parents were among these groups. There

was general agreement that vocational education needed more funds from the federal government. Vocational education debates assumed needs for sex equity.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate
Need for sex equity in vocational education.

Support for displaced homemakers and single parents in job training.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate was focused on the need to increase funding for vocational programs and although there was an effort to degender the debate by conservatives, the debate remained gendered with respect to the need for special funds for groups of disadvantaged women. Advocates for women managed to bring focus to the impact of reducing set-asides for women. Further, through the end of the debate, women's movement actors argued that the state should retain current vocational programs and try to change them so that they would stop training so many women for stereotypical women's work types of positions (which paid less and were lower status).

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

Reducing set asides would have serious impact on women.

Should stop training so many women for stereotypical women's work jobs which paid less and had lower status.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1: Vocational programs should retain set asides for displaced women and should train women for non-stereotypical positions.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames

WPA 1: Vocational programs should retain set asides for displaced women and should train women for non-stereotypical positions.

Feminist because non traditional occupations for women overcome gender hierarchies.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1

The sex equity coordinators were single issue WPAs and focused on issues surrounding the Vocational Education Act. Their mandate was to administer programs for single parents and homemakers and sex equity.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

The sex equity coordinators were all state level bureaucrats who were charged with implementing the Vocational Education Act. The equity coordinators all oversaw the implementation of the VEA to ensure that it treated the sexes equally.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

No one head; two coordinators testified before Congressional hearings including Mary Mulloy, for Vermont.

WMA Activity: This varies by state; a number of coordinators were movement activists before appointment according to Schmuck. Connections with National Coalition for Women and Girls in Education.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

By the 1990s, the women's movement Actors at the national level were found in well-organized interest groups and inside government institutions; as a result of the 1992 election there was a significant increase in the number of women's advocates in the Congress itself.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Sexual harassment**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Violence against women (rape, battery)**
- **Women in elective office/politics**
- **Women in the arts**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals Bush administration, Conservatives in Congress, especially Republicans, e.g. Rep Goodling

Informal Organizations

Formal Organizations: National Alliance of Business

Micro Frames: Opposed set asides for special groups under a federal mandate; distribute vocational education funds directly to states and educators to administer as they will, preferably in block grants.

Prefer funds for innovation rather than supporting access.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **President/Secretary of Education**
- **Congress**
- **State governments**
- **Networks of individuals centered in Congress develop vocational educational policy**
- **National and state interest groups**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not applicable.

Debate ID: USA_PR1 1972-1979

Title: ERA ratification in Arkansas

WPA: Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)

Dates of Coding: 12/31/03, 3/08/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name: **Marilyn Simmons, State Director FLAG**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **She cautioned that the measure only stood to deny women the 'extra' rights and privileges they had been granted, particularly in matters related to the workplace and military service.**

Policy Goals: **Do not ratify the ERA.**

WMA 2

Name: **Phyllis Schlafly, Head of Eagle Forum, National Anti-era Champion**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **The Fourteenth Amendment to the U.S. Constitution also was presented as evidence that Congress already had the power to ameliorate any remaining inequities between men and women. She cautioned that the measure only stood to deny women the 'extra' rights and privileges they had been granted, particularly in matters related to the workplace and military service.**

Policy Goals: **Do not ratify the ERA.**

WMA 3

Name: **Alice Glover, co-chair of ERArkansas**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals: **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA 4

Name: **ERA Arkansas**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA5

Name: **Business and Professional Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA6

Name: **League of Women Voters**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA 7

Name: **American Association of University Women (AAUW)**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA 8

Name: **The Arkansas Women's Political Caucus**

MicroFrame:

Issue Definition: **Argued that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal (and often, economic or political) rights and would have no effect on their social status.**

Policy Goals : **In favor of ratifying the Equal Rights Amendment.**

WMA 9

Name: **Committee for the Protection of Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Women's roles are based on their roles as mothers; the ERA would harm them.**

Policy Goals: **Against ratification.**

WMA 10

Name: **FLAG (Family, Life, America, and God)**

MicroFrame:

Issue definition: **Women's roles are based on their roles as mothers; the ERA would harm them.**

Policy Goals: **Against ratification.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. ERA was not ratified

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Marilyn Simmons**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Articulating the anti-ERA position; lobbying state officials to defeat it; talking to local groups around the state.**

WMA 2 **Phyllis Schlafly**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **National anti-ERA champion Phyllis Schlafly articulated the anti-era position during visits to Arkansas. Testified before a state legislative committee in early 1973. Made other appearances, including – notably – a debate with former state women's commission chair and pro-ERA activist Diane Kincaid (Blair) on the floor of the state House in front of the legislators on 2/15/75.**

WMA 3 **Alice Glover**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Active lobbying of various legislators. Organizer and participant in various rallies and speaking engagements.**

WMA 4 **ERA Arkansas**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Tried to influence the state legislators and the public. Full page advertisement in the Arkansas Gazette, April 1977 listing ERA backers.**

WMA 5 **Business and Professional Women**

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Tried to influence the state legislators and the public in and around the state capitol; at meetings of local affiliates across the state; gave**

dinner for pro-ERA activists and legislators in 2/2/79 together with Ark Women's Political Caucus.

WMA 6 League of Women Voters

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Tried to influence the Arkansas state legislators and the public in and around the state capitol; at meetings of local affiliates across the state.**

WMA 7 American Association of University Women (AAUW)

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in the debate by tried to influence members of the Arkansas state legislature and the public. Also attended and held meetings with local affiliates around the state.**

WMA 8 The Arkansas Women's Political Caucus

Form: **Formal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Tried to influence members of the Arkansas state legislature and the public as well; gave dinner for pro-ERA activists and legislators in 2/2/79 together with Ark Business and Professional Women; worked in and around state Capitol; specifically a major player in a march to the Capitol on 8/26/78.**

WMA 9 Committee for the Protection of Women

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **A busload of women came to the capitol to express publicly their objections to what they saw as radical changes active in and around state capitol.**

WMA 10 FLAG (Family, Life, America, and God)

Form: **Informal**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **A busload of women came to the capitol to express publicly their objections to what they saw as radical changes.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The addition of an explicit recognition of sex equality to the U.S. Constitution was proposed in 1923 by a 'radical' wing of the victorious suffragists. Though congressional passage was not achieved until 1972, nearly half the states voted to accept the proposed amendment the same year, and in the opening days of 1973 it seemed 'virtually assured' that Arkansas would join the rapidly-growing list of ratifying states. ERA-backers including the state chapters of the Women's Political

Caucus, the Federation of Business and Professional Women, and the League of Women Voters as well as the Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW) had been contacting policymakers since the spring of 1972, and had received public declarations of support by the Governor (Democrat Dale Bumpers, who made ratification one of his 'administration bills' and several legislators). But on January 15th a busload of South Arkansas women calling themselves the 'Committee for the Protection of Women' disembarked at the state capitol building to express objections to the radical changes they claimed the ERA would invoke. The ratification debate in Arkansas was officially underway.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was gendered and focused on the idea that the Equal Rights Amendment was a symbolic gesture that women deserved. Proponents of the ERA argued that it would only improve women's legal rights and would have no effect on their social status. In the beginning, there was little opposition to the ERA.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
Women deserve symbolic equal status in the Constitution; will improve women's legal rights.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate was still gendered as the opposition arose to it. Opponents of the ERA argued that there were already enough laws to ensure women's legal equality to men. Further opponents of the ERA argued that the act would alter social relations between men and women and allow (*or force*) women to fill many roles traditionally played by men. Advocates of the ERA argued that the Supreme Court failed to interpret many of the enacted laws and that new legislation was necessary to ensure that women and men had equal legal rights.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Women need ERA to gain equal legal status.

Women don't need ERA to gain equal legal status; it would alter social relations between women and men and allow or force women to fill many roles traditionally played by men.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

**WPA 1. The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)
GCSW Supported ratification of ERA but downplayed the effects that the ERA would have on the status of women.**

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

None

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
 WPA 1. **The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)**
Multi-issue. Broad mandate and it was involved with many women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
 WPA 1 **The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)**
Commission located in Governor's office.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 WPA 1 **The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)**
 Name and years in WPA:
Diane Kincaid (later, Blair) from 1971-1975;
Harryette Dorchester from 1976-1978
 WMA activity: **Kincaid (Blair) was a feminist political science instructor at the state's flagship university and an attendee at a conference on women in politics early in 1971 in Dallas, TX. She was later an Arkansas delegate at the Houston meeting for International Women's Year in 1977. Dorchester had been the earlier WPA's part-time executive secretary and a long-time 'fellow traveler' of the feminist movement.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence
Growth
At this time, the women's movement was in a period of growth, expanding their agenda to include seeking financial and legal information and freedom from threat or use of violence.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **ERA (Equal Rights Amendment)**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Rape/sexual violence law reform**
- **Equal Employment**
- **Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength
Strong
There were many individuals (like Phyllis Schlafly) who came out against the ERA. There was a strong counter-movement in this debate. Schlafly framed the issue in terms of women's rights and argued that the ratification of the ERA would discontinue many privileges granted to women with regard to military service. Further, Schlafly argued that the ERA was not necessary because there were already enough laws to ensure the equal protection of women.

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Governor**
- **Arkansas State Legislature**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority
Democratic party (ultra conservative)

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name
IWY UN 1975 Network

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate
Not Applicable

Debate ID: USA_PR2 1991-1992

Title: Citizen's Initiative on Term limits in Michigan

WPA: Michigan Women's Commission (MWC)

Dates of Coding: 12/31/03, 3/08/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

Name: **Gloria Woods, President of the MI National Organization for Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **We did not take a stand in part because our closest allies in the legislature were Democrats, mostly women, all of whom would be termed out if the legislation passed. Further it was not at all clear that the possible gains women might make with term limits would mean an overall gain in allies.**

Policy goals: **No support for term limits.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. In 1992, voters in the state of Michigan adopted the term limits initiative.**
 - a. The measure's provisions were typical: state representatives were limited to three 2-year terms, state senators to two 4-year terms, state executive officers to two 4-year terms, U.S. Representatives to three 2-year terms, and U.S. Senators to two 6-year terms.**
 - b. In addition, a lifetime cap was placed on service at each level.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Gloria Woods**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Was interviewed by media; otherwise not very active.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The late 1980s and early 1990s were ripe for the reemergence of term limits in American politics. A banking scandal in the U.S. House, a floundering economy, and dimly low electoral competitiveness at the national level produced a sour mood. The solution – or at least, in many eyes, a just punishment to be exacted on the 'ruling class' – was to cap the number of terms elected officials could serve. Getting little support for the idea from national officeholders (despite polls which consistently registered public support at 75% or better), term limits advocates turned to the individual states, especially those in which citizens could take policy matters into their own hands through the mechanisms of direct democracy. California, Colorado, and Oklahoma led the charge in 1990 by limiting the service of their state legislators. Activists in other states soon followed suit, adding caps on the terms of executive officers as well as members of Congress to their proposals.

Michigan – which had seen slightly lower-than-average state legislative turnover and other signs of increased legislative professionalization in recent decades and at the time was represented by some of the longest-serving national elected officials in the country – was among these other states. Though at least two earlier Michigan petition drives failed to produce the necessary number of signatures to present voters with a term limits proposal, in December 1991 proponents Submitted nearly 150,000 more signatures than required. The measure was among the most comprehensive of any proposed: state representatives were limited to three 2-year terms, state senators to two 4-year terms, state executive officers to two 4-year terms, U.S. Representatives to three 2-year terms, and U.S. Senators to two 6-year terms. In addition, a lifetime cap was to be placed on service at each level.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate was gender neutral and framed in terms of protecting democracy. Those in favor of term limits argued that it would help to keep 'career politicians' from abusing the system. Those opposed to term limits argued that term limits would inhibit democracy and the right of the people to choose whomever they want for elected office.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

In spite of at least one pro-term-limits activist's remark that term limits would 'destroy the good ol' boy system' by 'opening things up for more women, more minorities to serve,' little was said on this point by him or anyone else. Thus, the debate remained gender neutral throughout. Eventually, the debate came to favor the proponents of term limits and the idea that they would prevent career politicians from abusing the system.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate

None

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

WPA 1. The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)

MWC did not participate in debate.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1. The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)

Multi-issue – Dealt with a variety of women's issues.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA

**WPA 1. The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)
Within Department of Civil Rights**

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1. The Governor's Commission on the Status of Women (GCSW)

Name: **Patricia Thomas, Chair**

Years in WPA: **May 1991-January 1993**

WMA activity: **None**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

By the 1990s, the women's movement actors at the national level were found in well-organized interest groups and inside government institutions; as a result of the 1992 election there was a significant increase in the number of women's advocates in the Congress itself.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Sexual harassment**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Violence against women (rape, battery)**
- **Women in elective office/politics**
- **Women in the arts**

C20A_1—Counter-movement Strength

No counter-movement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Public**
- **Governors**
- **NGOs**
- **Members of State Legislature**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

Republican

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Article 4

1. Adoption by States Parties of temporary special measures aimed at accelerating de facto equality between men and women shall not be considered discrimination as defined in the present Convention, but shall in no way entail as a consequence the maintenance of unequal or separate standards; these measures shall be discontinued when the objectives of equality of opportunity and treatment have been achieved

Article 7

States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men, the right:

- (a) To vote in all elections and public referenda and to be eligible for election to all publicly elected bodies;**
- (b) To participate in the formulation of government policy and the implementation thereof and to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels of government;**
- (c) To participate in non-governmental organizations and associations.**

Debate ID: USA_PR3 1988-93

Title: National Voter Registration Act

QUAWPA: Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI)

Dates of Coding: 12/31/03, 3/04/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA1

Name: **Frances Fox Piven, prominent political scientist and reform activist**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Piven attempted to gender the issue and produced evidence to show that the motor voter act would allow more women to register to vote and would likely increase voter turnout among women, especially the poor and elderly.**

Policy Goals: **In favor of motor voter reform.**

C1_2A—WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

None

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

- 1. The final measure, Public Law 103-31, required states to allow people to register to vote when applying for a driver's license and interacting with certain public agencies (though not unemployment compensation sites); states also had to provide for mail registration.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Frances Fox Piven**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Piven published articles on the effects of the motor voter registration, using examples of poor women as prime beneficiaries of the new law. She also testified at legislative hearings and was present at the official ceremony in which President Clinton signed the bill into law.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Spurred on by the earlier state actions, and by 'good government' groups like the League of Women Voters, federal motor-voter legislation was introduced in Congress in 1988. It required all states to supply registration forms at motor vehicle agencies as well as state offices serving welfare recipients, the unemployed, and the disabled. Though the House passed the measure in 1990 and 1991, Republican members blocked floor consideration in the Senate. Republican President George Bush eventually received a compromise measure in July of 1992, but promptly vetoed it. When an override effort failed in the Senate two months later, Democratic Governor Bill Clinton of Arkansas made the matter a campaign issue in his bid for the presidency that fall. Indeed,

when Clinton assumed office in January of 1993, congressional Democrats elevated national motor-voter legislation to the top of the agenda.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the debate was not gendered and was framed in terms of democratic representation and voter turnout. The side in favor of the motor voter law noted that it would encourage greater voter turnout because it would make it easy for people with little time to register. Those opposed to the bill argued that it would allow for more people to register who were likely to vote for the Democratic party.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate
None

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

The debate was not explicitly gendered throughout and in the end it favored the frame that focused on the desire to allow more people to register to vote. Implicitly, however, this frame was gendered because the women were thought to comprise a large number of people that had little time to register and the motor voter bill would allow for greater turnout among female voters.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
No explicit gendered ideas

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

**WPA 1 The Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI)
CCWI not involved in the debate (a QUAWPA)**

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames

Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 The Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI)

Multi-issue. It was a legislative service organization of Congress bringing together officeholders with an interest in improving the status of women. Really, serving as a 'nexus' between congresswoman (and sympathetic congressmen) and feminist organizations/NGOs.

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA

WPA 1 The Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI)

A congressional caucus is composed of like-minded members of Congress. It has become gradually more influential (even to the point of being an agenda-setter, according to Gertzog) since it reorganized in the early 1980s and – mostly – expanded its membership in the late 80s and early 1990s.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

WPA 1 The Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI)

Name: Rep. Patricia Schroeder (D-CO) and Rep. Olympia Snowe (R-ME) were co-chairs during this period.

Years in WPA: 1983-1993

WMA activity: Both were identified as feminists, though Snowe always walked a difficult line balancing her feminist ideals with those of most in her party, especially during the Reagan and Bush presidencies at the very beginning of this debate period.

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

By the 1990s, the women's movement actors at the national level were found in well-organized interest groups and inside government institutions; as a result of the 1992 election there was a significant increase in the number of women's advocates in the Congress itself.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Sexual harassment**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Violence against women (rape, battery)**
- **Women in elective office/politics**
- **Women in the arts**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Congress**
- **President**
- **NGOs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican and then Democrat after 1992

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable

Debate ID: USA_PT1 1976-1978

Title: Sexual Exploitation of Children

WPA: National Commission for Observance of International Women's Year (NCOIWY)

Date of Coding: 4/15/03, 9/13/03, 3/02/04, 12/02/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Florence Rush, Author**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Sexual abuse of children, who are overwhelmingly female, by sexual offenders who are overwhelmingly male adults is part and parcel of male dominated society which overtly and covertly subjugates.**

Policy goals: **Did not offer a policy solution.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women Against Violence Against Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **We would draw the line wherever violence or hostility toward women is equated with sexual pleasure, we would draw the line wherever children are sexually exploited. We do not oppose sex education, erotic literature or erotic art.**

Policy goals: **Do not oppose sex education; policy could intervene to deal with violence toward women and sexual exploitation of women.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

Name **Florence Rush, Author**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Sexual abuse of children, who are overwhelmingly female, by sexual offenders who are overwhelmingly male adults is part and parcel of male dominated society which overtly and covertly subjugates.**

Policy goals: **Did not offer a policy solution.**

WMA 2

Name: **Women Against Violence Against Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **We would draw the line wherever violence or hostility toward women is equated with sexual pleasure, we would draw the line wherever children are sexually exploited. We do not oppose sex education, erotic literature or erotic art.**

Policy Goals: **Do not oppose sex education; policy could intervene to deal with violence toward women and sexual exploitation of women.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Made it a crime to employ, use, persuade, induce, entice, or coerce any minor to engage in, or any other person to engage in, any sexually explicit conduct for the purpose of producing any visual aid or print medium depicting such conduct.**
2. **The law made it illegal to traffic minors (defined as under the age of 18 years) across state lines to engage in illegal sex acts or prostitution: This was an amendment to the Mann Act of 1909 which had made it a crime to transport women across state lines.**
3. **The law made it illegal to ship child pornography across state lines.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 Florence Rush

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Informal women's movement organization: Radical Feminist conference 1971**

Activities During the Debate: **Did not participate in Congressional arena or through lobbying; delivered speech at Radical Feminist Conference on subject; wrote book on sexual abuse of children.**

WMA 2 Women Against Violence Against Women

Form: **Informal women's movement organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Just forming in 1977**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The story begins with the publication of another book *For Money or Love* by Robin Lloyd (1976). This was a study of boy prostitution and suggested a connection with child pornography. Congress had already taken up the issue of child sexual abuse and runaways; soon connections were made between teenage runaways, child pornography, and juvenile prostitution. A series of news stories in the *Chicago Tribune* revealed that the most serious problem with prostitution was for boys, not girls. The networks took up the topic of teenage prostitutes, and a bill was drafted to include sexual abuse of children—defined as use in pornography or sending child pornography across state lines—as a federal criminal offence. Another player in the arena was Judianne Densen-Gerber, Director of the Odyssey Institute and a psychiatrist who had been active in promoting an anti-child pornography protection bill.

Congress convened hearings; it was only during those hearings that the idea of amending the Mann Act arose.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning the dominant frame of the debate in the Congressional hearings in 1977 focused on a redefinition of the pornography question from the usual contest of

free speech versus morality enforced by the Supreme Court to a problem of sexual abuse of children. Additionally, the dominant frame argued that child pornography was connected to child prostitution.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
In the beginning, the debate was largely not gendered. gendered references tended to focus on boys and ways to prevent them from being preyed upon by adult males.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.
The debate remained focused on pornography as a problem that involves sexual abuse of children and the idea that child pornography was connected to child prostitution. In order to stop this problem, the dominant frame suggested that there should be stiffer penalties for child pornography and prostitution.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
The debate was largely devoid of gendered references throughout.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym

NCOIWY:

Children of both sexes are abused, but the crime has special impact on females. Girls are more apt to be sexually abused than boys and more likely to be exploited through pornography; supported prevention and treatment programs set up by Congress in 1974.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)
Children of both sexes are abused, but the crime has special impact on females. Girls are more apt to be sexually abused than boys and more likely to be exploited through pornography; supported prevention and treatment programs set up by Congress in 1974.

Note: feminist because it incorporates idea of exploitation of women through pornography and abuse.

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
 WPA 1

Primary charge to committee by Congress was to organize and convene a national conference and state or regional meetings in preparation for International Women's Year. Assess the role of women in all areas of society and develop recommendations to remove barriers to their full and equal participation in all aspects of national life. all issues relating to IWY conferences on advancing the status of women.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
The IWY was established by Congress to prepare for US participation in the UN's International Women's Year conference. The IWY sought to gather information on

a variety of women's issues and it was created so that the US could properly represent the women's movement at the UN conference.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership

Name: **Bela Abzug**

Time in WPA: **2 years as chair**

WMA Activity: **Active feminist in New York women's movement organizations before becoming a Member of Congress.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Growth

At this time, the women's movement was in a period of growth, expanding their agenda to include seeking financial and legal information and freedom from threat or use of violence.

C16A_1—List of Policy agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **ERA (Equal Rights Amendment)**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Rape/sexual violence law reform**
- **Equal Employment**
- **Health**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Members of Congress - especially committees and committee chairs**
- **Some NGOs**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Democrat

House: Democrat

Senate: Democrat

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

None

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: USA_PT2 1984-86

Title: Child Sexual Abuse and Pornography Act

WPA: None

Date of Coding: 4/17/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/1/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1.

Name: **Kathleen Barry, Sociologist at Brandeis University**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **International traffic in women is forced prostitution; women abducted or sold for sexual purposes, like black slavery in the 19th century. Practice shrouded in secrecy because the male brotherhood protects it. Some are girls under 18.**

Policy goals: **End prostitution as exploitation.**

WMA 2

Name: **Catharine MacKinnon; associate professor at University of Minnesota Law School**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Pornography is sex discrimination and degrading to women.**

Policy goals: **Allow women to sue pornographers for violation of women's civil rights.**

WMA 3

Name: **Informal network of activists against pornography**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Pornography perpetuates subordination of women.**

Policy Goals: **Allow women to sue pornographers for violation of women's civil rights.**

WMA 4

Individuals: **Margo St. James**

Micro Frames

Issue Definition: **Prostitution can be a profession; pornography can be pro woman.**

Policy Goals: **Pornography should not be banned.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1.

Name: **Kathleen Barry, Sociologist at Brandeis University**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **International traffic in women is forced prostitution; women abducted or sold for sexual purposes, like black slavery in the 19th century. Practice shrouded in secrecy because the male brotherhood protects it. Some are girls under 18.**

Policy goals: **End prostitution as exploitation.**

WMA 2

Name: **Catharine MacKinnon; associate professor at University of Minnesota Law School**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Pornography is sex discrimination and degrading to women.**

Policy goals: **Allow women to sue pornographers for violation of women's civil rights.**

WMA 3

Name: **Informal network of activists against pornography**

Micro Frame

Issue Definition: **Pornography perpetuates subordination of women.**

Policy Goals: **Allow women to sue pornographers for violation of women's civil rights.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **Whoever knowingly transports any individual in interstate or foreign commerce, or in any territory or possession of the United States, with the intent that such activity for which any person can be charged with a criminal offence, shall be fined under this title and imprisoned not more than five years, or both.**
2. **Additionally, the act specifically outlawed coercion or enticement and transportation of minors for prostitution or criminal sexual activity.**
3. **The 1986 Act strengthened federal criminal law pertaining to buying or selling sexual representations of children and their use in advertising or through the mail.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1 **Kathleen Barry**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academia)**

Activities During the Debate: **Published interview in the New York Times; presented views at NGO Conference in Nairobi in 1985.**

WMA 2 **Catharine MacKinnon**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women's movement organization (academia)**

Activities During the Debate: **Worked to change pornography laws in Minneapolis.**

WMA 3 **Informal network of activists against pornography**

Form: **Informal network**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities: **Worked in Minneapolis to fight pornography.**

WMA 4 **Margo St. James**

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Informal organizations, free speech feminists**

Activities during the debate: **Spoke out publicly on the issues.**

C2A_2—Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

Congress strengthened the 1978 law with the Child Protection Act of 1984 (Campagna & Poffenberger 1988). By definition, selling representations of children in sexual modes was prohibited; no longer was it necessary for prosecutors to prove that pictures, either photographs or films, of children were obscene according to the *Miller* standards. It also raised the age of Majority with respect to federal law to 18 from 16. When signing this bill President Reagan (Republican) announced the establishment of a Federal commission to examine the harm of pornography, headed by the Attorney General, Edward Meese.

In 1985, backers of even stronger legislation were active, Their goal was to remove the requirement of a commercial purpose to the sexual exploitation in order to have a conviction. Upon recommendation of the Meese Commission, this debate again provided the opportunity to amend the Mann Act. While the commission devoted little of its huge two-volume report to the question of trafficking or the Mann Act, they pointed out that men and boys were used in prostitution and in making pornography. They explained that controlling prostitution and pornography was the purpose of the statute. Thus, it made sense in terms of equal protection law, that, although women and girls may be the Majority of the victims of sexual exploitation, there was no reason not to extend the protections of the Mann Act to males. The report concluded that by removing the references to 'immoral purposes' the Act would be better enforced because the concern about arbitrary punishment by overzealous prosecutors would be diminished.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the debate

In the beginning, the debate focused on child pornography and pedophiles who exploit children. The policy actors involved sought to redefine the issue from a child abuse issue to a morality issue. In the beginning, the debate was not gendered.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

No gendered ideas

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.

Through the end, the debate focused on ending child pornography and child sex abuse. policy suggestions ranged from improving social programs to stiffening law enforcement policies. Additionally, the dominant frame linked child pornography with child prostitution. Through the end there were also policy suggestions which focused on ways to end the prostitution and sexual trafficking of children.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
Through the course of the debate, gender ideas were rare and there was little attention paid to the victimization of female prostitutes.

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
No WPA coded in this debate.

C5A_3—WPA feminist micro Frames
Not applicable

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda
Not applicable

C10A_1—Institutional Setting of WPA
Not applicable

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
Not applicable

C13A_1—WMA Stage and Evidence
Decline
After 1983, radical feminists had dispersed and no longer had a national presence. Many feminist organizations remained, but membership began to decrease along with the attention of the media.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Pro-choice**
- **Pornography debates**
- **Comparable worth/pay equity**
- **Woman battery**
- **Family/medical leave**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

Individuals: **Margo St. James**

Informal Organizations **Free speech feminists**

Formal Organizations

Micro Frames: **Prostitution can be a profession; pornography can be pro woman and should not be banned.**

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **Congress - members of committees, staff**
- **Attorney General Meese**
- **Commission on Pornography**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Republican

House: Democrat

Senate: Republican

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **International Feminist Network Against Female Sexual Slavery**
- **Non Governmental women's conference in Nairobi discussed trafficking in 1985**
- **Defense of Children International.**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not applicable

Debate ID: USA_PT3 1998-2000

Title: Trafficking in Women and Children

WPA: The President's Inter-Agency Council (PIAC)

Date of Coding: 4/17/03, 9/13/03, 3/2/04, 12/2/05

C1A_1— WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals

WMA 1

Name **Laura Lederer, Director of Protection Project**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Trafficking of women for prostitution like slavery, not work. No right to choose slavery.**

Policy goals: **Trafficking for prostitution should be criminal, even without direct coercion. Opposed the Wellstone/ administration bill as too weak.**

WMA 2

Name **Gloria Steinem author, feminist activist, founder of MS magazine**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Sex trafficking is modern form of slavery; excused as something inevitable, even natural as the 'oldest profession'.**

Policy goals: **We need to severely punish national and multi national profiteers; arrest customers; offer a way out to prisoners and create self respecting economic alternatives for girls and women who are at risk.**

WMA 3

Name **Equality NOW**

Micro Frame:

Issue definition: **Opposed narrow definition of trafficking proposed by administration focusing on so-called 'forced trafficking' The question is not whether women and girls can legitimately choose the sex industry but whether third parties should be allowed to exploit the prostitution of another person. The narrow definition will legitimize a growing segment of the trafficking industry.**

Policy goals: **Equality Now is dedicated to ending the trade in women. A broad definition is necessary to achieve this goal.**

WMA 4

Name **Feminist Majority**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals: **Feminist majority sought to remove coercion from the definition of sex trafficking and to create a special definition of sex trafficking that separated it from other forms of trafficking.**

WMA 5

Name **Women's Commission for Refugee Women and children of the International Rescue committee.**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy goals:

Register refugees; improve security at refugee camps; programs for specific needs at camps; resettlement opportunities for victims of trafficking.

WMA 6

Name **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Opposed definition of trafficking limited to fraud, force, coercion, etc. this will allow traffickers to use consent as a defense.**

Policy goals: **We suggest: add cases of sex exploitation in general; keep gender specific language of women and children because they are most vulnerable.**

WMA 7

Name: **No name**

Micro Frame: **Against trafficking; prostitution is coercion of women**

Policy goals: **Punish all trafficking, not just that by direct force.**

C1A_2 – WMA Issue Definition and Policy Goals That Are Feminist

WMA 1

Name: **Laura Lederer, Director of Protection Project**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Trafficking of women for prostitution like slavery, not work. No right to choose slavery.**

Policy goals: **Trafficking for prostitution should be criminal, even without direct coercion. Opposed the Wellstone/ administration bill as too weak.**

WMA 2

Name: **Gloria Steinem author, feminist activist, founder of MS magazine**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Sex trafficking is modern form of slavery; excused as something inevitable, even natural as the 'oldest profession'.**

Policy goals: **We need to severely punish national and multi national profiteers; arrest customers; offer a way out to prisoners and create self respecting economic alternatives for girls and women who are at risk.**

WMA 3

Name **Equality NOW**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Opposed narrow definition of trafficking proposed by administration focusing on so-called 'forced trafficking' The question is not whether women and girls can legitimately choose the sex industry but whether third**

parties should be allowed to exploit the prostitution of another person. The narrow definition will legitimize a growing segment of the trafficking industry.

Policy goals: **Equality Now is dedicated to ending the trade in women. A broad definition is necessary to achieve this goal.**

WMA 4

Name: **Feminist Majority**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition:

Policy Goals: **Feminist Majority sought to remove coercion from the definition of sex trafficking and to create a special definition of sex trafficking that separated it from other forms of trafficking.**

WMA 6

Name: **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**

Micro Frame:

Issue Definition: **Opposed definition of trafficking limited to fraud, force, coercion, etc. this will allow traffickers to use consent as a defense.**

Policy goals: **We suggest: add cases of sex exploitation in general; keep gender specific language of women and children because they are most vulnerable.**

WMA 7

Name: **No Name**

Micro Frame: **Against trafficking; prostitution is coercion of women.**

Policy goals: **Punish all trafficking, not just that by direct force.**

C1A_5—Major Stipulations of Policy Outcome

1. **The Act included a two tiered definition of sex trafficking. Sex trafficking was defined as the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act. Severe sex trafficking would mean a commercial sex act induced by force, fraud, or coercion or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age.**
2. **While the preamble to the act recognized that women and girls were most often the victims of trafficking, the final law was largely gender neutral. At the same time, the final law included a separate definition for sex trafficking and also had other provisions that dealt with general forms of trafficking that involved coerced labor.**
3. **Criminal sanctions in the new law applied only to crimes that met the definition of severe sex trafficking, and not regular sex trafficking.**

C2A_1—WMA Form, Location, and Activities During the Debate

WMA 1

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization (academia)**

Activities During the Debate: **Organized women’s organizations to join coalition to lobby Congress and the administration; worked with Chris Smith staff; testified at committee hearings.**

WMA 2

Form: **Individual**

Location: **Non women’s movement organization (pre hearing for congressional hearing)**

Activities During the Debate: **Participated in public pre hearing to show support for feminist position on sex trafficking.**

WMA 3

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbying members of Congress individually; also part of informal feminist coalition.**

WMA 4

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbied members of Congress.**

WMA 5

Form: **Formal organization**

Location: **Inside formal non women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified at committee hearings.**

WMA 6

Form: **Informal organization**

Location: **Free standing women’s movement organization**

Activities During the Debate: **Testified at congressional committee hearings; maintained web site on the issue.**

WMA 7

Form: **Informal organization/coalition**

Location: **Free standing**

Activities During the Debate: **Lobbied members of Congress.**

C2A_2 —Information on Beginning of Policy Debate

The issue of trafficking in women came to the public agenda of Congress in the late 1990s from two directions: international organisations—especially the United Nations and the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE)—and media reports of cases showing that the U.S. had become a destination country. International conferences, usually including personal testimony of victims, brought attention to the increase in sexual trafficking from countries in the former Soviet bloc, as well as Asia and

Latin America. In 1998, concurrent resolutions in the House of Representatives and the Senate called upon the Justice Department to prepare a report on the cases of trafficking in the U.S.

The same year, the Democrat President Bill Clinton issued a directive entitled: 'Steps to Combat Violence Against Women and Trafficking in Women and Girls'. With this, he gave responsibility for the issue of trafficking to the President's Interagency Council on Women (Interagency Council or IAC). The Interagency Council was a women's policy office created to implement the 1995 Beijing Plan of Action in the United States. Housed in the Department of State; its chair was Madeleine Albright, Secretary of State, and the honorary chair was First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton. A deputy director of the Council was assigned to the trafficking issue, and there was a working group representing the departments of Justice, State, Labor, Health and Human Services and the U.S. Agency for International Development. Another working group in the Department of Justice studied exploitation of workers including sexual exploitation.

The Interagency Council proposed a three part framework for policy:

- i. prevention through funding research to gather information on the issue**
- ii. protection through specific projects for social services**
- iii. prosecution: to enhance the enforcement of existing laws. It prepared a bill to authorise this plan; Democrat sponsors Senator Paul Wellstone and Representative Louise Slaughter set the policy process in motion.**

Chris Smith, a Republican congressional representative from New Jersey and delegate to the OSCE, was also impressed with what he learned at international conferences about sexual trafficking. He drafted a bill to strengthen criminal law in the U.S. and to authorise the President to sanction countries which contribute to the trafficking problem. As chair of the Human Rights committee in the House of Representatives, he was in a position to push his bill through a series of Congressional hearings.

C3A_1—Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate

In the beginning, the dominant frame sought to redefine the trafficking problem to focus on human rights, rather than immigration. Under the human rights frame, sex trafficking was portrayed as a major abridgement of the victims' human rights and was equated with slavery. The human rights frame sought to change laws to ensure that the victims of sex trafficking (the actual prostitutes) would not be punished, and to stiffen the criminal sanctions against the perpetrators of sex trafficking. Additionally, proponents of legislation sought to enact programs to help the victims of sex trafficking, rather than simply deport them.

C3A_2—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the Beginning of the Debate
The debate was also gendered from the beginning and focused on the idea that the victims of sex trafficking were often women and children and that the perpetrators were often men. The gendered component of the dominant frame portrayed female victims of sex trafficking as naive and destitute usually from poor communities being sold as commodities.

C3A_3—Issue Frame at the End of the Debate.
The debate remained gendered and focused on sex trafficking as a human rights issue throughout. Through the end of the debate, feminist groups sought to remove coercion from the definition of sex trafficking, as they argued that the act of prostitution itself was exploitative in nature. However policymakers in congress countered, and in the end, sex trafficking remained defined as an act that involved coercion to force people into prostitution.

C3A_4—List of Gendered Ideas in the Issue Frame at the End of the Debate
**Sex trafficking is a violation of human rights that affects women and girls;
 Act of prostitution exploits women.**

C4A_4—Micro Frames of WPA/QUAWPA(s) by Acronym
PIAC sought to define the trafficking issue as an economic issue and argued that sex trafficking should be treated the same as other forms of coerced labor.

C5A_3—WPA Feminist Micro Frames (pending)
Not feminist

C8A_1—WPA Formal/Informal Policy Orientation and Policy Agenda

WPA 1 To implement the 1995 Beijing Plan of Action in the United States. The President assigned sex trafficking as a special project in 1998.

C10A_1—Institutional setting of WPA
The IAC was an inter-agency group The IAC was housed in the Department of State and its trafficking staff came from people that were reassigned from the Department of State. Other working groups were centered in appropriate administrative departments: Commerce; Agriculture; Justice; Treasury and the Agency for International Development.

C12A_1—WPA Leadership
 Names: **Hillary Rodham Clinton, Honorary chair
 Madeline Albright Chair
 Anita Botti (trafficking project)**
 Years in WPA: **1996-2000**
 WMA Activity: **Only Clinton was involved with women’s movement groups as a fellow traveler; others were not and Botti was especially critical of women’s movement actors.**

C13A_1— WMA Stage and Evidence

Consolidation

In the late 1990s, the U.S. women's movement remained in the position of consolidation which had characterised it since the 1980s.

C16A_1—List of Policy Agendas of WMAs for the Period of the Debate

- **Human rights for women**
- **Abortion rights**
- **Welfare reform**
- **Lesbian/gay rights**
- **Women in politics**

C20A_1—Countermovement Strength

No countermovement

C23A_1—List of Policy Actors in Sub-system

- **State Department**
- **Interagency Council**
- **Congressional Committees dealing with sex trafficking**
- **Equality Now**
- **Feminist majority**
- **Protection Project**
- **National Organization for Women (NOW).**

C25A_1—List of parties in the governing majority

President: Democrat

House: Republican

Senate: Republican

C26A_1—List of Trans-national Advocacy Networks by Name

- **Coalition Against Trafficking in Women**
- **Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe**

C26A_3—CEDAW Provision on the Policy Issue Under Debate

Not Applicable